

UCSF

UC San Francisco Previously Published Works

Title

Mechanisms of M. tuberculosis Immune Evasion as Challenges to TB Vaccine Design.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2qh8n8vg>

Journal

Cell host & microbe, 24(1)

ISSN

1931-3128

Author

Ernst, Joel D

Publication Date

2018-07-01

DOI

10.1016/j.chom.2018.06.004

Peer reviewed

Why is it hard to make an effective TB vaccine?

Joel D. Ernst

joel.ernst@med.nyu.edu

Tuberculosis

Despite the impression that tuberculosis (TB) is a disease of historic (Dubos and Dubos, 1952) or romantic (Lawlor, 2007) interest, TB causes more deaths (1.7 million in 2016) than does HIV (<http://www.who.int/tb/en/>). *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, the bacteria that cause TB, is estimated to have infected 23% of the current human population (Houben and Dodd, 2016), and progressed to cause active disease in 10.4 million people in 2016. TB is potentially curable, but there were an estimated 500,000 new cases of drug resistant TB in 2016. Cure rates are lower with resistant strains, the drugs are more costly and more toxic, and drug resistant *M. tuberculosis* can be transmitted to other individuals (Shah et al., 2017).

Most people that encounter *M. tuberculosis* do not progress to active TB disease, and are considered to have latent TB infection (LTBI). However, progression from LTBI to active, transmissible TB disease occurs at a sufficient rate to sustain the global epidemic.

The relationship between *M. tuberculosis* and our ancestors is longstanding, as long as 3 million years (Gutierrez et al., 2005). *M. tuberculosis* has no other ecological niche, so all of its evolutionary selection is through interactions with humans. Coevolution has resulted in an infection that induces partial immunity, where the host survives most of the time and so does the pathogen. TB is spread through the air by people with active TB, so mechanisms that promote release of bacteria from the lungs benefit the bacteria, and TB may be unique in its ability to exploit adaptive immune responses (through inflammatory lung tissue damage) to promote its transmission. *M. tuberculosis* is also unusual, as the vast majority of its antigens do not exhibit sequence diversity (Comas et al., 2010; Coscolla et al., 2015). Although the full implications of antigen conservation remain to be determined, the lack of escape mutations is consistent with partial immunity.

TB vaccine history

M. tuberculosis was identified as the cause of TB in 1882, and by 1927 the live attenuated bacille Calmette-Guérin (BCG) TB vaccine became available. Approximately 100 million infants receive BCG annually, due to its low cost, stability, and safety. Although BCG reduces the risk of disseminated tuberculosis in childhood (Rodrigues et al., 1993), its efficacy in preventing pulmonary tuberculosis in adults varies widely (Mangtani et al., 2014). The variation is attributed to multiple factors, including the BCG strain, dose, and route of administration; prevalence of nontuberculous mycobacteria (NTM); host genetics, microbiota, and coinfections; and prevalence of specific *M. tuberculosis* lineages. Variations in outcomes notwithstanding, BCG has not been sufficiently effective to prevent the growth of global TB.

One mechanism that may limit BCG efficacy is that its antigenic composition is insufficiently related to *M. tuberculosis*. Analysis of 13 BCG genomes revealed that of the 1,530 known human T cell epitopes in *M. tuberculosis*, 21%-28% of the epitopes are deleted from BCG (Copin et al., 2014). Besides the deleted antigens, 15 epitopes in 9 antigens differ in sequence compared with *M. tuberculosis*. Although the evidence is insufficient to conclude that antigen loss and sequence variation account for the limited efficacy of BCG, several immunodominant antigens (ESAT-6, CFP-10, PE35, and PPE68) are lacking from all BCG strains.

The only new TB vaccine examined in phase II trials, MVA85A, lacks efficacy. MVA85A is comprised of Modified Vaccinia Ankara (MVA) expressing *M. tuberculosis* antigen 85A (Ag85A). Ag85A is an abundant secreted protein of *M. tuberculosis*, and during infection, it induces high frequency T cell responses. After MVA85A was found safe and immunogenic in humans, two groups at high risk of TB were selected for efficacy trials: HIV-infected adults, and infants.

The study in HIV-infected adults randomized 650 subjects to MVA85A or control (Ndiaye et al., 2015). MVA85A induced Ag85A-responsive T cells that produced IFN γ , as well as cells that produced TNF, IL-2, or IL-17; low magnitude CD8 T cell responses were detected, but fewer than 1% of the recipients produced detectable antibodies to Ag85A. There were 6 cases of active TB in 320 MVA85A recipients and 9 cases in 325 controls; the difference was not significant. MVA85A also failed to prevent new infections.

The other trial enrolled 2,797 healthy infants who received BCG at birth, randomized to MVA85A or control (Tameris et al., 2013). MVA85A induced Ag85A-responsive T cells that could produce IFN γ , TNF, and IL-2, as well as IL-17. No Ag85A-responsive CD8 T cells were detected. Thirty-nine MVA85A recipients and 32 controls developed active TB defined by stringent diagnostic criteria, and 178 MVA85A recipients and 171 controls developed evidence of new infection. Therefore, MVA85A did not confer protection from *M. tuberculosis* disease or infection.

Lacking an efficacious vaccine, contemporary TB control consists of identifying people with active TB and treating them effectively, finding close contacts of the patient, testing the contacts for evidence of infection, and administering 3-9 months of preventive chemotherapy to the infected contacts. The WHO End TB Strategy program emphasizes the need for new tools, including vaccines, to achieve the goal of 95% reduction in TB deaths and 90% reduction in TB incidence by 2035.

Mechanisms of immunity that control *M. tuberculosis*

T cells are essential to control *M. tuberculosis*. In mice, CD4 and CD8 T cells both contribute (Mogues et al., 2001); in humans, a role for CD4 T cells was revealed by the impact of HIV (Kwan and Ernst, 2011), but the contributions of CD8 T cells remain unclear. It has been widely believed that IFN γ production by T cells is a major determinant of TB immunity. However, in mice, CD4 T cells can contribute to control without expressing IFN γ (Gallegos et al., 2011; Sakai et al., 2016), and transfer of CD4 T cells engineered to produce larger amounts of IFN γ resulted in worse outcomes (Sakai et al., 2016). These results in mice are consistent with those of the MVA85A trials, in which increases in IFN γ -producing CD4 T cells did not provide protection. They are also consistent with results in rhesus macaques, in which aerosol vaccination with an adenovirus expressing Ag85A, Ag85B, and Tb10.4 induced IFN γ -producing CD4 and CD8 T cells but did not protect from *M. tuberculosis* (Darrah et al., 2014). Therefore, although both CD4 T cells and IFN γ are essential for control of *M. tuberculosis*, the assumption that IFN γ production by CD4 T cells is the dominant mechanism for protection is not supported by data.

