

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Cherokee Ghost Dance. By William G. Mcloughlin.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2cf4z3m0>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 9(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Mullin, Michael J.

Publication Date

1985-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

natives along the Panama Route to California." However, this chapter is primarily devoted to examining anti-Mormon prejudices and their causes, and secondarily, to identifying the experiences along the Panama Route which did little to motivate women to reevaluate their negative attitudes toward Panamanians.

In Chapter 7, the author discusses the power of the legacy of image and myth which not only gave frontierswomen much to overcome, but also prevented their attitudinal changes and real experiences from filtering back and affecting the social treatment of both women and Indians in 19th and 20th century America. As Riley correctly notes, the legacy itself has perpetuated prejudice and discrimination into the 20th century and has prevented generations of observers from perceiving the true nature of the interaction of women and Indians on the frontier. We should all take heart that a move is now underway to reexamine old images and myths, explode old prejudices, and revise presentations of this particular portion of the history of the American West. However, until the realities of the lives and cultures of American Indians and other populations are also incorporated into revisions of American history, the task will not be complete.

Charlotte J. Frisbie

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville

The Cherokee Ghost Dance. By William G. McLoughlin. Macon, Georgia: Mercer University Press, 1984. 512 pp. \$34.50 Cloth.

It is a pleasure to have seventeen of William G. McLoughlin's previously published essays collected together in a single volume. However, at first glance *The Cherokee Ghost Dance* does not seem aptly titled. Not only does this work have little to do with the famous Ghost Dance Movement of the late nineteenth century, only one chapter of the book deals with the Cherokee equivalent of the early 1800s. What McLoughlin does is enliven the history of the Cherokee Nation between 1789 and 1861, as few, if any, previous scholars have been able to do. Divided into three sections: Cherokee Nationalism, Slavery, and Missionaries, this work illustrates how "Indian" history is often times more connected with "traditional" American political history than

scholars of either school care to admit. Using political, ethno-historical, and religious sources, McLoughlin presents the reader with a detailed account of the Cherokee Nation, particularly its relationship with the American government and various missionary groups. This work should be considered primarily a work in "Indian" history despite the author's claim that his work is about "the cultural history of the United States and not about the history of Native Americans" (p. xix).

Throughout the book the author demonstrates how Southern states' rights political philosophies affected Cherokee history. The author also shows how "national" political divisions came to be fought over the "Indian question." To do this McLoughlin focuses his attention on how these "national" conflicts took shape within the Cherokee Nation, and he does this by discussing the cultural assimilation of both "full" and "mixed" blooded Cherokee, Indian removal, and slavery. In the process, McLoughlin gives the reader brief biographical sketches on some of the most colorful and controversial figures in Cherokee history, and shows how quantification can be put to good use in certain areas of "Indian" history.

Despite the author's disclaimer, this work is primarily a study of Native Americans and as such it offers the historian a wealth of information. One of the highlights of the book is McLoughlin's documentation of a persistent cultural cleavage between the "full" and "mixed" blood Cherokee. According to McLoughlin, these divisions were apparent in the peoples' willingness to acculturate, language preference, Christian affiliation (or lack thereof), and (at the end of the book) with which side of the slavery question they took. Throughout the book one is shown how the "mixed" bloods dominated the political and economic life of the nation. This domination becomes most visible when the author discusses who supported or rejected the institution of slavery. Although this division can be seen prior to the 1840s and 1850s, the divisiveness of the slavery issue did not become apparent until another issue, that of Cherokee removal, had been settled. Yet where slavery ultimately divided the Cherokee Nation, removal had the opposite effect.

The first plan for Cherokee removal was the brainchild of the Cherokee Indian agent Return J. Meigs, and came during the Presidency of Thomas Jefferson. However, those scholars who maintain that the government's plan for removal was actively

pursued from this time on would do well to pay close attention to McLoughlin. He argues that the idea of removal was initiated by Meigs and was not only in conflict with traditional governmental Indian policy, it was never truly pursued by any president before Andrew Jackson. More importantly, McLoughlin argues that Meigs' attempt to remove the Cherokee, an endeavor which threatened to erupt into a civil war among the Indians and almost destroyed the Cherokee Nation, "ended in the reunification and revitalization of the Cherokee Nation" (p. 110). For the next thirty years internal quarrels would be set aside when it came to fighting Indian removal. On this issue there was unanimity.

It is no secret that the Cherokee lost their bid to remain in the Southeast, yet as McLoughlin makes clear, the nation was not destroyed when it resettled in the Oklahoma Territory. It would take more than physical displacement to destroy the cohesiveness of the Cherokee. Like their white neighbors, the issue which led to the break-up of the Cherokee nation in its original form was slavery.

