

UCLA

Comitatus: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies

Title

Usuard's Journey to Spain and Its Influence on the Dissemination of the Cult of the Cordovan Martyrs

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4016k4z6>

Journal

Comitatus: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 21(1)

ISSN

0069-6412

Author

Effros, Bonnie

Publication Date

1990-10-01

Peer reviewed

Usuard's Journey to Spain and Its Influence on the Dissemination of the Cult of the Cordovan Martyrs

Between the years 850 and 859, approximately fifty Christians were martyred in Muslim Cordova. What distinguishes these martyrdoms from the third-century and earlier Roman persecutions is the voluntary nature of the martyrs' confessions. In a majority of the cases, a Cordovan approached the local *qadi* (judge) or the prince, and without provocation blasphemed the prophet Mohammed. Christians sought actively in this manner to embrace martyrdom at the hands of the Muslim authorities. Documented by Eulogius, a Cordovan priest and subsequent martyr, in his *Memoriale Sanctorum*, and by his longtime friend Paul Albar in the *Indiculus Luminosus*, this seemingly incomprehensible series of suicidal confessions puzzled and angered contemporary Muslim leaders. Moreover, the martyrs gained little sympathy from the Christian community where the validity of their sacrifice was questioned. These Christians criticized the martyrs' actions as fanatical gestures and selfish demonstrations of pride which incited Muslim hatred. Was incurring the wrath of Muslim authorities by committing acts known to warrant capital punishment to be judged on the same scale as the Roman persecutions of Christians who simply desired to practice Christianity? The dearth of miracles accompanying the ninth-century martyrdoms added to the skepticism of a number of would-be faithful.

The tensions and conflicts which stimulated the ninth-century Cordovan martyr movement, not to mention the motives of the martyrs themselves, will remain largely inexplicable. The paucity of sources for the period and the inherent bias of the surviving documentation, largely consisting of passions, polemical works, and apologetic works, make an accurate assessment of the martyrs' beliefs impossible. Thus, instead of attempting to dissect further the motivations of the martyrs, as has been the goal of a number of recent analyses,¹ this essay will seek to clarify and assess the implications of an incident directly related to the martyrdoms: the translation of the relics of three of these martyrs—George, Aurelius, and Natalia (also known as Sabigotho)—by the monks Usuard and Odilard to Paris in 858.²

This incident provides a window through which the complexity of the ninth-century movement becomes more approachable, since the two monks demonstrated immediate acceptance of the validity of the martyrdoms. The translation of these relics to Saint Germain-des-Prés serves as a practical means not only of identifying the conflicts inherent in Christian Cordova with regard to the martyr movement, but also of highlighting the highly political nature of saints' cults in northern Spain and Carolingian Europe.

* * *

Christians in ninth-century Cordova appear to have faced regularly a number of difficulties in their daily lives by virtue of their religion. This conflict existed despite the fact that the Muslims, particularly the more lenient Cordovan emirate under Abd al-Rahman II (822-852), allowed them to practice their faith freely with the exception of some restrictions on public processions and the ringing of church bells, and sanctions against apostasy from Islam to Christianity. The greatest burden placed by Muslim leaders on the Christian population consisted of the customary tax cited in the *Quran*.³ In contrast to this evidence of apparent religious freedom, however, native Christian sources, primarily Eulogius and Albar, stress the nature of the inherent friction between the two populations. Galvanizing the pervasive unrest among the Christians, stimulated by complete intolerance for differing religious beliefs, Albar describes Mohammed in his polemical work the *Indiculus Luminosus* as the precursor of the anti-Christ; prompted by the powerlessness of Cordovan Christians against their Muslim overlords, Albar depicts Muslim domination and persecution of the Christian population in apocalyptic terms. To be certain, Albar did not represent the majority of Cordovan Christians. Nevertheless, he drew on popular sentiment of the period and merited a certain degree of respect among his contemporaries.⁴ Eulogius's description of Muslim anger directed towards priests in particular suggests that these conflicts loomed larger for those who wished to practice their faith zealously and consistently. Priests faced the taunts and stones of Muslim crowds more frequently as a result of their greater visibility. Their habitual dress, which some may have chosen to abandon, must have easily identified them to those who wished to cause difficulty for Christians. Moreover, priests such as Eulogius were often the first to be jailed at any indication of unrest. Perfectus, a priest who was martyred after expressing his thoughts about Islam to a Muslim crowd which had promised him immunity, had simply been walking through the marketplace when he was accosted.⁵

In the period contemporary to the martyr movement, the more zealous

Christians of the Cordovan community feared that a significant number of local Christians, including priests, were becoming lax in their observances. The Cordovan community had grown increasingly isolated from its Christian counterparts in northern Spain and Frankish territories. In addition to his comments regarding the great number of Christian youths who pursued Arabic studies in order to read poetry, Albar states that even Christian leaders sided with the emir against more zealous Christians, particularly the martyrs. While one must always keep in mind the polemical nature of his works as well as, to a lesser extent, those of Eulogius, it is not difficult to identify other indications of assimilation into the Muslim population. From Eulogius's description of the various martyrs and legislation of the period against intermarriage, one may infer a significant number of interfaith marriages, suggesting the willingness for and perhaps the necessity of constant interaction between the two faiths.⁶ In addition, the negative response to continuing the martyr movement in the Cordovan community, evident in the tone of the Council of Cordova in 852, indicates a more moderate attitude among the majority of Christian leaders in the city towards Muslims than evident in the major sources from which this study draws.⁷