Tumor necrosis factor (TNF) is essential for control of *M. tuberculosis* in mice (Flynn et al., 1995), nonhuman primates (Lin et al., 2010), and humans (Keane et al., 2001), and is produced by mononuclear cells as well as by T lymphocytes. In mice, TNF produced by T cells contributes to control of *M. tuberculosis* (Allie et al., 2013; Sakai et al., 2016; Saunders et al., 2004) although another study found that ESAT-6-specific CD4 T cells improved control without producing TNF (Gallegos et al., 2011). While studies in humans cannot determine the importance of distinct cellular sources of TNF, the frequency of CD4 T cells that produce only TNF is associated with active TB and with higher bacterial burdens (Day et al., 2011), indicating that TNF-producing T cells correlate inversely with control of *M. tuberculosis*.

Other mechanisms contribute to *M. tuberculosis* innate immunity, including pattern recognition molecules and adaptors (Stamm et al., 2015), neutrophils (Blomgran et al., 2012; Blomgran and Ernst, 2011), reactive oxygen (Koster et al., 2017) and nitrogen (Mishra et al., 2017), autophagy (Ouimet et al., 2016), and apoptosis (Martin et al., 2012). For each of these, *M. tuberculosis* has evolved the ability to inhibit or resist them (Cambier et al., 2014; Goldberg et al., 2014). There is also increasing knowledge of 'unconventional' or donor-unrestricted T cells, including mycobacterial lipid antigen-specific T cells restricted by CD1a, CD1b, or CD1c (Van Rhijn and Moody, 2015), mucosal-associated invariant T cells (MAITs) (Gold et al., 2015), and $\gamma\delta$ T cells. Although these may bear on TB vaccine development, there is less known regarding their contributions to protection. Similarly, antibodies are produced in response to *M. tuberculosis* infection. Until recently, TB vaccine strategies to target antibodies have been largely dismissed, and new information on the potential roles of antibodies in protective immunity to *M. tuberculosis* is just emerging (Lu et al., 2016).

Since T cells that recognize peptides bound to MHC class I or II have been the focus of most research and TB vaccine efforts, this review focuses on mechanisms that limit the efficacy of conventional T cells, especially CD4 T cells, and that contribute to challenges in developing effective TB vaccines.

Mechanisms of T cell evasion in TB

M. tuberculosis possesses multiple mechanisms to perturb innate immunity (Cambier et al., 2014). By disrupting innate responses, such as phagosome maturation (Mehra et al., 2013), apoptosis (Velmurugan et al., 2007), and autophagy (Ouimet et al., 2016), or by inducing detrimental type I interferon secretion (Mayer-Barber et al., 2011) or excessive TNF (Roca and Ramakrishnan, 2013), *M. tuberculosis* optimizes its early survival, and modulates adaptive immunity to its own advantage. Development of attenuated mycobacterial vaccines and selection of adjuvants for subunit vaccines depends on understanding how *M. tuberculosis* uses specific innate responses to bias or attenuate beneficial T cell responses.

Other mechanisms that act early in infection, including impaired or misregulated dendritic cell maturation (Hanekom et al., 2003) and delayed priming of CD4 T cells (Wolf et al., 2008) should be bypassed by vaccination, although their characterization may shed light on mechanisms that limit T cell containment of infection early after exposure.

Most knowledge of initiation and regulation of T cell responses is based on studies of antigen administration followed by restimulation of cells harvested from blood or lymphoid tissues. However, protective immunity to tuberculosis requires T cells to traffic to infected tissues and recognize and respond to pathogen antigens there (Figure 1). Even if antigen-specific T cells are generated by vaccination, they will not contribute to protection if they are not activated through antigen recognition at the site of infection. Recent studies have revealed mechanisms whereby *M. tuberculosis* interferes with activation of antigen-specific T cells, and these mechanisms likely contribute to the limitations of existing TB vaccines.

Mechanisms directed at antigen-presenting cells

Since *M. tuberculosis* infects professional antigen-presenting cells, the bacteria are ideally located to perturb the functions of these cells. One target is the MHC class II antigen presentation pathway (hereafter termed the MHCII pathway), which is essential for antigen activation of CD4 T cells. Initially described as sequestration of antigens produced by intramacrophage mycobacteria from CD4 T cells (Pancholi et al., 1993), multiple mechanisms contribute to reduced recognition of *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells by antigen-specific CD4 T cells.

M. tuberculosis inhibits MHCII expression by blocking IFN γ induction of class II transactivator (CIITA) (Kincaid and Ernst, 2003; Pai et al., 2003), which controls genes in the MHCII pathway. One mechanism that blocks IFN γ induction of MHCII expression is by prolonged engagement of TLR2 by mycobacterial lipoproteins and lipoglycans (Pai et al., 2003), although there is also evidence for TLR2-independent mechanisms (Fortune et al., 2004).

Mycobacteria also perturb the MHCII pathway by interfering with intracellular trafficking of MHCII, due to defective processing of the class II invariant chain through IL-10 reduction of cathepsin S expression (Sendide et al., 2005). Although interference with invariant chain processing due to IL-10 suppression of cathepsin S has not been directly examined in vivo, support for the relevance of this mechanism is provided by the finding that IL-10-deficient mice have accelerated CD4 T cell responses and lower lung bacterial burdens when infected with *M. tuberculosis* (Redford et al., 2010).

Two recent studies have identified *M. tuberculosis* proteins that perturb MHC II antigen presentation and activation of CD4 T cells. A genomewide screen revealed inhibition of MHCII antigen presentation by PE_PGRS47, a member of a large *M. tuberculosis* multigene family (Saini et al., 2016). Targeted

deletion of PE_PGRS47 attenuated *M. tuberculosis*, and PE_PGRS47 blocked presentation of multiple *M. tuberculosis* antigens to CD4 T cells in vitro and in vivo. PE_PGRS47 was also found to impair autophagy in infected macrophages, providing evidence for a role of autophagy in MHC class II presentation of mycobacterial antigens.

Another recent study revealed interference with MHC II antigen presentation by *M. tuberculosis* EsxH, which directly interacts with Hrs, a component of the endosomal sorting complex required for transport (ESCRT) complex in human and murine cells (Portal-Celhay et al., 2016). EsxH overexpression diminished activation of *M. tuberculosis* antigen-specific CD4 T cells in vitro and in vivo, and deletion of EsxH increased activation of CD4 T cells in vitro and in vivo in ESCRT-replete, but not ESCRT-deficient cells. EsxH-deficient mycobacteria were attenuated in vivo, but much of the attenuation was lost in CD4 T cell-deficient mice, indicating that EsxH interferes with CD4 T cell activation.

In addition to inhibition of MHC class II antigen presentation by PE_PGRS47 and by EsxH, *M. tuberculosis* diverts secreted mycobacterial antigens from the MHCII pathway to the extracellular space (Srivastava and Ernst, 2014; Srivastava et al., 2016). Export of *M. tuberculosis* antigens from infected cells employs vesicular transport, and depletion of kinesin-2 revealed that not only was antigen export decreased, but antigen presentation to Ag85B- or ESAT-6-specific CD4 T cells by *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells was increased. Blockade of antigen export from infected cells improved T cell-dependent restriction or killing of intracellular *M. tuberculosis* in vitro, and enhanced control of *M. tuberculosis* in vivo (Srivastava et al., 2016).

