UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

"Enemies Like a Road Covered with Ice": The Utah Navajos' Experience during the Long Walk Period, 1858-1868

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/24d7s6jc

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Authors

Hornsby, Sarah
McPherson, Robert

Publication Date

2009-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

Peer reviewed

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

AMERICAN INDIAN CULTURE AND RESEARCH JOURNAL 33:2 (2009) 1–22

“Enemies Like a Road Covered with Ice”: The Utah Navajos’ Experience during the Long Walk Period, 1858–1868

SARAH HORNSBY AND ROBERT S. MCPHERSON

“What is history but a fable agreed upon.” So wrote Napoleon Bonaparte, a man considered by many to be a tactical genius and by others to be a bloody butcher. Reality lies somewhere between, part of the fable. Defined as “a narrative making a cautionary point . . . a story about legendary persons or exploits . . . [or] a falsehood,” the term *fable* characterizes, in a positive and a negative sense, the treatment of many historic episodes, including the Navajo Long Walk period.[1] Much has been written of this time when the Navajo people, following what appears to be a fairly short resistance, surrendered in droves to the US military, collected at Fort Defiance and other designated sites, then moved in a series of “long walks” to Fort Sumner (Hwéeldi) on the Pecos River in eastern New Mexico.[2]

There was much that preceded these events. Stretching back to the beginning of Euro-American occupation of the Southwest, the Spanish initiated a slave trade against the “wild” or unsettled (non-Puebloan) Indians that pitted various groups against their neighbors. Two major players in the arena were the Utes and Navajos. They shared relatively few years of peace, remaining generally in a state of warfare that simmered somewhere between hostility and open conflict. As with so many colonial wars, the beginning of these tit-for-tat reprisals is lost to history, but its constancy is not. Spanning the Spanish, Mexican, and early territorial period of the American Southwest, the slave trade was a prime source of fuel for intertribal conflict and provided the owner of captive Indians with labor to enhance comfort and spur economic development.[3] Much of what characterized this period of history and Navajo/Ute relations is comparable to what happened to other peoples in different settings.

Sarah Hornsby holds a bachelor’s degree in anthropology from Troy University and currently serves as a VISTA volunteer while working on a book about Navajo women. Robert S. McPherson teaches at the College of Eastern Utah—San Juan Campus, is a member of the Utah State History Board, and is writing an ethnohistory of the White Mesa Utes.

By the time the Americans inherited an already volatile situation, the drama had been underway for two hundred years. Ten years after the Treaty of Guadalupe-Hidalgo (1848) assigned the responsibility of controlling the Indians of the Southwest to the United States, a war to quiet the frontier gained momentum. Central to these events and the telling of our "fable" is Brigadier General James H. Carleton's directing Kit Carson to invade the Canyon de Chelly area in January 1864, lay waste to what he found, and starve the Navajos into submission. Believed to be a place of refuge in a time of war, a central gathering place for the tribe, and a hitherto unexplored maze of canyons and hiding spots, the canyon became the prize target, the fulcrum upon which the outcome of the war balanced. Take it, and the defeat of the Navajo was imminent. Carson's two-pronged attack into the maze, which he led from the west and which Captain Albert Pfeiffer began in the east, actually netted poor results. By the end of the expedition Carson claimed to have killed twenty-three Navajos, taken thirty-four prisoners, accepted two hundred voluntary surrenders, and captured two hundred sheep.[4] Hardly the death knell of a people, whose numbers probably ranged near twenty thousand. Yet shortly after Carson departed, large bodies of Navajos began to surrender and continued to do so long after the winter months ended. The completion of the foray coincided with the surrenders and appeared to vindicate the thinking that one event led to the other.

Reading Carson's correspondence raises doubts. His search-and-destroy missions netted few positive results; he complained of never being able to find the enemy and force a pitched battle, while the Navajos often ridiculed and derided the soldiers in the canyon below. He was successful in finding crops of wheat and corn, small settlements, some livestock, and a few captives, but the possibility of sustained combat fled as quickly as the moccasin-wearing feet that scaled the passageways out of the canyon and pounded over the desert sand. There were plenty of other military operations besides his that destroyed food stores and kept the enemy moving but nothing that outwardly appeared to cause such a mass surrender. Yet hundreds, then thousands capitulated *en masse*. Starvation and cold were problems the Navajo had faced, as well as enemies they encountered throughout their history; so what was different?

Some revisionist historians have attempted to correct misunderstandings, but the fable persists.[5] Carson is credited with bringing the Navajo to Fort Sumner, as the "fall" of Canyon de Chelly triggered capitulation. There were some military leaders at the time who believed it, pointing to the surrender that followed hard on the heels of the expedition. However, when one understands the geographical size of the land where the Navajos roamed—including large portions of Arizona and New Mexico and the southern third of Utah—then considers their decentralized form of government, one realizes there was no single event that caused the collapse. Traditional governance based on the *naat'áanii* (headman), an honored leader who spoke for several homesteads and perhaps a region, did not foster acceptance of a monolithic crash and surrender of the "Tribe." Local rule prevailed.[6] What affected one group in a certain area may not have had any impact on another depending on time, distance, and local conditions.

Thus the answer as to why so many Navajos surrendered is not derived from Kit Carson and Canyon de Chelly but rather from the more insidious practice of turning neighbor against neighbor. The use of Indian auxiliaries was nothing new in American history, going back to colonial times. What is noteworthy is that so many neighboring tribes actively pursued their own agendas in concert with the US military. In the northern part of Navajo land, this meant the Utes prosecuting a war against the Navajos with whom they were already at odds. Other Native American groups, such as the Hopi and Zuni, as well as the New Mexico Volunteers, which was comprised of Hispanic and Anglo civilians, waged war in their respective areas, but none were more effective and more feared than the Utes. In a random survey of more than fifty Navajo oral histories concerning the Long Walk period, more than 80 percent discussed, either in passing or at length, the fact that the Utes were a devastating foe. The Utes were mentioned even when the central villains of these narratives were New Mexicans, the US military, Jicarilla Apache, or a Pueblo group.

NAVAJO ORIGIN STORIES

Navajo tradition teaches that the origin of the Utes hearkens back to the creation of the world, when Coyote, the trickster, sought to marry his daughter. Feigning death, he left instructions for his wife and child to place his body on a drying rack and move away from their home, and for the daughter to marry the first man she met. After completing Coyote's wishes, the two women gathered their belongings and began to look for a new home. Along the way, they encountered a man, actually Coyote in disguise. The daughter married him; soon his wife recognized the imposter, but too late, for her daughter had conceived. Following the birth, the young mother tossed her baby boy into a badger's hole and left him to die. A mother owl rescued and raised the child, but her husband grew jealous and chased the now-grown man away to his own people, who also rejected him. As he fled, he uprooted spruce, ash, sumac, mountain mahogany, and other plants, which became the ancestors of the Utes and were personified as arrows.[7] Born through trickery and deceit, related to Coyote, and associated with night and death, the progenitor of the Utes established the characteristic foundation of one of the Navajos' great competitors.