In contrast to mores prevalent in Cordovan Spain, attitudes regarding Islam in the kingdoms of northern Spain and in the Carolingian marches developed under Christian overlords. Although communication with Mozarabic Spain appears to have remained fairly consistent until the unrest which surrounded the Cordovan martyrdoms, northern Christians clearly developed an extreme ideology against Muslims as a result of the absence of their direct interchange with them. Their lack of immediate contact with Muslim domination and the success of the missionary movement in Germany made more radical stances towards Islam easier to uphold. Thus, for instance, the polemical *Life of Mohammed*, acquired by Eulogius on his visit to Leyre, originated in northern Spain. Moreover, Carolingians probably saw Cordova as the source of the troublesome Adoptionist controversy, which held that Christ was only the adopted son of the Father. Since Elipand—one of the main leaders of the movement, which also affected Septimania, Asturias and Galicia—may have been a monk of Cordova, Mozarabic culture in general caused many northern Christians to question its orthodoxy.⁸ Christians to the north appear to have believed that the only proper solution to the problem of Muslim rule was for the Christians either to reconquer the territory held by Muslims or to leave. Both Charlemagne and Louis the Pious encouraged the emigration of Christians from Muslim Spain to Carolingian lands in the north of the peninsula or in the south of France.⁹

In light of the issues surrounding the circumstances of these ninth-century "voluntary" martyrs, the translation of relics of the three martyrs from Cordova becomes even more interesting. In Carolingian lands, an increased emphasis had come to rest upon the necessity of possessing relics: relics had become instruments necessary not only for religious devotion but also representative of powerful symbolic forces in territory sinking increasingly into political confusion.¹⁰ Thus, when Hilduin II, abbot of what was to become Saint Germain-des-Prés, decided to acquire relics for the sanctity and protection of his house, he acted in a manner appropriate to his office, for at the same time he sent two brothers Usuard and Odilard to Spain in 858, members of the house had already fled from Paris to safety from the Vikings. (Judging from his later works, Usuard seems to have been purposely selected for this mission as having a special interest in martyrs.) Hilduin instructed the two monks to obtain the relics of Saint Vincent, then believed to be at Valencia, for the abbot had heard of the destruction of the city and suspected that the relics could be easily obtained. The house would have probably judged this mission critical, as the cult of Saint Vincent had been established centuries earlier at the site of Saint Germain-des-Prés with the monastery's acquisition of Vincent's stole. As Usuard and Odilard travelled southwards, however, they learned that his relics had been translated to Benevento. Although Aimon, the author of the *Translatio*, would later discount the veracity of this rumor, the two monks nevertheless abandoned their quest for Saint Vincent's relics. Upon hearing news in Barcelona of the Cordovan martyrdoms from a prominent citizen Sunifred, they redirected their journey towards Cordova.¹¹

Clearly the events prior to Usuard's and Odilard's acquisition of Cordovan relics indicate that they had no particular desire to obtain relics of martyrs of Muslim persecutions. Judging from the manner in which Aimon describes their arrival in Barcelona, they probably were not even aware until that time of the martyrdoms which had occurred in Cordova over the prior eight years. Usuard and Odilard simply wanted to ensure that they had not undertaken their dangerous journey to Spain in vain. Indeed, the isolation of Cordova had become so complete that Aimon stated that no caravans had reached the city in eight years, most likely because of the Muslim crackdown associated with the start of the martyr movement in 851. In the end, despite the hesitance of Ataulf, bishop of Barcelona, and Sunifred to promote the dangerous journey, circumstances favored the two Frankish monks and their desire to acquire new relics. Having made the acquaintance of the Christian count, Honfroy, who guarded the Spanish march, Usuard and Odilard acquired a letter of introduction from him to

his ally the Muslim governor of Zaragoza. Thus, the two monks even received permission to visit important pilgrimage sites during the course of their journey.¹² Although Usuard and Odilard were unable to obtain Saint Vincent's relics, Hilduin had provided them with sufficient political connections to enable them to present themselves as powerful emissaries from Carolingian France.

Aimon states that, upon their arrival in Cordova, the monks attracted a fair amount of attention from the local Christians as foreign Christian visitors. They proceeded directly to the church of Saint Cyprian, the burial site of some of the martyrs, where Jerome the deacon received them with hospitality. Once again Usuard and Odilard possessed a helpful letter of introduction, in this instance from Sunifred and Ataulf to an influential Christian named Leovigild, who enabled them to meet Samson, the future abbot of the monastery of Pinna Mellaria. Located outside Cordova, this monastery played a significant role in the martyr movement, sheltering a number of martyrs prior to their confessions before the *qadi* and guarding their relics after their executions.¹³ While Samson favored Usuard's and Odilard's desire to obtain relics of some of the Cordovan martyrs, especially those to which he had access as abbot, the monks of Pinna Mellaria remained reluctant to part with the bodies of Aurelius and the monk George buried there. Thus, while engaged in lengthy negotiations for the two martyrs, Usuard and Odilard also became acquainted with Eulogius, who had by this time probably concluded his version of the *Memoriale Sanctorum*. In anticipation of the journey northward, Eulogius appears to have written a separate version of the *Passion* of George and Aurelius to take with the relics.¹⁴ Eulogius and Samson supported the translation of relics from Cordova to France, in the belief that the spread of the cult would make the plight and the sanctity of Cordovan martyrs better known. In contrast, the monks of Pinna Mellaria, reluctant to sacrifice their direct access to the relics of George and Aurelius, opposed the loss of the bodies of their personal friends and powerful intercessors.

