

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Justice in Aboriginal Communities: Sentencing Alternatives. By Ross Gordon Green.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2fs5g8c0>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 24(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

James, Keith

**Publication Date**

2000

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

warriors attacked the *Bell Savage* (for what reason Sturgis is silent). Shortly thereafter, Captain Ingersoll, commanding the *Charlotte*, sought to avenge the attack. Unfortunately, he attacked the wrong Indians. This produced another attack against a different American vessel. The result was a series of skirmishes that produced a climate of distrust between the indigenous hunters and American traders. This too is a theme found in other studies of the fur trade.

The editors provide the reader with important commentary about the impact of the Bostonians' arrival among the Indian groups. They remind the reader that indigenous peoples saw the Americans as intruders who often created violent situations through their trading practices or violations of indigenous custom. While Phelps' account omits references to these encounters, Sturgis' account does not. He details the consequences Bostonians paid when they failed to live up to Native concepts of behavior.

Scholars looking for new information about the Indians involved in the Pacific fur trade should look elsewhere. Still, this book is useful reading if one is interested in seeing how the American participants of the Northwestern fur trade viewed the enterprise. The editors are to be complimented for the documents they have included in the volume. One wishes, however, that the editors had paid attention to how the information found in these documents fits into our current understanding of the fur trade and the Native peoples mentioned in the texts.

Michael J. Mullin  
Augustana College

**Justice in Aboriginal Communities: Sentencing Alternatives.** By Ross Gordon Green. Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: Purich Publishing, 1998. 192 pages. \$20.50 paper.

This book has value within a limited scope. The cover, which has *Justice in Aboriginal Communities* in substantially larger type than *Sentencing Alternatives*, is somewhat misleading. It would be better were it something like *Sentencing Alternatives for Aboriginal Offenders*, since the book gives only very limited attention to broader issues of justice for aboriginal peoples. Instead, the focus is on alternative approaches to sentencing and, to a lesser extent, the attempted rehabilitation of Native people charged with criminal offenses by the mainstream Canadian police and court systems.

Its focus on options for sentencing Native people found guilty of or pleading guilty to violations of Canadian law offers a good overview of the variety of approaches that have been used to incorporate community input into the standard Canadian criminal justice system. Four categories of approach are examined: "The Sentencing Circle"; "The Elders' or Community Sentencing Panel"; "The Sentence Advisory Committee"; and the "Community Mediation Committee." Background discussions of Canadian sentencing law and traditional aboriginal approaches to justice, for which information is limited, according to this author, set the stage for case studies of these four alternative

approaches that are in operation in communities in Manitoba and Saskatchewan. Academic theories of criminal justice are outlined. Comparisons between Canadian criminal law and procedures and mainstream US legal approaches round out the contents. Given that aspects of the US legal system are presented in contrast to those of the Canadian system, it is interesting that nothing is mentioned about the tribal courts that are operated by a number of US tribal governments.

The author does a nice job of outlining the characteristics of the four alternative approaches examined and of giving examples of each in operation. In addition to the relatively detailed case studies from Saskatchewan and Manitoba that form the heart of the book, brief references are made to similar approaches in Alberta, British Columbia, Ontario, and the Yukon. Although written in a bland style, the case studies are informative and interesting, particularly to readers seeking information about sentencing options for Aboriginal criminal offenders. Many of the strengths, weaknesses, and operational difficulties of the various approaches are weighed. Some variations in how a particular approach has been put into effect in different communities are also described. These are the strengths of this book.

Its weaknesses begin with its narrow focus. While some attention is given to broader sociopolitical issues, a more in-depth analysis of criminal justice issues in the context of history, culture, current economic, political, and structural conditions, and internal community dynamics and systems would more thoroughly educate the non-Native reader and would more likely satisfy the Native reader. Just as the sentencing approaches reviewed are, as the author acknowledges, relatively thin and narrow efforts to patch problems of applying mainstream Canadian law and legal systems to aboriginal communities, the analysis of the roots and process of aboriginal justice issues is also somewhat narrow in focus. This problem is illustrated clearly in a brief mention of the alternative sentencing approaches developed by the Blood Tribe in Alberta. Nothing is written of the fact that the approach taken there involved efforts to examine traditional cultural practices and current community conditions in depth. In addition, it goes unmentioned that the resulting information was used to develop approaches that seek to integrate tradition and current realities and link justice reforms to other community issues and desires. The type of broad-based analysis undertaken on the Peigan Reserve would be a useful model for considering justice and sentencing issues in general. The interventions attempted at Peigan deserve much more consideration than they receive in this text.

Even the limited effort made to consider traditional justice approaches and their potential applicability in modern aboriginal communities seemed to me somewhat suspect. For instance, the author makes a passing reference to the potential value of teasing as a means of reprimanding those who have violated a community's laws or social order. This reminded me of a candidate for a Native community social service job who I once helped interview. When asked how she would deal with an existing conflict between two highly polarized community groups, she said that she would get members of the two factions to sit down together and, among other things, tease each other. Given

the diversity of Native cultures and communities in North America, I would not go so far as to say that teasing is or was ever used for dealing with relatively serious problems existing between individuals or groups. My experience, however, tells me that teasing is mainly used to teach lessons and maintain social systems that are relatively healthy and harmonious. The author's invocation of ribbing as potentially useful for dealing with substantial offenses gave me pause.

