

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Indians and the American West in the Twentieth Century. By Donald L. Parman.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2bb0m7kq>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 19(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Johnson, Troy R.

Publication Date

1995-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

government. Tribes that were not forcibly removed from the Southeast to Indian Territory found their lands reduced to mere remnants of the vast territories they had proudly inhabited.

Growing Up Native American relates many of these injustices. Instead of being educated by their families and elders to pass on tribal values through storytelling and ceremonial participation, young children were removed from their homes and thrust into boarding schools. Punished for speaking their native languages, frequently ill fed and brutally treated, these young people often experienced psychological traumas. One section of the book includes autobiographical accounts of student life in mission schools, revealing the courage of young people during a stressful period of their lives. For example, an excerpt from Louise Erdrich's *Love Medicine*, which won the National Book Critics Circle Award for fiction in 1984, tells about the brutal treatment of a sensitive fourteen-year-old girl in a convent school.

N. Scott Momaday, whose novel *House Made of Dawn* won the Pulitzer Prize for fiction in 1969, explores his family history and searches for his own identity through the life story of grandfather. In "Uncle Tony's Goat," Leslie Marmon Silko recalls learning a valuable childhood lesson about respecting animals. Silko received a MacArthur Foundation award in 1981 for her Laguna Pueblo stories and poems.

Patricia Riley has selected magnificent growing-up stories, some of the best examples of her people's writings, to give the reader a sense of both the commonality and the diversity of Native American life on reservations and in urban communities. Inés Hernandez, who teaches in the Native American studies program at the University of California at Davis, has contributed an insightful foreword and a list of scholarly literature, both of which add to the worth of this collection of well-known and lesser-known contemporary voices.

Edith Blicksilver

Indians and the American West in the Twentieth Century. By Donald L. Parman. Foreword by Martin Ridge and Walter Nugent. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994. 256 pages. \$12.95 paper.

In their foreword to Donald Parman's book, Martin Ridge and Walter Nugent provide the reader with the parameters and scope

of the work at hand: to provide a study of government policy and relationships with Native American people in the American West during the twentieth century. Specifically, in *Indians and the American West in the Twentieth Century*, Parman sets out to provide an understanding of the relationships between competing economic interests in the developing West, the role and influence of government policy and decision-making, and the role of influential individuals, including presidents of the United States, congressmen, and officials within the Bureau of Indian Affairs. Ridge and Nugent place this book in its proper genre as one in a series of books, the *American West in the Twentieth Century*, along with Richard W. Lowitt's *The New Deal and the West*, and William H. Mullins's *The Depression and the Urban West Coast*, a series designed to provide a better understanding of the recent past of the American West.

As can be seen, the parameters are broad, and the scope encompasses more than one hundred years of policymaking, hearings, appeals, and Congressional actions beginning with the 1886 Dawes Act and ending with a 1991 district court ruling on fishing, hunting, and gathering rights for the Lac Courte Oreille and several other Wisconsin Chippewa bands of Indian people. This is a challenging task indeed, but one that Donald Parman handles with proficiency and clarity.

Parman begins his assessment of the impact of the American West on Indian people by pointing out that the General Allotment Act (Dawes Act) of 1887, one of the most devastating federal government programs dealing with Indian lands, was not a product of the West. The act, which cost Indian people ninety million acres of land, was, in fact, a product of the East, specifically Senator Henry L. Dawes, from Massachusetts, and his eastern supporters, who had inspired earlier severalty bills. The allotment of land in severalty to Indian people was a common feature of treaties negotiated with Indian tribes in the mid- to late 1800s. The provisions of the act authorized the president to allot reservation lands to enrolled Indians: 160 acres to heads of families; 80 acres to single individuals over eighteen and to orphans; and 40 acres to unmarried persons under age. Although this would appear to benefit greatly those in the West, the West as we know it was still in its infancy and, as Parman points out, had little political influence. Only California, Colorado, and Nebraska had matured to the level of statehood, and these states had more pressing matters to address in 1887 than the allotment of Indian

land. Parman is correct in his assessment of the influence of the East when he points out that the Allotment Act was more than an attack on tribal lands. Land allotment, as Parman states, "embodied more than property rights. The architects of the policy aimed at broader goals, such as destroying tribal authority, eradicating native religions, and changing Indians into farmers" (p. 1). The Allotment Act intended to bring about a complete transformation of Indian life, a life those in the East could comprehend only poorly. eastern policymakers, as Parman points out, "had little understanding of the western geography, economic and social environment, and no concern for Indian traditions" (p. 10).