Another version of Ute origin tells of a young man who uses arrows to kill two Navajo children while they played and then flees.[8] As the Navajos pursue him, they discover that at each of his camps another man joins him. The story suggests that the boy actually creates these people from the previously mentioned trees. Realizing that they are outnumbered, the Navajos return home. In another version the boy makes arrows as he looks for his relatives, and these become the Utes.[9] The boy's rejection and pursuit by the Navajo resulted in fighting and the enemy warriors. The trees from which these men derived are tough mountain plants, some of which are used to make arrows, the symbol of war.[10]

All these stories, unflattering to the Utes, provide insight as to why the Navajos feared and mistrusted their neighbors. Coyote, although a sacred

being with extensive power, also exhibited negative characteristics abhorred by the Navajo. Incest, deceit, uncontrolled passion, excess, and fighting among relatives were qualities to avoid. Owl is also a dangerous creature associated with death. Thus, the Ute-Navajo conflict was interpreted as being as much a spiritual contest between good and undesirable as it was a physical contest. The enemy and what he stood for could be confronted on a physical and a spiritual level. With such a long history of feuding, rooted in the beginning of time, it is not surprising that the Navajo referred to the Utes as "The Enemies You Continually Fight With."

CAUSES OF THE CONFLICT

Carson was fully aware of this friction and the Ute military asset he had at his disposal. He and Pfeiffer had recently served as Ute agents, spoke the language, and understood their wards' capabilities. On 24 July 1863, Carson encountered Utes on the prowl. He wrote, "Shortly after encamping I was joined by nineteen Ute warriors who had been operating against the Navajos on their own account. They report having met a party of Utes returning to their country having eleven captives and that there are two other parties now in this country. . . . I have hired five of this party as spies."[11] What Carson recognized is a policy that had started as early as 1860, when Colonel T. F. Fauntleroy requested the use of three hundred Utes to serve against the Navajos, "as they do not require pay as soldiers but only to be supplied a short time with provisions until they can get well into the Indian country. . . . It will at once have the effect to get the cooperation of a most valuable force and at the same time employ these restless people, who otherwise must foray upon our own settlements."[12] Once set in motion, the plan proved highly effective.

This article's focus is to look at the Navajo story, not that of the Utes, and to understand the experience of those who did not go to Fort Sumner. Of primary concern are the Navajos in the north, mostly in Utah, and how they recalled events before, during, and after the "Fearing Time" (Náhonzhoodą́ą́') that extended from roughly 1858 to 1868. During this period Navajo and Ute relations, having previously vacillated between uneasy friendships to outward hostilities, reached their zenith in open conflict. A series of relatively minor incidents erupted into full-scale war. In one sense, the blame for part of this friction may be placed on the traditional form of Navajo government. Agents at this time pointed out that fragmented band leadership had "no power to punish the bad men of the nation nor to prevent them from committing depredations when they are disposed to do so."[13] Often these leaders were wealthy and paid an indemnity from their own herds. These rich men or *ricos* had the most to lose if a total war occurred and so they wanted to maintain a peaceful status quo. This was not true of the young men interested in building their herds and acquiring status. Labeled by the Mexicans as "*ladrones*," they listened to the *ricos*, if convenient, but exhibited little concern about long-range effects.

Although there is little Ute testimony about this period in history, there is a rich body of Navajo oral tradition that confirms this view. Approximately

half of forty stories told by Navajo elders blame the start of hostilities on their people. A few examples:

> "The reason for being taken to Fort Sumner was that the Diné were stealing from other tribes . . . and they were caught sometimes in stealing livestock."
>
> "It was because of the fighting between the Navajos and other Indians that our ancestors were taken to Fort Sumner."
>
> "They [ancestors] said it was our own fault that we were rounded up and taken to Fort Sumner. They said we used to kill Ute Indians, Pueblo Indians and Mexicans and bring their sheep back and that those actions caused the wars between us, the Army, and other Indian tribes."
>
> "Our late forefathers, those that were wise, begged their fellow Diné to stop going around stealing horses, sheep and cattle from the Mexicans; but the stealing went on. One of the men who was begging the Diné to quit stealing said, 'Don't be sorry when we get enemies like a road covered with ice—starvation, poverty, and cold. You will suffer; then you will understand.'"[14]

Martha Nez, living near Mexican Water, attributed the problem locally to Navajo men harassing Ute women picking sumac berries. The men killed some of the women, which started the conflict. "The uprising did not begin with the white people. It started with the Utes first."[15]

Yellow Horse, a future Navajo leader, tells of traveling with friends to Mancos Creek, the "traditional boundary between Utes and Navajos."[16] There they encountered an encampment of Utes, mostly women and children, whose husbands were hunting in the Gallina Mountains. The Navajos, seizing the opportunity, killed some of the men and women and stole the horses in retaliation for past wrongs. A Ute runner alerted the hunters who chased the offending party toward the San Francisco Mountains before giving up and returning home. Many Navajos living along the San Juan River feared retaliation and left the area, heading for the Lukachukai Mountains and other secluded spots away from the enemies' domain. "Eventually the Utes won the battle because the refugees lost many people to starvation before spring arrived." As for those who initiated the raid, they fled to the Fort Defiance area until taken to Fort Sumner. By then, Yellow Horse and his friends were starving and nearly naked.

Charlie Mitchell concurs, providing some delightful Navajo metaphors to explain what he experienced.[17] As he grew into young adulthood, his "arrows came into being [old enough to own his arrows]." Groups of young men, two or three at a time, sneaked off to steal horses, "which made them go wild." Others joined in, stealing and killing. The elders cautioned, "You should stop behaving so! Under no circumstances should you be behaving so. . . . My young men, my children, do not speak in that way! In peace we want to live. If ever on to us you should upset (the enemy), it is not easily remedied."[18] The young men argued that with war comes rain, and beautiful flowers resulted.[19] The Utes, at first, "had respect for us," but after some were killed, "they rose

up against us . . . and became pretty fierce." After attacking some Americans, "[Abraham] Lincoln became angry, . . . [and] in accordance with his command, all of the different people—the Utes and the Pueblo Indians [etc.] . . . all of those who live around us were put down toward us. . . . And we being alone, all of the different tribes spilled over on us. From this side, from toward the north, the Utes came to trouble us."[20] Devastation and starvation followed.

Even today, informed elders recognize the young warriors' insolence. Basing their views on types or patterns established long ago, they point to a reckless, uncaring attitude as the basis for the problem. Ben Silversmith noted that he and other medicine men believed the Fort Sumner experience was rooted in a Navajo phrase glossed as "none of your business."[21] During the Creation, Mother Earth and Father Sky argued with each other about what went on in their respective spheres. They felt strongly that what occurred was not the other's business so difficulties arose. Later, during the separation of the sexes in the underworld beneath this one, a similar thing happened between the men and women. Before Fort Sumner, the old men were worried about what was taking place with the young men, who were raiding the white man and different Indian tribes. Again, the young men told their elders, "none of your business." The older men held only persuasive authority and could not enforce their desire to maintain peace. No doubt the Utes and Navajos retaliated against perceived wrongs. Now a similar problem exists with young people telling their elders that what they are doing is not their concern. That is why there are problems today, based in a selfish pattern established long ago.