As Usuard and Odilard prepared to depart from Cordova, they were granted permission to travel with the army of Mohammed I, which was to engage in battle in Toledo. (This plan, formulated with the aid of Leovigild, allowed them to travel safely to Zaragoza without fear of attack by the robbers who dominated the roads at this time). Due to the speed with which they were forced to leave the city on 11 May 858, as well as the unexplained absence of Samson from Pinna Mellaria, Usuard and Odilard sought the assistance of Saul, the bishop of Cordova, in obtaining the relics. Only a few priests were present at the exhuming of the two bodies, and, much to

their surprise, the head of Aurelius was missing from the sepulcher and the head of Natalia was present instead. (According to Eulogius's *Memoriale Sanctorum*, Natalia's body was buried not at Pinna Mellaria but at the church of SS. Faustus, Januarius and Martial, although some confusion had arisen earlier regarding the whereabouts of her head.)¹⁵ In any case, the Cordovan bishop wrapped the bodies of George and Aurelius with the head of Natalia in linen marked with his seal for protection. Aimon, in his *Translatio*, describes Usuard's and Odilard's journey as blessed by the miracles performed by the new relics in their possession.

Returning to Frankish territory, Usuard and Odilard found the members of their community of Saint Germain-des-Prés at Émant in the diocese of Sens, as the monks had been forced again to flee from Scandinavian marauders. Charles the Bald expressed his pleasure with the monks' new acquisitions and sent Mancio, possibly a deacon in his chancery, to Spain in order to confirm the validity of the Cordovan relics. Mancio's return in 861 brought not only a satisfactory reply for the king, but also details of a miracle associated with the bodies of the martyrs: Despite their exposure to birds and dogs, the relics had remained untouched. Mancio also brought news of the martyrdoms in 859 of Eulogius and two unnamed sisters. In addition, at approximately this same period, Aimon, a monk of the same house, concluded his account of the translation of the three martyrs' relics. Soon after Mancio's return, however, the monks of Saint Germain-des-Prés were forced to flee again, this time seeking safety at Nogent-l'Artaud-sur-la-Marne with all the relics from Saint Germain.¹⁶

This account of the fate of the relics of George, Aurelius and Natalia concludes with the triumphant return of the monks to Saint Germain-des-Prés on 19 July 863, in a formal procession involving the relics of Saint Germain and, presumably, the house's other relics as well. Approximately seven years after his journey to Spain, Usuard finished his *Martyrology*, dedicated to Charles the Bald, which includes a significant number of the Cordovan martyrs in its liturgy, among them George, Aurelius, and Natalia. Usuard's failure to mention a number of the saints included by Eulogius in the *Memoriale Sanctorum*, however, renders the source of his material on the Cordovan martyrs difficult to identify.¹⁷ Additional evidence for the continued importance of the Cordovan relics at Saint Germain-des-Prés consists of their rediscovery in 1110 by the monks of the house; Abbot Renaud, who had recently defended his right to rule the house against the bishop of Paris, celebrated both victories with ceremonies in honor of the relics. Finally, Bouillart in his eighteenth-century account of the house mentioned that in 1597 the Feuillants, at that time

residing at rue Saint-Honoré in Paris, requested that Saint Germain-des-Prés donate relics to their house. The monks of Saint Germain answered the petition by donating among other relics the side of Aurelius. According to Bouillart, the relics of the three Cordovan martyrs continued to be venerated even in his own day.¹⁸

* * *

While the history of translations and elevations of these relics provides interesting background, in order to understand more accurately the significance of these events on the cult of the saints George, Aurelius and, Natalia, and of the Cordovan martyrs in general, an analysis of the available martyrologies and calendars is necessary. These documents give a more accurate account of the actual usages and observances of various churches during the same time period. One would expect Usuard to include the Cordovan martyrs in his *Martyrology*, written after his journey to Cordova and his acquisition of important relics, as he wished to enhance the reputation of his house. Monasteries without such possessions would perhaps be more resistant to inclusion of the Cordovan martyrs in the liturgy, especially in light of the somewhat dubious nature of the martyrdoms. Indeed, the glaring differences between Usuard's *Martyrology* and contemporary as well as later calendars and martyrologies confirm these expectations. Each of the calendars in question and their Cordovan saints will be described; a tabular summary and a discussion of the implications of these usages follows:¹⁹

1. *Eulogius's Memoriale Sanctorum* (851–857)—Provenance: Cordova. Composed by the Cordovan priest and martyr Eulogius in three books contemporary with the martyrdoms, this Mozarabic account provides the definitive version of the martyr movement.²⁰

2. *Martyrology of Ado (Family I)* (c.855, c.865, c.875)—Provenance: Ferrières. Composed by Ado, a monk of Ferrières, this family exists in three recensions from his lifetime, the first of which constitutes one of the Frankish sources of Usuard's *Martyrology*.²¹

3. *Usuard's Martyrology* (865–870)—Provenance: Saint Germain-des-Prés. Dedicated to Charles the Bald primarily as a means of ensuring the widespread acceptance of the martyrology, this manuscript appears to be the first to promote the cult of the Cordovan martyrs.²²

4. *Calendar of Heric of Auxerre* (865–876)—Provenance: Saint Germain d'Auxerre. Heric of Auxerre, who became a priest in 865, composed this work contemporary to Usuard's. Despite the fact that Aimon states that the relics of George, Aurelius, and Natalia passed through Auxerre and

conducted miracles there, Heric omits any reference to the Cordovan martyrs.²³ Perhaps Aimon's reference to the powers of the Cordovan martyrs at the shrine of a local saint demonstrates the existence of an inherent rivalry between Auxerre and St. Germain-des-Prés.

