

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Native Performers in Wild West Shows: From Buffalo Bill to Euro Disney.
By Linda Scarangella McNenly.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1v71v13q>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 38(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Spears-Rico, Gabriela

Publication Date

2014

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

through the visual works of Dana Claxton (Lakota). On a theoretical note, scant attention is paid to the political or social economy of this crucial cultural form, such as the hastening divergence between well-funded Canadian (or New Zealand) Aboriginal productions and the more financially marginalized US Native film scene. There is also relatively little attention paid to indigenous documentary films beyond those of Alanis Obomsawin and Sandra Osawa whose work, while groundbreaking in many ways, does not begin to represent the body of work by Native documentarians. However, Jennifer A. Machiorlatti's interview with Mona Smith (Dakota) is a poignant look at the multiplatform, community-based visual documentary that is quickly emerging as a future direction for indigenous filmmakers.

Overall the volume is a useful and welcomed addition to the growing literature and will prove to be invaluable as a resource for research. As a somewhat selective overview of the field, its usefulness in courses will depend upon the expertise and interests of the instructor and the breadth and nature of other classroom materials. It necessitates classroom engagement with specific films, which some will find either very helpful or quite limiting. The structure of the work certainly lends itself to using a selection of the readings in a multitude of ways, a very productive way to include such a good resource in classes. Students will love the more candid filmmaker conversations and interviews. Reading the interviews makes one wish that more scholars would pay attention to what indigenous filmmakers are saying. In sum, this thoughtful collection will prompt more lively, reflexive, and critical dialogue among academics, filmmakers, and global audiences from a variety of backgrounds with divergent expectations about Native American auteurs and films.

Leighton C. Peterson
Miami University

Native Performers in Wild West Shows: From Buffalo Bill to Euro Disney. By Linda Scarangella McNenly. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2012. 272 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

In *Native Performers in Wild West Shows*, Linda Scarangella McNenly offers a poignant analysis of Native American agency in Wild West show performances. McNenly engages practice theory and performance theory to analyze how Native American performers from the twentieth century to the present have negotiated power and demonstrated intention. McNenly argues that Wild West shows functioned as contact zones between Western and Native American cultural influences. Although these encounters between Native

performers and non-Native producers/co-workers/audiences lent themselves to the exploitation of Native American performers and to the commodification of Native American culture, they also opened up opportunities for Native American performers to indigenize the encounters and the performances for their own purposes. McNenly contends that Native American performers made conscious decisions to participate in the shows in order to access travel, money, resources, success, and a platform to express their Native identities.

Utilizing both archival and ethnographic research methods to explore Native American agency in Wild West shows, McNenly engaged with archives such as the McCracken Research Library at the Buffalo Bill Center of the West in Wyoming and the Princess White Deer Collection at Kahnawake, Mohawk Territory in Quebec to analyze newspaper articles, photographs, and letters written by Native American performers. Typically, historians contextualize archival documents within their corresponding time periods and use them to complement that period's historical record. Like other anthropologist-historiographers, McNenly supplements archival research with ethnographic methods to give readers more accurate interpretations of the documents and photographs in the archives. Complementing the archival research with ethnographic data, she interviews the descendants of some of the most famous Native American performers in Wild West shows, tracing the generational memory passed from the performers onto their children, grandchildren, and future generations. By conducting an oral history, McNenly not only honors the importance of the oral tradition in the preservation of Native American historical memory, she also addresses the crisis of representation that has historically afflicted the relationship between scholars and Native Americans within the field of anthropology.

Although anthropologists such as Renato Rosaldo and James Clifford attempted to address the crisis of representation within anthropology in the 1980s, the field is still overwhelmingly made up of Western scholars who study, write about, and represent indigenous communities throughout the world. Scholarly representation is particularly problematic when Western scholars attempt to interpret archives and indigenous texts about the past or analyze onstage and offstage indigenous performances without consulting indigenous communities. McNenly addresses this issue not only by interviewing the descendants of deceased Native American performers, but contemporary performers in Wild West shows as well. She thus includes Native perspectives of such performances from the people who knew the performers best or who may have insight into the context of the performances. By incorporating indigenous perspectives into her analysis of Native American archives and Native American performances, McNenly helps bridge the gap between anthropologists and Native objects of study, or what has been termed the

subject/object dichotomy. In its acute awareness of indigenous perspectives and indigenous subjectivities, her book parallels other recent insightful ethnographies addressing the relationship between indigenous performances, tourism, and agency, such as Walter E. Little's ethnography of Maya performances in Guatemala's tourist economy (2009) and Ruth Helier-Tinoco's ethnography on P'urhepecha musical performances for tourists visiting Mexico (2011).

Practice theory acknowledges the relationship between power structures and human action. By using practice theory to frame her argument, McNenly contextualizes her exploration of Native American agency within the larger power structures that affect Native American people. As subjects of colonization, Native Americans constantly navigate intersecting oppressions such as racism, poverty, dispossession, and segregation; these larger social forces that shape the actor's life inform all performances, whether onstage or off, continuously influencing the choices they make and the performances they choose to participate in. Although McNenly acknowledges that the shows exploited Native performers, commodified Native American culture, and greatly contributed to constructing negative stereotypes about Native people, McNenly chooses to focus on the agency or intention that Native performers demonstrated while participating in Wild West shows because so many previous studies have already focused on the exploitative and stereotypical aspects, such as Louis S. Warren's *Buffalo Bill's America* (2005) and Carter Meyer and Diana Royer's *Selling the Indian* (2001).