Slavery is generally perceived as being a black-white relationship, but as McLoughlin makes clear the issue also had a red component. With the Cherokee, slavery came to be seen as an example of assimilation gone awry, or as proof of their growing acculturation. In 1809 the Cherokee owned 583 slaves, by 1835 there were 1,592 slaves residing among the nation, and by the 1850s the Indians had established slave codes similar to their southern neighbors. Held primarily by wealthy mixed bloods, these slaves proved an embarrassment to some of the missionaries living within the nation. Indeed, McLoughlin points out that the Baptist Schism of 1844-1845 was nominally begun when a Cherokee minister named Jesse Bushyhead was found to own three slaves. From this point on, the author argues, all the missionary groups among the Cherokee—Baptists, Methodists, and Presbyterians—would find their attitude toward slavery unavoidably intertwined with their relationship towards the Indian. McLoughlin persuasively documents how these "national" religious clashes often manifested themselves in the religious groups dealings with the Cherokee. Therefore, it should not be surprising that many missionary boards came to equate the success of their missions with the Indians position on slavery.

Much of McLoughlin's work borders on church history. It is

the story of missionary activities among the Cherokee, rather than the Indians' relationship towards the missionaries. McLoughlin justifies his reliance on missionary records on the grounds that they offer an alternative to official governmental records. Still, this emphasis on white documentation means the reader is still reading about Indian actions rather than studying what the Indians themselves thought. Furthermore, this reliance on missionary records means the reader is studying "mixed" blood Cherokees rather than the nation as a whole since the "mixed" bloods were more likely to belong to a Christian establishment than were the "full" bloods. Although the "full" bloods came to be proportionately smaller in numbers throughout the years of the book, it would be nice to get a greater understanding of their side of the story. Still, McLoughlin did say that this work was not about Native Americans particularly; therefore, it might be unfair to hold McLoughlin accountable on this point.

Though primarily about the Cherokee people as a whole, as the book moves through time it also serves as an introduction into the famous families and individuals of Cherokee history. One such family are the Vanns, and perhaps its most interesting member is James Vann. Beginning with Vann's role in Cherokee unification and his opposition to Cherokee removal, McLoughlin's portrait of the Vann family only reinforces the old adage 'the rich always get richer.' McLoughlin's chapter on James Vann and subsequent references illustrate the best and worst of this work.

With James Vann one sees the role of the "mixed" blood in Cherokee society and at its best the reader is told the story of one man's participation in some of the great moments in Cherokee history. Yet the reader is also given contradictory information about some of James Vann's acts. One such example is Vann's relationship with the "Earle" settlers in 1807-1808. In Chapter Two the reader is told that the Cherokees' apprehension of the settlers took place without the prior approval of Vann and only after William Brown's letter did Vann become involved. In the very next chapter, however, McLoughlin writes that Brown's wagon train "was surrounded by armed Cherokees whom Vann had equipped and directed" (pp. 91-92). This confusion would probably be overlooked if each chapter had remained a separate article, yet when they are combined back-to-back it leads to some confusion.

In conclusion, despite some discrepancies and limitations, McLoughlin's work makes a valuable contribution not only to "Indian" history but to understanding American political history during the first six decades of the nineteenth century. It is well written and full of interesting characters and events. It would not be surprising to see this work become a standard reference for Cherokee history in the years to come.

Michael J. Mullin

University of California, Santa Barbara

The Shoshoni-Crow Sun Dance. By Fred W. Voget. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. 347 pp. \$19.95 Cloth.

Illustrated with the author's photographs, this well-written account discusses much more than the modern Crow Sun Dance and its diffusion from the Wind River Shoshoni. Voget's association with the Crow spans the years 1939-1975. Thus, the book represents the results of a longitudinal study of nearly 40 years. Although cast in an ethnohistorical framework, the book is not merely an ethnographic history; it also constitutes an important statement on the origins of religion and the role of individuals in cultural change.

The book's central questions are: What is the modern Crow Sun Dance, how did it get that way, and why does it persist? In order to elucidate these questions, the author proceeds first to a short history of the Crow people, then to an excellent synopsis of traditional Crow culture based on salvage ethnographies of the pre-1930 period, punctuating the discussion with anecdotes from Frank Linderman's (1930) biography of Plenty Coups, from Robert Lowie's many articles and monographs, and from other works. Clans, kinship, medicine lodges and warrior sodalities, reciprocal obligations, chieftainship, residence patterns, prestige indicators, and the complexities of social life and its political and legal parameters are all covered succinctly and authoritatively. An entire chapter is devoted to the traditional Crow Sun Dance, which was abandoned in 1875, and to the symbolism and mythology concerning it. Another two chapters cover the Crow cultural innovators, who disseminated the Sun