5. *Calendar of Cordova* (961)—Provenance: Cordova. Recemund, bishop of Cordova, probably composed the Latin portion of this manuscript dedicated to the emir al-Hakam II and focusing on liturgical observances. 'Arib b. Sa'd al-Katib wrote the Arabic half of the text which consists primarily of an almanac. Because of the dual nature of the calendar, omission of reference to the Cordovan martyrs appears to have stemmed from a desire not to offend the emir, a descendant of Abd al-Rahman II and Mohammed I.²⁴

6. *Martyrology of Ado (Family II)* (tenth century)—Provenance: Ferrières. This second family, written in the century following Ado's death, includes a significant number of additions from Usuard's *Martyrology* and the region of Auxerre.²⁵ The influence of Usuard is especially notable in the martyrology's incorporation of a large number of Cordovan martyrs, making the manuscript a clear exception to the norm of Carolingian martyrologies.

7. *Calendar of Ripoll* (tenth to eleventh century)—Provenance: Catalonia. This manuscript in Frankish minuscule is the oldest and most complete of the Catalan calendars, and follows the Roman rather than the Visigothic rite.

8. *Calendar of Vigilano* (976)—Provenance: Albelda (northern Spain). This manuscript is the most ancient and complete of the Mozarabic calendars of northern Spain. The monasteries of the northern Spanish kingdoms were more conservative than either Usuard or Ado regarding changes in the liturgy in order to accommodate veneration of the Cordovan martyrs.

9. *Emilian Calendar* (994)—Provenance: San Millán (northern Spain). This calendar appears to be a direct copy of the former.²⁶

10. *Calendar of Silos (I)* (before 1039)—Provenance: Silos. Written at the Benedictine abbey of Silos, this manuscript may actually date from the end of the tenth century.

11. *Calendar of Silos (II)* (1052)—Provenance: Silos. This calendar constituted a part of a larger *Liber Ordinum*.²⁷

12. *Madrid Fragment of Calendar* (eleventh century)—Provenance: San Millán. In the portion of this calendar which survives, January, March and April closely resemble the second Silos calendar while February echoes the calendar of León.²⁸

13. *Calendar of Compostela* (1055)—Provenance: Castile. This calen-

dar was composed at the order of Queen Sancha of Castile, wife of Ferdinand I.²⁹

14. *Calendar of San Millán* (mideleventh century)—Provenance: San Millán. This calendar is of the Roman rite, despite the fact that the monastery's official change to the Roman rite did not occur until after 1090.³⁰

15. *Calendar of León* (917–960)—Provenance: León. While this calendar is believed to have been composed in the first half of the tenth century, its only reference to a Cordovan martyr occurs in a later interpolation from the 1060s. It forms a part of the *Antiphonarius* in the cathedral of León.

16. *Calendar of Silos at Paris (I)* (before 1067)—Provenance: Silos.

17. *Calendar of Silos at Paris (II)* (1072)—Provenance: Silos. This calendar was copied closely from the previous one.³¹

18. *Calendar of Oña* (1173–1228)—Provenance: Oña (northern Spain). Written at the Cluniac monastery of Oña, this manuscript not only demonstrates Cluniac influence in northern Spain, but also the continuing failure in the twelfth century to incorporate the Cordovan martyrs from Usuard's *Martyrology* into northern Spanish calendars.³²

In these eighteen martyrologies, the Cordovan martyrs fall into the following four groups. (The inclusion of martyrs within each of the classifications in the martyrologies and calendars described above is summarized in Table 1.)

Pre-Eulogius. This classification contains the saints Adulphus and John, two sons of a Muslim father and Christian mother. Both became martyrs at the hand of Abd al-Rahman II some time soon after 822. Although Eulogius includes them in the *Memoriale Sanctorum*, their deaths cannot be construed as a true part of the midninth-century martyr movement, as they died thirty years earlier. Moreover, their confessions do not appear to have been voluntary. (Abbot Esperaindeo, the teacher of Eulogius and Albar, wrote the *Life* of the two brothers; their sister Aurea died as a voluntary martyr in 856.)³³

Contemporary to Eulogius. This group contains saints listed by Eulogius in his *Memoriale Sanctorum*. Outside of Usuard's *Martyrology* and the second family of Ado's *Martyrology*, few contemporary calendars make mention of any of the saints from the ninth-century movement. Saints whom they include are individuals more acceptable to those skeptical of the validity of the Cordovan martyrdoms: Rudericus, a priest in Cabra, was knocked unconscious during a fight between two of his brothers, one of whom had converted to Islam. His Muslim brother declared falsely that Rudericus too had embraced Islam, and when Rudericus denied this charge, Muslim authorities imprisoned and later executed him for apostasy on 13 March