Unlike other mechanisms of *M. tuberculosis* perturbation of antigen presentation that decrease CD4 T cell priming, antigen export enhances priming of naive CD4 T cells by allowing uptake, processing, and presentation of exported antigens by uninfected cells in lymph nodes (Srivastava and Ernst, 2014). However, antigen export can be detrimental to CD4 T cell control of *M. tuberculosis* in the lungs through at least two mechanisms. First, since direct recognition of infected cells by CD4 T cells is essential for control of *M. tuberculosis* in vivo (Srivastava and Ernst, 2013), diversion of bacterial antigens from the MHCII pathway decreases antigen presentation by infected cells, thereby decreasing their recognition by CD4 T cells (Srivastava et al., 2016). Second, uptake and presentation of exported antigens by uninfected cells (which outnumber infected cells in the lungs (Wolf et al., 2007)) allows antigen-specific T cells to be engaged by uninfected cells instead of infected cells.

The significance of impairing antigen presentation by *M. tuberculosis* was revealed by comparing CD4 T cell responses to Ag85B presented by cells infected with *M. tuberculosis* (which persists in vivo) or *M. bovis* BCG (which is eliminated by T cells) (Grace and Ernst, 2016). Ag85B-specific CD4 T cell responses after *M. tuberculosis* infection were more delayed and required more antigen-producing bacteria to prime Ag85B-specific CD4 T cells than after aerosol BCG infection. When the numbers of bacteria in infected cells were equivalent, *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells were poorer stimuli than BCG-infected cells for activating Ag85B-specific CD4 T cells in vivo and in vitro. The number of CD4 T cells recruited to the lungs was greater after *M. tuberculosis* infection than after BCG infection, indicating that *M. tuberculosis* persistence is due to poor CD4 T cell efficacy, rather than to deficient T cell recruitment. These results indicate that *M. tuberculosis* interference with antigen presentation to CD4 T cells contributes to its persistence, and imply that interference with antigen presentation contributes to evasion of vaccine-induced T cells.

M. tuberculosis also modulates its gene expression to limit T cell efficacy. Expression of Ag85B is highest during early growth of *M. tuberculosis* in the lungs, and then decreases, leading to decreased activation of Ag85B-specific CD4 T cells. This mechanism is functionally important, since an *M. tuberculosis* strain engineered to express Ag85B throughout infection is attenuated in mice, but only in the presence of CD4 T cells (Bold et al., 2011). However, the findings with Ag85B cannot be extrapolated to all *M. tuberculosis* antigens, since expression of ESAT-6 is maintained throughout infection, and ESAT-6-specific CD4 T cells can be activated at comparable levels during early and later

stages of infection (Moguche et al., 2017). These results emphasize that vaccine antigens must be selected with specific knowledge of their expression dynamics.

Mechanisms that directly affect T cells

Mycobacterial lipomannan and mannosylated lipoarabinomannan (man-LAM) can inhibit T cell activation downstream of TCR triggering. Whether this mechanism contributes to the inability of T cell responses to eliminate *M. tuberculosis* in vivo has not been established, but man-LAM and other mycobacterial lipoglycans can be acquired by T cells via bacterial membrane vesicles, and man-LAM can be detected on T cells isolated from lungs of *M. tuberculosis*-infected mice (Athman et al., 2017).

M. tuberculosis-specific T cells have been characterized for their maturation states that affect their functions and antimycobacterial efficacy. Chronic *M. tuberculosis* infection in mice drives ESAT-6-specific CD4 T cells to terminal differentiation (Reiley et al., 2010) and retention in the pulmonary vasculature (Moguche et al., 2015; Sakai et al., 2014). Terminally-differentiated (KLRG1^{hi}CX3CR1^{hi}Tbet^{hi}) CD4 T cells confer little protection when adoptively transferred, despite producing larger quantities of IFN γ than less-differentiated (CXCR3⁺CX3CR1-PD-1^{hi}CD69^{hi}) CD4 T cells that traffic to the lung parenchyma and provide protection (Sakai et al., 2014). Terminal differentiation is antigen-dependent: ESAT-6-specific CD4 T cells exhibit this property, but Ag85B-specific CD4 T cells do not, since Ag85B expression is reduced in chronic infection (Moguche et al., 2017). T cells with similar properties are present in humans: a vaccine that contains ESAT-6 was found to expand CD4 T cells with limited functional capacities when administered to subjects with LTBI (Moguche et al., 2017). This finding has important implications, since TB vaccines administered to those that already have LTBI will have little efficacy if they expand poorly functional antigen-specific T cells.

Chronic *M. tuberculosis* in mice is also associated with T cells whose phenotype and functions are characteristic of exhaustion. Lung T cells that express exhaustion markers (TIM3, PD-1, LAG3, 2B4) and transcriptional signatures are less able to produce multiple cytokines (Jayaraman et al., 2016). Although human studies that indicate that T cell exhaustion may develop at certain stages of infection or disease, more investigation is warranted, especially with a focus on T cells with distinct antigen specificities, since the data will be important for design of TB vaccines administered to those with LTBI or active TB.

Other mechanisms limit effector T cells and may impact TB vaccine efficacy. Regulatory T cells (T_{reg}) are induced early after infection in mice, and retard priming, expansion, and recruitment of effector T cells to the lungs. T_{reg} contract later, and do not accumulate in the lungs of *M. tuberculosis*-infected mice (Shafiani et al., 2013). Likewise, IL-10 is expressed by myeloid cells and T cells during *M. tuberculosis* infection, and T cell-derived IL-10 limits control of bacteria in the lungs (Moreira-Teixeira et al., 2017). Blockade of IL-10 receptor signalling during BCG vaccination of mice enhances IL-17 and IFN γ responses by T cells and innate lymphoid cells, and improves control of *M. tuberculosis* (Pitt et al., 2012). These results indicate that blockade of IL-10 at the time of vaccination may improve the protection obtained by TB vaccines.

Spatial restriction of T cells

The characteristic tissue lesion in TB is the granuloma, an aggregate of macrophages, dendritic cells, and neutrophils, with variable frequencies of B and T lymphocytes. The architecture of granulomas can be remarkably diverse in humans (Marakalala et al., 2016) and animals (Gideon et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2016), and in a common form of TB granulomas, T cells are confined to the peripheral regions, while infected cells are in the central core (Figure 2) (Kauffman et al., 2017). Since CD4 T cells must directly recognize and contact infected cells to control intracellular *M. tuberculosis* (Srivastava and Ernst, 2013), the architecture of TB granulomas may limit the efficacy of T cells in TB. One promising finding is that in *M. tuberculosis*-infected rhesus macaques, inhibition of indoleamine-2,3-dioxygenase (IDO) at the onset of the adaptive immune response resulted in enhanced T cell responses, positioning

of more T cells in the central regions of granulomas, and reduction in the number of bacteria in lesions (Gautam et al., 2018). If IDO inhibition is effective when administered after establishment of granulomas, this may be a promising adjunct to TB chemotherapy or vaccination.