There were those who knew little about the raids and fighting. Wolfkiller, living in the Monument Valley–Kayenta area, recalled that he and his brother were herding sheep one day when they spied four successive columns of white smoke. Unsure what this meant, that evening they asked their grandfather, who, after a second day of signaling, knew that it called for a council to be held. After attending, he returned with confirmation of his suspicions. War with the Utes was approaching, caused by the theft of young warriors taking sheep and women. The grandfather explained:

> My children, it is as we feared. The spirit of war is trying to walk into our land, but we must try to stop it. . . . We have done nothing to cause this thing, but some of the people have made another raid, and our chief, at what they call Washington, has sent us word that we must leave our land and go with the soldiers to a place far to the east. . . . Now I think the people who have brought this on themselves should be taken, but we who do not want to have trouble should not be taken away from a land we know and are contented to live in.[22]

Still others had no warning. John Holiday, a Blessing Way singer from Monument Valley, tells of his grandmother, Woman with the Four Horns (Asdzáán Deedįį'ii [named so because of her sheep]), who lived near present-day Richfield. As a newlywed, she and her husband were traveling to Rough Rock and had passed Kayenta when they saw a large dust cloud. Thinking that

it might be a group of Navajos participating in an Enemy Way ceremony, the couple remained in place until it was too late. A group of white men abruptly reined their horses in front of them, while the leader drew his weapon. "He pulled a gun, and at that instant, my grandmother 'spoke to the gun' [prayed] and heard the click of the hammer, but no bullet fired. Three times he pulled the trigger but nothing happened. Just then another horseman, a Mexican with a large sombrero, rode up and knocked the weapon out of the white man's hand. Then the gun fired."[23] The horsemen tied up the two, separated them, and split in different directions to continue their search for captives.

The efficacy of prayer and the invoking of supernatural power mentioned in this experience was very much a part of the Navajos' understanding of what lay at the root of this conflict as well as how to ameliorate subsequent problems. Holiday is familiar with four protective shields that medicine men possessed prior to the Fearing Time. He explains that the Holy Beings spiritually created these objects at the beginning of the earth, as were medicine bundles used for healing and protection. The gods controlled these powers and assisted the first person who made the physical shields. These objects are a representation of nature's invisible powers as well as living entities that can use their powers on the Navajos' behalf. Eight generations of medicine men before the 1860s had "fed" the shields with songs, prayers, and pollen, invoking their sacred powers to safeguard the Diné, or People.[24] Once renewed, bullets and arrows or evil and witchcraft could not penetrate the shields' powers. They provided protection against all harmful things.

EXILES IN THEIR OWN LAND

When the US military and its Indian and New Mexican auxiliaries warred against the Navajos, those living in proximity to the shields avoided detection and escaped exile to Fort Sumner.

> The Navajo were put in the "heart" of the shields and were safe. They were not captured. They remained hidden in the Henry Mountains and surrounding area where these sacred shields were and so were never caught. . . . They did not go to Fort Sumner because they lived closer to the sacred shields. It is said that these shields were often taken to other parts of our land, throughout the Navajo communities, just as the sacred mountain soil [medicine bundle, or *jish*] is carried around.[25]

During this time, however, as the people evaded detection, Ropey and Little Bitter Water Man, two medicine men who had guardianship over the shields, buried them to prevent capture. Little Bitter Water Man hid them and left the area. He became sick and died without telling anyone where the shields were hidden, which caused them to be "misplaced."[26] The powers were neglected, their influence waned, and the invasion of Navajo lands and capture of the People resulted in the four-year imprisonment of more than eight thousand Navajos. They had lost their protection.[27]

John provides a second explanation of why the Navajos suffered these trials. The following account, rich in detail, speaks as much about perception of supernatural events as to what happened on the land. His views also go to the heart of future solutions.

> Another reason for the captivity and eventual release of the Navajos from Fort Sumner was that an individual had been working against the people. This man had sacred powers to "talk," or pray, the Navajos deep into the ground.[28] He lived at the edge of Rock Canyon, at Twin Stars [Sonsela Butte, Arizona] and a place called Green Cattail Flat. He encouraged the enemies against us who gathered at his place. There were many. Some medicine men went to the top of Navajo Mountain and performed crystal gazing [divination]. They saw this person coming in and out of his hogan, followed by a dog. "This is the man. The man who did this to the Navajos," they said. They did a ceremony then departed, next going to Promise Rock, about eight miles south of Gouldings [Monument Valley], by the windmill. That rock, or mesa, tapers at the end and is said to be a large snake or reptile. There is a small patch of sand, with some bushes on its mid-crown, where there is a hole-like spot. The men performed another ceremony there, singing to the person who caused all the friction. "If it is really him, he will not last but perish before dawn," they said. These medicine men had sacred powers. It is said that the person died early that morning. This must have been during the summer, because the man was out hoeing his garden when his dog went past him from the south to north, singing a song about Mountain Boy and saying, "Mountain Boy, you will die."[29] The man who talked the Navajos into the ground, the one who sent the enemies, died.[30]

As the Utes invaded Navajo lands, the People spread to inaccessible recesses to avoid capture. Compare Wolfkiller and Hashkéninii, two men from different family groups who started out in the same Monument Valley–Kayenta area. Wolfkiller and his family were determined to stay in their country and did all they could to avoid detection. He left a chilling account of what it was like to live during this time. The feeling of helpless uncertainty, being ever vigilant, maintaining sentinels and scouts, moving constantly, surviving in winter weather without permanent shelter, building fires near large rocks that acted like a chimney to dissipate smoke, and worrying continuously about food took its toll on the family's morale. Winter ended and spring brought a new onslaught of enemy forays. Wolfkiller remembers a scout coming into camp announcing, "We are lost. The enemy has brought Utes to help them track us down, and they are coming nearer. They are cutting down the cornfields and killing the old people who cannot travel. They have taken many of the people out."[31]

The family moved farther into the canyons, but to no avail. The soldiers approached while signal fires indicated that the group was surrounded and resistance futile. The grandfather determined that surrender needed to be

accomplished at night because, "the Utes would welcome the chance to kill as many of our people as they could if our people came while it was light."[32] Grandfather and two elders left the others behind and made their way to the soldiers' camp. Mounted Utes rode about maintaining vigilance until long after dark. The Navajos were mainly concerned about avoiding any contact with them before reaching the soldiers, who they considered their source of safety. After a close call, the men infiltrated past the sentinels and made contact with a white man who spoke their language. They explained, "We would have come in to the soldiers' camp before, but we were afraid of the Utes. They had always been our enemies, and we knew that they would welcome the chance to kill as many of us as they could. . . . I asked him not to take any Utes to our camp. He said he knew he could trust us and would not send any Utes to our camp."[33] The party returned, gathered their belongings, and began their long walk.

