

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Sagebrush Soldier: Private William Earl Smith's View of the Sioux War of 1876. By Sherry L. Smith.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/38x2q9xn>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 14(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Price, Catherine

**Publication Date**

1990-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

value as a woman. Casse further develops this theme in her analysis of Iroquois moccasins. For the Iroquois, moccasins are rich in symbolic meaning, being incorporated into the tribal myths and burial rites.

Thompson does not relate the footwear she describes to tribal symbolism; she clearly states that her intent is to describe the material artifacts and to leave the task of analysis of the material culture to others. Thus, she has laid the groundwork for many future researchers to develop themes such as the sexual division of labor in Athapascan tribes and to explore the role of women as reflected in the construction of moccasins.

McCracken (*Culture and Consumption*, 1988) has explicated the process of transfer of symbolic meaning from the culture to the consumer goods to the individual consumer, for modern fashion goods. A similar, broader analysis of tribal culture in relation to Athapascan footwear may be a fruitful area of further research. Comparison of the meanings of these artifacts for tribal members, collectors, and Anglo consumers might also be explored. Oral histories and long interviews might be used to supplement the material presented by Thompson to shed light on these symbolic meanings. Hamilton (*Clothing and Textiles Research Journal*, 1987) also has presented a theoretical framework that suggests further avenues of research on these items of apparel. Left untouched for future students are the relations of these moccasins and boots to the economic, political, kinship, ideological, aesthetic, socialization, and communications structures of the groups who produce and/or use these products. In describing these museum artifacts so well, Thompson has left a goldmine of opportunities for other scholars.

*Carolyn Balkwell*  
San Diego State University

**Sagebrush Soldier: Private William Earl Smith's View of the Sioux War of 1876.** By Sherry L. Smith. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1989. 176 pages \$18.95 Cloth.

While conducting research at the Wyoming State Historic Preservation Office, Sherry L. Smith discovered that her great-grandfather, Private William Earl Smith, Company E, Fourth United

States Cavalry, had participated in the Powder River expedition. Born around 1853 in Peoria, Illinois, Smith had toiled for the local railroad before enlisting, in February 1876, for a five-year tour in the United States Army. Barely nine months later, on November 25, Smith would see action against Morning Star's Northern Cheyennes. Fascinated by the diary her ancestor had kept faithfully, and aware that it served as a rare example of the enlisted man's perspective, Sherry L. Smith obtained family consent to edit and publish it.

Utilizing her great-grandfather's journal and the writings of other men—mostly officers commanding the expedition—the author has garnered multicultural and multisided perspectives in her attempt to create a more balanced account of one campaign of the 1876 Sioux War. White soldiers marched against those bands of Northern Cheyennes and Lakotas who preferred to reject reservation status; but performing vital reconnaissance duties for these troops were over five hundred Lakota, Pawnee, Shoshone, and Southern Cheyenne scouts who, for a myriad of reasons, chose to side with the United States Army. In addition, *Sagebrush Soldier* explores the often turbulent relationships among enlisted men and their superiors, and among officers themselves. Finally, Smith argues that the Powder River expedition, the setting of this book, is as much a part of Indian history as it is of military history.

Several themes emerge: Private Smith's preoccupation with his survival, the hardships of life on the march—such as the intense cold of the northern Plains—ration shortages, venereal disease, diarrhea, alcoholism, physical and verbal abuse, as well as long bouts of depression and boredom, punctuated by fleeting moments of chaotic combat. Private Smith's realistic, sometimes comic, descriptions of daily life in a frontier unit offer stark contrasts to the published and unpublished accounts by famous military men, such as Brigadier General George Crook, Lieutenant Colonel Richard Irving Dodge, and Lieutenant John G. Bourke, whose flowery, dramatic prose styles, the author notes, have long served to conjure images of "heroic cavalymen" conquering the West. The following journal excerpts will illustrate. Private Smith's company arranged a funeral for five enlisted men killed in the November battle with the Northern Cheyennes. Lieutenant Bourke, Crook's aide-de-camp during the expedition, later recalled the funeral procession moving "with measured

tread to the place of sepulture" where "our heroes were left to sleep their last sleep undisturbed" (p. 101). Private Smith, who had drawn duty as pallbearer, remembered the sad event somewhat differently. "It was the hardest looking funeral I was ever at," he wrote. "Well, we goot done and went back. . . . The way they berrey in this cuntry they take and sow a man up in a Blanket and dont have no coffin" (p. 102).