Even though she acknowledges that power dynamics contributed to the exploitation of Native American performers, McNenly also seems to downgrade the severity of such exploitation by comparing it to the oppressive conditions that Native Americans experienced while living on impoverished reservations. For example, she compares the number of deaths in 1890 of Native performers in Buffalo Bill's Wild West show, a 6.7 percent death rate, to the number of deaths on the Pine Ridge reservation in the same year, at 9.8 percent. This is not a sensible comparison, given that the Pine Ridge Reservation was plagued by poverty and had a larger Native American population than any Wild West show in 1890. McNenly claims that the Office of Indian Affairs may have unfairly focused on the exploitation of Native American performers in Wild West shows in order to lessen the perceived severity of distressing living conditions on Native American reservations, yet she does not provide archival or ethnographic evidence to support such an ample assumption. While her assertion that living conditions on Native American reservations were deplorable is correct, such a fact does not lessen the importance of recognizing the effects that exploitative conditions in Wild West shows had on Native performers. Instead of comparing the exploitative nature of one experience to another,

McNenly could simply acknowledge that both experiences had shortcomings and negative impacts on Native American people.

Native Performers in Wild West Shows converses with previous works on the commodifying nature of tourism and its impacts on indigenous cultures, such as Dean McCannell's 1976 groundbreaking work on the touristic commodification of the pristine and primitive and Helaine Silverman's 2002 theory that the nation-state commodifies the past in order to market specific sites as tourist destinations, yet these studies did not necessarily explore indigenous agency in touristic interactions. Other works specifically on Native American performances focused on white motivations to commodify, take, or perform Native American identities, including Phillip Deloria and Shari Huhndorf's explorations of white America's inclination to "go native" or "play Indian" as a means for whites to appropriate indigeneity or lay claim to the land, while conveniently silencing the United States' violent genocidal past. McNenly builds upon this important body of work in Native American studies by focusing on how Native American performers expressed intention during their performances with Wild West shows. Defining agency in terms of power negotiations and the cultural projects that Native American performers engaged in while participating in Wild West shows, McNenly applies such terms as "performative agency," "expressive agency," and "absence as agency" to differentiate how Native performers expressed intention. Her findings indicate that Native American performers made conscious decisions to join Wild West shows in order to access opportunities to travel and earn money off-reservation, that Native performers were able to travel freely throughout the European countries they visited, and that they actually had much freedom in deciding when to join or quit a show.

Additionally, McNenly's interviews reveal that Native performers enjoyed building community with performers from other tribal backgrounds while on tour and incorporated some of their specific traditional dances and clothing into their performances, although Native American performers in Wild West shows were typically expected to wear the homogenizing and stereotypical Plains Indian outfit. As a result of undergoing what Mary Pratt terms the process of transculturation, Native American performers absorbed different cultural influences in the intertribal and non-Native contact zone of the Wild West show and created hybrid or blended Native cultural forms and hybrid identities. Not only were Native performers active agents in constructing Nativeness in these performance contexts, but they actually enjoyed their claim to Native authenticity, their ability to share traditional knowledge with people who had a genuine interest in American Indians, the fame and celebrity status they were accorded in foreign lands, and being role models for others. According to McNenly's findings, to this day Native American performers in

Wild West shows set goals and take pride in the accomplishments, success, and fame that performing grants them.

Native American Performers in Wild West Shows offers an excellent in-depth and comprehensive analysis of the relationship between Native American agency and performance that is much needed. Still, there are areas McNenly could have expanded on in this study. Even though McNenly acknowledges the structural forces that limit Native Americans' ability to be social actors, she does not explore the great body of theoretical work delineating how structural forces shape social action and thereby limit agency. Louis Althusser's work on the ideological state apparatus is particularly imperative when considering questions of agency and subjectivity. Additionally, McNenly does not complicate the question of subjectivity as it applies to deceased Native Americans in regard to her interviews of the descendants of Native performers and current Native performers in Wild West shows or her archival research. While the oral tradition can reveal a snapshot of what early twentieth-century Native American performers felt, McNenly does not ask whether their feelings can truly be revealed or represented either by studying archival documents or interviewing their descendants. In considering questions of subjectivity when writing about subaltern populations, as Gayatri Spivak has theorized, repressive historical forces limit what we can learn about Native American performers who have already passed on, even if we attempt to trace their oral histories by interviewing their descendants. Nonetheless, *Native American Performers in Wild West Shows* is an imperative contribution to understanding Native Americans as social actors with agency.

Gabriela Spears-Rico

University of California, Berkeley

The Only One Living to Tell: The Autobiography of a Yavapai Indian. By Mike Burns. Edited by Gregory McNamee. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2012. 176 pages. \$17.95 paper.

After I taught Cormac McCarthy's *Blood Meridian* recently, my undergraduate students could not shake the novel's inherent violence: the senseless and repeated murder of American Indians and Mexicans by a marauding gang of white men. It was all too much for the students to imagine. Thankfully, they said, it was merely fiction. *The Only One Living to Tell*, however, is all true, a nonfiction account of Mike Burns (Hoomothya), a Yavapai who was the sole survivor of the Skeleton Cave Massacre in 1872. He writes jarringly of endless mistreatment, imprisonment, persecution, and murder of Indian people by the