Resistance to T cell effector mechanisms

An additional mechanism that may limit the efficacy of T cells is resistance to their effectors. One example is that *M. tuberculosis* infection of human (Ting et al., 1999) or murine (Fortune et al., 2004) macrophages inhibits responses to IFN γ . The effect of *M. tuberculosis* operates at a late step in transcription initiation, and does not inhibit transcription of all IFN γ -responsive genes. Among the genes most repressed in *M. tuberculosis*-infected macrophages is the transcription factor CIITA, which regulates MHC II genes. There is currently no information whether *M. tuberculosis* infection inhibits macrophage responses to IFN γ in vivo, but the observation that *M. tuberculosis* can interfere with cytokine signalling provides a potential explanation why production of IFN γ is not a correlate of protection in TB: if the IFN γ produced cannot act optimally due to disrupted signalling, then the quantities will not correlate with outcomes (Figure 3). It is reasonable to hypothesize that resistance to other effector mechanisms limits the efficacy of T cell control of TB.

Recent progress

Despite the plethora of mechanisms that interfere with immune responses to *M. tuberculosis*, recent results raise optimism for successful TB vaccine development.

A rhesus cytomegalovirus (rhCMV) vaccine containing *M. tuberculosis* antigens provided protection not previously achieved by a TB vaccine (Hansen et al., 2018). RhCMV-TB induced IFN γ and TNF-producing CD4 and CD8 memory (effector > central memory) T cells, and when challenged with a low inoculum (10-25 cfu) of *M. tuberculosis* Erdman, 14 of the 34 RhCMV-TB vaccinated animals had no evidence of TB disease, and 10 of the 14 had no viable *M. tuberculosis* recovered. Although RhCMV-TB induced memory T cells, the magnitude did not correlate with the outcomes of infectious challenge. Instead, a durable whole blood transcriptional signature correlated with protection, and included genes involved in innate immunity, including neutrophil degranulation. The durability of the innate immune signature is thought to relate to persistence of the RhCMV vector. The possibility that the vaccine induced lung-resident memory T cells was not examined, but should be the subject of future studies, since the lungs are a major site of human CMV persistence (Gordon et al., 2017), and the rapid onset of protection after bacterial challenge suggests that vaccine-induced immunity was present in the lungs. While it is notable that protection was achieved by a vaccine that did not induce detectable antibodies, the findings do not exclude a potential role for antibodies in immunity to TB.

Another recent study revealed the potential for protection against TB by trained innate immunity (Kaufmann et al., 2018). Intravenous *M. bovis* BCG stimulated expansion of hematopoietic stem cells (HSC), associated with epigenetic changes transmitted to their progeny, including multipotent progenitors and bone marrow-derived macrophages (Kaufmann et al., 2018). In bone marrow chimeras, parabionts with CCR2^{-/-} partners, and transfer into Rag1^{-/-} mice, BCG 'training' of cells enhanced control of *M. tuberculosis*. Training of bone marrow cells depended on IFN γ responsiveness, but did not involve infection of HSC themselves, or the presence of T cells. Although BCG training was insufficient to fully control a high inoculum *M. tuberculosis* challenge, the results are promising, as they indicate that the cells that harbor *M. tuberculosis* can be modulated to improve their control of infection. This is significant for at least three reasons: 1) the results may relate to the observation that certain humans exposed to TB remain uninfected, an effect attributed to alveolar macrophage elimination of *M. tuberculosis* without a T cell response; 2) the protection observed in the RhCMV-TB studies correlated with an innate immune signature - it will be interesting to determine whether there are common features between that signature and that of BCG-trained cells; 3) training HSC and their progeny may circumvent mechanisms of immune evasion that limit the efficacy of T cell responses.

In a recent unpublished human study, revaccination with BCG or administration of a subunit vaccine (termed H4:IC31) containing Ag85B and Tb10.4 were compared for the ability to prevent *M. tuberculosis* infection. Neither BCG revaccination nor H4:IC31 prevented initial infection, but both reduced the rate of sustained infection (defined as persistent Quantiferon positive versus reversion to Quantiferon negative), although the effect of H4:IC31 was not significant.

It's hard to make TB vaccines that work, but it's not hopeless.

As studies of immunity and pathogenesis generate insight into the complexity and diversity of TB, they provide principles for making effective TB vaccines. Advances in disciplines such as cancer immunotherapy can also inform TB vaccine discovery. Two general principles are important to note. First, efforts and resources for TB vaccine development must acknowledge the vast amount of information that is currently unknown and that can guide TB vaccine development. Second, it is unlikely that one TB vaccine will eliminate TB in all populations. In considering TB vaccine development, a useful framework is the "Tumor Immunogram", meant to optimize cancer immunotherapies (Blank et al., 2016). A "TB Immunogram" to illustrate major gaps is in Table 1.

Table 1. The TB Immunogram

Challenge	Strategies
Different vaccine approaches needed for distinct populations	Optimize animal models to test vaccines for naive, BCG-vaccinated, LTBI, active TB
Optimal vaccine antigens not known	Consider different antigens for distinct target populations Examine antigen properties beyond frequency of T cell recognition Prioritize antigens presented by HLA alleles prevalent in regions with high TB burdens.
Vaccine-induced T cells need combination of properties	Assay vaccines for induction of T cells with appropriate state of differentiation, residence in lung tissue compartments, and expression of effector mechanisms beyond cytokine secretion
<i>M. tuberculosis</i> -infected cells evade T cell recognition	Identify antigens less impacted by evasion mechanisms (nonsecreted antigens, antigens with evidence of selection pressure from T cell recognition); develop pharmacological interventions to overcome specific evasion mechanisms Exploit trained innate immunity for T cell-independent protection
<i>M. tuberculosis</i> occupies diverse intracellular compartments	Identify mechanisms for elimination of bacteria in immature phagosomes, cytoplasm, autophagosomes, mature phagolysosomes.
<i>M. tuberculosis</i> can be extracellular	Determine the bacterial population fraction that is extracellular during distinct stages of infection; optimize antibodies and other humoral mediators
Range of inoculum size unknown in humans	Examine vaccines efficacious against low dose challenges for efficacy against higher inocula and more virulent bacterial strains
Correlates of immunity not identified	Develop methods for analysis of cells in human tissues; apply analyses that account for nonlinear relationships between response and protection

TB vaccine development is hindered by technical gaps, including suboptimal animal models. A pipeline of concepts and candidates depends on tractable and economical animal models for initial discovery, and TB vaccine efforts need to improve models to predict effects in humans. An additional gap is a lack of knowledge of the *M. tuberculosis* epitopes presented by infected cells; certain vaccines induce T cells that recognize epitopes not presented by *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells (Billeskov et al., 2010; Nyendak et al., 2016). This mismatch may be due to vaccines targeted to antigen-presenting cells whose processing machinery differs from that in *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells. Knowledge of the repertoire of peptides presented by *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells would provide a basis for vaccine antigen selection, but there are technical challenges, including: the need to obtain infected cells from humans with TB (or humanized animal models), methods for sample preparation to minimize peptide loss, improved mass spectrometry sensitivity, and the facilities and equipment to perform the necessary procedures with appropriate biosafety.

