

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Converting the West:A Biography of Narcissa Whitman. By Julie Roy Jeffrey.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/37k0c32x>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 16(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bannan, Helen M.

Publication Date

1992-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

language of a former time that could matter-of-factly report an army attack on Indian families while deploring an Indian attack on white families.

In *Campaigning with King*, Russell, who knew the Indian wars thoroughly, passes over this phase of King's service in quick order. His best chapters deal with army routine and the war in the Philippines. He also does an expert job in discussing King's fiction. He is as admirably concise as King was occasionally prolix, his journalistic training preparing him to rapidly sketch in the historical and fictional backgrounds necessary for understanding. King published 250 short stories and fifty-two novels between 1883 and 1909, and Russell is especially adept at correlating certain plots with actual incidents in King's career. His judgment about King's contribution to literature (negligible) and history (considerable) still stands, as books like Oliver Knight's *Life and Manners in the Frontier Army* (1978), which rests on King's novels, attest.

Paul Hedren, a leader among the new generation of historians of the Indian wars, is responsible for reviving Russell's long-dormant manuscript and seeing it into print. Superintendent of the Fort Union Trading Post outside Williston, North Dakota, and possessor of a King collection nonpareil, Hedren has written an informative introduction that places the biography, its subject, and its author in perspective. His bibliographical essay is also useful, as is the concise listing of King's books. Hedren's appreciation of the contribution made by Don Russell, like Russell's of King's, continues an old and honorable tradition in the writing of American frontier military history.

Brian W. Dippie

University of Victoria, British Columbia

Converting the West: A Biography of Narcissa Whitman. By Julie Roy Jeffrey. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991. 238 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

Biography is a challenging genre. After years of research, one's subject becomes, as Julie Roy Jeffrey states in her preface, "a near family member" (p. xvii). Empathy seems essential to creating a humane account of any individual, yet critical distance is required to place the subject's life in perspective, to understand her in her appropriate context, and to elucidate the meaning of her life for

contemporary readers.

Writing a missionary's life must be a particularly complex task in today's secular and culturally sensitive environment. While earlier generations of biographers of missionaries have verged on hagiography, lauding the saintly self-sacrifice and pious dedication of their subjects, postcolonial writers have sometimes portrayed them as repulsively self-righteous emissaries of imperialism, irredeemably ethnocentric, however well-intentioned.

In *Converting the West: A Biography of Narcissa Whitman*, Jeffrey has avoided both extremes; she has succeeded in her intention to have Narcissa Whitman emerge "as less heroic than the nineteenth century believed her to be but as more human and understandable" (p. xv-xvi). Narcissa and her husband Marcus, among the first Protestant missionaries to the Indians of the Northwest, were conspicuous failures at their chosen work. Their eleven years among the Cayuse produced not a single convert and ended in 1847 with their murders by those they sought to save. The bloody conclusion to her story ensured Narcissa's reputation as a martyr to the cause—a cause that, Jeffrey emphasizes, she had largely abandoned years before her death as hopelessly unsuited to her talents and interests.

Narcissa's decision to become a missionary was strongly influenced by her desire to please her pious mother; Narcissa saw herself as Isaac to her mother's Abraham, a child sacrificed to the Lord. Jeffrey notes that, while Narcissa was highly skilled in doing evangelical work among her own people in upstate New York, she had no prior experience with diverse cultures and little sympathy for those who differed from herself. In her romantic idealization of a missionary's exalted life, Narcissa overlooked this personal failing, which was apparent in her rejection of an offer of marriage from a missionary who seemed beneath her station. Dr. Marcus Whitman's search for a wife to accompany him as medical missionary to Oregon was more welcome to Narcissa, and they married in 1836, shortly before Narcissa's twenty-eighth birthday. The day after the wedding, they left for the West.

Jeffrey reads between the lines of Narcissa's diary and letters, written with an eye toward their evangelical audience, to reconstruct her subject's difficult adjustment to mission life. Jeffrey emphasizes Narcissa's contentious relationships with the other missionary couples in the area, her quick negative judgment of the Cayuse, her reluctance to visit Indian homes, and her dependence on, and resentment of, her husband, who often left her alone to

tend to the sick or consult with superiors.

Narcissa's loneliness, intensified by the two years it took mail from home to reach her, was eased somewhat with the birth of her daughter. The Cayuse were very interested in the child, who could have served as a link between the Whitmans and the Indians—except that Narcissa feared the influence of Indian culture and tried to isolate Alice from her native neighbors. When the child drowned at the age of two, Narcissa was devastated by grief “beyond the bounds of what the nineteenth century considered acceptable,” because, Jeffrey argues, she “was responding to the loss of both her beloved child and her illusions about missionary work” (pp. 146–47). Jeffrey takes at face value Narcissa's letter to her mother, refusing to blame herself for carelessly causing Alice's death. I would speculate that Narcissa did blame herself but could not express any culpability in writing, particularly to her mother, whose approval she always craved. However, I agree that the deep depression and series of illnesses Narcissa suffered subsequently were ways of dealing with guilt, whether denied or secretly admitted. Narcissa finally resolved this crisis in true evangelical fashion, with a conversion experience far more powerful than her early adolescent one, during which she accepted her sinfulness and appealed to God's mercy.