Table 1.
Cordovan Martyrs in Calendars and Martryologies

	<i>Pre-Eulogius</i> Adulphus, John	<i>Contemporary-Eulogius</i> in Cordova	<i>Eulogius</i> Nunilo, Alodia	<i>Eulogius</i>	<i>Post-Eulogius</i>
1. <i>Memoriale Sanctorum</i>	Yes	45	Yes	No	None
2. <i>Martyrology of Ado (Family I)</i>	No	None	No	No	None
3. <i>Usuard's Martyrology</i>	Yes	25	Yes	Yes	None
4. <i>Calendar of Heric of Auxerre</i>	No	None	No	No	None
5. <i>Calendar of Cordova</i>	Yes	Emilio Perfectus	No	No	Esperaindeo* Albar* Pelagius
6. <i>Martyrology of Ado (Family II)</i>	Yes	18	Yes	No	None
7. <i>Calendar of Ripoll</i>	No	None	No	No	Pelagius
8. <i>Calendar of Vigilano</i>	No	None	Yes	No	Pelagius#
9. <i>Emilian Calendar</i>	No	None	Yes	No	Pelagius
10. <i>Calendar of Silos (I)</i>	No	None	Yes#	Yes#	Pelagius
11. <i>Calendar of Silos (II)</i>	No	None	Yes	No	Pelagius Eugenia
12. <i>Madrid Fragment (San Millán)</i>	(Only Months January to April Extant)				Eugenia
13. <i>Calendar of Compostela</i>	No	None	Yes	No	Pelagius
14. <i>Calendar of San Millán</i>	No	None	Yes	No	Pelagius
15. <i>Calendar of León</i>	No	None	No	No	Pelagius#
16. <i>Calendar of Silos at Paris (I)</i>	No	Rudericus Salomon	Yes	Yes and Leocritia	Pelagius
17. <i>Calendar of Silos at Paris (II)</i>	No	Rudericus Salomon	Yes	Yes and Leocritia	Pelagius
18. <i>Calendar of Oña</i>	Yes	None	Yes	No	Pelagius

KEY: *Not known to be martyrs outside of this text.
#Later interpolations.

857. Similarly, Saloman, a foreign Christian layman, had converted to Islam and back again. The *qadi* executed him with Rudericus on a similar charge.³⁴ The case of Perfectus was discussed earlier. Despite his denial of wrongdoing, Perfectus received a death sentence from the *qadi*; only then did the priest denounce Islam openly. Finally, Emilio was a noble youth who denounced Mohammed in Arabic with a childhood friend Jeremiah. The two, a deacon and a layman, were executed 15 September 852.³⁵

Particularly interesting are the calendars which include Nunilo and Alodia, two virgins of the same time period martyred outside Cordova in the town of Bosca. The two sisters came from an interfaith home composed of a Muslim father and Christian mother; when their mother remarried a more observant Muslim man who would not allow them to practice their faith, the sisters were forced to receive instruction from Muslim women about Islam. Because they would not abjure their Christian faith, Nunilo and Alodia were martyred on 22 October 851; their bodies were translated to the monastery of Leyre outside of Pamplona, which Eulogius visited in 848 or 849. Bishop Venerius of Alcala, from whom Eulogius learned of their martyrdom, composed their *Passion* and enabled their cult to become widespread in northern Spain.³⁶

Eulogius. This classification includes Eulogius and sometimes Leocritia. Their presence in a calendar implies contact with Saint Germain-des-Prés or familiarity with the *Passion* of Eulogius composed by Albar shortly after Eulogius's death. Leocritia was a noble Muslim girl who had become a Christian in secret and was instructed and sheltered by Eulogius. Apprehended by the *qadi*, Eulogius was executed 11 March 859 for his instruction of Leocritia, while she was executed three days later for apostasy from Islam. Eulogius's cult was most popular in the north of Spain, probably because his relics and those of Leocritia were obtained from Mohammed I and translated in 884 to the cathedral of Oviedo by Dulcidus, a priest of Toledo, for Alfonso II of Asturias.³⁷

Post-Eulogius. These saints' names obviously could not have been derived from either the *Memoriale Sanctorum* or the *Martyrology* of Usuard. The popularity of the martyr Pelagius among the calendars once again demonstrates the more acceptable nature of involuntary martyrs and those with some attraction for the northern Spanish monasteries. Sent by his father, a Galician noble, to the court of Abd al-Rahman III as ransom for his uncle, Bishop Hermogius of Tuy, Pelagius apparently faced execution on 26 June 925 for rejecting sexual advances by the emir and conversion to Islam. Eugenia, another saint listed in later calendars, was a later martyr of Cordova who suffered under the emir Abd al-Rahman III and was executed 26 March 923. Nothing further is known about her. Finally, the

respect paid to Esperaindeo and Albar, neither of whom was a martyr, by their inclusion in the *Calendar* of Cordova, perhaps stemmed from a desire to honor the Cordovan martyrs in an inconspicuous manner. As Esperaindeo was an abbot and the teacher of both Eulogius and Albar, their names would most likely have been unknown to the emir al-Hakam II, to whom the calendar was dedicated.³⁸

