

UCLA

UCLA Historical Journal

Title

Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages: Comparative Perspectives on Social and Cultural Formation. THOMAS CLICK.
Princeton, NJ:Princeton University Press, 1979. Pp. xi + 376.
Illustrations, notes, bibliographic essay, index. \$22.50

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/32t9t3gk>

Journal

UCLA Historical Journal, 2(0)

Author

Simon, Larry J.

Publication Date

1981

Copyright Information

Copyright 1981 by the author(s). All rights reserved unless otherwise indicated. Contact the author(s) for any necessary permissions. Learn more at <https://escholarship.org/terms>

Peer reviewed

ever, has forced Peters to edit to the point of discontinuity. The book runs the danger of falling between two extremes: either too short for research or too much for teaching. The fact that the book has no index hampers cross-sectional research so important to social history. It is difficult to find women or laborers, for example. Yet despite these limitations, Peters has assembled a good running bibliography, placed in historical context and studded with intriguing tidbits from the sources.

Jeffrey Artz
University of California, Los Angeles

Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages: Comparative Perspectives on Social and Cultural Formation. By THOMAS F. GLICK. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1979. Pp. xi + 376. Illustrations, notes, bibliographic essay, index. \$22.50.

In this work Glick applies a comparative method intended "to blur the profile projected by political peaks and valleys, and to stress phenomena which bespeak continuity between periods, and among different societies or cultures to identify and compare their basic components" (p. 194). After introductory remarks and a skeletal chapter devoted largely to the development of Islamic Spain from 711 to 1000, Glick systematically and brilliantly examines the growth of Christian and Islamic cultures, and their points of interaction. Successive sections treat agriculture and the "moving frontier," urbanization and trade and investment patterns, social structure, relations between ethnic groups, and structural stability. A somewhat truncated Part Two devotes itself to diffusion of technological discovery and scientific knowledge, concluding with a more general chapter on cultural change and exchange. Glick is not as concerned with documenting the fact of cultural borrowing as with the manner in which this borrowing qualitatively alters the recipient culture and also the ways in which specific elements are qualitatively altered by the very act of diffusion. The result is a masterful work of scholarship, one which might well justify what many have viewed as the overly optimistic future Marc Bloch projected for the comparative method in history in his well-known 1928 article, "Pour une Histoire Comparée des Sociétés Européennes" (presented at the Sixth International Congress of Historical Sciences held in Oslo in 1928).

Some of Glick's more striking theses include a social model of Islamic Spain comprising the dominant Arabs, Berbers, and a great mass of Neo-Muslims (Hispano-Roman converts) who occupied the lowest echelons of society, as well as a predominantly Islamic model for the establishment of Christian towns and villages. He also argues that medieval people perceived ethnicity largely in terms of religious affiliation, and that the tribal nature of Islamic Spain (described so well by Pierre Guichard) is not necessarily indicative of the political instability so often noted. Glick also draws numerous arguments from Richard W. Bulliet's hypothesis on the conversion process to Islam. Bulliet sees the rate as slow until the tenth century (only one-fourth of the eventual total having been converted), with the explosive period coinciding with the reign of 'Abd al-Rahman III (912-961), and the process being completed (eighty percent converted) by the year 1100. Although I have no basis upon which to quarrel with Bulliet, it seems noteworthy that Glick so readily accepts what was then an unpublished

thesis, and certainly one yet to have stood the test of scholarly criticism.

The one major drawback in the work is that the text spans only three hundred pages, and therefore neglects many topics deserving Glick's characteristically sure-handed scholarship. The Visigoths and the Jews, though frequently mentioned, do not receive the full treatment called for. In his section on the patterns of cultural diffusion, Glick neglects art, architecture, literature, and, more importantly, warfare. The methods and mechanisms of transmission in these areas certainly need to be established for a complete picture. Also missing, as indicated by the title, is any discussion of the high and later Middle Ages. Even if one accepts Glick's thesis that the formative periods in both Islamic and Christian Spain were the early centuries of the Middle Ages, the so-called *convivencia* of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries still play a key role. Perhaps Glick's next book will center here.

Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages is a magnificent work. Despite technical language and the imposing quality of frequent analysis of Castilian, Latin, and Arabic terms, it is straightforward and clear enough to be used in an upper-division undergraduate class. The fifty-seven pages of notes and bibliography, as well as suggestions for avenues of future research, suit it ideally for the graduate seminar. The book's legacy will not be pedagogical, however, but rather, the significant role it will most likely play in advancing Spanish historiography beyond the stagnating polemic of Claudio Sanchez-Albornoz and Americo Castro. In this alone, scholars of medieval Spain will remain enormously in debt to Professor Glick.

Larry J. Simon
University of California, Los Angeles

In Contempt of All Authority: Rural Artisans and Riot in the West of England, 1586-1660. By BUCHANAN SHARP. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980. Pp. xi + 292. Maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$17.50.

This is the first book-length study of rioting in seventeenth-century England. Its findings are of major significance for our understanding of both the history of popular disorder and the social structure of pre-industrial England. The most important characteristic of the rural disorders Sharp studies is that the participants were predominantly skilled artisans employed in the mining, ironmaking, and textile industries. In contrast to historians who assert that industrial labor in this period was commonly a "by-employment" of agrarian laborers or husbandmen farmers, Sharp argues that these artisans were in fact propertyless wage earners who together constituted a large proletariat almost entirely dependent on industrial prosperity for their income.

The book focuses on two types of disturbances, food riots and enclosure riots, which resulted from the marginal existence these workers experienced as an industrial labor force in a primarily agricultural society. Unlike previous work on the subject, Sharp emphasizes the role of industrial unemployment, as opposed to harvest failures and high grain prices, as the cause of the approximately forty food riots which occurred in East Anglia and the West between 1586 and 1631. He attributes the anti-enclosure riots, on