Recent advances in microscopy, especially two-photon intravital microscopy, provide unprecedented insight into interactions of lymphocytes and antigen-presenting cells during immune responses, but biosafety considerations and cost have prevented the TB field from benefiting from this technology. Since recent studies indicate that defective interactions between T cells and *M. tuberculosis*-infected cells contribute to the failure of T cells to eliminate infection, the ability to image vaccine-induced T cells and their real time interactions with infected cells in tissues is likely to guide design and selection of TB vaccines.

Other techniques are less impacted by biosafety requirements, and expanding their use will likely inform TB vaccine development. These include high-content flow cytometry; transcriptomic analyses on specific cell subsets and single cells; studies of T cell antigen receptor (TCR) diversity and specificity after vaccination; and studies to determine whether certain individuals and populations are more susceptible to certain bacterial strains. While these technologies and studies are expensive, TB is an expensive problem: in addition to the cost of diagnosis and treatment of millions of cases of drug-susceptible TB each year, treatment of one case of MDR-TB in South Africa costs \$6,800 (Pooran et al., 2013), and there are 19,000 incident cases of MDR-TB there, which translates to ~\$1.3 billion for South Africa alone. This number pales when considering that India and China together are estimated to have 220,000 incident cases of MDR-TB (WHO Global TB Report, 2017), that treatment of XDR-TB costs even more than treatment of MDR-TB, and that MDR- and XDR-TB are readily transmitted to others with the potential for further expansion of the problem (Shah et al., 2017).

Summary

TB is a complex disease, and there are major barriers and challenges to developing effective TB vaccines; the magnitude of the problem demands improved tools for bending the curve of TB prevalence steeply downward. Recent progress in TB vaccine development and advances in technology and conceptual understanding provide optimism that sustained and creative efforts will lead to successful vaccines and other modes of immunotherapy for this major global health problem.

Acknowledgments

Supported by grants from the National Institutes of Health (AI051242, AI124471, and AI111211). I apologize to the numerous investigators whose valuable work could not be cited due to length restrictions.

References

- Allie, N., Grivennikov, S.I., Keeton, R., Hsu, N.J., Bourigault, M.L., Court, N., Fremond, C., Yermeev, V., Shebzukhov, Y., Ryffel, B., *et al.* (2013). Prominent role for T cell-derived tumour necrosis factor for sustained control of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *Sci Rep* 3, 1809.
- Athman, J.J., Sande, O.J., Groft, S.G., Reba, S.M., Nagy, N., Wearsch, P.A., Richardson, E.T., Rojas, R., Boom, W.H., Shukla, S., *et al.* (2017). Mycobacterium tuberculosis Membrane Vesicles Inhibit T Cell Activation. *J Immunol* 198, 2028-2037.
- Billeskov, R., Grandal, M.V., Poulsen, C., Christensen, J.P., Winther, N., Vingsbo-Lundberg, C., Hoang, T.T., van Deurs, B., Song, Y.H., Aagaard, C., *et al.* (2010). Difference in TB10.4 T-cell epitope recognition following immunization with recombinant TB10.4, BCG or infection with Mycobacterium tuberculosis. *Eur J Immunol* 40, 1342-1354.
- Blank, C.U., Haanen, J.B., Ribas, A., and Schumacher, T.N. (2016). The “cancer immunogram”. *Science* 352, 658-660.
- Blomgran, R., Desvignes, L., Briken, V., and Ernst, J.D. (2012). Mycobacterium tuberculosis inhibits neutrophil apoptosis, leading to delayed activation of naive CD4 T cells. *Cell Host Microbe* 11, 81-90.
- Blomgran, R., and Ernst, J.D. (2011). Lung neutrophils facilitate activation of naive antigen-specific CD4+ T cells during Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *J Immunol* 186, 7110-7119.
- Bold, T.D., Banaei, N., Wolf, A.J., and Ernst, J.D. (2011). Suboptimal activation of antigen-specific CD4+ effector cells enables persistence of M. tuberculosis in vivo. *PLoS Pathog* 7, e1002063.
- Cambier, C.J., Falkow, S., and Ramakrishnan, L. (2014). Host evasion and exploitation schemes of Mycobacterium tuberculosis. *Cell* 159, 1497-1509.
- Comas, I., Chakravarti, J., Small, P.M., Galagan, J., Niemann, S., Kremer, K., Ernst, J.D., and Gagneux, S. (2010). Human T cell epitopes of Mycobacterium tuberculosis are evolutionarily hyperconserved. *Nat Genet* 42, 498-503.
- Copin, R., Coscolla, M., Efstathiadis, E., Gagneux, S., and Ernst, J.D. (2014). Impact of in vitro evolution on antigenic diversity of Mycobacterium bovis bacillus Calmette-Guerin (BCG). *Vaccine* 32, 5998-6004.
- Coscolla, M., Copin, R., Sutherland, J., Gehre, F., de Jong, B., Owolabi, O., Mbayo, G., Giardina, F., Ernst, J.D., and Gagneux, S. (2015). M. tuberculosis T Cell Epitope Analysis Reveals Paucity of Antigenic Variation and Identifies Rare Variable TB Antigens. *Cell Host Microbe* 18, 538-548.
- Darrah, P.A., Bolton, D.L., Lackner, A.A., Kaushal, D., Aye, P.P., Mehra, S., Blanchard, J.L., Didier, P.J., Roy, C.J., Rao, S.S., *et al.* (2014). Aerosol vaccination with AERAS-402 elicits robust cellular immune responses in the lungs of rhesus macaques but fails to protect against high-dose Mycobacterium tuberculosis challenge. *J Immunol* 193, 1799-1811.
- Day, C.L., Abrahams, D.A., Lerumo, L., Janse van Rensburg, E., Stone, L., O'Rie, T., Pienaar, B., de Kock, M., Kaplan, G., Mahomed, H., *et al.* (2011). Functional capacity of Mycobacterium tuberculosis-specific T cell responses in humans is associated with mycobacterial load. *J Immunol* 187, 2222-2232.
- Dubos, R.J., and Dubos, J. (1952). *The White Plague: Tuberculosis, Man, and Society* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press).

Flynn, J.L., Goldstein, M.M., Chan, J., Triebold, K.J., Pfeffer, K., Lowenstein, C.J., Schreiber, R., Mak, T.W., and Bloom, B.R. (1995). Tumor necrosis factor- α is required in the protective immune response against *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in mice. *Immunity* 2, 561-572.

Fortune, S.M., Solache, A., Jaeger, A., Hill, P.J., Belisle, J.T., Bloom, B.R., Rubin, E.J., and Ernst, J.D. (2004). *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* inhibits macrophage responses to IFN- γ through myeloid differentiation factor 88-dependent and -independent mechanisms. *J Immunol* 172, 6272-6280.

