

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Kahnawa'ke: Factionalism, Traditionalism, and Nationalism in a Mohawk Community. By Gerald F. Reid.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2fr3m4qs>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 29(2)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Mohawk, John C.

**Publication Date**

2005-03-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

*Injun Joe's Ghost* provides a systematic look at the trope of mixed blood in specific political and historical contexts and in relation to the development, and even the waning, of American nationalism. In a final estimation of the power of contemporary Native writers, Brown suggests that the development of hybrid subjectivity in Native American writing will have a revolutionary effect: "a new understanding of race and the literary canon that recognizes the unsupportability of classification and division of writers, readers, and literatures as ethnically distinct" (245).

*Margo Lukens*

University of Maine

**Kahnawa'ke: Factionalism, Traditionalism, and Nationalism in a Mohawk Community.** By Gerald F. Reid. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004. 256 pages. \$49.95 cloth.

This is a history of the origins of modern Kahnawa'ke activism from 1870 to 1940. Kahnawa'ke (On-the-rapids) is a Mohawk community of some 7,200 residents located on the St. Lawrence River opposite Montreal. Previous published studies described Kahnawa'ke as a community that had been passive during the first seven decades of Canada's early formation and its planned gradual assimilation and integration of the Indian peoples. Reid's thesis departs from conventional Iroquois studies scholarship (Fenton, Tooker, Berkhofer, Shimony). Instead of viewing factions and factionalism as signs of dysfunction and the roots of debilitating weakness, competition between groups is seen as dynamic and a necessary way in which such communities respond to changes, pressures, and processes that threaten, or are perceived as threatening, the society's survival or well-being. Reid argues that the resulting complex dynamics in Kahnawaga energized a community characterized by cultural revitalization (herein designated "traditionalism") and a determination to achieve a political autonomy that was (and continues to be) nationalist in character.

The first chapter, "At the Rapids," tackles early history of a migration in the seventeenth century to the St. Lawrence Valley. The description of how the community was transformed from its Confederacy roots to a modern distinct community is consistent with the author's view that the evolution was complex and guided by pragmatic interactions with the environment. A quote is illustrative: "Kahnawakehro'non successfully integrated Rotinonhsionni and European cultural patterns and interacted with Euro-Canadian society in ways that avoided assimilation and created a unique culture. The community had a definite Catholic character, but traditional spiritual practices persisted and some Kahnawakehro'non were indifferent to Christian belief and practices" (14).

The approach is successful—and could have been successfully extended to the rest of the Confederacy—and is a reasonable rendering of a history of a group reacting to coercion and changing environments. *Kahnawa'ke* focuses

on changes since Canada became a confederation in 1867. Canada's 1869 Indian Act revoked an Indian woman's Indian status when she married a non-Indian. Resources (in this case firewood) were in short supply. Non-Indian spouses of Indian women were cutting wood and resentments grew into protests and a movement to have all white people removed from the reserve. From these origins tensions increased, arsons (mostly of barns), and livestock killings occurred; people were beaten, and at least one (white) man died (of suffocation in a burning barn). The story told here is balanced, well documented, and readily accessible.

The struggle between the reform movement and the traditionalists turned to politics with a movement to oust the life-chiefs in favor of an "elected system" of chiefs with three-year terms. The reform faction was embraced primarily by well-off landowners who favored the Indian Act, and the conservatives tended to be older and to own little or no land. A new system of government was imposed by Canada in 1889, and the Indian Act, including a provision that actions of the new council must be approved by the superintendent of Indian Affairs, prevailed. This was an important moment, perhaps more important than indicated by the text, in the evolution of Kahnawa'ke resistance and factionalism. Canada's attempts at assimilation invited the Indians either to acquiesce and cooperate with the band council system, to raise resistance by insisting on a return to "life-chiefs" and the traditional system of laws, or to try to maintain some kind of balance between the two alternatives.

An important meeting of the Confederacy Grand Council, the traditional government with its capitals in Grand River and Onondaga, New York, took place at Tyendinaga (at Bay of Quinte) in 1890. By then, Kahnawa'ke conservatives were declaring themselves allies, not subjects, of the British crown and announcing that they continued to maintain their sovereignty. Another important meeting took place at Akwesasne (here Ahkwesasne) and attracted chiefs from Onondaga and Grand River, Oneidas of the Thames, and other communities. Participants forged a statement, addressed to the superintendent general of Indian affairs, expressing opposition to the band council "elective system." Among the six signatories was Joseph Foster, a prominent political leader from Kahnawa'ke. By 1895 a significant number at Kahnawa'ke were in favor of returning to their traditional system of life-chiefs, but the Canadian government refused because they feared a return to the old ways would be an admission that Canadian Indian policy was a failure. A popular teacher, Peter J. Delisle, increased enrollment to the Catholic boys' school, but when he was replaced by the Sisters of St. Anne as part of an assimilationist strategy under the direction of Duncan Campbell Scott, deputy superintendent general of Indian Affairs in 1915, a resulting surge in nationalism drove the Kahnawa'ke community closer to the Confederacy.