Hashkéninii enjoyed a different outcome. Like Wolfkiller, he was surprised one day when a rider came into camp and announced that the dust they could see on the horizon belonged to the soldiers, and that "there were some Ute scouts among the white soldiers and we were more afraid of them than the whites, as we had always been at war with them."[34] Scattering about the desert floor and nearby canyons to avoid detection, seventeen people reassembled at night and, with a few possessions, headed north. Hashkéninii, mounted and armed with an old rifle, led the party and scouted for enemy. Next he turned west, traveling through a maze of canyons until he reached the south end of Navajo Mountain. His wife, her two sisters, and the rest of the group were exhausted, hungry, and footsore. She sat down and refused to go farther. The group selected a campsite, located a permanent source of water, began collecting seeds and nuts, killed an occasional rabbit, and prepared for winter. No sheep from their flock of twenty were to be eaten, so that they would increase. Hashkéninii was a taskmaster, pushing his people through constant work in order to do what was needed to survive. His son recalled, "He drove everyone all day long and would never let us rest, knowing that we might starve," and from this Hashkéninii received his name that translates as "Giving out Anger" or "The Angry One."[35]

They remained at Navajo Mountain for six years, during which only one Ute ever found them, and all he did was trade. Hashkéninii Biye' (Begay, or Giving out Anger's Son) did not realize until later that this person was White Haired Ute (Grayhair, or Cabeza Blanca), a scourge to Navajos in hiding. He is described as a bad man

> who pretended to be our friend only in order to spy on us. When our flocks began to increase, he organized a group of young warriors and started for Navajo Mountain to kill us and also to get revenge on the people [Ute] who had thrown him out. At the south end of [Sleeping] Ute Mountain, he stopped to visit with some Utes, but he was so bad they killed him and his nephew. After that all the Utes moved away from Navajo Mountain and we had no more trouble.[36]

By the time the government released the Navajos from Fort Sumner, Hashkéninii and his family were wealthy with large herds of sheep and silver jewelry, which was made from a vein of ore he had discovered.

There were other groups that sought refuge at Navajo Mountain. Manuelito, a major war leader and one of the last to surrender and go to Fort Sumner, directed Bighorse to take his relatives and others and move behind Navajo Mountain for protection. Bighorse named thirty warriors, who with their families would have comprised a sizeable contingent of Navajos seeking safety in the canyons, along the San Juan and Colorado Rivers, and near the mountain.[37] Bighorse shared the experience of one of these men, Wounded Knee (Hastiin Bigodí), who received his name from a wound he sustained when he strayed too far from Navajo Mountain, shot by soldiers and left for dead. Some Navajo warriors eventually found him and brought him back to camp.[38] Bighorse, in relating this event, emphasized the importance of prayer and the power of the Holy Beings.

POWER, PRAYERS, AND PROTECTION

The Navajos in hiding actively sought divine intervention through prayer for the people taken captive. Bighorse left no doubt as to its importance.

> The medicine man named Many Whiskers and another called Old Arrow go to the top of Navajo Mountain to pray to the Holy People. They pray that these captured Navajos [at Fort Sumner] will come back to their homeland safely, soon be free. At this time there are lots of medicine men. They pray every time before they eat—the whole family, all the time praying for the safe return. When they cook mush or any kind of food to eat, they use the stick, *ádístsiin* that they stir it with. When they are finished, they take that stick out, with mush on it, and they pray with it too, for the safe return. And they can pray to the fire too. The charcoal that they use to cook with, they pray with it for their people to come home safely. They use corn pollen. And some of them use the corn that's ground. They do this every day and every night, before the sunrise and after the sunset—white corn before the sunrise and yellow corn after the sunset. And they pray for the warriors that are protecting them and for the white people who are holding all those people captive, pray to soften the white soldiers' hearts to let these people go free.[39]

Navajo Mountain, a sacred place, is believed to be the head of Earth Woman and the birthplace of Monster Slayer. During the Fearing Time, it acted as a shield for the people and prevented the enemy from gaining access to the territory. "The people and their medicine men had performed the sacred prayer of the protection boundary line that went from the San Juan River, north of Navajo Mountain, to the mouths of the canyons near Inscription House. The people dwelled behind this sacred line, therefore, they were never caught."[40] Navajos used this area, along with Rainbow Bridge,

for rain-producing ceremonies as well as protection. Karl Luckert suggests that during the Long Walk period there was a major shift in religious thinking in which ceremonies became less focused on hunter rites and more focused on warrior rituals like Evil Way. Blessing Way and Protection Way ceremonies also became prominent.[41] Protection Way prayers passed down through generations exemplify the thoughts of those residing at Navajo Mountain, "I am spared! I am spared! Enemy has missed me! Enemy has missed me! Today it did not happen!"[42] A similar prayer intones, "I have survived for you!"

Another prominent terrain feature in southeastern Utah, the Comb Ridge–Bears Ears area, received other Navajo families seeking protection but was not as secure. Old Man Bob, or People Lying Down at the Spring (Hastiin Tó Bitsíígiisitíinii), recalled, "There were no permanent homes because there were Utes raiding in this country in those days so we were afraid to stay in one place too long."[43] His mother told him that her family used to inhabit the area between the Dolores River (Colorado) and the Bears Ears long before the conflict began. Once the Utes started attacks, her family stayed more in the Bears Ears area, living in fear of White Haired Ute. Old Ruins (Kints'iilnii), born in 1871, shared his family's story of his mother, Woman Who Walked Like She Was Crippled (Asdzáán Jidii) and his father, also called Old Ruins, who lived north of the Bears Ears. Crippled Woman's mother remained west of the Bears Ears and north of the San Juan River. A raid by the Utes pushed her group across the river, which then doubled back to the Bears Ears, joining a noted *naat'áanii*, or headman, named K'aa Yélii.[44]

Not all Navajos were as fortunate. Woman Who Had Her House Burned (Kin Díílid) was born at the Bears Ears, but with the start of hostilities, she ended up on Black Mesa in Arizona. The enemy, under the leadership of White Haired Ute, raided her camp, captured her, and sold her as a slave to a Mexican; she did not return home for two years until the soldiers released the Navajos from Fort Sumner. "It was told by the Navajos that this leader [White Haired Ute] looked for Navajos who had sheep, horses, or young girls that he could capture and sell to other people such as the Mexicans."[45] Her great-grandfather, Man Who Regained and Lost Horses (Hastiin Biłį́į́' Nádláhí), received his name when Utes and Mexicans stole his large horse herd. After he obtained more livestock, the Utes again took a large portion of them. Finally, his camp, which was comprised of many hogans located on Long Point near the Bears Ears, came under attack. Utes from the Dolores River area raided the settlement, killing him and others.

These types of occurrences are typical of the well-known events of the time. Less known are the stories of those who were not detected. Piecing together this information is more difficult. What emerges, however, is a fascinating collage of perseverance in the face of fear and uncertainty. Paul Goodman tells of his family group and their association with this area. His maternal grandmother named Shoot or Dragging Something was born on the south side of the Bears Ears, fifteen or twenty years before the People went to Fort Sumner. As a younger sister of Hashkéneinii, she remained north of the San Juan River during the Fearing Time. Her mother, Uses Club Downward (Yaago 'Adiłhaałii), and father, Very Small, were born near the

Bears Ears. The father's maternal uncle, Hashkéneinii, married a woman of the Bitterwater (Tódích'íinii) Clan, making him an in-law by clan to K'aa Yélii (One with Arrow Quiver), the most famous headman living on Elk Ridge at what is now the Kigalia (anglicized name for K'aa Yélii) Ranger Station. Five or six hogans comprised his settlement located near a spring (K'aa Yélii Bitó) named after him.[46]

A pattern begins to emerge from this and other oral testimonies. The first is the importance of relationships. Extended families shared a general area of resources; intermarriage between local groups was common. The Bears Ears, known as a good place to hunt deer, herd livestock, collect berries, and obtain seeds and nuts, served as a magnet that drew Navajos to its resources.[47] Plants such as salt berry, three-leaf sumac, sacaton and sand grass, piñon nuts, juniper berries, wild cherries, wild potatoes, and yucca fruit were plentiful.[48] Other places for collecting plants included Blue, La Sal, Henry, Navajo, and Sleeping Ute mountains, the area around Bluff, and the canyons along Comb Ridge.

