

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Plains Indians of the Twentieth Century. Edited with an introduction by Peter Iverson.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3p82c0sj>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 10(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Moses, L. G.

Publication Date

1986

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

a problem which, along with bad weather, destitution and hunger, brought on the massacre at Frog Lake.

It is in establishing this characterization, in measuring the scale of the man, that Dempsey does put a foot wrong. Perhaps because of the family sources, Big Bear is made to appear large at the expense of others. This is, at times, unfair and illogical. For example, Plains Cree treaty signatories, such as Sweet Grass, are not wise leaders, who, at odds with Big Bear, see a road to the future paved by Canadian promises, but are Christians duped by their priests. What, therefore, is one to make of such non-Christian signatories as Half Blackfoot Chief or, further afield, Crowfoot? As well, all of this is somehow beside the point. In the end the fate of all the people, signatories and non-signatories alike, was the same—dispossession and powerlessness.

Despite the foregoing reservations, Dempsey's book is one of first rate scholarship and is, for the period and the leader studied, unrivalled in its usefulness. The whole period from 1860 to 1890 is in great need of revision. Dempsey has made a fine start.

J. S. Milloy
Trent University

The Plains Indians of the Twentieth Century. Edited with an introduction by Peter Iverson. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1985. 277 pp. \$21.95 Cloth. \$9.95 Paper.

In 1974 Vine Deloria, Jr. challenged historians to study in greater detail Indian life of the twentieth century. Too much attention had been paid to Indians as supporting actors in the conquest of the continent between the Lewis and Clark Expedition and Custer's Last Stand. Nine years later, in October 1983, Francis Paul Prucha, S.J., in his presidential address to the Western History Association, issued the same challenge, thereby indicating that only a few historians responded with dispatch to Deloria's earlier reproach. Fortunately, in the few years since Prucha's address, many more books on twentieth century Indian themes have reached the public. As this trend continues, Peter Iverson would add another, more subtle though no less important purpose to his latest contribution to American Indian history: to enhance an understanding of Indian history "as a continuing story. Above

all, it speaks to a basic reality: the Indian people of the Plains will always be here" (p. v).

Specialists may find fault either with Iverson's definition of the Plains or his failure to include—or exclude for that matter—certain tribes over others. These criticisms are inevitable given the moderate length of the book. What the editor hopes to accomplish, as he explains in his preface, is to offer readers a sampling of "the best work in the field of modern Indian history. . . ." (p. vi). That purpose is easily fulfilled when one considers that eight of eleven chapters have been previously published, three as chapters or parts of books, and five as articles. Of the three original contributions to this volume, one is a transcript of interviews conducted by Joseph Cash and Herbert T. Hoover as part of the Doris Duke projects.

Following Iverson's six-page introduction "They Shall Remain," which stresses that the Indian peoples of the Plains are an important, integral part of the region's past, present, and future, the anthology includes: "Adjusting to the Opening of the Kiowa, Comanche, and Kiowa-Apache Reservation," by William T. Hagan; "Legacies of the Dawes Act: Bureaucrats and Land Thieves at the Cheyenne-Arapaho Agencies of Oklahoma," by Donald J. Berthrong; "From Prison to Homeland: The Cheyenne River Reservation Before World War I," by Frederick E. Hoxie; "The *Winters* Decision and Indian Water Rights: A Mystery Re-examined," by Norris Hundley, Jr.; "The Indian New Deal and the Years that Followed: Three Interviews," conducted by Joseph H. Cash and Herbert T. Hoover; "Fighting a White Man's War: The Extent and Legacy of Indian Participation in World War II," by Tom Holm; "Federal Water Projects and Indian Lands: The Pick-Sloan Plan, a Case Study," by Michael L. Lawson; "What They Issue You': Political Economy at Wind River," by Loretta Fowler; "Tribal Leaders and the Demand for Natural Energy Resources on Reservation Lands," by Donald L. Fixico; "The Distinctive Status of Indian Rights," by Vine Deloria, Jr.; and "Power for New Days," by Peter J. Powell. Excluding the general introduction and the brief chapter introductions that, for the most part, place each chapter into the context of the period in question, only the chapters by Fixico and Deloria have been expressly written for this book.

