

# UCSF

## UC San Francisco Previously Published Works

### Title

Chocolate Milk in Schools

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3q88199h>

### Journal

Pediatrics, 136(6)

### ISSN

0031-4005

### Authors

Dooley, Diane  
Patel, Anisha  
Schmidt, Laura A

### Publication Date

2015-12-01

### DOI

10.1542/peds.2015-3202a

Peer reviewed

## Chocolate Milk in Schools

As pediatricians and professors dedicated to the prevention of childhood obesity, we were disappointed by the March 2015 American Academy of Pediatrics' Policy Statement on "Snacks, Sweetened Beverages, Added Sugars, and Schools."<sup>1</sup> The American Academy of Pediatrics' Committee on Nutrition and Council on School Health endorsed this statement, which seems to accept the trend that 70% of milk consumed in schools is "flavored" and minimizes the detrimental health effects of flavored milk because children consume "nutrient-rich nonfat milk" with added sugar and chocolate.

The committees' endorsement of adding sugar to the milk of millions of schoolchildren conflicts with the majority of leading health organizations' recommendations, such as the American Heart Association, which recommends that children consume only 3 to 4 teaspoons of added sugar per day.<sup>2</sup> If a child drinks a single 8-oz carton of flavored milk at school, he or she will consume the recommended daily amount of added sugar in 1 sitting. Interestingly, this endorsement also contradicts the Committee on Nutrition's own 2011 clinical report on sports drinks and energy drinks, which stated, "In general, there is little need for carbohydrate-containing beverages other than the recommended daily intake of fruit juice and low-fat milk."<sup>3</sup> The authors of the recent policy statement cite references which report that "flavored milk [*sic*] consumption is not associated with weight gain or even a higher total daily sugar intake in children." However, the cited studies stand in conflict with a large body of evidence showing that avoidance of sugar-sweetened beverages is a major strategy for the prevention of childhood obesity.<sup>4</sup>

In their endorsement of flavored milk offerings in schools, the authors should

have noted the limitations of the studies cited in the policy statement.<sup>1</sup> The study citing flavored milk's lack of an adverse impact on weight had relatively low rates of flavored milk consumption, and it calculated whether the mean BMI was changed, rather than rates of obesity.<sup>5</sup> The studies citing increased "milk wastage" were limited in that they were quasi-experimental, had short follow-up periods, and did not comprehensively assess the impact that removal of flavored milk in schools would have on students' daily nutrient and caloric intake.

As pediatricians, we have the trust of the public and the obligation to "primum, non nocere" (first, do no harm). It seems important that an endorsement of sugar-flavored milk in schools, an admittedly "controversial" issue according to the authors,<sup>1</sup> should reflect a sound body of evidence. The evidence shows that sugar-sweetened beverages are a major source of excessive sugar intake for children and that excessive energy and sugar consumption can lead to obesity and dental caries. In light of these findings, we encourage these committees to critically review their statement and reconsider how flavored milk offerings in schools may affect children's health and well-being.

Diane Dooley, MD, MHS  
*Pediatrician, Contra Costa Health Services,  
Associate Clinical Professor, Department of  
Family & Community Medicine, University of  
California, San Francisco, Past School Board  
Trustee, Benicia Unified School District*  
E-mail: 4dianedooley@gmail.com

Anisha Patel, MD, MSPH, MSHS  
*Assistant Professor, Division of General  
Pediatrics, Philip R. Lee Institute for Health Policy  
Studies, University of California, San Francisco*

Laura A. Schmidt, PhD, MSW, MPH  
*Professor, Philip R. Lee Institute for Health Policy  
Studies and Department of Anthropology, History  
and Social Medicine Co-Director, Community  
Engagement and Health Policy Program, Clinical  
and Translational Science Institute*