Navajo clans, although usually not a corporate group, focused on economic concerns and played a part in social organization. The Folded Arm People (Bit'ą̨hnii), Many Goats (Tł'ízí łání), Bitter Water (Tó dích'íi'nii), Towering House People (Kin yaa'áanii), Salt (Áshįįhí), and Water's Edge People (Tábą̨ą̨há) were among the most prominent in this region for the people who did not go to Fort Sumner. Leadership by local headmen fostered another means of social control. Hashkéneinii of the Red Running into the Water People (Táchii'nii) Clan maintained ties with groups living around the Bears Ears even after he moved to Navajo Mountain. He is also said to have resided at Wooden Shoe Butte (near Blue Mountain) and traveled as far north as Green River.[49] His wife, Black Goat (Tłizi Łizhinii), and brother, Gentle Man (Hastiin Doo'át'íní), also shared relations with Navajos in this area.

The most prominent leader in the vicinity of Comb Ridge was One with Quiver (K'aa Yélii). Born near Shonto, Arizona, about thirty years before the Long Walk, K'aa Yélii belonged to the Within-His-Cover People (Bit'ahnii) Clan. As a *naat'áanii,* he established his camp near the Bears Ears. He had at least two brothers, Manuelito and Abaa'ade (a Ute name—no translation), who lived in Montezuma Creek.[50] The people accepted K'aa Yélii as their leader, adopting his policy of not provoking the enemy to avoid conflict. At the same time, he had an uncanny ability to escape raids and ambushes. He also was skilled in hunting and working with livestock. "These headmen . . . were good horse trainers. They trained their horses for hunting deer. They could ride these horses all day long and they would not play out. These old Navajos used to hunt in the Monticello area [Blue Mountain] when they did not have anything but bows and arrows, but they used to get the game they wanted."[51]

K'aa Yélii's sister, Woman with a Burned House (Asdzáán Kin Diidlii), lived in his camp behind the Bears Ears with other Navajos at Place to Escape from the Enemy (Naznidzoodii), a canyon that facilitated disguised movement off Elk Ridge.[52] Her husband, Mexican Man (Naakai Diné), was born in the vicinity of the Bears Ears, where the couple stayed during the Fearing Time. Her maternal grandmother (no name) was not as fortunate. The Utes

captured and sold her to Mexicans, guarding her in a log cabin. She found a ladder inside and escaped, making her way to the mountains where snow covered her tracks. She eventually reached the San Juan River, recognized Shiprock, followed the south side of the river to Douglas Mesa, and then wended her way back to Naznidzoodii and K'aa Yélii's band.

Oral history also suggests that there were fairly peaceful relations between some members of the local Ute and Navajo populace, and that it was the Utes living farther to the east who actually hunted for those in hiding.[53] At least in the Bears Ears and Navajo Mountain areas there were strong ties among some of the San Juan Band Paiutes, local Weeminuche Utes, and Navajos. Trade was an important element. For example, Hashkéneinii was an "outstanding" trader, visiting many Utes and Paiutes who had moved around the Bears Ears. From this, friendships grew.[54] Items traded by the Utes included buckskins, buckskin clothing, elk hides and elk storage sacks, buffalo robes, saddlebags, horses, bandoliers, beaded bags, beaver skins, buffalo tail rattles, pitch for ceremonial whistles, and baskets. The Navajos traded woven blankets, silver, and agricultural products.[55] Navajo Mountain provided red-earth paint that the Paiutes sold to the Utes.[56] Paiutes worked for wealthier Navajo families with large herds of livestock that required tending. Navajo informants also tell of using Paiutes to provide early warning of danger. George Martin says that his father first met the Paiutes in the Bears Ears country, and they became his "watchers."[57] Others mention Paiutes hiding Navajos from Ute raiders, being involved with intermarriage, and sharing resources. K'aa Yélii "had men posted to watch for the approach of enemy tribes," so that his group could flee.[58] Hashkéneinii practiced the same technique at his camp near Navajo Mountain.[59]

Perhaps the most dramatic, written proof of Ute, Paiute, and Navajo cooperation occurred in September 1866. A group of Capote and Weeminuche Utes and a few Mexicans organized a ruse to trap a group of Navajos living in northern Arizona. The plan was to send word that the Utes wanted to live in peace and in close proximity to them. After the Navajos arrived, the Utes would kill the men, enslave the women and children, and capture the livestock. Upon hearing this, White Haired Ute refused, saying that he had friends among those Navajos whom he did not want to kill. A fight ensued, and the Capotes killed him and fled, which agrees closely to the account given earlier by Hashkéneinii Biye'. Following retaliatory strikes, White Haired Ute's sons went with other Utes to "the neighborhood of Rio Dolores, Sierra Salir [La Sal Mountains], and Sierra Orejos [Bears Ears]" to "join as is supposed the [Weeminuche] and Pah Utes who had made friends with the Navajos."[60] Even with this slight leavening of apparent friendship, intertribal conflict with its fear and mistrust dragged on for another two years before the treaty of 1868 ended hostilities.

VILLAINS AND HEROS

The death of White Haired Ute removed one of the most feared and hated villains the Navajos had encountered. Stories abounded about his skill at war. Not only did he track, capture, and kill many Navajos, but also he was said

to have performed ceremonies to weaken the effectiveness of their prayers. It was rumored that White Haired Ute took the heart from a baby, placed it in a crow's heart, and then shot the two hearts up a canyon cliff.[61] This witchcraft contributed to the Navajos' suffering and their inability to recover their losses quickly. Many of his attacks were at night during the full moon or in bad weather when the Navajos were home. He would rope the top of a forked-stick hogan, pull it over with his horse, and kill the occupants as they fled. White Haired Ute is said to have made an agreement with the military to keep anything that he took including horses, women, and children.[62]

As with any villain, there must be a way to defeat him. One story tells of how the Navajos outsmarted White Haired Ute and his band.[63] Four Navajo warriors saw his war party enter a canyon and decided to prevent it from going any farther even though they were heavily outnumbered. The Navajos built several large piles of wood for bonfires some distance apart. One man rode down and told the Utes that they could not proceed because there were many warriors with bows, arrows, and rifles waiting for them. The Utes did not believe him, so he gave the signal to the other men to light the bonfires. Suddenly a great cloud of smoke went up, and he restated that there were many warriors ahead. The Utes decided not to take any chances and retreated. There are mixed accounts of how White Haired Ute died. One asserts that the Navajos killed him through witchcraft chants, while another says his own people killed him over woman troubles.[64] Whatever the reason, the loss of White Haired Ute provided relief to the Navajos remaining at large.

