

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The World Turned Upside Down: Indian Voices from Early America.
Edited by Colin G . Calloway.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2cg58374>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 19(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Ghere, David L.

Publication Date

1995-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The World Turned Upside Down: Indian Voices from Early America. Edited by Colin G. Calloway. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1994. 208 pages. \$35.00 cloth; \$6.50 paper.

Early American history has traditionally been written from a European and, particularly, a British perspective. American Indian people were portrayed as obstacles to the forward progress of civilization, and, when they no longer fulfilled this role, they simply disappeared from history. Rarely were they ever depicted as autonomous actors in the historical drama but merely military auxiliaries controlled by threats of a fiery damnation from French Jesuits or enticed by English gifts and trade goods. Only in the last few decades have ethnohistorians been able to discard the stereotypes of warlike savage and noble savage to examine how Indian peoples confronted their various situations.

Colin Calloway's *The World Turned Upside Down* is a collection of fifty-two documents containing Indian speeches and letters from early American history. These Indian voices "allow us to question the assumptions of Europeans whose writings for so long monopolized our view of America's history. They help us to remember that one people's nation building often means another's conquest, that 'civilization' is in the eye of the beholder, and that America's colonial and national roots were planted in ground that Indian people had cultivated for thousands of years" (p. 18).

Calloway points out that Indians were quite vocal about their relationships with Euro-Americans and that a significant number of documents exist that record Native American viewpoints. "Indian people were virtually everywhere in colonial America," employed in a wide variety of endeavors in towns and cities as well as on the frontier. However, "mundane, nonviolent, everyday relationships never attract as much attention as do murder and mayhem," so many of these activities went unrecorded in colonial documents (p. 10). Calloway indicates that this omission skews the historical evidence, since Native American speeches and letters that have survived generally focus around contentious issues or wartime activities. Similarly, the recorded viewpoints of Indian women are quite scarce, resulting from the social mores of both Native American and Euro-American cultures.

While promoting his book as a much-needed counter to traditional history, Calloway, in his introduction and his editorial comments that precede each selection, urges the reader to be cautious. This collection must be read carefully, he advises, be-

cause Native American views may be distorted by the perceptions and purposes of the Euro-American writers of the documents. Even in accurately recorded and translated texts, the particular situation that prompted the document, the current diplomatic and military context, Indian factional struggles, and the document's target audience all must be considered to understand the Indians' motives for choosing the particular words used. Calloway also warns that Native Americans could be just as ethnocentric and biased in their views as Euro-Americans and that they may have been silent, evasive, or purposefully misleading concerning those issues that were most important to them.

The World Turned Upside Down provides a wide variety of Native American views and perspectives on intercultural relations in early America. Indian people "were living in a world that was literally changing before their eyes," and their words "reveal their concerns about the transformations they witnessed and their opinions about Europeans as the primary agent of change" (p. 2). Numerous speakers lamented the decline of their populations and military power compared to the Euro-Americans and their growing dependence on European trade goods. Others objected to the European powers' manipulating Indian peoples into European wars and then expecting the Indians to carry the burden of the fighting. Still others charged that the Europeans created disputes between Native American peoples so that they could be more easily deprived of their lands.

The selections contain numerous examples of the imagery and symbolism that were prevalent in Indian oratory, as well as the use of humor, irony, and sarcasm. Eloquent speeches provided include Garangula's reply to New France Governor La Barre in 1684 and Canasatego's and Gachadow's speeches at the Treaty of Lancaster in 1744. A number of articulate critiques of European and Euro-American societies can be found, such as Powhatan's bewilderment at the illogical English penchant for war, a Micmac elder's questioning of French civilization in 1677, and Joseph Brant's (Mohawk) comparison of Indian and white cultures in 1789. Indian complaints concerning the mistranslation of treaty provisions are included, as well as two treaty texts in the appendices for comparison with the documents. Particularly compelling is the contrast between the text of the Casco Bay Treaty and Loron Sauguarum's (Penobscot) detailed account of the treaty negotiations.

