

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Narratives of Citizenship: Indigenous and Diasporic Peoples Unsettle the Nation-State. Edited by Aloys N. M. Fleischmann, Nancy Van Styvendale, and Cody McCarroll.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/224151px>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 37(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

MacKenzie, Sarah

**Publication Date**

2013-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Tribal determinations about social and sexual relations have been profoundly shaped by US narrations about nation, family, and gender, thereby naturalizing patriarchy as the norm. Barker argues that Native cultures and identities are always in negotiation, transformation, change, and exchange, and that there never has been a moment of “authenticity.”

It is still the case that most textbooks on tribal nation-building will make a cursory nod toward the relationships between nation, gender, and belonging, thereby legitimizing and sustaining patriarchy and relationships of domination and inequalities. *Native Acts* is an important development in studies of tribal nation-building and sovereignty because it makes so many decolonizing movements. This study illuminates the historical, social, and legal processes through which US national narrations reify cultural authenticity for Native peoples as always in the precolonial past: prehistorical and therefore always natural, inevitable, compromised, and tragic. Rather, we must think about decolonization as an engagement with the ongoing consequences of colonialism and imperialism. Engaging with the consequences of colonialism, imperialism, and neo-liberalism on tribal nation-building necessarily requires critiques of how Western and United States ideologies assume that all histories and cultures dovetail neatly into the dominant narrative; how tribal nation-building is shaped by dominant discursive practices, legal and otherwise; and how the language of tradition is used to mediate Native assertions of tribal legal status and rights to sovereignty and self-determination. Further, although it seems that the realization of sovereignty on each tribal nation’s terms remains elusive, Barker does suggest that tribal nations’ move to an international forum, particularly the adoption of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, holds the possibilities of rearticulations to produce social formations that are more in keeping with distinctive tribal philosophies and teaching. *Native Acts* is a necessary step to creating healthy indigenous nations that respect the rights of all their citizens.

*Jennifer Denetdale*

University of New Mexico

**Narratives of Citizenship: Indigenous and Diasporic Peoples Unsettle the Nation-State.** Edited by Aloys N. M. Fleischmann, Nancy Van Styvendale, and Cody McCarroll. Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2011. 408 pages. \$39.95 paper.

Inspired by Samaro Kamboureli’s and Roy Miki’s collection *Trans.Can.Lit: Resituating the Study of Canadian Literature* (2007) and the special issue of

*West Coast Line*, “Citizenship and Cultural Belonging” (Fall 2008), *Narratives of Citizenship* focuses on indigenous and diasporic works, along with media depictions of indigenous and diasporic peoples, so as to problematize political and cultural ideals of citizenship. Written and edited by a mix of (mainly Canadian) established scholars and doctoral candidates, the essays here deal especially with salient issues raised by the Canadian multiculturalist approach to citizenship. Very much in keeping with recent critical works such as Nira Yuval Davis’ *The Politics of Belonging: Intersectional Contestations* (2011), the articles are tethered by an overarching acknowledgment that citizenship involves state-sanctioned, legal definitions as well as cultural/individual and emotional responses, and that these two aspects of citizenship are deeply imbricated, bearing extensively upon one another and, laterally, state-functioning. Through examination of various cultural products—film, photography, music, and the literary arts—these provocative essays use the works of individual artists or in a few cases, particular situations, as a means of elucidating some of the pertinent issues rendered obscure by the concept of citizenship.

Fleischmann and Van Styvendale’s introduction has feminist underpinnings, citing such seminal works as Iris Marion Young’s *Feminism and Political Theory* (1990) and Kathleen Canning and Sonya Rose’s *Gender, Citizenship & Subjectivities* (2002), and draws upon newly released data from Statistics Canada (2008) regarding the Aboriginal population in Canada, resonating also with the Ethnic Diversity Survey released after Canada’s 2001 census. Fleischmann and Van Styvendale employ the data to facilitate an exploration of the themes of political/public and personal/private, indigenous and diasporic resistance to postcolonial assimilation. The editors’ evident interest in affect leads to the introduction’s turn to a literary analysis that culminates in a discussion of minority and majority cultural production, providing an ideal foreground to the essays that follow. As the subtitle indicates, these are broadly divided between studies concerning the original indigenous inhabitants of a territory and immigrant peoples, the former chiefly concerned with the indigenous peoples of Canada and of Hawai’i, and the latter with a variety of immigrant groups.