Although tales of Ute villainy abounded there were also stories of Navajo valor. Many still talk of Manuelito's prowess. They say he was a particularly good fighter. One man tells how Manuelito wore a mask on the back of his head, could shoot arrows as he ran backward, and fooled the enemy as to the direction he traveled. He also had his people capture eagles to feather their arrows, saying, "We will not be killed poorly; we will be considered dangerous."[65] Each man carried arrows poisoned with snake venom, and, according to the Navajo, the body quickly swelled and died when they wounded an enemy. Manuelito initially refused to surrender because he believed dying in his homeland was better than dying at Fort Sumner. He is said to have thought, "They [whites] already took part of our people and put them in prison. What more do they want? We love this land, and we have to keep ourselves brave to keep the land and help each other stay free."[66] In 1865, following decimating attacks by the Hopis and others that left him wounded and impoverished, he finally surrendered at Fort Sumner.

CAPTIVITY NARRATIVES

Navajos also enjoy their own genre of captivity narratives. Just as these were popular in the dominant society's literature in the past, these captivity narratives revolve around things important in Navajo culture and exhibit two major themes: defeat of the enemy and supernatural assistance. Through both, Navajo existence is reassured. The central motif usually focuses on a woman who is captured, is enslaved by Utes or Mexicans, escapes, passes through a

series of trials, and is reunited with her people. Most accounts involve women and girls, as they were the preferred booty for the slave trade.

A typical example of a narrative that does not involve supernatural elements talks of an unnamed woman captured by the Utes and brought north into their country. One day she was herding sheep when a war party surrounded and seized her, then slaughtered the flock. Eventually the Utes separated, and she rode off with her captor, sitting on the back of his horse. As they camped, he sharpened a stick to clean his ears. Waiting for the right moment, she slammed his hand, driving the stick into his skull and toppling him. The woman grabbed a rock, hit him on the head, and proceeded to hammer his skull "just as one tans leather."[67] Taking his horses, she crossed the San Juan River and met her maternal uncle, who had been tracking the enemy. In other stories, the Utes tied their captives with leather thongs or placed them under large buffalo robes and slept around its edges. The only times that women had any possibility of escape was when the men allowed them to gather wood or water or were asleep.

Occasionally a Navajo woman might win the sympathy of her captor and receive help in fleeing. One Mexican woman refused to allow her husband to sell their Navajo slave and worked out a plan for her escape.[68] While the husband was away, the women prepared for the journey, bundling food and blankets into a pack. The Mexican woman even gave her pregnant captive a sword and knife to protect herself from wild animals. The captive made good her escape, but the hardships had only begun. She was hundreds of miles away from her destination, had little food or clothing, wore out her moccasins, delivered her baby whom she had to leave behind, and contended with increasingly cold weather. She finally arrived home to the safety of her diminished family.

Wolfkiller recalls returning from a trading expedition to find that the Utes had raided his camp. Gathering some men, the party went to retrieve the captured women, children, and livestock. Because there were only a few raiders, the Utes herded their spoils faster, depending on speed rather than fighting the Navajos. As the pursuit wore on, the Utes released the sheep and many women and children, while killing some of the older ones and babies during the hard drive. The enemy made good their escape. Warrior Girl was among the women that the Utes kept. She arrived in the enemies' camp and was immediately put to work, hauling wood and water for her captors. If the women were unable to complete their chores, the Utes beat them with a buckskin whip until they bled.

Many of these women became wives, which angered the jealous Ute women. They told the new arrivals that their husbands would soon tire of them and sell them to the Mexicans as slaves. The Ute women encouraged them to escape before it was too late, attempting to be rid of their competitors. After a failed escape by another Navajo, the Utes bound Warrior Girl's hands and feet when she went to bed. One night, however, the wife cut Warrior Girl's bindings, gave her some food, and sent her on her way. She ran all night and the next day. The men were in no hurry to recover her because they did not believe she could cross the San Juan River, which was full from

the late spring runoff. They finally caught sight of her at the river and scornfully laughed, believing that she would drown. To their surprise Warrior Girl used a cottonwood log to cross safely then eluded her pursuers. She traveled for many days before reaching her home, starved and exhausted, but having escaped her captors.

In many captivity narratives, Navajos receive supernatural assistance. A variety of animals guided, fed, and protected escapees. The dove, for instance, warned of the enemy's approach so a Navajo could flee in the direction the bird flew.[69] One woman followed a dove to find water, realizing that the bird lived near it.[70] Blue jays were said to fly toward the enemy, alerting the people that the Utes were near, and so they must go in the opposite direction.[71] A coyote's howl was another safe-path indicator, whereas fake owl or coyote calls warned of the enemies' presence. Hawks and crows likewise indicated danger, and so a person either fled or remained hidden until conditions were safe. Not only were these natural observations helpful in surviving, but also they provided comfort that the Navajo were not alone in their difficulties. Jim Dandy tells of his great-grandmother who was captured by American soldiers on their way to Fort Sumner.[72] As they surrounded the people, his great-grandmother realized she had a limited time to escape. She spoke to one of her family's horses, one that had never been ridden before, describing her plight and asking for help. The horse obeyed and carried her out of a canyon by a route known only to her and the horse.

Following her capture, Woman with the Four Horns also received supernatural aid.[73] At the enemies' camp, a young Mexican woman guarded her. She eventually released Woman with the Four Horns as she escorted her to some brush where she was to relieve herself. After running for many miles, Woman with the Four Horns realized that her captors with dogs were in hot pursuit. She quickly hid in a nest of thorns and cacti built by pack rats and prayed to the female pack rat for protection and to keep her hidden from the Mexicans. Although they rode close to her position, they never saw her. After the danger passed, she continued her journey, searching for food along the way. A strange-looking cactus offered its fruit, which she later learned was peyote. This plant acted as a guide and sustenance. By eating just one button she felt as if she had partaken of a large meal.

One night she discovered that she had been walking in a circle and did not know how to find her way. She followed bear tracks that set her on the right path. Bear, one of the protectors of Sun Bearer and Changing Woman at the time of creation, had its representatives provide similar assistance during these times of need for Woman with the Four Horns. Tezbah Mitchell shared a similar incident of how her grandmother fled from Fort Sumner and was befriended by a brown bear that guided and protected her until she reached safety. She spoke to the bear, who understood her words just as she understood its gestures.[74] In another story, a bear provides a woman with food by leaving a deer uneaten.[75]

Woman with the Four Horns traveled for a long time. As the weather grew cold, she called upon the owl saying, "Please, Grandfather Owl, cover me with your skin."[76] The bird came and spread its wings over her until she

was warm. Likewise she asked the wolf for help. The animal lay on top of her shelter of bushes, lending its warmth on a snowy night. Another Navajo woman lost at night also sought guidance from an owl. The bird hooted at intervals, indicating the correct direction.[77] Frank Johnson describes his grandmother's escape after being held captive by Mexicans for four years. While walking at night, she sensed danger and realized she was standing on the edge of a steep canyon. She heard an owl nearby and appealed to it to guide her down the precipice to safety.[78] These accounts recall the instructions given when Monster Slayer created the first owl from the remains of some monster birds (Tsé ninááléeh) that had been terrorizing the Navajo. The hero Twin instructed the owl, "When they [Navajos] are out alone and lost you will help them."[79]