Fixico's chapter on energy resource development and tribal lands, originally presented as a paper in 1979 at the Institute of

Indian Studies of the University of South Dakota, has been extensively revised and expanded to include Plains Indians with sources as recent as the Fall of 1983. Fixico argues persuasively that "today's Indian leaders are negotiating with white Americans and the federal government for tribal lands as their ancestors did more than 100 years ago," (p. 232) but that today's Indians now possess a more informed sense of the advantages and disadvantages of tribal energy development, especially when compared to lease agreements of tribal councils negotiated in the first two decades of this century. Although the effects of these negotiations are not readily discernable, and will not be for some time, the impression remains that social changes will not be at the expense of native identity.

Deloria's chapter on Indian rights, and more specifically the American Indian Religious Freedom Resolution (92 *U.S. Stat.* 469), seems, on the surface, to defy the organizational principle of Plains Indians in the twentieth century. Deloria, according to the editor, "addresses the continuing importance of religion in Plains Indian life within the larger framework of a careful analysis of the unique place of American Indians in this country" (p. 238). Most readers, however, may question the aptness of the chapter.

Deloria contends that the distinctive status of Indian rights originates in Indians' extraconstitutionality. The Bill of Rights, he explains, did not mention Indians, and their subsequent historic treatment by the federal government suggests that Indians were perceived as having no constitutional rights at all; or that until *United States ex. re. Standing Bear v. Crook* (25 Fed. Cas. 695, C. C. D. Neb. 1879), "Indians were not even perceived to be persons under the domestic law of the United States" (p. 242). He argues that, except for Congress' powers to regulate commerce "with Indian Tribes," and Indians "not taxed" are never to be counted for the purpose of apportioning taxes and representatives to the Congress among the states, Indians were never in the minds of the constitution's framers. Yet this argument has also been used on occasion for people other than Indians. Historians of immigration or slavery can point to the laws of the 1790s excluding Chinese from naturalization and the ruling of the Taney court in the 1850s regarding the status of blacks and the constitution to overthrow the argument. In a more personal vein, he concludes that in efforts to clarify and expand the

scope of Indian religious freedom, "we must ensure that it is seen in the full light of the history of the federal-Indian relationship" (p. 247). Deloria's chapter may spark additional effort at clarification.

With its two maps and sixteen photographs (two as recent as 1984), this book is a valuable addition to the literature. Its availability in paperback should make it attractive for adoption in college courses that examine contemporary Indian history. Aside from a few "documentary histories," there are no readers available that treat the twentieth century exclusively. *The Plains Indians of the Twentieth Century*, therefore, compares well with the long-lived anthologies of Richard N. Ellis, *The Western American Indian: Case Studies in Tribal History* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1972), and Roger L. Nichols, *The American Indian: Past and Present*, third ed. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1986), though these include readings whose subjects antedate the twentieth century and are more appropriate for the broad surveys in American Indian history.

Perhaps other scholars will follow Iverson's lead in bringing together recent scholarship of Indian life in the twentieth century, both on a regional and national basis.

L. G. Moses
Northern Arizona University

Tecumseh's Last Stand. By John Sugden. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1985. 298 pp. \$19.95 Cloth.

The scholarly interest in the famous Shawnee leader Tecumseh has been growing for several years. Older brother of the well-known shaman/prophet Tenskwatawa, Tecumseh rose to prominence in the shadow of his brother's religious movement. In response to the needs of his people for a strong and united military front against encroaching American settlers, Tecumseh organized a military-political alliance among the tribes of the Old North West and some southern peoples. The military power of this confederacy was interesting until the beginning of the War of 1812.

Thereafter, the Indian alliance supported the Anglo-Canadian