Among the environmental factors the eastern policymakers failed to comprehend was water. Indeed, the key ingredient in the development of the West was access to water and water rights. Most lands in the West—both Indian and non-Indian—are arid. In a quest for control of this liquid gold, the California goldminers made their own law in the absence of a codified system: "first in time, first in right." States adopted this prior appropriation doctrine, which stated that, under state law, a water user obtains a right senior and superior to all later users if he or she puts the water to beneficial use. Indian water rights, however, as Parman points out, are defined not by state laws of prior appropriation, but by federal law. The 1908 landmark decision, *U.S. v. Winters*, defined these Indian water rights. Parman provides an excellent synopsis of what has become known as the "Winters doctrine" and friction in the West between white settlers and Indian over the water rights issue. He also correctly identifies the Bureau of Indian Affairs as a major hindrance to the protection of Indian water rights, because it acceded to state water codes based on the doctrine of prior appropriation. Other natural resources were exploited as well, such as timber resources on Indian reservations in Minnesota and Wisconsin. Parman provides the reader with an insight into the problems associated with "standing timber" as opposed to "dead and down timber" and the failure of the federal government to provide modern forestry management for Indian timber resources.

In the areas of water and timber, the West was now heavily involved. Western influence over Indian affairs had increased drastically. However, the goals of the westerners, as Parman states, "remained almost identical to the eastern reformers who designed and secured passage of the General Allotment Act of 1887."

Other areas of interest to the reader are Parman's thorough research and presentation of issues in the development of the

American West that impacted Indian people, Indian land, and Indian natural resources. Parman provides the reader with an insight into the awesome consequences of the Allotment Act of 1887, foremost of which was the resultant exploitation in Oklahoma of Indian land and oil money. Included are land and mineral thefts that often took the shape of guardianship abuses of young Indian children who, under the Allotment Act, now held title to lands containing extensive mineral wealth. Following at this point in the footsteps of the eminent Angie Debo, Parman highlights the massive corruption that followed the declarations of incompetence of Indian adults and the rampant land frauds and illegal conveyances of fee simple land titles under the guise of land lease and convenience marriages, as well as the mysterious disappearance or death of Indian landholders.

Parman also presents the reader with an analysis of World War I and World War II as means to carry forward the prewar goal of taking Indian land. While Indian men and women served in the armed forces in large numbers during both wars, the government capitalized on the opportunity to acquire Indian lands, such as the Pine Ridge grazing lands, for uses such as bombing ranges and, in California and Arizona, concentration camps for Japanese-Americans during World War II. Promises were made to return the land to the Indian people or, in the case of the land taken for concentration camps, for agricultural improvement, the government did neither. In the 1970s, the return of land taken for use as bombing ranges would be one of the focuses of the new Indian activism by members of the American Indian movement and what has come to be known as the Red Power movement. The contributions of graduates of the various Indian boarding schools and of the Indian code talkers during both world wars are included in Parman's analysis.