Gallegos, A.M., van Heijst, J.W., Samstein, M., Su, X., Pamer, E.G., and Glickman, M.S. (2011). A gamma interferon independent mechanism of CD4 T cell mediated control of *M. tuberculosis* infection in vivo. *PLoS Pathog* 7, e1002052.

Gautam, U.S., Foreman, T.W., Bucsan, A.N., Veatch, A.V., Alvarez, X., Adekambi, T., Golden, N.A., Gentry, K.M., Doyle-Meyers, L.A., Russell-Lodrigue, K.E., *et al.* (2018). In vivo inhibition of tryptophan catabolism reorganizes the tuberculoma and augments immune-mediated control of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 115, E62-E71.

Gideon, H.P., Phuah, J., Myers, A.J., Bryson, B.D., Rodgers, M.A., Coleman, M.T., Maiello, P., Rutledge, T., Marino, S., Fortune, S.M., *et al.* (2015). Variability in tuberculosis granuloma T cell responses exists, but a balance of pro- and anti-inflammatory cytokines is associated with sterilization. *PLoS Pathog* 11, e1004603.

Gold, M.C., Napier, R.J., and Lewinsohn, D.M. (2015). MR1-restricted mucosal associated invariant T (MAIT) cells in the immune response to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Immunol Rev* 264, 154-166.

Goldberg, M.F., Saini, N.K., and Porcelli, S.A. (2014). Evasion of Innate and Adaptive Immunity by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Microbiol Spectr* 2.

Gordon, C.L., Miron, M., Thome, J.J., Matsuoka, N., Weiner, J., Rak, M.A., Igarashi, S., Granot, T., Lerner, H., Goodrum, F., *et al.* (2017). Tissue reservoirs of antiviral T cell immunity in persistent human CMV infection. *J Exp Med* 214, 651-667.

Grace, P.S., and Ernst, J.D. (2016). Suboptimal Antigen Presentation Contributes to Virulence of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* In Vivo. *J Immunol* 196, 357-364.

Gutierrez, M.C., Brisse, S., Brosch, R., Fabre, M., Omais, B., Marmiesse, M., Supply, P., and Vincent, V. (2005). Ancient origin and gene mosaicism of the progenitor of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *PLoS Pathog* 1, e5.

Hanekom, W.A., Mendillo, M., Manca, C., Haslett, P.A., Siddiqui, M.R., Barry, C., 3rd, and Kaplan, G. (2003). *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* inhibits maturation of human monocyte-derived dendritic cells in vitro. *J Infect Dis* 188, 257-266.

Hansen, S.G., Zak, D.E., Xu, G., Ford, J.C., Marshall, E.E., Malouli, D., Gilbride, R.M., Hughes, C.M., Ventura, A.B., Ainslie, E., *et al.* (2018). Prevention of tuberculosis in rhesus macaques by a cytomegalovirus-based vaccine. *Nat Med* 24, 130-143.

Houben, R.M., and Dodd, P.J. (2016). The Global Burden of Latent Tuberculosis Infection: A Re-estimation Using Mathematical Modelling. *PLoS Med* 13, e1002152.

Jayaraman, P., Jacques, M.K., Zhu, C., Steblenko, K.M., Stowell, B.L., Madi, A., Anderson, A.C., Kuchroo, V.K., and Behar, S.M. (2016). TIM3 Mediates T Cell Exhaustion during *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Infection. *PLoS Pathog* 12, e1005490.

Kauffman, K.D., Sallin, M.A., Sakai, S., Kamenyeva, O., Kabat, J., Weiner, D., Sutphin, M., Schimel, D., Via, L., Barry, C.E., 3rd, *et al.* (2017). Defective positioning in granulomas but not lung-homing limits CD4 T-cell interactions with Mycobacterium tuberculosis-infected macrophages in rhesus macaques. *Mucosal Immunol.*

Kaufmann, E., Sanz, J., Dunn, J.L., Khan, N., Mendonca, L.E., Pacis, A., Tzelepis, F., Pernet, E., Dumaine, A., Grenier, J.C., *et al.* (2018). BCG Educates Hematopoietic Stem Cells to Generate Protective Innate Immunity against Tuberculosis. *Cell* 172, 176-190 e119.

Keane, J., Gershon, S., Wise, R.P., Mirabile-Levens, E., Kasznica, J., Schwieterman, W.D., Siegel, J.N., and Braun, M.M. (2001). Tuberculosis associated with infliximab, a tumor necrosis factor alpha-neutralizing agent. *N Engl J Med* 345, 1098-1104.

Kincaid, E.Z., and Ernst, J.D. (2003). Mycobacterium tuberculosis exerts gene-selective inhibition of transcriptional responses to IFN-gamma without inhibiting STAT1 function. *J Immunol* 171, 2042-2049.

Koster, S., Upadhyay, S., Chandra, P., Papavinasasundaram, K., Yang, G., Hassan, A., Grigsby, S.J., Mittal, E., Park, H.S., Jones, V., *et al.* (2017). Mycobacterium tuberculosis is protected from NADPH oxidase and LC3-associated phagocytosis by the LCP protein CpsA. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 114, E8711-e8720.

Kwan, C.K., and Ernst, J.D. (2011). HIV and tuberculosis: a deadly human syndemic. *Clin Microbiol Rev* 24, 351-376.

Lawlor, C. (2007). *Consumption and Literature: The Making of the Romantic Disease* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan).

Lin, P.L., Myers, A., Smith, L., Bigbee, C., Bigbee, M., Fuhrman, C., Grieser, H., Chiosea, I., Voitenek, N.N., Capuano, S.V., *et al.* (2010). Tumor necrosis factor neutralization results in disseminated disease in acute and latent Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection with normal granuloma structure in a cynomolgus macaque model. *Arthritis Rheum* 62, 340-350.

Lu, L.L., Chung, A.W., Rosebrock, T.R., Ghebremichael, M., Yu, W.H., Grace, P.S., Schoen, M.K., Tafesse, F., Martin, C., Leung, V., *et al.* (2016). A Functional Role for Antibodies in Tuberculosis. *Cell* 167, 433-443.e414.

Mangtani, P., Abubakar, I., Ariti, C., Beynon, R., Pimpin, L., Fine, P.E., Rodrigues, L.C., Smith, P.G., Lipman, M., Whiting, P.F., *et al.* (2014). Protection by BCG vaccine against tuberculosis: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *Clin Infect Dis* 58, 470-480.

Marakalala, M.J., Raju, R.M., Sharma, K., Zhang, Y.J., Eugenin, E.A., Prideaux, B., Daudelin, I.B., Chen, P.Y., Booty, M.G., Kim, J.H., *et al.* (2016). Inflammatory signaling in human tuberculosis granulomas is spatially organized. *Nat Med* 22, 531-538.

Martin, C.J., Booty, M.G., Rosebrock, T.R., Nunes-Alves, C., Desjardins, D.M., Keren, I., Fortune, S.M., Remold, H.G., and Behar, S.M. (2012). Efferocytosis is an innate antibacterial mechanism. *Cell Host Microbe* 12, 289-300.