* * *

In conclusion, one must again stress the prominent position occupied by the cult of the Cordovan martyrs at Saint Germain-des-Prés, as well as in Usuard's *Martyrology* and its offspring. This is in contrast to the failure of the majority of the Cordovan martyrs to gain a following of size in northern Spain and Carolingian France. Even in Cordova a century following the martyr movement, the veneration of these martyrs remained secretive and indirect. Usuard's inclusion of a significant number of the Cordovan martyrs in his *Martyrology* follows to some degree from his personal contact with the ninth-century martyr movement, as well as his role in the translation of relics of three of them. Whether he based his acceptance of the validity of these martyrs solely on his contact with Eulogius and his expectation of the benefits that a large cult could bring to Saint Germain-des-Prés remains more difficult to determine. Similarly, the clear rejection of the ninth-century martyrs by northern Spanish monasteries may have represented a political action (dismissing martyrs from a rival city known to be less than orthodox in its observances), the rivalry between monasteries, or simply a refusal to recognize saints whose martyrdoms were questionable. Future studies might profitably define the exact terms denoting the qualities of a martyr in the ninth, tenth, and eleventh centuries. In the course of this analysis, the unpopularity of the Cordovan martyrs in Visigothic and some Carolingian liturgy has become clear. While the *Martyrology* of Usuard certainly influenced various calendars, as evidenced by the *Martyrology* of Ado, as well as the sixteenth-century Roman *Martyrology*, in areas where veneration of these Cordovan saints had no immediate relevance, their cult with few exceptions was not established.³⁹

Bonnie Effros

Bonnie Effros is a doctoral student at the University of California, Los Angeles. She specializes in the history of early medieval France.

NOTES

1. Recent studies which have stressed the importance of understanding the motives behind the Cordovan martyrs' actions, include: Allan Cutler, "The Ninth-Century Martyrs' Movement and the Origins of Western Christian Movements to the Muslims," *Muslim World* 55 (1965): 321-39; Richard W. Southern, *Western Views of Islam* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1962), 20-25; James Waltz, "The Significance of the Voluntary Martyrs of Ninth-Century Cordoba," *Muslim World* 60 (1970): 143-59, 226-36; Kenneth Baxter Wolf, *Christian Martyrs in Muslim Spain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988).

2. Socii Bollandiani, ed., *Bibliotheca Hagiographica Latina: Antiquae et Mediae*, vol. 1 (Brussels: Socii Bollandiani, 1898-99), 507-8. George, Aurelius, Felix, and their companions are listed in this text as numbers 3407, 3408 and 3409. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 28-30: Aurelius, the son of a Muslim father and Christian mother, and his wife Natalia, of a Muslim household but with a Christian stepfather, both practiced Christianity in secret. In conjunction with Felix and Liliosa, a couple facing similar circumstances, they decided to become overt Christians and risk apostasy. With George, a monk from Jerusalem, they resolved after a period of penance to make their wishes public. Natalia and Liliosa appeared in church with their faces unveiled, thus revealing to the *qadi* their true intentions. The five embraced martyrdom together on 27 July 852. This translation of relics is recorded in: Aimon, *De translatione SS. martyrum Georgii monachi, Aurelii, et Nathaliae ex urbe Corduba Parisios*, ed. Mabillon, *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 115, ed. J.-P. Migne (Paris: Garnier Fratres, 1881), 939-60. All information drawn from Aimon's account will be taken from this work, or from the following summaries: Edward P. Colbert, *The Martyrs of Cordoba (850-859): A Study of the Sources*, new series, vol. 17 (Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Studies in Medieval History, 1962), 345-49; Jacques Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye royale de Saint Germain des Prés* (Paris: Gregoire Dupuis, 1724), 36-44.

3. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 8-19. In comparison to Ar-Razi's description of the conquest of Cordova in 711, and the laws instituted by Caliph Umar II (717-720), the emirate of Abd al-Rahman II (822-852) allowed a much greater amount of freedom for the Christian population. Umar II restricted Christian dress and forbade the construction and repair of churches, bell ringing and funeral processions. Under Abd al-Rahman II, Christians held office as translators, tax collectors and *exceptor reipublicae* (an official of the chancery of the emir). Eulogius speaks of four basilicas and nine monasteries in the vicinity of Cordova alone. This statement also contrasts Ar-Razi's account of all but one of the churches of Cordova being destroyed after the conquest. Only unrest led the emir to take steps to tighten his control over the Christian population. The large presence of Malikite jurists, who were less tolerant of *dhimmis* (protected people such as Christians), in the court of his son Mohammed I demonstrated the growing extremism of Muslim rule in response to Christian fanaticism. According to Eulogius, after ridding his palace of Christian officials, Mohammed I considered killing all Christian men of Cordova and selling their wives and children into slavery.

4. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 91–94. Albar depicted the eleventh horn as Mohammed, and described the kingdoms in Revelations as those of the Greeks, Visigoths and Franks. On the other hand, he was careful to leave the rendering of judgment untouched. One must thus be hesitant to accept Southern's strongly worded interpretation of the Cordovan situation. Eulogius, the only martyr to give an account of the movement, in contrast, never used apocalyptic imagery. R. Dozy, ed., *Le Calendrier de Cordoue*, new edition, trans. Ch. Pellat, Medieval Iberian Peninsula Texts and Studies (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1961), 162–63. In the *Calendar of Cordova*, the tenth-century creation of Recemund, bishop of Cordova, Albar is noted as a saint. This reference, however, represents the only such description of Albar found to date.

5. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 141–45. Leovigildus' *De Habitu Clericorum* spoke of the problems of clerical discipline in Cordova, particularly many clerics' failure to wear the appropriate dress to their office. See Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 24; and Norman Daniel, *The Arabs and Medieval Europe* (London: Longman, 1975), 31.

6. Daniel, *Arabs*, 32–33. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 12. Waltz, "Significance of Martyrs," 153–54. At the time of the martyrdoms, there was a literary and intellectual flowering of cultural activity at the court of Abd al-Rahman II, in contrast to the rather limited repertoire of Christian learning in Cordova during the same period. The Council of Cordova, which met in 839, repeated Adrian I's condemnation in 785 of intermarriage with Muslims.

7. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 247–49. The Council of Cordova in 852 forbade martyrdom as well as public profession of faith. In Eulogius's opinion, however, the legislation did not condemn the martyrdoms which had already taken place.

8. Richard E. Sullivan, "The Carolingian Missionary and the Pagan," *Speculum* 28 (1953): 705; Colbert, *Martyrs*, 180–90. Eulogius's journey to the north of Spain included visits to most of the major monasteries of the region around Pamplona. While at the monastery of Leyre, he acquired a Christian polemical account of the *Life of Mohammed*. For further description of Eulogius's journey, see: Elie Lambert, "Le Voyage de Saint Euloge dans les Pyrénées en 848," *Estudios dedicados a Menéndez Pidal* 4 (1953): 557–67; and Dominique Urvoy, "La Pensée religieuse des Mozarabes face à l'Islam," *Traditio* 39 (1983): 426–32. Elipand sought to emphasize the transcendence of the Father to combat the followers of Migetius, who spoke of the Trinity in very human terms. In doing so, however, he committed the error of extending his theory to the point where Christ could only embody an adopted son of the Father due to his human nature. Elipand preached Adoptionism in Asturias and Galicia, while Felix of Urgel preached in Septimania.

9. Waltz, "Significance of Martyrs," 145–57. Charlemagne recognized his role as leader of the *res publica christiana* and established the Spanish march, although his success was somewhat undermined by his disastrous defeat at Roncevalles. Louis the Pious expanded the march and attempted to assist the Christians of Merida in an uprising against Cordova.

10. Patrick J. Geary, *Furta Sacra: Thefts of Relics in the Central Middle Ages*

(Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978), 19–24. During the Carolingian renaissance, the Council of Carthage was reinvoled, thus mandating all altars to contain relics. In addition, authorities encouraged the swearing of oaths on relics and pilgrimage to the tombs of saints.

11. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 345–49. Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye*, 36–44. Aimon, a monk of Saint Germain, stated that the relics of Saint Vincent actually rested at Zaragoza under the name Saint Marin. Geary, *Furta Sacra*, 166. Childebert had brought the stole of Saint Vincent to Saint Germain-des-Prés in 527.

12. Jacques Dubois, *Le Martyrologe d'Usuard: Texte et Commentaire* (Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1965), 129–30. Abdilumar (the Christian version of his name), was at that time the governor of Zaragoza.

13. Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye*, 41–42; Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 30–32. Fandila, martyred 13 June 853, had served the monks of Pinna Mellaria as a priest. The nun, Pomposa, whose parents had founded this monastery, embraced martyrdom on 19 September 853, despite the efforts of some other nuns to stop her. Peter, a monk of Pinna Mellaria, died on 30 April 855. Monasteries such as Pinna Mellaria and Tabanos served as centers of discontent as expressed by the martyrs.

14. Rafael Jimenez Pedrajas, "San Eulogio de Córdoba, autor de la pasión francesa de los mártires mozárabes cordobeses Jorge, Aurelio y Natalia," *Anthologica annua* 17 (1970): 465–73. The nature of the version of the Passion given to Usuard and Odilard is disputed due to the French sources' use of the name Natalia as opposed to Sabigotho. Eulogius used the name Sabigotho consistently to refer to Aurelius's wife throughout his *Memoriale*, as this name was the one she took at baptism. Moreover, there is some discrepancy between dates used by Usuard in his *Martyrology* and Eulogius in his *Memoriale*. Pedrajas suggests that the *Passion* taken by Usuard to the north may have been an entirely distinct work from the *Memoriale* rather than just a copy of Book II, Chapter 10. See also Dubois, *Martyrologe*, 94. The relationship between the *Martyrology* and the *Memoriale* remains unclear as well due to Usuard's choice of only a certain fraction of the Cordovan martyrs in his work.

15. Aimon, *De Translatione*, I: 12, 946: "et quidem beati Georgii corpus ex integro, Aurelii vero sine capite tollentes in ecclesiae loco sub altari quemadmodum significavimus, sepelierunt. Sanctae vero Nathaliae corpus, dum aliorum ab aliis truncum sublatum fuisset, caput illius in eadem ecclesia, ubi viri corpus, collatum est. Unde accidit quatenus tempore effossionis eorum beati athletae Aurelii caput cum suo corpore minime inveniretur, ac sacrae Nathaliae corpus quo humatum fuerit, nesciretur. Sed ut impleretur in eis etiam post mortem, quia erunt duo in carne una, corpori beati Aurelii caput Nathaliae suae conjugis subrogatum est, atque cum nimia admiratione quaerentibus datum, quod deifice factum neminem qui audit, latere putamus."

16. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 345–49. Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye*, 36–44.

17. Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye*, 43–44; Baudouin de Gaiffier, "Les notices hispaniques dans le martyrologe d'Usuard," *Analecta Bollandiana* 55 (1937): 275–

78. De Gaiffier suggests that Usuard might have been familiar with another Spanish martyrology now lost. Dubois suggests that it is a different version of Eulogius's work. (*Martyrologe*, 62-72).

18. Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye*, 81-82, 210; L. Ferrando, "Feuillants et Feuillantines," *Dictionnaire d'histoire et géographie ecclésiastiques*, vol. 16 (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1967), 1338-44. The Feuillants were a branch of Cistercians founded under Jean de la Barrière who fought against their mother house and finally received papal approval from Gregory XIII in 1586. The austere group only ate bread, herbs, and water, allowing no eggs, oil, or fish in their diets. They did not view study as important, with the exception of necessary learning for the preparation of the mass. Their sanctity attracted the attention of Henry III, who constructed the monastery of Saint Bernard for them at rue Saint-Honoré in 1587.

19. For a complete list of Mozarabic calendars, see: Rivero Recio and Juan Francisco, eds., *Estudios sobre la liturgia mozárabe*, Estudios, Introducciones, Repertorios, ser. 3, vol. 1 (Toledo: Diputación Provincial, 1965), 149-50.

20. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 56-60. His account is edited in: Eulogius, *Memoriale Sanctorum*, ed. Mabillon, *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 115, ed. J.-P. Migne (Paris: Garnier Freres, 1881), 777-92.

21. Jacques Dubois and Geneviève Renaud, *Le Martyrologe d'Adon: Ses deux familles, ses trois recensions, texte et commentaire*, Source d'histoire médiéval (Paris: Éditions du centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1984), xiv-xxvi.

22. Dubois, *Martyrologe*, 15, 38-39, 62. The manuscript believed to be the autograph is at Paris: Bibl. Nat. Lat. Ms. 13745.

23. Baudouin de Gaiffier, "Le calendrier d'Heric d'Auxerre du manuscrit de Melk 412," *Analecta Bollandiana* 77 (1959): 392-99; Dubois, *Martyrologe*, 132.

24. Dozy, *Calendrier*, viii-x; José Vives, "Santoral visigodo en calendarios e inscripciones," *Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia* 14 (1941): 36-47. Vives makes no reference to possible reasons for the strange choice of martyrs included other than the isolation of the Mozarabic community.

25. Dubois and Renaud, *Martyrologe d'Adon*, xxvii.

26. José Vives and Ángel Fábrega, "Calendarios hispanicos anteriores al siglo XII," *Hispania Sacra* 2 (1949): 122. The first calendar is numbered: Barcelona, Arch. Corona de Aragón, Fondo Ripoll, Ms. 59; the second and third are El Escorial Mss. d.I.2 and d.I.1. See M. Alamo, "Les calendriers d'après Dom Férotin, additions et corrections," *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* 39 (1943): 125-26.

27. Marius Férotin, *Le Liber Ordinum en usage dans l'Eglise wisigothique et mozarabe d'Espagne du cinquième au onzième siècle*, Monumenta Ecclesiae Liturgica, 5 (Paris: Librairie de Firmin-Didot et Cie, 1904), xxvii-xxxiii, 450-95. The six calendars from northern Spain are all edited in this text. Vives and Fábrega update Férotin's material significantly: "Calendarios anteriores al siglo XIII," 341-42. These manuscripts are Silos, Bib. Mon. 4(A), fol. 1-6, and Bib. Mon. 3(B), fol. 1-3.

28. José Janini, "Dos calendarios emilianenses del siglo XI," *Hispania Sacra* 15 (1962): 177-78. The manuscript is numbered: Madrid, Bibl. de la Real Academia de la Historia, Cod. Emilian. 18, fol. 1rv.

29. Vives and Fábrega, "Calendarios anteriores al siglo XIII," 343. The manuscript is numbered: Santiago de Compostela, Bib. Univ. Reservado 5, fol. 104.
30. Janini, "Dos calendarios," 181. The manuscript is numbered: Madrid, Bibl. de la Real Academia de la Historia, Cod. Emilian 18, fol. 6-11.
31. Vives, "Calendarios anteriores al siglo XIII," 344-48. Manuscripts are León, Arch. Cat. 8, fol. 6-9; Paris, Bibl. Nat. Nouv. Acq. Lat. 2171, fol. 28-33, and 2169, fol. 22-24.
32. Baudouin de Gaiffier, "Un calendrier franco-hispanique de la fin du XIIe siècle," *Analecta Bollandiana*, 69 (1951): 282-85. The manuscript is numbered: Milan, Bibl. Ambros. F 105 sup.
33. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 157-58. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 32.
34. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 32-33.
35. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 242-43.
36. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 224-25.
37. Colbert, *Martyrs*, 98, 350-53. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 33-34. Férotin, *Liber Ordinum*, 466-67.
38. Wolf, *Christian Martyrs*, 34. Férotin, *Liber Ordinum*, 461. Dozy, *Calendrier*, 82, 162.
39. Baudouin de Gaiffier, "Les notices hispaniques du Martyrologe Romain," *Analecta Bollandiana* 58 (1940): 79-89.