After that, she worked out a compromise between her original goals and her limitations. Rejecting the missionary role she felt “entirely unfitted for,” she remained at her post but withdrew from contact with the Cayuse, focusing instead on traditional domesticity. She created a family by adopting three mixed-blood children and seven orphaned Anglo brothers and sisters, and worked to build a sense of community among Anglo migrants whose presence she welcomed as much as she feared the Indians, who grew increasingly hostile. The Cayuse interpreted Marcus's doctoring as witchcraft, blaming the missionaries for a measles epidemic and for encouraging white encroachment on their homeland. These tensions erupted in violence in November 1847 in a well-planned Cayuse revenge attack on the mission; Marcus Whitman was the first casualty and Narcissa the only woman among twelve settlers killed. Forty-seven survivors were held hostage for a month until ransomed by a trader; the Cayuse exchanged raids with American forces for two years, until they finally turned over five tribesmen to the authorities to be hanged for the murders. One of these, Tilokaikt, interpreted his fate in the missionary's own terms, comparing his death to Christ's: “So die

we, to save our people.”

Jeffrey handles this whole episode extremely well, using ethnohistorical insight to explain Indian motivation and demonstrating restraint and balance in her descriptions of the event and its effects. The book ends with a confrontation with the key issue of cultural relativism—“Martyrdom depends on perspective”—noting that the Whitmans “were not martyrs but intruders” to the Cayuse, who, in a sense, were “the real martyrs,” eventually losing not only land and lives but tribal identity (p. 221). Throughout the book, Jeffrey keeps her focus on her subject, but provides sufficient ethnographic information about the Cayuse to help readers understand the cultural context of mission life.

I do not know of any other recent full-length biography of a woman missionary in North America; surely many others (for example, Mary C. Collins and Sue McBeth) merit this attention. Jeffrey’s book provides a clear case study, illustrating patterns delineated in several monographs in an important and growing new literature on missionary women worldwide: Jane Hunter’s *The Gospel of Gentility: Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China* (1984); Patricia R. Hill’s *The World Their Household: The American Woman’s Foreign Mission Movement and Cultural Transformation* (1985); Patricia Grimshaw’s *Paths of Duty: American Missionary Wives in Nineteenth-Century Hawaii* (1989) and Peggy Pascoe’s *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West* (1990). Narcissa Whitman provides a clear counterexample to Glenda Riley’s contention, in *Women and Indians on the Frontier, 1825–1915* (1984), that female settlers were likely to revise the stereotypical prejudices about Indians when they came to know Native Americans as people. I wish that Jeffrey had engaged more directly in this and other developing historiographical debates than she did in the sometimes cryptic comments in her appended essay on sources.

This brings me to my major problem with the book: It has no footnotes. Readers wishing to see the complete citations are referred to Cornell University, the Oregon Historical Society, and the Whitman College Library. While I realize that this represents a compromise with publishing costs, it is a solution I hope will not become standard practice. Historians enjoy seeing how an argument is constructed, vicariously experiencing the detective work of our trade by following the clues. Beyond that, other scholars, particularly budding ones, students interested in pursuing related research but lacking travel resources, will be unable to follow

specific leads. This mars my appreciation of an otherwise solid work of scholarship that enriches our understanding of how gender and personality affected the complexity of intercultural interactions in the nineteenth-century West.

Helen M. Bannan

Florida Atlantic University

Dawnland Encounters: Indians and Europeans in Northern New England. Edited by Colin G. Calloway. Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1991. 296 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

Dawnland Encounters recounts almost three centuries of contact between Abenaki people and Europeans through a long series of episodes, almost always instructive and often entertaining or surprising. Its settings are the relatively stable frontiers in Maine, New Hampshire, and Vermont, where Europeans were long content with tiny outposts and the natives were a locally powerful people who expected to be courted. Calloway's theme is that the relationships between English, French, and Abenaki, although they occasionally turned hostile, were normally marked by cooperation, accommodation, and intercultural borrowing. These processes could be exceedingly complicated, since the Indians needed to incorporate Europeans and their products into an indigenous social system, while the Europeans tried to enforce their own notions of how commercial partners and subordinate allies ought to behave. Despite having to bear a disproportionate share of the burdens of contact, the Indians learned to function in frontier society and helped to transform Englishmen and Frenchmen into Americans and Canadians.

The bulk of the text consists of excerpts from primary documents—letters, treaties, proclamations, narratives, and official reports—including a chance encounter between French and Indians that developed into a song contest, and a letter that some English hunters wrote with a pin on a piece of birch bark. The documents are organized into chapters dealing with first encounters, religion, diplomacy, war, commerce and coexistence, and captives and culture crossings. The editor has contributed informative introductions to the book as a whole and to each chapter and document, as well as notes and a comprehensive bibliogra-