"Different Indian peoples had different experiences and different ways of dealing with European invasion. There was no single

Indian response just as there was and is no single Indian voice" (p. 8). In some selections, Native Americans identify contradictions between Christian beliefs and actions and reject missionary offers to teach their children; in others, Christianized Indians extoll their newfound beliefs. Several documents illustrate fraudulent land acquisitions, such as the infamous "Walking Purchase" from the Delaware, as well as instances where Indians used land sales as a tactic in their efforts to maintain their way of life. At times, Indians strenuously rejected European sovereignty over them and engaged in warfare and/or migration in an effort to maintain their autonomy. Selections in this vein include Stung Serpent (Natchez) castigating the French in 1723, Atiwaneto (Abenaki) defying the English in 1752, and Minavavana (Chippewa) rejecting English pretensions to Chippewa land in 1761. In other circumstances, Native Americans submitted to European sovereignty for the military or legal protection they hoped it would afford them, such as in the Narragansett people's submission to "Old England" in 1644 or the Mashpee's petition to the Massachusetts General Court in 1752.

The World Turned Upside Down is an excellent choice as a supplementary reader for American history courses focusing on the period from first settlement to the Constitution. Calloway's selections focus on the crucial issues affecting Euro-American relations with Native Americans, such as land, trade, sovereignty, warfare, and treaties. The nineteen-page introduction is a cogent, concise discussion of Indian/white relations and an assessment of sources. The documents are divided into topical chapters and organized chronologically within each chapter, with editorial comments that both provide a context for each selection and emphasize important points about Native American history. The text is augmented by useful illustrations and informative maps, a rare inclusion in a documentary collection.

This book compares favorably with James Axtell's *The Indian Peoples of Eastern America: A Documentary History of the Sexes* for its usefulness in the history classroom. Axtell's work provides the reader with an understanding of Native American societies through the selection of documents addressing the life cycle of Indian people and may be more suitable to the anthropology classroom. Calloway's focus on issues affecting intercultural relations, his topical/chronological organization of the documents, and his excellent editorial comments facilitate the documents' integration throughout the course of early American history.

Furthermore, the introduction serves exceptionally well as an overview of issues in Native American history for this period, while the documents will provide the student with an appreciation of Indian perspectives on events and issues raised in other assigned readings or in class discussion.

David L. Ghere
University of Minnesota

A Zuni Artist Looks at Frank Hamilton Cushing: Cartoons by Phil Hughte. Zuni, New Mexico: Pueblo of Zuni Arts and Crafts, A:shiwi A:wam Museum and Heritage Center, 1994. 124 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Late one September afternoon in 1879, a stranger from the East rode unannounced into Zuni Pueblo on muleback. This was Frank Hamilton Cushing, who would become Zuni's—and the world's—first live-in anthropologist. In the course of the next four-and-one-half years, Cushing became conversant in the Zuni language, was adopted into the governor's family and clan, and participated generally in the life of the pueblo, eventually winning a prominent role as an officer in the Zuni war society and an intermediary with the local white authorities. At the same time, to varying degrees of Zuni consternation, he learned—and recorded—everything he could about their culture and secret lore.

Now, a century later, Cushing remains a legendary figure in Zuni, as well as in the field of anthropology—and one who still arouses mixed feelings among Zuni people as well as among anthropologists. In Zuni, he is remembered at once as a friend who understood the Zuni and who saved a vital part of their reservation from land-grabbers with powerful political connections; as a well-meaning but comically immature busybody; and as a not-so-well-meaning intruder who wormed his way into the inner sanctums of Zuni religious life and then betrayed sacred secrets.

Mixed feelings figure accordingly in the story recounted in the forty-three cartoons by Phil Hughte gathered and published here with comments by Triloki Nath Pandey, Jim Ostler, and Krisztina Kosse. As the title suggests, the cartoons belong to the genre of "observers observed" or "the other speaks," represented (under titles that betray an earlier sensibility) in studies of indigenous art