

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Building on a Borrowed Past: Place and Identity in Pipestone, Minnesota.
By Sally J. Southwick

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2jc8t3q6>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Treuer, Anton

Publication Date

2006-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

from the Ojibwe, Swampy Cree, Miami-Illinois, and Potawatomi accompany translations of the two Naskapi wolverine stories.

Cheyenne is represented by a translation of Laura Rockroads's 1975 telling of "The Rolling Head" story. Pauline Running Crane writes the one Blackfeet story, "Scarface," using her own translation of her grandfather's tale. Jeffrey D. Anderson revisits an old concern about what can be said for public consumption with several of his translated Ghost Dance songs from the Arapaho. Some traditionalists from Ghost Dance societies take exception even to century-old print and audio representations of this form. The translation and production of story narratives face similar criticism. Other considerations include the following: How can indigenous oral traditions survive amidst the distractions of the modern world? What about persistent interest by white scholars and some tribal people? How are ubiquitous encroachments of the English language to be reconciled?

Robert M. Leavitt, coeditor of a Passamaquoddy-Maliseet dictionary, introduces texts in all three volumes in this contemporary translations series; in the second and third volumes Philip LeSourd, who studies Wabanaki languages, introduces and translates Maliseet stories. For the collection's descriptive information to identify periods and dates of original renderings and translations in a more obvious way would help many readers. But Brian Swann's undertaking otherwise rewards our curiosity and attention for its content and what we learn about the topic.

Ron Welburn

University of Massachusetts Amherst

Building on a Borrowed Past: Place and Identity in Pipestone, Minnesota.

By Sally J. Southwick. Athens: Ohio University Press, 2005. 204 pages. \$38.95 cloth; \$18.95 paper.

The surprisingly well-researched *Building on a Borrowed Past* will be a useful addition to most library collections and historical researchers. Although Sally Southwick is not trained as an historian and does not practice a profession in the academy, her abilities to gather and synthesize a myriad of resource materials ranging from newspaper articles to personal interviews and official government documents is obvious. Although she probably overstates the importance of Longfellow's *The Song of Hiawatha* in inspiring interpretations of the pipestone quarries in Minnesota, she does an excellent job of demonstrating how they were conceived and interpreted by the general population. She also deftly demonstrates how they are reinterpreted today.

Building on a Borrowed Past is not without its limitations, however. The book would be of further use to historians if there had been some attempt to integrate Southwick's research with other historiography and writing on images of Indians and the interpretation of sacred sights. Southwick rightly delves into Catlin's writings and their influence on other scholars and government officials. However, an effort to show how a pervasive imaging of Indians

and their spirituality saturated the intellectual construction of the Pipestone National Monument would have been welcome and useful.

Perhaps even more troubling is the fact that Southwick embarked on this ambitious intellectual exercise for a period of many years without making a sincere effort at examining Indian voices, interpretations, or reservation politics. Although there are a few pages devoted to the Yankton Dakota position on the new interpretive center and many references to Pipestone's demarcation as a sight of Native mysticism, Southwick really should have taken some time to interview Indians who work in the quarries every day, reservation political leaders, spiritual leaders, and scholars. I think Southwick would have found a plethora of opinion, substantive historical and anthropological data, and advice. That information could have given a much broader range of understanding to the importance of Pipestone as a place and her work about it. It also would have given voice to Native concerns and interpretations of their sacred place in a positive and constructive way, eliminating the perception of this book as an outsider's view of how white people have interpreted the place, thus making it a balanced analysis of the site's importance to all people.

With those concerns in mind, however, *Building on a Borrowed Past* is a welcome exploration of a very importance place and perception in the American psyche. There is much to learn from reading this book, and it is also a great inspiration for further research.

Anton Treuer

Bemidji State University

The Cambridge Companion to Native American Literature. Edited by Joy Porter and Kenneth M. Roemer. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005. 343 pages. \$65.00 cloth; \$24.99 paper.

As difficult as it may be to believe, it has been more than fifteen years since LaVonne Ruoff's benchmark reference work, *American Indian Literatures* (1990), and a decade since Andrew Wiget edited his *Handbook of Native American Literature* (1994, 1996). Much has happened in both Native literary output and criticism of that literature since then, and there is a need for an update. Porter and Roemer step in to fill the void with this useful handbook. The volume bears more than a superficial resemblance to Wiget's handbook. Roemer was a contributor to that volume, as were several of the contributors here (Ruoff, Bernd Peyer, James Ruppert, Laura Coltelli, and Robert Nelson). Both books contain thematic, chronological, and genre essays, as well as pieces on specific Native writers.

Yet there are also important differences. Wiget's volume contains brief essays on more than forty Native writers; Porter and Roemer limit such pieces to longer treatments of eight of the most familiar (and hence most commonly taught) authors—all of them writing since 1968. Also, where Wiget gives considerable coverage to indigenous oral traditions, the editors here focus more narrowly (and usefully) on written literary production in English. They "hope that the