

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Indigenous Symbols and Practices in the Catholic Church: Visual Culture, Missionization, and Appropriation. Edited by Kathleen J. Martin.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2nm1t3hg>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

O'Brien, Suzanne Crawford

Publication Date

2012-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Indigenous Symbols and Practices in the Catholic Church: Visual Culture, Missionization, and Appropriation. Edited by Kathleen J. Martin. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing, 2010. 300 pages. \$99.95 cloth.

As its title indicates, some of the articles in Kathleen Martin's edited volume examine the incorporation of indigenous symbols and practices in the Catholic Church, some contributions focus on missionization and appropriation, and others reflect on teaching art and art history to Native students outside of the Catholic context.

Although Martin emphasizes that the volume is not meant as a "challenge or critique" to those who practice Catholicism, her introductory comments suggest that she approaches the topic with a keen sense of skepticism. For example, Martin defines art as "socially constructed acts that reflect and perpetuate dominant ideology and interpretation" (2). This critical lens is evident in her chapter "Resistance and Change: Visual Culture, Missionization and Appropriation." Martin contrasts the work of the American Indian Movement of the 1960s and 1970s (which sought to revive Native traditions) with the Catholic ecumenical movement that took shape at the same time (which crafted efforts toward reconciliation). For Martin, the crux of the matter is power, and she argues that despite Catholic gestures toward reconciliation, existing power structures remain unchanged. Martin notes the shift toward lay leadership elsewhere in the world, but argues that the "gentle liberalism" of the Catholic ecumenical movement maintains its paternalism because it is not accompanied by a real shift in power in terms of church leadership, theology, or doctrine (26). Despite the rhetoric of unity, in Native North America non-Native church leaders retain final authority, causing significant elements of the mission concept to continue. True interfaith dialogue, Martin points out, requires equal collaboration and participation, while Catholic leaders downplay differences and provide a superficial, decontextualized interpretation of indigenous philosophies. For Martin, the borrowing and incorporation of indigenous symbols are another form of cultural suppression—albeit in a more subtle form.

Making a similar case, Jim Garret argues in chapter 2 that efforts to appropriate Native imagery in Catholic churches must be seen within an overarching history of the suppression of Native traditions. He describes the incorporation of the Sacred Pipe into the mass as a species of neocolonialism. For Garret, the use of indigenous images by Catholic churches must be accompanied by a fundamental change in behavior toward the earth: As long as the church maintains its doctrine of the hierarchy of humanity over nature, as well as the assumed superiority of Catholicism over indigenous religions, the incorporation of such symbols should be seen as "just another ploy."

Chapters 3 and 4 depart from Catholic appropriation of Native symbols and practices to provide histories of missionization. Examining the encounter between French Catholic missionaries and Native Americans in colonial Quebec, James Jeffries contributes to the book's overall conversation by framing the distinctions that existed between Catholic views of religion and that of the Native people of New France. Jeffries concludes that for the French, religion was a matter of belief in a divinity and "spiritual conviction" about those beliefs. The indigenous people of the region, however, were far more comfortable with ambiguity; that is, what they knew or believed about the spiritual beings that populated their landscape was less important than what they did to honor them.

Kalani Beyer's chapter examines the history of religious transformation among Native Hawaiians. In this context religious affiliations and alliances shift along with their intertwined political systems. For example, when political leaders die, they leave a religious vacuum; when conversions to Catholicism occur, they may be motivated in part by political dissent against a Protestant queen. Beyer's chapter reminds us of the ever-present political nature of religious conversion. She notes that Catholicism seemed to appeal to Native Hawaiians because it is "less doctrinaire, more accepting of Hawaiian culture, and offer[ed] a more active religion connected to rituals and beliefs that seemed more similar to the traditional Hawaiian religion" (94). At the same time, regardless of political shifts, local veneration of familial and ancestral spirits seemingly continued unabated, a parallel tradition that survives.

Two chapters examine the representation of Native people as images within the larger American landscape. Larry Taylor discusses how nineteenth-century photographs claiming to represent the Ghost Dance conflated the dance with violence, constructing a national narrative that viewed Native people and particularly Ghost Dancers as violent and unpredictable, in contrast to the domestic tranquility of Euro-American settlers. Looking at the National Museum of the American Indian, David Toole adds to the book's examination of Native people as "evidence," but in this case, Native people are constructing the narrative. Both Taylor and Toole are more optimistic about the interaction between Native and Christian traditions than the authors of previous chapters. Taylor describes the Ghost Dance as a missed opportunity for connection and continuity between Christian and indigenous traditions. Toole sees within Native cultures the possible salvation of the Christian tradition, writing "the irony is obvious: those sent on a mission to rescue the world have ruined it. . . . And how ironic is that? Those who were meant to be saved may now be in a position to offer salvation in return" (135).