Mayer-Barber, K.D., Andrade, B.B., Barber, D.L., Hieny, S., Feng, C.G., Caspar, P., Oland, S., Gordon, S., and Sher, A. (2011). Innate and adaptive interferons suppress IL-1alpha and IL-1beta production by distinct pulmonary myeloid subsets during Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *Immunity* 35, 1023-1034.

Mehra, A., Zahra, A., Thompson, V., Sirisaengtaksin, N., Wells, A., Porto, M., Koster, S., Penberthy, K., Kubota, Y., Dricot, A., *et al.* (2013). Mycobacterium tuberculosis type VII secreted effector EsxH targets host ESCRT to impair trafficking. *PLoS Pathog* 9, e1003734.

Mishra, B.B., Lovewell, R.R., Olive, A.J., Zhang, G., Wang, W., Eugenin, E., Smith, C.M., Phuah, J.Y., Long, J.E., Dubuke, M.L., *et al.* (2017). Nitric oxide prevents a pathogen-permissive granulocytic inflammation during tuberculosis. *Nat Microbiol* 2, 17072.

Moguche, A.O., Musvosvi, M., Penn-Nicholson, A., Plumlee, C.R., Mearns, H., Geldenhuys, H., Smit, E., Abrahams, D., Rozot, V., Dintwe, O., *et al.* (2017). Antigen Availability Shapes T Cell Differentiation and Function during Tuberculosis. *Cell Host Microbe* 21, 695-706.e695.

Moguche, A.O., Shafiani, S., Clemons, C., Larson, R.P., Dinh, C., Higdon, L.E., Cambier, C.J., Sissons, J.R., Gallegos, A.M., Fink, P.J., *et al.* (2015). ICOS and Bcl6-dependent pathways maintain a CD4 T cell population with memory-like properties during tuberculosis. *J Exp Med* 212, 715-728.

Mogues, T., Goodrich, M.E., Ryan, L., LaCourse, R., and North, R.J. (2001). The relative importance of T cell subsets in immunity and immunopathology of airborne Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection in mice. *J Exp Med* 193, 271-280.

Moreira-Teixeira, L., Redford, P.S., Stavropoulos, E., Ghilardi, N., Maynard, C.L., Weaver, C.T., Freitas do Rosario, A.P., Wu, X., Langhorne, J., and O'Garra, A. (2017). T Cell-Derived IL-10 Impairs Host Resistance to Mycobacterium tuberculosis Infection. *J Immunol* 199, 613-623.

Ndiaye, B.P., Thienemann, F., Ota, M., Landry, B.S., Camara, M., Dieye, S., Dieye, T.N., Esmail, H., Goliath, R., Huygen, K., *et al.* (2015). Safety, immunogenicity, and efficacy of the candidate tuberculosis vaccine MVA85A in healthy adults infected with HIV-1: a randomised, placebo-controlled, phase 2 trial. *Lancet Respir Med* 3, 190-200.

Nyendak, M., Swarbrick, G.M., Duncan, A., Cansler, M., Huff, E.W., Hokey, D., Evans, T., Barker, L., Blatner, G., Sadoff, J., *et al.* (2016). Adenovirally-Induced Polyfunctional T Cells Do Not Necessarily Recognize the Infected Target: Lessons from a Phase I Trial of the AERAS-402 Vaccine. *Sci Rep* 6, 36355.

Ouimet, M., Koster, S., Sakowski, E., Ramkhelawon, B., van Solingen, C., Oldebeken, S., Karunakaran, D., Portal-Celhay, C., Sheedy, F.J., Ray, T.D., *et al.* (2016). Mycobacterium tuberculosis induces the miR-33 locus to reprogram autophagy and host lipid metabolism. *Nat Immunol* 17, 677-686.

Pai, R.K., Convery, M., Hamilton, T.A., Boom, W.H., and Harding, C.V. (2003). Inhibition of IFN-gamma-induced class II transactivator expression by a 19-kDa lipoprotein from Mycobacterium tuberculosis: a potential mechanism for immune evasion. *J Immunol* 171, 175-184.

Pancholi, P., Mirza, A., Bhardwaj, N., and Steinman, R.M. (1993). Sequestration from immune CD4+ T cells of mycobacteria growing in human macrophages. *Science* 260, 984-986.

Pitt, J.M., Stavropoulos, E., Redford, P.S., Beebe, A.M., Bancroft, G.J., Young, D.B., and O'Garra, A. (2012). Blockade of IL-10 signaling during bacillus Calmette-Guerin vaccination enhances and sustains Th1, Th17, and innate lymphoid IFN-gamma and IL-17 responses and increases protection to Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *J Immunol* 189, 4079-4087.

Pooran, A., Pieterse, E., Davids, M., Theron, G., and Dheda, K. (2013). What is the cost of diagnosis and management of drug resistant tuberculosis in South Africa? *PLoS One* 8, e54587.

Portal-Celhay, C., Tufariello, J.M., Srivastava, S., Zahra, A., Klevorn, T., Grace, P.S., Mehra, A., Park, H.S., Ernst, J.D., Jacobs, W.R., Jr., *et al.* (2016). Mycobacterium tuberculosis EsxH inhibits ESCRT-dependent CD4(+) T-cell activation. *Nat Microbiol* 2, 16232.

Redford, P.S., Boonstra, A., Read, S., Pitt, J., Graham, C., Stavropoulos, E., Bancroft, G.J., and O'Garra, A. (2010). Enhanced protection to Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection in IL-10-deficient mice is accompanied by early and enhanced Th1 responses in the lung. *Eur J Immunol* 40, 2200-2210.

Reiley, W.W., Shafiani, S., Wittmer, S.T., Tucker-Heard, G., Moon, J.J., Jenkins, M.K., Urdahl, K.B., Winslow, G.M., and Woodland, D.L. (2010). Distinct functions of antigen-specific CD4 T cells during murine Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 107, 19408-19413.

Roca, F.J., and Ramakrishnan, L. (2013). TNF dually mediates resistance and susceptibility to mycobacteria via mitochondrial reactive oxygen species. *Cell* 153, 521-534.

Rodrigues, L.C., Diwan, V.K., and Wheeler, J.G. (1993). Protective effect of BCG against tuberculous meningitis and miliary tuberculosis: a meta-analysis. *Int J Epidemiol* 22, 1154-1158.

Saini, N.K., Baena, A., Ng, T.W., Venkataswamy, M.M., Kennedy, S.C., Kunnath-Velayudhan, S., Carreno, L.J., Xu, J., Chan, J., Larsen, M.H., *et al.* (2016). Suppression of autophagy and antigen presentation by Mycobacterium tuberculosis PE_PGRS47. *Nat Microbiol* 1, 16133.

Sakai, S., Kauffman, K.D., Sallin, M.A., Sharpe, A.H., Young, H.A., Ganusov, V.V., and Barber, D.L. (2016). CD4 T Cell-Derived IFN-gamma Plays a Minimal Role in Control of Pulmonary Mycobacterium tuberculosis Infection and Must Be Actively Repressed by PD-1 to Prevent Lethal Disease. *PLoS Pathog* 12, e1005667.