Parman provides the reader with great insight into a major historical figure, John Collier, who was instrumental in the development of policies that affected Indian people in the American West. Parman credits—correctly, I would argue—Collier's emergence as an Indian reformer in 1922 as a turning point in Indian affairs (p. 76). Collier believed in cultural pluralism, countered those who favored assimilation, attacked the BIA, and fought to preserve tribal cultures and the remaining Indian land base. He disagreed with western congressional leaders who proposed the rapid opening of additional Indian lands and was subsequently attacked by the Senate Indian Affairs Committee in 1943. Collier

replied to allegations of distortion of population statistics, underestimates of per capita expenditures, and wasted funds by insisting that his main concern had always been the protection of Indian people. This concern, however misdirected it may seem, prompted him, while he was commissioner of Indian affairs, to cooperate in granting leases for oil, gas, and mining on reservations in the West. Although protection of the Indian land base and approval of mineral leasing may be seen as incompatible, by cooperating with other government agencies in granting these leases, Collier was attempting to enhance his agency and gain support in assisting Indian people.

Parman also provides the reader with a keen insight and analysis of the 1926–27 Meriam inquiry, what many have called the most significant inquiry into Indian conditions and administration to that date. Parman provides a view of the team makeup, the investigation, and the Meriam report, which was published in 1928 as *The Problem of Indian Administration*. The report was, in fact, an exposé of the failure of the federal government to live up to the trust responsibility dating back to the John Marshall Supreme Court. The report focused on Indian education, health, and poverty. BIA education was correctly classified as grossly inferior to public schooling, and the report was particularly critical of the boarding schools, where Indian students spent half of their school days performing duties needed to operate the institutions instead of studying in the classroom. The report was equally critical of BIA health care. Indian people, it was pointed out, suffered extremely high rates of tuberculosis, trachoma, and other diseases, but BIA treatment facilities were inferior to facilities maintained by federal and state agencies for non-Indians (p. 85). The report went on to state that “too many of them [Indians] are poor and living below any reasonable standard of health and decency” (p. 85). Parman points out that approximately two-thirds of the Indian population possessed less than \$2,000 each, with one-half holding personal property worth less than \$500 (p. 85). Many of the recommendations issued by the Meriam Commission focused on improving the efficiency of the BIA with more funding, and the Hoover administration attempted to implement many of the reforms of the Meriam report. The two major achievements were the reorganization of the BIA and major increases in funding. BIA appropriations, Parman points out, rose from \$16,000,000 in 1929 to \$20,000,000 in 1932 (p. 91). Unfortunately, as is often the case, much of the additional money went to raise the salaries of BIA

workers and to add new positions to the bureaucracy, neither of which relieved the severe distress among Indian people that was highlighted in the Meriam report.

Parman's presentation of the 1934 Indian Reorganization Act, the post-World War II era, termination, relocation, and the rise of self-determination and the Red Power movement in the 1960s and 1970s are equally compelling and informative. Parman guides the reader through the ideology, political maneuvering, and ramifications of the various programs as they have impacted upon the American West, and specifically Indian people as residents of the American West: the attacks on land base, mineral resources, and tribal sovereignty. Parman correctly identifies the new Indian wars as an effort by Indian people to preserve energy, water, and autonomy (p. 169).

My criticisms of Parman's work are few and, in view of the overall importance of his work, would only detract from an excellent book. Therefore, I will mention only one; ironically, it is the final sentence in his conclusion. Parman states, "If Indians and non-Indians can overlook their differences and *concentrate on the basics that unite them*, such as the land and a *shared sense of place*, perhaps the next century will offer better prospects for rapport" (p. 184). I believe Indian people would argue that, in the development of the American West, as with the rest of the nation, non-Indians have never possessed a "sense of place" for reasons other than possession and exploitation; "sense of place" certainly is not a current basis that unites Indian and non-Indian. Non-Indians need to develop a respect for the land, a concentration on conservation rather than relentless development; then, perhaps, a shared sense of place can exist, and unity will be possible.

Indians and the American West in the Twentieth Century is an important contribution to understanding the development of the West and provides a clear and impressive analysis of evolving government policy and programs that impacted directly on the resident Indian people. The book is a welcome addition to the growing historiography on government policy, economics, and political power in the American West, which includes Vine Deloria, Jr.'s *American Indian Policy in the Twentieth Century* and Christine Bolt's *American Indian Policy and American Reform*, and is recommended for college classroom use.

Troy R. Johnson
California State University, Long Beach