Martin provides a more critical perspective on the interaction of Christian and Native traditions in her second contribution, which examines the use

of Native images in Catholic churches in light of interviews with Native consultants. Martin is critical of “a Western ethic that supports combining of traditions to make a point as opposed to an Indigenous ethic that explores spiritual ideas for further understanding life and the sacred” (139). She and her Native consultants see the use of Native symbols, detached from place and cultural context, as “antithetical” to indigenous values. She challenges the ways in which such images are used over the objections of traditionalists, and in ways that do not fundamentally change existing power structures. She raises the intriguing question: can religion be distilled from culture? She concludes that the use of such images by the Catholic Church is nothing less than “conversion violence” (161).

Chapters 8 and 9 take a very different direction, both exploring ways in which indigenous pedagogies can contribute to the teaching of art and art history. Chapter 8 suggests that teaching Native Hawaiian visual culture can focus students on community healing and emphasize interrelationship, and in Chapter 9, photography can serve as a medium for examining Navajo sacred places, memories, lessons, and traditions, in classes where Diné students are taught to frame their photographic work within Diné philosophies of Sa’ah Naghai Bik’eh Hozho and the four directions.

Chapters 10 and 11 (Angela Blaver and Bernardo Gallegos, respectively) turn our attention to the repercussions of colonialism in the Southwest. Blaver describes how colonialism has transformed Paiute rituals such as the Cry Dance and burial practices. Gallegos presents a history of Indians sold into slavery and finds that their descendants share “a relentless desire to name themselves” (212). Without a clear claim to a tribal identity and tradition, these descendants turn to ritual practices that merge the Catholic and the indigenous: Comanche Dances, veneration of Santo Niño de Atocha, Our Lord of Esquipulas, and La Virgen de Guadalupe. Such rituals, pilgrimages, and personal piety become ways of holding two cultures simultaneously, of participating in ambiguous identity. Strikingly, when Gallegos asks if a pilgrimage to Chimayo is a Tewa or Catholic practice, the response he provides is: “Does it matter?” Those who have inherited the unmistakable effects of Spanish imperialism must live within ambiguity and racial hybridity.

Martin concludes that the use of indigenous symbols by Catholic churches is “consuming, misleading, irritating, and disheartening, ambiguous and generally responsible for contributing to internal conflicts and external misrepresentations.” She notes that they might also be “comforting, reassuring, dynamic, and the basis for cultural and spiritual memory” (229), but she appears unconvinced of this, adding that such imagery “supports the continuing ideology of missionization and assimilation of the past,” and reflects a “homogenized ‘we’re all the same’ mentality of Western ideology” (233). At times, other

contributors to this volume agree with her conclusions, while other authors are not willing or able to draw a clear line between indigenous and Catholic practices. With such a diversity of method and subject matter, this fine collection can sometimes feel disjointed. Some chapters clearly fit under the book's purview, and others seem out of place. A different title would more accurately reflect its strengths, its diversity of voices and methodologies, and the many intriguing questions the collection raises regarding religion, culture, colonization, appropriation, and visual imagery.

Suzanne Crawford O'Brien
Pacific Lutheran University

Lessons from a Quechua Strongwoman: Ideophony, Dialogue, and Perspective. By Janis B. Nuckolls. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2010. 248 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

Nuckolls successfully intertwines complex linguistic concerns with an in-depth presentation of the language patterns of Luisa Cadena, her Quechua research subject. The book's focus is on ideophones, varied sounds people instinctively incorporate into their conversations in idiosyncratic language patterns in order to add meaning to such categories as gender, age, human, nonhuman, plant, and time, bringing depth and clarity to everyday discussions. As with other languages worldwide, Quechua patterns of ideophone use are possibly endangered due to contact with outside cultures, and their unique expressions are increasingly becoming marginalized due to culture change. This is not a new area of concern; as with Nuckolls's focus on the Andean language of the Quechua, anthropologists, historians, and sociologists have written of the normalizing of expression toward English and other Western languages that has been occurring.

The strongwoman of the title is a gendered category that has been described in other discussions of the Quechua. Women's power is generated in a number of life areas, including that of subsistence activities (for example, horticulture, cooking, and washing) as well as the production of a local fermented beverage that requires mastication. In doing this, women control a socially important beverage that household members are expected to share with visitors. Andean women do not necessarily have political power in a conventional sense, but are able to use their unique characteristic of personal strength to make their opinion known and to take action when they feel that something must be corrected. Nuckolls attributes a range of attributes and activities to the category of the strongwoman, including not only strength of character, but also