

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Coacoochee's Bones: A Seminole Saga. By Susan A. Miller.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3869b7gf>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 28(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Chaudhuri, Joyotpaul

Publication Date

2004-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

populated by hostile whites. Not surprisingly, perhaps, many whites still held the idea that removal was the most viable Indian policy for California. Since transporting Indians to Indian Territory was impractical, Phillips notes that the editor of a San Francisco newspaper called for the US government to purchase Baja California for use as an Indian reservation.

Not unexpectedly, though, as Phillips argues, despite the difficulties they faced, Indian peoples of this region were adept at accommodating white culture. Indians were already familiar with European agricultural practices, and they were successful at individual subsistence farming, as were the Mission groups in southern California. Still, some Indians served as vaqueros and ranch hands while others relocated to Bakersfield or eventually to the Tule River Reservation.

Although it contains little ethnographic material, the book's merits are clear, as it provides a detailed account of how California's first reservations were established and how they ultimately declined in the southern San Joaquin Valley. Moreover, the author demonstrates clearly how California's Indian policy acted as a test case for a new federal program implemented throughout the American West, one that focused more on the sequestration of Native peoples on reserved lands closer to their traditional lands than on outright removal. The book contains an excellent array of maps, tables, and illustrations and is essential reading for any serious student of US federal Indian policy in the West. Together with its two predecessors, it will likely remain the most comprehensive study of Indian-white relations in California's Great Central Valley for some time to come.

Steven M. Karr

Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County

Coacoochee's Bones: A Seminole Saga. By Susan A. Miller. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2003. 284 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

A great deal of hard, extensive, and relevant archival research went into Susan Miller's important and interesting book, *Coacoochee's Bones: A Seminole Saga*. The book should be in the library of anyone seriously interested in American Indian history, especially that of the Seminoles and Creeks, and in the biographies of American Indian leaders.

Professor Miller's work joins the rising tide of literature on tribal history and culture written by tribal people themselves, providing a counterbalance to the earlier, more colonialist points of view of some established scholars whose works lack the authenticity of the voices of tribal people. I will provide context for Miller's book in the literature, addressing why and where it is important.

The sad but perhaps inevitable encounter of European and American Indian civilizations brought about many serious changes in tribal life, with many of those changes occurring in a destructive way. The changes often included the widespread scattering, dispersal, and displacement of Natives

from sacred lands by force, as well as through economic and cultural pressures. The Muscogees and Seminoles are good examples of this wide and sustained diaspora that has existed since the coming of the Spaniards, British, and Americans to southeastern United States and on to contemporary times, where almost one-third of Muscogee people today live in California.

Oral history records the early flight of some Creeks and Seminoles to Cuba and their assimilation, relative invisibility, or disappearance. History also records an entire period of Natives' conflict with settlers, the states, and the federal government in the complicated details of Indian removals by land and water; the challenges of statehood; economic depressions and hardships; assaults on values and psyches; attempts at termination; relocation; and urban migration. The written histories do not give a complete account of the tribal reactions of the Muscogees and the Seminoles.

The Seminole world was composed of complex aggregations of Upper and Lower Creeks and Miccosukees, Appalichicolas, and several other peoples indigenous to Florida. The remnants of the Florida group that fought on valiantly in the Florida swamps provided the core of the eastern group—the regenerated Florida Seminoles. The same was true for the Miccosukee survival near the Tamiami Trail. The forced removal of Natives from Florida to Oklahoma by land and sea provided the foundations of the Seminole tribe of Oklahoma, which included some Miccosukees. Scattered remnants are also found in different stages of acculturation in Texas and elsewhere.

In the struggle for survival, Mexico attracted some Muscogees, Seminoles, and Kickapoos. Some Muscogees believe the Muscogee rebel hero Chitto Harjo ended up in Mexico after his battles in Oklahoma over the loss of tribal lands and tribal sovereignty. A significant portion of the Tohono O'odhams found their lands divided between Mexico and the United States by the boundaries drawn by the Gadsden Purchase. Boundary drawing, which commonly ignores the sacred space of various peoples, has been a product of colonialism in different parts of the world, and many are still paying for the conflicts arising out of that arbitrariness in Asia, the Middle East, and the Americas.

Susan Miller's major work casts an important light on the little-known flight of a band of Seminoles and some allies to Mexico under the leadership of Coacoochee, also known as Wildcat. Although he is discussed in Seminole history in the literature, Miller's book is likely to be the definitive work on Coacoochee and his followers in their long journey from Florida to Oklahoma and then to Mexico where he negotiated for land rights. The Mexican borderlands invoked controversy involving several tribes at one time or another over possessory land and other rights, including trade and travel.

Miller undertook a difficult challenge in trying to weave and combine several different tasks, including providing insight into Coacoochee as a person, giving a narrative of the journey from Florida to Mexico, and substituting a Native voice for the not uncommon colonialist points of view. Of these tasks, the narrative of the band and the elaborate combing of Mexican and US sources are impressive. Given the problem of oral history sources, Coacoochee's character emerges as intriguing but less complete than one might wish, although the glimpses of the real man are fascinating.

The too brief but intense critique of establishment colonialist history and its methods and prejudices has both strengths and weaknesses. It is not necessary to begrudge Asin Yahola's (spelled as Assi Yahola or Osceola) legitimate and heroic work for his nation to highlight Coacoochee's role or to repeat the prejudiced colonialist claims that Assi Yahola was a mixed blood. Miller also overgeneralizes at times about elite families and clans and hereditary succession among Muscogee and Seminole leaders, although she balances this with comments to the effect that succession was not always hereditary. Some historians and anthropologists immersed in their own culture tend to overreify castelike elitism and clan and social hierarchy among tribal peoples, and they miss the balancing, the consensual elements in decision making among Muscogeese and Seminoles. Tribal groups had their own dynamics and politics rather than being simply status bound. To be fair, Miller does point out at times that Assi Yahola's authority came from his achievements rather than from biology.

Miller at times overgeneralizes about Muscogee behavior. The Muscogeese or Creeks had their own internal problems as a result of the coming of the Europeans in their midst, with the latter's vigorous orientation to the acquisition of private property. Creek groups often exhibited different attitudes and behaviors. Hence Coacoochee's alienation or distance from Muscogeese in the Fort Gibson area is likely to have been from Muscogeese in a particular area rather than from Muscogeese in general. Parts of the book may create that impression. But the pursuit of the main theme of Coacoochee's interesting and challenging journey makes this book an important addition to the literature.

The book is arranged fairly chronologically except for the first two chapters, which include commentary on the author's point of view and on aspects of Seminole culture. There are informative endnotes and a bibliography.

Without any intent of providing an alternative bibliography, some reference points may assist readers not familiar with the general subject area. John Mahon's *History of the Second Seminole War* is a standard reference work on that war. The late Jean Chaudhuri's Indian voice on Muscogee values is found in a book I coauthored, *A Sacred Path—The Way of the Muscogee Creeks*. Her work included considerable oral history fieldwork among Muscogeese and Seminoles. The late Willie Lena cowrote a book with James Howard entitled *Oklahoma Seminoles, Magic and Religion*. Many of Vine Deloria's works offer critiques of standard approaches to the study of American Indian worlds. A key one is *Red Earth, White Lies*. Grant Foreman's *Indian Removal* is also a standard work on the removal of Southeastern Indians to Oklahoma.

Susan Miller's book should be of interest to several different audiences, including people interested in Seminoles, Muscogeese, and Southeastern Indians, Indian studies, and possibly border studies.

Joyotpaul Chaudhuri

Arizona State University, emeritus