

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

From the Sands to the Mountain. By Pamela A. Bunte and Robert J. Franklin.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3n17k42f>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 12(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Stucki, Larry R.

Publication Date

1988-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

From the Sands to the Mountain. By Pamela A. Bunte and Robert J. Franklin. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. 1987. 339 pages. \$22.95 Cloth.

Few people know about and fewer still care about such small surviving Native American bands as the San Juan Paiutes described in this book. However, as most educated Americans clearly recognize, the very foundation of our democracy is in danger as long as we permit the continued violation of the legal rights of any small minority group. Caught up in the current Navajo—Hopi land dispute, the San Juan Paiutes are unfortunately numbered among the most neglected of all of these small minority groups since the satisfaction of their legal rights is often either directly or indirectly opposed by their infinitely more powerful minority group neighbors, the Navajos and, to a lesser extent, Hopis.

The authors of this book make a valiant attempt to overcome this inequality in political/economic power by thoroughly documenting the prior aboriginal claims that the San Juan Paiutes have to both land and water in this arid region although their case is much stronger in the Northern rather than Southern occupation area where both Hopi and Havasupai (but not Navajo) prior claims may be more valid.

The use of the word "tribe" to describe the small San Juan population, according to the authors, is not an attempt to be anthropologically "precise" but rather to "follow . . . a convention established in federal policy discourse" (p. xiii). However, it soon becomes obvious to the reader that the use of this term is also an attempt to partially overcome the enormous population disparity between this small remnant group and its surrounding huge neighbor, the Navajo Nation, as is also their continual effort to stress (ad nauseum at times) the cultural and political unity of the "tribe" through time and its "separate" cultural identity from its Navajo and Hopi neighbors. In particular, Navajo tribal members and their federal government supporters with but few exceptions are "the enemy" throughout the book not only for their wrongful attempts to seize Paiute land and water but also for their efforts to culturally and politically assimilate individual members of the San Juan Paiute tribe. Especially disturbing to the authors was the false identification of many Paiutes as Navajos on official Navajo tribal rolls.

While being sympathetic to the authors' obvious goal of providing ample documentation to support the effort of the San Juan Paiutes to obtain official federal recognition as a separate "tribe," this leads to the seemingly endless repetition of material to support the idea that in contrast to Julian Steward's notion that the environment and technological level of the Southern Paiutes "interacted to produce among Great Basin societies a mobile, fluid population that did not have strong ties to any social or political group larger than the family nor to any special land area" (page 7), the San Juan Paiutes have always had both strong intertribal leaders and strong attachments to specific land areas.

Much of the material in the book is excellent and with the proper editing to improve the order of presentation and to eliminate the redundancy which becomes almost unbearable in the last half of the book, this volume would be very valuable for classroom use but in its present very bloated, poorly organized form I doubt that the University of Nebraska Press will sell many copies. Other editing flaws include such things as the partially repeated sentence on the top of page 255 and the extremely confusing switching of figures 3 and 4 which are many pages apart in the book.

Most of the authors' research for the book seems fairly solid. However, they failed to discover the true identity of the "unknown" archaeologists who in "1964 or 1965" "began a series of excavation at several Anasazi sites in the Navajo Mountain area" (page 159) and the mysterious "Anglo man" who at this same time came from Cedar City to attend a meeting called by a Paiute leader to discuss what the archaeologists and their Navajo helpers were doing to the old homes and graves of "Paiute" people (pages 159-160). (A few phone calls could have cleared up both these mysteries.) And their coverage of the San Juan (Douglas Mesa) band that once lived in the Monument Valley region is surprisingly incomplete as is their coverage of the Mormon influence on the tribe which they should have especially seen in the name Lehi given to Pak'ai (and passed down to his many descendants) who had a vision whose content was remarkably parallel to that in the vision of the prophet Lehi in the *Book of Mormon*. Even more importantly, I was surprised by their disbelief in a 1907 government report that there was a lake situated between the San Juan and Colorado Rivers on the shores of which the Paiute Canyon Band of Indians had been staying (page 169). Had the authors read more about the early Mormon history

of the area they would have never made this mistake nor would they had they even bothered to investigate why on modern maps one of the Colorado River's side canyons in the indicated area is called Lake Canyon. This beautiful spring-fed lake must have surely been a major San Juan Paiute resource until its natural dam was washed out by torrential rains in the year 1915.

Even worse, though the authors give a few examples of occasional help given Paiutes by Navajo friends and some social interaction with Navajos, one of the biggest shortcomings of the book is the failure of the authors to explain why most of the San Juan Paiutes have in recent years joined pentecostal churches which are mostly led by Navajos and whose congregations are mostly Navajo (pages 225, 282-83) if the continuing general friction is as bad and the level of social/cultural separation as great between these two tribes as the book leads one to believe. This is especially puzzling since the authors continually stress how the difference in religious beliefs between the Paiutes and the Navajos is one of the key factors in explaining how they are able to continue to maintain a social/cultural identity that differs greatly from that characterizing the Navajos.

Theoretically, this is an important book in showing how very broad "incest" (i.e., marriage) prohibitions can create extremely cohesive social groups. However, even though the authors comment that it is becoming increasingly difficult for a San Juan Paiute to find an unrelated tribal marriage partner, they fail to suggest that the fairly large percentage of individuals remaining unmarried or not remarrying after the death of a spouse may be at least a partial reason why the San Juan Paiutes are losing the demographic race to the Navajo tribe. Also, the attempt to increase their power base by seeking to establish kinship ties, no matter how distant, not only within the tribe but also to members of other Southern Paiute tribes insures that the present very large percentage of marriages to outsiders (page 246) will continue to increase thus further threatening the cultural isolation and separate group identity that the present group leaders are trying so hard to maintain. All too soon they will be facing many of the same problems that confront other tribes (e.g., the Eastern Cherokees) with large numbers of "mixed-bloods."

The authors also contribute both directly as well as indirectly much to the understanding of how Southern Paiute leadership roles have evolved through time in response to changing outside

environmental pressures even though they tend to overinflate the power of the early so-called "tribal" leaders. In particular, the story of the would-be "leader" who fails on page 86 is as useful as their many examples of leaders who succeed. However, I was extremely disappointed that the authors saw fit to leave unfinished their most detailed dispute settlement story (pages 266-67) and I was left to wonder if the actual outcome would have weakened their overall case concerning the effectiveness of the recent leaders in resolving disputes. Thus, it may appear admirable to retain a decision making system where "a decision is considered to be made only when the adult membership have expressed their unanimous consent" (page 271) but there is an inherent evolutionary weakness in a system where "the matter" is "simply put . . . aside until a later time" "if dissent remains" (pages 271-72). This is, I suspect, the possible reason why the story on page 266-67 never revealed the decision that was supposedly made but instead ended by saying that "although the [original land use permit holder] later returned to Navajo Mountain and began farming his mother's field again, this case illustrates the chief elder's role as an informal mediator in dispute settlement (page 267). And this too may also help explain the growing power differential between the San Juan Paiutes and their more successful (at least in a political/economic sense) neighbors.

Larry R. Stucki
Brigham Young University

Talking with the Clay. By Stephen Trimble. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press. 116 pages. \$14.95 Paper.

This book contains six chapters and begins with an introduction to the Pueblos and ends with a conclusion on economics and the pottery tradition.

A number of books have been written on Pueblo pottery and individual Pueblo potters. The sub-title of Trimble's book leads the would-be reader to think that a writer's perception of Pueblo pottery might be the subject of this writing. Trimble, however, completed an unusual survey of every Pueblo's pottery status at the time of his research. Trimble's data gathering was an unusual