Notably, two of the essays fall outside of either category. The first, Jennifer Bowering Delisle’s exploration of Wayne Johnston’s memoir, addresses the intricacies of Newfoundland identity. Though Newfoundlanders are certainly Canadian citizens, joining the Canadian Federation in 1949 was extremely controversial, with the province’s constituency audaciously striving to maintain a distinct cultural identity. As Johnston’s memoir reveals, the decision to join the federation impelled many Newfoundlanders to migrate, dividing families. Yet on the whole Newfoundland’s diaspora remained deeply attached to the homeland. The other essay, Paul Ugor’s study of representations of Nigerian youth gangs, uses popular film as a vehicle to explicate the complexities of Nigerian

citizenship. State failure to provide law and order caused militarized youth to intervene and, ultimately, be exploited by those they defended. Unhonored in any official capacity, these child soldiers were commemorated in film. While neither author deals with indigenous or diasporic citizenship in the same respect as the other contributions, they do represent the collection's polarities, with Delisle's article demonstrating the manner in which cultures and individuals can impact Canadian citizenship and Ugor revealing some of the effects of legal policies and political practices of Nigerian citizenship on individuals/cultures.

Though perhaps less overtly, the remaining essays also address the political and legal aspects of citizenship in tandem with cultural/individual emotional responses to neglect, rejection, or exploitation experienced by indigenous and diasporic peoples. Daniel Coleman's and Carmen Robertson's essays consider different interpretations and understandings derived from historical documents and narratives. Coleman's close reading of *Guswhenta*, or "Two Row Wampum," an ancient ideographic document that discloses traditional indigenous political philosophy and jurisprudence, examines the consequences of the treaty between the Six Nations and the Canadian government and, by extension, contests Eurocentric assumptions regarding Six Nations territory. Focusing on the disputed development of Six Nations land, Coleman's discussion of alternative epistemologies is geared towards a reconfiguration of political relationships between indigenous people and the Canadian state. Robertson's article on the Canadian 1969 white paper (designed by the federal government to eliminate "special" rights for First Nations) examines racialization in editorial cartoons. Drawing upon Sunera Thobani's notion of imagined community described in *Exalted Subjects: Studies in the Making of Race and Nation in Canada* (2007), Robertson explores the constitutional and legal issues surrounding the precarious citizenship status of the indigenous peoples of Canada.

Also addressing the position of indigenous people in Canada—particularly indigenous women—Aloys N. M. Fleischmann's article discusses nineteenth-century missionary and general attitudes toward women of mixed indigenous and European ancestry in British Columbia. Critical of both intra- and intercultural mistreatment of indigenous women, Fleischmann paints a sad portrait of systemic discrimination, oppression, and representational violence. Sydney L. Laukea deals with similar issues through an examination of the role of photographs in creating a Hawaiian historical narrative aligned with the official American version. Using photographs taken before and after the construction of the Ala Wai Canal (1921–1928), Laukea manages to construct a visual history of indigenous people overmastered by coercive government measures, most evidently manifest in the illegal overthrow of the Hawaiian Kingdom in 1893. Laukea's analysis makes obvious the inextricable connection between the politics of citizenship and individual well-being.

Several of the collection's articles serve to encourage improved intercultural understanding in multicultural nation-states. Robert Zacharias' essay contrasts Joy Kogawa's *Obasan* (1981) with Larissa Lai's *Salt Fish Girl* (2002), the former concerning the Second World War internment of Japanese-Canadians and the latter transitioning between the past and an imagined future. Invoking the work of Italian political philosopher Giorgio Agamben, Zacharias' analysis implies that much remains to be accomplished in order for the cultural majority to better understand the particular position of Japanese-Canadians. Raising similar concerns regarding intercultural misunderstanding, David Chariandy's article pertains to the status of black Canadians, whether long-standing inhabitants of many generations or immigrants recently arrived, in particular subsequent to the 1966 abolishment of white Canadian immigration preference, evidencing the varying effects of policies upon black Canadians. In a similar vein to Chariandy and Zacharias, Lily Cho's analysis of Madeleine Thien's short story *Simple Recipes*, the title piece from Thien's 2001 collection, explores the particular brand of melancholia experienced by immigrants, touching upon issues of intergenerational tension and cultural dislocation.

While none of the examples provided here unsettle the nation-state in any profound respect, the writers certainly succeed in demonstrating the inadequacy of the state's official narratives and policies regarding citizenship, reminding readers of the complexities of citizenship, both historical and contemporary, on both governmental/administrative and individual/personal levels. This timely and illuminating collection successfully moves readers to imagine the nation-state as both a narrative construction and a product of tension between indigenous/diasporic rights advocates and coercive practices of exclusion and assimilation exercised by the state. Contributors also demonstrate that nation-states have the power to support and nurture or suppress and ignore cultural differences, emphasizing the often tragic outcome in instances of state oppression. Reminiscent of such critical anthologies as Engin Isin's *Recasting the Social in Citizen* (2008), *Narratives of Citizenship* unites historical, political, sociological, and literary studies, connecting the general with the particular to reveal the impact of state citizenship policy upon cultures and individuals, as well as the roles played by cultures and individuals in shaping policies. A vital contribution to the growing body of work relating to multiculturalism and citizenship, this collection might be followed up by further interdisciplinary studies that use literature, photographs, or music as media through which to communicate the distinct struggles of indigenous and diasporic populations and individuals.

Sarah MacKenzie  
University of Ottawa