

# UCLA

## American Indian Culture and Research Journal

### Title

Indian Alliances and the Spanish in the Southwest, 750-1750. By William B. Carter.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/45x8477n>

### Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 35(3)

### ISSN

0161-6463

### Author

Brown, Tracy

### Publication Date

2011-06-01

### DOI

10.17953

### Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

**Indian Alliances and the Spanish in the Southwest, 750–1750.** By William B. Carter. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. 312 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

In *Indian Alliances and the Spanish in the Southwest*, William Carter presents a panoramic view of Indian peoples of the Southwest and their interrelationships over one thousand years. Carter begins the book with a synthesis of research concerning when and by what routes groups of Athapaskans are thought to have arrived in the Southwest first, and he details what their initial contact with Ancestral Puebloans was thought to be like. He argues that Pueblo and Athapaskan groups formed alliances beginning as early as the tenth century, and that these alliances endured into the seventeenth century and beyond—through the difficulties of Spanish contact in 1539 and the Pueblo Revolt of 1680. As Carter notes, the relationship between Pueblo and Athapaskan groups such as the Apaches and Navajos is typically portrayed in the historiography of the Southwest as a difficult one (138). Authors such as Elizabeth John (*Storms Brewed in Other Men's Worlds*, 1975), John Kessell (*Kiva, Cross and Crown*, 1987), and Ross Frank (*From Settler to Citizen*, 2000) have meticulously documented the Athapaskan raiding of Spanish and Pueblo settlements during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries as well as the disruption to local economies and communities that such raiding caused. Although not denying that Pueblo-Athapaskan interrelations were sometimes hostile, Carter seeks to highlight the fact that these interrelations could also be friendly and beneficial to both groups. Perhaps most significantly, Carter argues that Apaches and Navajos played central roles not just in the Pueblo Revolt of 1680 but also in all insurrections throughout the seventeenth century (185). Pueblos and Apaches formed a “web of widespread cooperation” to remove the Spanish from New Mexico in 1680 (186).

The strength of this work lies in its synthesis of evidence and research concerning Pueblo and Athapaskan relationships throughout the centuries. The prehistory and history of these groups is a complex one; Carter succeeds in unraveling that complexity without bogging readers down with too much detail. His writing is clear, succinct, and accessible. This means that his book is ideal for those uninitiated in the complexities of Southwest ethnohistory and Spanish contact and would be ideal for use in the undergraduate classroom. Carter also seeks to weave Native perspectives into the narrative of Pueblo and Athapaskan relations, rather than simply relying upon Spanish-language documentation and observation to reconstruct those relations. For example, he discusses Navajo and Hopi origin stories in his efforts to explain the long-standing nature and character of relations between them (36–40). Such efforts

are in line with the best ethnohistorical research and writing about Native North America.

Although the book has many strengths, it can, at times, seem a bit disjointed. It focuses, for the most part, on the American Southwest. Chapter 4, however, concerns the conquest of Mexico and Indian responses to that conquest. The reason for the inclusion of this chapter in the book is to provide background to the Spanish conquest of New Mexico, or, as Carter puts it, to “offer a larger transatlantic context for Spanish colonization of the New World and its impact on the Indians” (81). Carter, again, does a fine job of synthesizing and summarizing the research that has been done on the Mexican conquest. This allows him to draw some basic comparisons between the conquests of central areas of New Spain, as opposed to the northern frontier. For example, he points out the difficulties of colonizing the settled populations of central Mexico (that is, the Aztecs and the Maya) as opposed to nomadic groups of the frontier region. However, it would have been helpful for Carter to demonstrate more fully how the conquest of Mexico provided the intellectual foundation for the conquest of New Mexico. For example, he writes about the philosophical debates in Spain concerning the nature of Indian people at the time of contact, which drove the conquest of the New World (were they human or “natural slaves”?). One wonders how—or if—such debates shaped the way in which the colonization of New Mexico was carried out. Although Carter discusses the diabolism that underwrote the spiritual conquest of Native peoples throughout New Spain, making a few more simple connections between what happened in central Mexico and the northern frontier would make the chapter seem less out of place.

Another matter of debate is Carter’s interpretation of the Pueblo Revolt. Although he argues that the Apaches played an influential role in the Pueblo Revolt, other historians such as Elizabeth John argue that they played only a minimal role in that revolt (*Storms Brewed in Other Men’s Worlds*, 1996, 98–107). Carter does not address such alternate views, thus leaving readers to question why such disparate portrayals exist in the historiography. Furthermore, he stresses that Pueblo leaders encouraged a return to tradition after the Spanish had been removed from New Mexico (196), but does not acknowledge that many Pueblo people actually retained and continued to practice traditions adopted from the Spanish. Postrevolt Pueblo leaders even adopted Spanish modes of authority, as is evidenced by the fact that some dressed as priests and outfitted their houses with church furnishings while others conducted Spanish-style inspections of pueblos and demanded they be treated like Spanish governors (Jane Sanchez, “Spanish-Indian Relations during the Otermín Administration, 1677–1683,” *New Mexico Historical Review*, 1983). It is clear that Spanish influence was not erased during the postrevolt period.

The Spanish were able to reconquer New Mexico in part because they had the assistance of Pueblo allies (which Carter does briefly acknowledge). Pueblo-Athapaskan alliances were not the only alliances that were common in colonial New Mexico. A bigger nod toward these alliances and the adoption of Spanish tradition would clue readers into the complexity of the postrevolt period and would be in line with Carter's efforts to present a more complete portrait of the Indian Southwest.

Carter comments in the preface that writing the book was not easy (x). It could not have been. The literature concerning the prehistory and history of the Southwest is voluminous and, again, the peopling of the region and the creation of complex societies involved processes that stretched over many generations. Despite some inevitable issues, Carter does an admirable job of synthesizing the scholarship and providing a short and accessible synopsis of the history of the Southwest.

*Tracy Brown*

Central Michigan University

**Intermediate Creek: Mvskoke Emponkv Hokkolat.** By Pamela Innes, Linda Alexander, and Bertha Tilkens. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2009. 329 pages. \$29.95 paper.

*Intermediate Creek: Mvskoke Emponkv Hokkolat* is the second of two books about the Creek (Mvskoke) language authored by linguist Pamela Innes and Creek speakers Linda Alexander and Bertha Tilkens, mother and daughter. The book is not a grammar reference but rather is a guide intended for the general reader. The authors assume that most readers will have access to a classroom setting with a teacher trained to present the material, and this would probably be best given the analytical way the material is organized. The self-teaching language learner would need an appreciable amount of formal language experience—not merely a high level of education—to master this material.

The volume contains ten chapters, each organized around a point of grammar; a vocabulary set based on a semantic field, such as clothing or occupations; comprehension and grammar exercises; a cultural section written in English; and suggested readings that point the reader to further linguistic and cultural materials. This second volume does not repeat or summarize the material from *Beginning Creek* (2004); hence the reader really must have that first volume for reference to concepts that will be built upon in this volume. The language concepts in the second volume include the forms of plural marking