Another important episode involved the Thunderwater movement. Chief Thunderwater established the Council of Tribes, which soon grew to include an estimated 26,000 members. The Thunderwater movement demanded Indian rights and a reversal of the Department of Indian Affairs' (DIA) tradition of treating them as children who could not attend to their own affairs. The DIA responded by insinuating that the meetings of the Council of Tribes

included a display of a German flag (Canada was at war with Germany at the time) and Duncan Campbell Scott refused to meet with them in Ottawa. Shortly thereafter the DIA found out that Thunderwater was an imposter (he was a non-Indian) and they exposed him. He disappeared, but his followers prevailed in the subsequent Kahnawa'ke elections and while the Thunderwater movement declined and eventually dissolved, the nationalist impulses it stirred lived on.

In 1920 Canada passed an amendment to the Indian Act that included a provision that Canada would decide which individuals could continue to be Indians and which would lose their Indian status because of their state of advanced acculturation. The Indians so vigorously protested this that the DIA withdrew the provision. Sometime between 1920 and 1927 a small group of Kahnawa'ke families began meeting at one of the homes in the village, including the home of Teres Kwarsenni, where they started to practice longhouse ceremonies. This is the first appearance of an organized longhouse community. Teres Kwarsenni was the mother of Paul Diabo.

In 1925 Paul Diabo was arrested in the United States, where officials initiated proceedings to deport him as an illegal alien. The Diabo case was vigorously supported by the Confederacy at Onondaga under the principle that the provisions of ancient treaties were still in force and provided rights, in this case rights to cross the border. Diabo won, and to this day Indians from Canada cannot be deported as illegal aliens. The establishment of a longhouse, at virtually the same moment as the unfolding Diabo case, led to yet another faction at Kahnawa'ke, one dedicated to the revitalization of Haudenosaunee sovereignty and the sovereignty of the Indian nations. A Confederacy meeting at Kahnawa'ke in 1927 helped to advance the movement for sovereignty and revitalization of the old ways.

Reid's book is an important, even indispensable, work in the area of contemporary Haudenosaunee history. The amount and quality of source document research is impressive and useful, and the book adds detail to our knowledge of how a tradition of resistance to Canadian plans for assimilation worked out in Kahnawa'ke, the Indian community with the most militant tradition of resistance in Canada.

The work does suffer, however, from a persistent absence of sources from fields other than anthropology in the analysis of important themes. This is especially true in the discussion on nationalism. There is no analysis here based on modern work on the origins and manifestations of nationalism that might inform how and why certain things took place the way they did. A more multidisciplinary approach might have offered informed speculation about why similar patterns of nationalism, "discovered" by Edmund Wilson in *Apologies to the Iroquois*, occurred in other territories that did not have benefit of Canada's rigid refusal to acknowledge Mohawk political rights of self-determination.

These comments are not intended to diminish the importance of the book. Reid challenges a tendency to view factionalism as simply a source of dysfunction and this is a much-needed correction. We are left to ponder how Iroquois communities in New York State, Southern Ontario, and even

Wisconsin developed nationalist movements that were similar and whether Native nationalism is ever anything but a reaction to external policy. The conclusion of *Kahnawa'ke* will be read with interest. Here, Reid examines the work of Tiaiake Gerald Alfred and finds that Alfred's work does not adequately address internal factional rivalries. I was not persuaded by the assertion. Alfred is a member of the Kahnawa'ke Mohawk and a political scientist at the University of Victoria. His books, *Heeding the Voices of our Ancestors: Kahnawake Mohawk Politics and the Rise of Native Nationalism* and *Peace, Power, Righteousness: An Indigenous Manifesto*, lend critical insight to anyone studying Kahnawa'ke culture and history.

*John C. Mohawk*

State University of New York, Buffalo

**Louis Owens: Literary Reflections on His Life and Work.** Edited by Jacquelyn Kilpatrick. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2004. 257 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

As the title and subtitle *Louis Owens: Literary Reflections on His Life and Work* suggest, Jacquelyn Kilpatrick's collection of essays is both a critical appraisal of the works of Owens and a commemoration of his life. The collection offers an important addition to Owens scholarship, especially since—with the exception of a special edition of *Studies in American Indian Literatures* (1998) and the commemorative issue of *Southwestern American Literature* (2003)—Owens has received relatively little critical attention.

This dearth of critical attention is especially troubling in that Owens, as the essays in this collection make eminently clear, is easily one of the most important and prolific of Native American fiction writers and critics to emerge in the past fifteen or so years. (His first novel, *Wolfsong*, came out in 1991, almost fifteen years after he first drafted it.) Louis Owens, who died in July of 2002, is the author of five novels, two works of autobiographical/critical nonfiction, two critical books on John Steinbeck, and another critical work on American Indian novels, *Other Destinies: Understanding the American Indian Novel*. The essays in Kilpatrick's collection are devoted primarily to his novels (at least one essay on each but *Bone Game*) and his two autobiographical/critical essay collections, *Mixedblood Messages* and *I Hear the Train*. Although there is no immediately apparent theme that unites the collection, the essays do successfully present a case for the complexities of Owens's thought and the need for yet more scholarship. They demonstrate the important links between Owens's life, politics, and friendships and his writings. The collection also includes a poem for Owens by Neil Harrison, an interview, and responses to Owens's essay collections.

In the interview, A. Robert Lee asks Owens about his childhood and young adulthood, focusing primarily on the author's life up to the point when he wrote *Wolfsong*. Although the interview focuses on his early life, as the editor comments, Owens's "responses resonate insightfully throughout the