One element common to this bond with animals and successful escape is that the Navajos knew the necessary songs, prayers, and ceremonies with which to appeal for assistance. Woman with the Four Horns summoned the creatures' help through their sacred names. "At the beginning of time, when our [Navajo] language was first developed, the Wolf said, 'If anyone calls me by my real name, I will assist them.'"[80] While she was away, her people performed ceremonies for her safety by using the lifelong sacred song given to her at birth.[81] Bighorse shares a similar view, noting everyone must know a song or ritual to protect him or her from the enemy or from starvation and sickness. [82] There are also traveling songs that are sung to keep a person safe. Each one is different and passed down through the family. Songs also defeated the enemy. When four enemy riders surrounded one Navajo woman, she sang a witchcraft song and told the men that they would all be dead by noon.[83] They shot her in the head and killed her, but the prophecy came true for three of the four men. A Navajo man had the ability to detect enemy witchcraft practices against the Navajo. He could also direct the people on safe paths and hear warnings of danger.[84]

Prayers and ceremonies were also essential to ending hostilities and the return of the people. Medicine men prayed for the Navajos' swift release by having a "soften[ing of] the white soldiers' hearts" and the People's return to their homeland.[85] The Navajos performed the Put Bead in Coyote's Mouth (Ma'ii' Bize'e' 'nast'a') ceremony to determine if they would be released while at Fort Sumner.[86] The people formed a circle around the coyote, watched as it made its way out of the enclosure, and were delighted to see the direction it went. To their relief, the animal headed toward Navajo land, indicating that the people would soon be going that way. The next day the leaders placed a white bead under their tongue and said a prayer directed to the commanding officer. He informed them that they would return home within four days. And they did.

CONCLUSION

So what lessons can be drawn from this history, or "fable agreed upon"? The first point is that Kit Carson and his entrada into Canyon de Chelly did not cause the surrender of the Navajo Nation. Given the responsibility of bringing

in a people he struggled to find, he turned to a scorched-earth policy that sent US military units, the New Mexico Volunteers, and Indian auxiliaries into the field to prosecute the war. In the northern part of the Navajo domain, the Utes became the salient thrust that proved most effective. Navajo oral tradition testifies to the Utes' power to ferret out hiding Navajo families. In a number of instances, elders felt they could avoid capture until they realized Utes were operating in the field against them. Surrender to the military then appeared to be the best choice.

In Navajo teachings, the qualities, characteristics, and elements associated with the enemy and conflict arose at the time of creation and persisted through the Fearing Time. Often at war and occasionally in an uneasy peace, Navajos and Utes had a long history of jockeying for supremacy. Beginning in 1858, the conflict increased in intensity as both sides took turns inflaming the situation. What is surprising is the number of Navajos who felt that the final push that set major events in motion came from their people. This is not a matter of "blaming the victim" when the victim claims responsibility. This is also not to place the entire onus on the Navajo as a whole. The decentralized form of Navajo government and its inability to control its young men allowed the situation to deteriorate into an all-encompassing war. If one purpose of a government is to control its people to prevent outside reprisals, the *naat'áanii* system proved incapable. This is not to suggest that it was ineffective in other areas of responsibility, given the decentralized lifestyle of the times, but it failed on this crucial point.

The Navajos waged the war on two fronts. In Utah, hiding and defense characterized the physical approach. Defendable terrains, escape routes, employment of scouts, the use of Paiutes for early warning, and dispersed campsites provided protection. Although the Navajos were consummate warriors familiar with the land, its resources, and how to avoid detection, so were the Utes. Without these "spies and guides," a recurrent phrase in correspondence of the times, the other military forces would have been much less effective. Equally important were the prayers, songs, ceremonies, and other forms of supernatural assistance for those avoiding detection and those captured. In traditional Navajo thought, the reason for and pattern of what occurs in contemporary society looks back to the time of creation for a preexisting model or answer. The Holy Beings were the only strong allies that the Navajos could call upon to assist during this traumatic situation. They were not disappointed.

As the People returned from exile and entered into the sacred lands that they had left four years before, their relatives, those who had not gone, greeted them. Peace walked with the Diné. In the future, their reservation expanded through more than a dozen land additions, while the Utes, who signed a treaty that same year (1868), began to lose most of their holdings. Part of the Protection Way ceremony sung at Navajo Mountain summarizes the joy of the returning people and the future that lay ahead.

> We have survived. We have survived.
> . . . .

Life will be good.
My home will be sitting there secure.
And my fire will burn well.
Anyone and whatever one has at his house:
. . . .
With them we survived like that.[87]

And they did.

NOTES

1. "Fable," *The American Heritage Dictionary*, 2nd ed. (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1985), 484.

2. See L. R. Bailey, *The Long Walk: A History of the Navajo Wars, 1846–68* (Pasadena, CA: Westernlore Publications, 1978); Peter Iverson, *Diné: A History of the Navajos* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2002); Broderick H. Johnson, ed., *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period* (Tsaile, AZ: Navajo Community College Press, 1973); Lawrence C. Kelly, *Navajo Roundup: Selected Correspondence of Kit Carson's Expedition Against the Navajo, 1863–1865* (Boulder, CO: The Pruett Publishing Company, 1970); Gerald Thompson, *The Army and the Navajo: The Bosque Redondo Reservation Experiment, 1863–1868* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1982).

3. For detailed discussions of the slave trade see Frank McNitt, *Navajo Wars: Military Campaigns, Slave Raids, and Reprisals* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1972; repr., Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1990) for its impact on the Navajo, and Ned Blackhawk, *Violence over the Land: Indians and Empires in the Early American West* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006) for that of the Ute; also see James F. Brooks, *Captives and Cousins: Slavery, Kinship, and Community in the Southwest Borderlands* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002).

4. Kit Carson as cited in Kelly, *Navajo Roundup*, 100.

5. Perhaps the best example of revisionism is found in R. C. Gordon-McCutchan's *Kit Carson: Indian Fighter or Indian Killer?* (Niwot: University Press of Colorado, 1996) in which the author takes to task Clifford E. Trafzer's *The Kit Carson Campaign: The Last Great Navajo War* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1982). Gordon-McCutchan refutes many of the statements and assumptions; in some cases he goes from page to page uncovering what he believes to be inaccuracies.

6. See Commission on Navajo Government Development, *Navajo Nation Government*, 4th ed. (Window Rock, AZ: Office of Navajo Government Development, 1998); Aubrey W. Williams Jr., *Navajo Political Process*, Smithsonian Contributions to Anthropology, vol. 9 (Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1970).

7. Washington Matthews, "The Origin of the Utes," *The American Antiquarian* 7 (September 1885): 271–74.

8. Martha Nez interview with Baxter Benally and Robert S. McPherson, 10 August 1988.

9. Charlie Blueyes interview with Baxter Benally and Robert S. McPherson, 28 August 1988.

10. Nelson Begay interview with Robert S. McPherson, 1 March 1987.

11. Kelly, *Navajo Roundup*, 28.

12. US Congress. House. House Ex. Document 69, "Indian Hostilities in New Mexico," 36th Cong., 1st sess., 1860, 29.

13. James L. Collins, "New Mexico Superintendency," 30 August 1857, *Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1857), 274.

14. Florence Charley; John Tom; Dugal Tsosie Begay; Hascon Benally as cited in Johnson, *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period*, 148, 178, 13, 279.

15. Martha Nez interview.

16. Yellow Horse as cited in Will Evans, *Along Navajo Trails: Recollections of a Trader* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 2005), 65.

17. Charlie Mitchell, "A Navaho's Historical Reminiscences," in *Navaho Texts*, ed. Edward Sapir (Iowa City: University of Iowa, 1942), 337–97.

