

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Kinsmen of Another Kind: Dakota-White Relations in the Upper Mississippi Valley, 1650-1862. By Gary Clayton Anderson.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2wr9g9t3>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 9(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Wozniak, John S.

Publication Date

1985

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

characterization, does require characters. To engage the reader, the story must be more than an outline.

Still, the book will find an important use in classes looking for creative material to read in Cherokee. It is a unique book, and I hope that Conley will continue to develop his skill so that such excellent material will have a medium to match.

James Ruppert

University of New Mexico-Gallup

Kinsmen of Another Kind: Dakota-White Relations in the Upper Mississippi Valley, 1650-1862. By Gary Clayton Anderson. Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press, 1984. 383 pp. \$25.00 Cloth.

This is a twelve-chapter synthesis of frontier Minnesota and Eastern Dakota Indian history. Development within and between the twelve chapters is both topical and chronological. The author employs the time frames generally utilized by other historians and anthropologists when dealing with this subject matter: (1) The Sioux and Their Ecosystem, 1650-1700; (2) Population Decline in the Woodlands; (3) Breaking the Algonquin Monopoly, 1670-1760; (4) Traders and the Evolution of Kinship Bonds, 1760-1800; (5) Conflicting Loyalties, 1805-20; (6) Intertwining Loyalties; (7) The Origins of Government Paternalism, 1827-36; (8) Culture Change and the Assault on Land Tenure; (9) The Treaties of 1851; (10) The Failures of Early Reservation Development, 1853-57; (11) The Dissolution of Kinship and Reciprocity Bonds; (12) Epilogue: The Upheaval, August-December, 1862.

The notes and the bibliography are excellent and extensive. Anyone desiring more information on the topics discussed can easily find the needed primary and secondary sources. Purists will note only two omissions: *The Scanlon Papers* and Father Paul Zylla's biography of Taliaferro (*Major Lawrence Taliaferro, Indian Agent in Minnesota, 1819-1839*, Catholic University of America). Individuals interested in pursuing the topics Anderson covers would be well-served by the following published accounts: S.W. Pond (1908), "The Dakotas or Sioux in Minnesota as They Were in 1834, *Collections of the Minnesota Historical Society*; Ruth Landes

(1968), *The Mystic Lake Sioux: Sociology of the Mdewakantonwan Santee*; Roy W. Meyer (1967), *History of the Santee Sioux: United States Indian Policy on Trial*; John S. Wozniak (1978), *Contact, Negotiation, and Conflict: an Ethnohistory of the Eastern Dakota, 1819-1839*.

Kinsmen is a work that will provoke heated discussions among and between historians and anthropologists. Historians will chide Anderson for his occasional, uncritical use of historical documents—for example, the use of Jonathan Carver's *Travels* in chapter 4. Moreover, one has to view the Taliaferro manuscripts (utilized extensively in chapters 5-8) with some skepticism, particularly after Theodore Blegen, the eminent student of Minnesota's cultural history, has noted that "the sum total of his [Taliaferro's] achievements as Indian agent was negligible" (Blegen, *Minnesota: A History of the State*, 1963:132). Indeed, when one recognizes that Taliaferro never learned the Eastern Dakotan dialect of Siouan, married an Eastern Dakota woman and then brought a white bride to Minnesota from the East, and frequently absented himself from agency work during the winter months, one has to re-evaluate Taliaferro's ability to chronicle and provide insightful commentary on Eastern Dakota history. One wishes that Anderson had elaborated on the following observation: "Perhaps Taliaferro's most telling fault was his vanity. His extensive journals are filled with pretentious comments on the importance of his role in the Indian service" (p. 100). The Taliaferro papers are an invaluable addition to the historical record, but they must be used carefully. Anderson's discussion of the Franquelin map (pp. 23-25) is crisp and insightful.

Anthropologists will wince at Anderson's apparent confusion of friendship and kinship (pp. 64-67, 75, 96, 119, 127, 195-200, 258, 261). Moreover, nowhere in *Kinsmen* does one find a detailed description of Eastern Dakota kinship, nor does one find the extensive genealogies of the white, Indian, and mixed families which are absolutely vital if one wishes to argue for the existence and subsequent dissolution of a functioning kinship network for much of the period under consideration. The application of the anthropological concept of "fictive kinship" (pp. 147-149, 210) to explain nineteenth century historical incidents is forced at best. For the period 1819-1839, the Saint Paul Archdiocesan Cathedral Records list baptismal and confirmation sponsors which would allow one to speculate on the possibility of a comparazado-type ("fictive") relationship, but extending the concept of "fictive kin-

ship" as a quasi-unifying principle beyond 1839 is problematic at best until this intriguing hypothesis receives further documentation and testing.