Sherry Smith has captured beautifully the dynamic between the enlisted man and his superiors. Mutual hostility and resentment often were evident among soldiers of different ranks, undoubtedly exacerbated by physical and emotional stress and the uncertainty of their mission. Officers frequently bemoaned their subordinates' lack of respect. Lieutenant Colonel Dodge remarked that his orderly had no concept of military etiquette; the orderly refused to address him as "sir." Some enlisted men remained loyal to their officers, but many held deep grudges against them. A surprisingly large number of troopers deserted, including Private Smith himself.

Enlisted men were well aware of the army's caste system. During the November fight, Private Smith scribbled in his diary that someone had mentioned that an officer had just fallen, "but not a word of lots of privits that I could se laying around ded" (p. 73). Officers' corpses were transported east for full military burial, but those of enlisted men were interred in the field.

*Sagebrush Soldier* also highlights the tensions among the officers. Dodge grumbled that Crook's military strategy left much to be desired, and complained that the brigadier general's Indian scouts received better treatment than his own officers. As for Captain Edwin Pollock, garrison commander at Cantonment Reno, he was, in Dodge's opinion, "the most conceited ass that ever existed" (p. 51).

This reviewer admires Sherry Smith's desire to juxtapose the experiences and perspectives of Morning Star's people with those of the white soldiers and Indian scouts enlisted to hound them. Although ambitious, however, the author's methodology has its limitations. If the perspectives of Private Smith and his contemporaries are sharply focused, those of the Native Americans in the story are blurred. Private Smith rarely mentions his Native American "enemies" or "allies." Indeed, one could hardly expect such insights from a man raised in the Midwest and fresh from basic training in Texas.

For glimpses of Northern Cheyenne views the author turns almost exclusively to Peter J. Powell's excellent two-volume work, *People of the Sacred Mountain* (Harper and Row, 1981). Admittedly, it is very difficult to obtain information about Indian motives and perspectives from this era, especially for the native people the government deemed "hostile." Perhaps Sherry Smith could have gleaned more information from the extensive records of the Office of Indian Affairs, which she barely utilized. The voices of the Indian scouts are stronger, however, thanks largely to the observations of Lieutenant Bourke, a keen amateur ethnographer who recorded councils with Crook's Indian auxiliaries. Although their words have come to us through interpreters, as Smith herself notes, the reader does gain some insights into the motives of these scouts.

Smith's bibliography and footnotes are most helpful. The former lists the published and unpublished accounts of other soldiers—both enlisted men and officers—who fought with Private Smith. The footnotes present concise biographical information on individuals mentioned throughout Private Smith's diary. Although more rooted in military history than in Indian history, *Sagebrush Soldier* is an entertaining and valuable work that has wide appeal.

Catherine Price  
St. Norbert College

**To Fish in Common: The Ethnohistory of Lummi Indian Salmon Fishing.** By Daniel L. Boxberger. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989. 212 pages. \$26.50 Cloth.

When most people think of Northwest Coast Indians, they think of totem poles and masks and those stylized paintings of whales and eagles. But how much do people know about the day-to-day economic and subsistence activities of contemporary Northwest Coast Indians? There is a serious lack of information about the modern ways of life of Indian tribes in the northwestern United States, in both the coastal and interior regions. *To Fish in Common*, by Daniel L. Boxberger, is a very welcome addition to the sparse literature pertaining to today's Native American issues in this part of the country.