18. Ibid., 341.

19. The association between war, death, and rain is unclear. Although in Navajo philosophy, water is often associated with life, Monster Slayer, the most prominent Navajo war god, also controls lightning, which is connected to rain. The Aztecs had Tláloc, the Mayans had Chac, the Totonacs had Tajín, and the Mixtecs had Cocijo as their rain gods; lightning and death were a part of their modus operandi. Navajo bows and arrows had symbols associated with Monster Slayer and his lightning. W. W. Hill (*Navaho Warfare*, Yale University Publications in Anthropology, no. 5 [New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1936], 16) points out that following a successful raid, the leader of a war party, before leaving the objective, would draw four designs in the sand with a flint arrowhead. Zigzag lightning, straight lightning, sun ray, and rainbow arrows, all of which were used to kill the monsters inhabiting this earth at the time of creation, are symbolized by these four types. Lightning, arrows, and rain are connected.

20. Mitchell, "A Navaho's Historical Reminiscences," 345.

21. Ben Silversmith statement at a public meeting, Blanding, UT, 26 January 2001.

22. Wolfkiller as cited in Louisa Wade Wetherill, recorder and Harvey Leake, ed., *Wolfkiller: Wisdom from a Nineteenth-century Navajo Shepherd* (Salt Lake City, UT: Gibbs Smith, 2007), 67.

23. John Holiday and Robert S. McPherson, *A Navajo Legacy: The Life and Teachings of John Holiday* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2005), 177–78.

24. Ibid., 353.

25. John Holiday, clarification interview with Lee Ann Kreutzer, 7 May 2002, Capitol Reef National Park Archives.

26. John Holiday interview with Marilyn Holiday and Robert S. McPherson, 24 February 2001.

27. For a fuller explanation of the "Pectol Shields" and their history, see Holiday and McPherson, *A Navajo Legacy*, 191–92, and John Fahey and Robert S. McPherson, "Seeing Is Believing: The Odyssey of the Pectol Shields," *Utah Historical Quarterly* (Fall 2008): 357–76.

28. John suggests that through witchcraft and other evil means, this man was able to curse the Navajos into captivity. But just as words can create this situation, once the cause is identified they can also correct the problem.

29. Dogs are said to have special powers to discern spiritual things connected to future events, people who practice witchcraft, and approaching danger. Here, the dog recognizes the fate of Mountain Boy, warning him of impending doom.

30. Holiday and McPherson, *A Navajo Legacy,* 190.

31. Wetherill and Leake, *Wolfkiller,* 80.

32. Ibid., 81.

33. Ibid., 84.

34. Hashkéninii Begay as cited in Charles Kelly, "Chief Hoskaninni," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 21 (Summer 1953): 219–26.

35. Ibid., 221.

36. Hashkéninii Begay as cited in Charles Kelly, "Notes," Charles Kelly Papers, Special Collections, J. Willard Marriott Library, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.

37. Tiana Bighorse, *Bighorse: The Warrior,* ed. Noel Bennett (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1990), 40–41.

38. Ibid., 42–43.

39. Ibid., 44–45.

40. Joe Many Goats interview with Marilyn Holiday and Robert S. McPherson, 18 December 1991.

41. Karl W. Luckert, *Navajo Mountain and Rainbow Bridge Religion* (Flagstaff: Museum of Northern Arizona, 1977), 30–31.

42. Ibid., 6.

43. Old Man Bob testimony, 27 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 734. All Doris Duke materials cited are in the Special Collections, J. Willard Marriott Library, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.

44. Old Ruins (Kit'siili) testimony, 18 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 704.

45. Eddie Nakai testimony, 21 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 23.

46. Paul Goodman testimony, 6 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 689.

47. Mexican Woman (Asdzaan Nakai) testimony, 23 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 731; Hastiin Claw testimony, 7 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 672; Hastiin Nez Begay testimony, 18 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 706; Hetty Nepah testimony, 7 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 671; Tom Stash testimony, 17 July 1968, Doris Duke no. 386; Hastiin Toh Tłizhini Bitsi testimony, 28 January 1961, no Doris Duke number.

48. Paul Goodman testimony.

49. Cecil Parrish testimony, 6 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 667.

50. White Sheep testimonies, 15 March 1953 and 6 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 687A and 687B.

51. Eddie Nakai testimony.

52. Warrior Woman (Desbaa') testimony, 18 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 703.

53. For a discussion of friendly relations with the local Utes and Paiutes living in the Bears Ears area, see Billy Holiday testimony, 21 July 1961, Doris Duke no. 668; George Martin Sr. testimony, 22 March 1961, Doris Duke no. 913; Cecil Parrish testimony; Paul Goodman testimony; Pat Shortfinger testimony, 11 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 694; Anderson Cantsee (Ute) testimony, 28 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 739.

54. Billy Holiday testimony.

55. W. W. Hill, "Navaho Trading and Trading Ritual: A Study of Cultural Dynamics," *Southwestern Journal of Anthropology* 4 (Autumn 1948): 377, 380.

56. Mabel Dry testimony, 25 July 1967, Doris Duke no. 110.

57. George Martin Sr. testimony.

58. Paul Jones testimony, 19 January 1961, Doris Duke no. 712.

59. Maggie Holgate interview with Gary Shumway, 13 June 1968, Doris Duke no. 956.

60. Major Albert Pfeiffer to A. K. Graves, 10 December 1866, RG 75, Letters Received by Office of Indian Affairs, New Mexico Superintendency, 1866, National Archives, Washington, DC.

61. Fred Descheene as cited in Johnson, *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period*, 210.

62. John Smith as cited in ibid., 137.

63. Howard W. Gorman as cited in ibid., 28.

64. Ibid.; Hashkéninii Begay as cited in Kelly, "Notes."

65. Fred Yazzie interview with Marilyn Holiday and Robert S. McPherson, 5 November 1987; Francis Toledo as cited in Johnson, *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period*, 144–45.

66. Bighorse, *Bighorse*, 32.

67. "The Story of a Navaho Woman Captured by the Utes," in Mitchell, *Navaho Texts*, 335–37.

68. Chadadineli Benally as cited in Johnson, *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period*, 62.

69. Mose Denejolie as cited in ibid., 242.

70. Frank Johnson as cited in ibid., 90.

71. Bighorse, *Bighorse*, 26.

72. Jim Dandy interview with Robert S. McPherson, 14 January 2008.

73. Holiday and McPherson, *A Navajo Legacy*, 176–85.

74. Tezbah Mitchell as cited in Johnson, *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period*, 252.

75. Frank Johnson, 89.

76. Holiday and McPherson, *A Navajo Legacy*, 184.

77. Chadadineli Benally, 67–68.

78. Frank Johnson, 88.

79. Aileen O'Bryan, *Navaho Indian Myths* (New York: Dover Publications), 90.

80. Holiday and McPherson, *A Navajo Legacy*, 184.

81. Ibid., 176–85.

82. Bighorse, *Bighorse*, 26–27.

83. Chadadineli Benally, 147.

84. George Littlesalt as cited in Johnson, *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period*, 166.

85. Bighorse, *Bighorse*, 44–45.

86. John Smith, 136.

87. Floyd Laughter as cited in Luckert, *Navajo Mountain and Rainbow Bridge Religion*, 76–77.