Both historians and anthropologists will question some of Anderson's assertions about the internal features of Eastern Dakota life. One can question, for example, how much of the Plains Teton lifeway, including their kinship model, can be extrapolated to the Eastern Dakota. For these reasons, Landes (*op. cit.*, 1968) and not Raymond DeMallie (*Teton Dakota Kinship and Social Organization*, 1971) might be more appropriate for an informed discussion of the structural attributes of Eastern Dakota kinship. Moreover, Eastern Dakota scholars will cringe when Roy Meyer is cited as a "recent scholar" (pp. 15, 47) and Eastern Dakota brides are said to have been "purchased" (pp. 67, 68, 75, 104). Dakota villages of 1,000-plus inhabitants (pp. 11, 81) simply do not jibe with comparative anthropological data for quasi-tribal entities that lack a substantial agricultural base. Perhaps there were notable swings in settlement patterns, but this point is not detailed. (It might be more appropriate to refer to macro-villages, if their existence can be proven, as "seasonal encampments," for lack of a better term, to designate a seasonal gathering of a series of tribute villages that have a perceived unity or a common history or look to a common civil leader as a "chief," a political term which also needs clearer definition. Preliminary data for suggesting such a village structure during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries might exist in comments made by Joseph Renville (William Keeting, *Narrative of an Expedition to the Source of St. Peter's River*, 1959:402). Estimates of villages with as many as twenty full-time shamans (pp. 167-168) appear unreasonably high. A discussion of the nature of shamanism and of the calling itself would do much to dispel another apparent inconsistency. Many of the concerns cited above relating to settlement patterns (size of villages, seasonal shifts, occupation periods and zones) should be answered after Minnesota archaeologists complete their work at nineteenth century Eastern Dakota sites. The assertion on the dust cover by editors of the University of Nebraska Press that Anderson's work is "the first . . . to employ an ethnohistorical approach" to explain the 1862 Minnesota Uprising is contradicted by citations in the bibliography.

Finally, it is encouraging to note that several young, academic specialists have developed a strong interest in the Eastern

Dakota. The field urgently needs more critical studies in Eastern Dakota archaeology, land use, and settlement patterns; development of and changes in their material culture; critical biographies of Taliaferro, the Pond brothers, the Campbell family, and the Wabasha family. With several specialists now prepared to conduct this detailed research, one can anticipate future, heated discussions of Eastern Dakota ethnohistory and historiography.

John S. Wozniak, F.S.C.
St. Mary's College

Night Flying Woman. An Ojibway Narrative. By Ignatia Broker. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 1983. 135 pp. \$12.95 Cloth, \$7.50 Paper.

This work is a folklore-like tale of the author's great-great-grandmother, "Night Flying Woman," an Ojibwa villager of the White Earth reservation, Minnesota; she was nicknamed Oona. Her personality comes to the reader wrapped in a mist whose blandness covers the whole tale; perhaps this is a style designed for a very young Ojibwa audience. There is no hint of the bold, imaginative Ojibwa character known to observers and recorded in many studies. Still, Oona is reported a "dreamer," i.e. a seeker after intuitive knowledge promising "power" over the future. The strains and passions of the true Ojibwa dreamer never appear; the traditional term "visionary" is given only once in a sentence covering mandatory pursuit or "power" dreams by young boys. Perhaps the author felt restrained by respect for the kinswoman that forbade probing the private mind.

But readers appreciate such insights. See my collection in *Ojibwa Woman* for an idea of the tales women ponder, about wrenching solutions to life's problems. Victor Barnouw had Julia Badger record her deep emotional problems to show how she managed them. Our author gives us rather a museum slide, praising attention to duty and mildly blaming the whites' rule. Hers is a world without sin or romance, though Ojibwa have always cared passionately about both. The author's dutifulness to the ancestor obscures the woman she wants us to know. We note instead that the writing style is light and graceful, as are descrip-