The same is true of Green's mention of the potential benefit of jury participation in sentencing in the United States. This method is argued to provide greater opportunity for community involvement than is seen in the standard Canadian approach to sentencing. I would not completely disagree. However, many historical instances have been documented that show US juries refusing to convict whites accused of crimes against minorities. Similarly, recent studies show that juries punish minority members more severely than whites accused of the same crimes. It seems as though Green assumes that Native defendants would face majority-Native juries so that bias would be less likely. Given the increasing percentage of Native Canadians residing off reserve, however, such an assumption is unwarranted. In fact, the author indicates that even the four alternative sentencing approaches he reviews would probably not apply to urban Natives. So the scope of applicability of the book's approaches to justice is narrowed still further. Even on reserve, jury bias because of familial and factional politics is possible. The author touches upon the possibility of this type of bias intruding into the four sentencing alternatives only briefly, and does not consider it in arguing for the advantage of the US system of jury involvement in sentencing. Consideration of the tribal court system in the US would have led to greater focus on this issue, since it is a problem that has influenced the actions of both judges and juries within it. So too would consideration of recent controversies in the United States over jury nullification—a jury's refusal to enforce a law because of the defendant's popularity or the law's unpopularity—add depth to the book. The O. J. Simpson murder trial and the Jack Kevorkian assisted-suicide trials have brought much negative publicity to the possibility of jury nullification in the United States in recent years.

Another concern I have about this work is hardly the author's error. Virtually no systematic efforts have been made by academics, judicial officials, or communities to examine the effectiveness of alternative sentencing approaches. The author reaches for evidence that shows whether reviewed alternative approaches are more likely to stop offense frequency and satisfy victims and their communities. He finds almost none other than anecdotes. This seems to me a serious lack that should be redressed. While *Justice in Aboriginal Communities* can be seen as a reasonable beginning effort in this direction, it is one that does not take us very far.

Finally, this book was written largely for academics and lawyers. The writing style is as dry as a dust storm on the Plains after a five-year drought. Legal precedents and legal system concerns, though leavened by some consideration of community issues and reactions, clearly dominate. *Justice in Aboriginal Communities* offers some valuable information and ideas, but will leave those

interested in achieving true justice for Native communities and individuals desiring much more.

*Keith James*

Colorado State University

**Kiowa: A Woman Missionary in Indian Territory.** By Isabel Crawford. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998. 241 pages. \$12.00 paper.

Isabel Crawford was a Canadian citizen and Baptist missionary who arrived at the Kiowa-Comanche-Apache Reservation near Mountain View, Oklahoma in 1893. She was single, white, and twenty-eight years old. *Kiowa: A Woman Missionary in Indian Territory* tells the story of her ten-and-a-half years among the Kiowa. Told in her own words and self-edited, this is a remarkable story of courage, faith, and determination. The book is as interesting and vital today as it was when originally written. She is both a product of her time in that she is totally immersed in her faith and desire to bring religious reform to those in need. At the same time, however, she is an opponent of the typical demure, respectful, fragile devout image of the turn-of-the-century lady. Her story brings a unique perspective to life on a Native American reservation at the turn of the century. This is, in part, because she was an unmarried female. The individuals living on the reservation were not afraid of a woman, because they did not vest her with the same authority they did white male missionaries. Rather than hold her apart from the people she served, the tribe accepted Crawford as a member of the community. It is this acceptance in the Native American community that provides a useful framework for understanding her narrative. Crawford writes that a goal of her book is "to contradict the statement that 'the only good Indian is a dead one'" (p. xxix). For their part, the Kiowa with whom she lived seemed more than willing to listen and learn from her without fearing that she was trying to destroy their way of life. The result is an interesting and complex picture of Native-missionary relations.

Unlike the way missionaries are presented in some academic histories, Crawford does not seem either ill-informed or malicious. She was headstrong, determined, strongly religious, and has the nineteenth-century reformer's belief that her religious ideals would and should guide the Kiowa away from their "savage habits." On the one hand she saw the Christian virtues of hard work, thrift, and love as antithetical to Kiowan values. On the other hand, she did not believe the Kiowa were evil or malicious. She viewed them simply as uninformed and thus she worked hard to overcome their ignorance. She believed in the value of hard work and example rather than preaching and prayer.

Crawford's diary is filled with accounts of everyday life that provide information about her experiences, her intelligence, and her faith and determination. Once after the visit of the "first Baptist Jesus-man to preach a sermon in the district," she writes that "it seems a long time since I prayed prayerfully but I'm sure I've worked prayerfully and I don't honestly believe the prayer