**Conflict of Interest:**  
None declared.

## REFERENCES

1. Council on School Health; Committee on Nutrition. Snacks, sweetened beverages, added sugars, and schools. *Pediatrics*. 2015;135(3):575–583
2. Johnson RK, Appel LJ, Brands M, et al; American Heart Association Nutrition Committee of the Council on Nutrition, Physical Activity, and Metabolism and the Council on Epidemiology and Prevention. Dietary sugars intake and cardiovascular health: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2009;120(11):1011–1020
3. Committee on Nutrition and the Council on Sports Medicine and Fitness. Sports drinks and energy drinks for children and adolescents: are they appropriate? *Pediatrics*. 2011;127(6):1182–1189
4. Te Morenga L, Mallard S, Mann J. Dietary sugars and body weight: systematic review and meta-analyses of randomised controlled trials and cohort studies. *BMJ*. 2013;346:e7492
5. Murphy MM, Douglass JS, Johnson RK, Spence LA. Drinking flavored or plain milk is positively associated with nutrient intake and is not associated with adverse effects on weight status in US children and adolescents. *J Am Diet Assoc*. 2008;108(4):631–639

doi:10.1542/peds.2015-3202A

## Authors' Response

### Reply to: Chocolate Milk in Schools

The nutrition community offers 2 different approaches to better health through dietary change: first, eliminate "bad nutrients"; and second, build a strong dietary pattern. These approaches seem complementary but in practice are often adversarial. The comments by Drs Dooley, Patel, and Schmidt illustrate the problem.<sup>1</sup>

Children consume excess "empty" calories from added sugars that must be curtailed. More than 70% of these calories come from candy, soft drinks, fruit drinks, and grain deserts, which are all excellent targets. But when we urge total prohibition, regardless of the consequences on a child's total diet, we then do harm.

## Chocolate Milk in Schools

Diane Dooley, Anisha Patel and Laura A. Schmidt

*Pediatrics* 2015;136:e1680

DOI: 10.1542/peds.2015-3202A

<b>Updated Information &amp; Services</b>	including high resolution figures, can be found at: <a href="/content/136/6/e1680.1.full.html">/content/136/6/e1680.1.full.html</a>
<b>References</b>	This article cites 5 articles, 3 of which can be accessed free at: <a href="/content/136/6/e1680.1.full.html#ref-list-1">/content/136/6/e1680.1.full.html#ref-list-1</a>
<b>Subspecialty Collections</b>	This article, along with others on similar topics, appears in the following collection(s): <b>Administration/Practice Management</b> <a href="/cgi/collection/administration:practice_management_sub">/cgi/collection/administration:practice_management_sub</a>
<b>Permissions &amp; Licensing</b>	Information about reproducing this article in parts (figures, tables) or in its entirety can be found online at: <a href="/site/misc/Permissions.xhtml">/site/misc/Permissions.xhtml</a>
<b>Reprints</b>	Information about ordering reprints can be found online: <a href="/site/misc/reprints.xhtml">/site/misc/reprints.xhtml</a>

PEDIATRICS is the official journal of the American Academy of Pediatrics. A monthly publication, it has been published continuously since 1948. PEDIATRICS is owned, published, and trademarked by the American Academy of Pediatrics, 141 Northwest Point Boulevard, Elk Grove Village, Illinois, 60007. Copyright © 2015 by the American Academy of Pediatrics. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 0031-4005. Online ISSN: 1098-4275.

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN™



# PEDIATRICS®

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF PEDIATRICS

## **Chocolate Milk in Schools**

Diane Dooley, Anisha Patel and Laura A. Schmidt

*Pediatrics* 2015;136:e1680

DOI: 10.1542/peds.2015-3202A

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:

</content/136/6/e1680.1.full.html>

PEDIATRICS is the official journal of the American Academy of Pediatrics. A monthly publication, it has been published continuously since 1948. PEDIATRICS is owned, published, and trademarked by the American Academy of Pediatrics, 141 Northwest Point Boulevard, Elk Grove Village, Illinois, 60007. Copyright © 2015 by the American Academy of Pediatrics. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 0031-4005. Online ISSN: 1098-4275.

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN™