Sakai, S., Kauffman, K.D., Schenkel, J.M., McBerry, C.C., Mayer-Barber, K.D., Masopust, D., and Barber, D.L. (2014). Cutting edge: control of Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection by a subset of lung parenchyma-homing CD4 T cells. *J Immunol* 192, 2965-2969.

Saunders, B.M., Briscoe, H., and Britton, W.J. (2004). T cell-derived tumour necrosis factor is essential, but not sufficient, for protection against Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *Clin Exp Immunol* 137, 279-287.

Sendide, K., Deghmane, A.E., Pechkovsky, D., Av-Gay, Y., Talal, A., and Hmama, Z. (2005). Mycobacterium bovis BCG attenuates surface expression of mature class II molecules through IL-10-dependent inhibition of cathepsin S. *J Immunol* 175, 5324-5332.

Shafiani, S., Dinh, C., Ertelt, J.M., Moguche, A.O., Siddiqui, I., Smigiel, K.S., Sharma, P., Campbell, D.J., Way, S.S., and Urdahl, K.B. (2013). Pathogen-specific Treg cells expand early during mycobacterium tuberculosis infection but are later eliminated in response to Interleukin-12. *Immunity* 38, 1261-1270.

Shah, N.S., Auld, S.C., Brust, J.C., Mathema, B., Ismail, N., Moodley, P., Mlisana, K., Allana, S., Campbell, A., Mthiyane, T., *et al.* (2017). Transmission of Extensively Drug-Resistant Tuberculosis in South Africa. *N Engl J Med* 376, 243-253.

Smith, C.M., Proulx, M.K., Olive, A.J., Laddy, D., Mishra, B.B., Moss, C., Gutierrez, N.M., Bellerose, M.M., Barreira-Silva, P., Phuath, J.Y., *et al.* (2016). Tuberculosis Susceptibility and Vaccine Protection Are Independently Controlled by Host Genotype. *MBio* 7.

Srivastava, S., and Ernst, J.D. (2013). Cutting edge: Direct recognition of infected cells by CD4 T cells is required for control of intracellular Mycobacterium tuberculosis in vivo. *J Immunol* 191, 1016-1020.

- Srivastava, S., and Ernst, J.D. (2014). Cell-to-cell transfer of *M. tuberculosis* antigens optimizes CD4 T cell priming. *Cell Host Microbe* 15, 741-752.
- Srivastava, S., Grace, P.S., and Ernst, J.D. (2016). Antigen Export Reduces Antigen Presentation and Limits T Cell Control of *M. tuberculosis*. *Cell Host Microbe* 19, 44-54.
- Stamm, C.E., Collins, A.C., and Shiloh, M.U. (2015). Sensing of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and consequences to both host and bacillus. *Immunol Rev* 264, 204-219.
- Tameris, M.D., Hatherill, M., Landry, B.S., Scriba, T.J., Snowden, M.A., Lockhart, S., Shea, J.E., McClain, J.B., Hussey, G.D., Hanekom, W.A., *et al.* (2013). Safety and efficacy of MVA85A, a new tuberculosis vaccine, in infants previously vaccinated with BCG: a randomised, placebo-controlled phase 2b trial. *Lancet* 381, 1021-1028.
- Ting, L.M., Kim, A.C., Cattamanchi, A., and Ernst, J.D. (1999). *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* inhibits IFN-gamma transcriptional responses without inhibiting activation of STAT1. *J Immunol* 163, 3898-3906.
- Van Rhijn, I., and Moody, D.B. (2015). Donor Unrestricted T Cells: A Shared Human T Cell Response. *J Immunol* 195, 1927-1932.
- Velmurugan, K., Chen, B., Miller, J.L., Azogue, S., Gurses, S., Hsu, T., Glickman, M., Jacobs, W.R., Jr., Porcelli, S.A., and Briken, V. (2007). *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* nuoG is a virulence gene that inhibits apoptosis of infected host cells. *PLoS Pathog* 3, e110.
- Wolf, A.J., Desvignes, L., Linas, B., Banaiee, N., Tamura, T., Takatsu, K., and Ernst, J.D. (2008). Initiation of the adaptive immune response to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* depends on antigen production in the local lymph node, not the lungs. *J Exp Med* 205, 105-115.
- Wolf, A.J., Linas, B., Trevejo-Nunez, G.J., Kincaid, E., Tamura, T., Takatsu, K., and Ernst, J.D. (2007). *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infects dendritic cells with high frequency and impairs their function in vivo. *J Immunol* 179, 2509-2519.

Figure legends

Figure 1. T cells must be activated in distinct compartments for protection. Naive T cells are primed by their cognate antigens in secondary lymphoid tissues. Priming initiates clonal expansion, and influenced by cytokines produced by dendritic cells, they differentiate into effector or memory T cells, and egress the lymph node via the blood. To accomplish effector functions, T cells must traffic to the site of infection and be activated by recognizing their cognate epitope presented by infected cells. If T cells cannot be activated at the site of infection, they will not contribute to control of the infection.

Figure 2. Positional limitation of T cell efficacy Granulomas form by aggregation of infected and uninfected macrophages, followed by epithelioid transformation of macrophages surrounding the initial aggregate. T cells are recruited to granulomas but often concentrate at the granuloma periphery and do not contact infected cells in the central region. Mechanisms that restrict contact between T cells and infected cells in granulomas may include: 1) failure to produce or respond to chemoattractants; 2) signals that repel T cells from infected cells; 3) failure of T cells to recognize infected cells and stop migrating; 4) killing of T cells in proximity to infected cells; 5) arrest of T cells when they contact uninfected cells that have acquired antigen; and 6) mechanical barriers that prevent T cells from penetrating to the granuloma interior.

Figure 3. Models for incomplete immunity The graph plots the magnitude of hypothetical immunological responses versus the extent of protection, with distinct responses required to establish latent infection and to achieve sterile immunity. The "Barrier to immunological clearance" (BIC) represents any process (such as evasion of T cells) that constrains the extent of protection provided by an immune response, such that increasing the magnitude of that response does not increase protection.

Mechanism A (orange line), if great enough in magnitude, can provide sterile immunity without being limited by the BIC; this is an ideal mechanism to induce by vaccination. Mechanism B (green line) is constrained by the BIC and cannot provide sterile immunity regardless of the magnitude of the response. Mechanism C represents immunological mechanisms that, when excessive, cause pathological inflammation and tissue damage. CD4 T cell production of IFN γ conforms to the pattern of Mechanism C.

The shaded region indicates the relationship between response magnitudes and protection that cannot inform identification of correlates of immunity: Mechanisms A, B, and C all exhibit inadequate protection if the response is insufficient in magnitude, even though the individual mechanisms differ markedly in their potential for protection. Studies of vaccines that induce responses in the range shown in the shaded box will not reveal correlates of immunity, even if the specific mechanisms have the potential to provide sterilizing immunity.