

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Voices from Four Directions: Contemporary Translations of the Native Literatures of North America. Edited by Brian Swann.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/18s732jb>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 29(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Kroskirty, Paul V.

Publication Date

2005-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

In discussing the events that transpired at the federal level, Rolde tells us that the chairman of the Senate Select Committee was “of Lebanese descent” (34–35). Again, it is not clear how the ethnicity of the senator from South Dakota affects how this individual chose to look at the issue at hand. Sometimes Rolde’s reminiscences are phrased a bit inappropriately. As he reflects on his past lack of awareness of diversity, he states, “It had no more meaning to my life than Negro shacks and barefoot piccaninnies. . . .” (vii). Rolde refers to the Seminole boy with whom he had his picture taken as “swarthy” (vii) and refers to Penobscot men as “braves” (153). When he discusses the Maori, he describes his experience viewing “this hokey folk dance” (421). He discusses his trip to Taipei, where a group of Aborigines from Australia performed while “cavorting about” (422) and where tribal dancers of “their own Oriental ‘aboriginal’ populations, in gaudy local costumes, welcomed us” (422).

However, one of the most serious flaws of the book is the frustrating lack of citations. There are far too few in general and they are often missing when the author asserts critical points. For example, Rolde cites statistics pertaining to socioeconomic factors and the Micmac of Maine, but he never says where he found these numbers. The critical interviews with Native people that Rolde uses are not documented at all, not even in the bibliography. As an individual interested in examining Wabanaki history, I found references to some very important events and materials in his book that I cannot substantiate because they are not documented. The time and place of even some direct quotes are not provided.

Despite some problems, *Unsettled Past, Unsettled Future* makes a significant contribution to the field of Native studies. It provides one of the few comprehensive pictures of Maine Natives; especially important is its coverage of the Wabanaki during the late-eighteenth and early-twentieth centuries. Of further significance is the voice Rolde gives to many Maine Natives through the extensive interviews. Rolde shows his devotion to the Native people of Maine by dedicating the book to Priscilla Attean (a Penobscot leader), and states that he is contributing any profit from the book to Passamaquoddy and Penobscot cultural endeavors. Books such as this, dedicated to the history of the Wabanaki, are critical to the field because they reveal a Native history unique to this area and unlike that of Western tribes.

Maureen E. Smith
University of Maine

Voices from Four Directions: Contemporary Translations of the Native Literatures of North America. Edited by Brian Swann. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004. 617 pages. \$70.00 cloth; 27.50 paper.

In this collection, Swann continues to manifest his long-term interest in the translation of Native American verbal art. In previous work, he has edited such important volumes as *Coming to Light: Contemporary Translations of North America*

(1994), *On the Translation of Native American Literatures* (1992), and *Smoothing the Ground: Essays on Native American Oral Literatures* (1983) and numerous other works. In many respects, *Voices* stands as a sequel to this stream of ambitious editing projects directed at interpretation, translation, and the goal of making Native American verbal art available to those, both Native and non-Native, who may not know the languages and the cultures of the storytellers. The editorial strategy for this collection centers not so much on a preoccupation with the process of translation as on publishing translated products that exemplify various attempts to convey at least some of the artistry of the Native performers and/or the cultural significance of the myths, stories, and songs. Though almost all the works included in *Voices* were originally articulated in Native American languages, this collection emphasizes English as the sole “target language” and nearly erases the Native American source languages. Since one of the goals of the volume is to popularize these works, even I—a linguistic anthropologist—can understand the logic of removing the delightful (but maddening) technicalities that accompany a more detailed, linguistic treatment that more explicitly relates the translations to their Haida, Yuchi, Tewa, or Migmaq originals. Of course, understanding in this case is not necessarily approving—more on this in my concluding paragraph.

The title of the volume provides an organizational trope for presenting translated works of verbal art from what Swann constructs as “the four directions”—materials from thirty-one different languages, arranged in four parts according to the cardinal directions. Though this organization might suggest an areal emphasis, neither the editor nor the authors attempt any internal comparisons between works in the same “directional” part, so the grouping is merely a way of naturalizing the organization of the volume. While any arrangement by geographical direction would impose considerable arbitrariness, Swann’s poetically licensed directions may seem particularly odd to anyone familiar with either the usual “culture areas” or areal linguistic groupings. Thus, for example, Tlingit and Haida selections are allocated to North and West, respectively, and the Colorado River Quechan (in the “West”) is separated from O’odham, Navajo, and San Juan Tewa (“South”), who are in the same part as Yuchi and Cherokee.

Part 1 includes four works from three “northern” (Koryak, Tlingit, and Inupiaq) languages. “Raven Stories” (Tlingit) provides a brief but excellent discussion of relevant language and culture by Nora Marks Dauenhauer and Richard Dauenhauer, as well as a translation of “Raven and Water,” originally told by Willie Marks and translated by his daughter Nora. The Dauenhauers include relevant background about joking relationships in Tlingit kinship, highlight the use of lines as a means of capturing the pace of the story, and furnish a very useful discussion of the role of understatement in Tlingit discourse.

Featuring eleven works from ten different languages, part 2 (“West”) includes verbal art from Kwakiutl, Haida, Okanagan, Lushootseed, Sahaptin, Upper Coquille Athabaskan, Lake Miwok, Miguelino Salinan, Yana, and Quechan. As in the other parts, works from each language are presented as largely self-contained chapters that typically include some introductory

materials presented by the translator, a discussion of who performed the verbal art, and then the work itself in English translation. Many authors display the influence of an ethnopoetic attention to the meaning of linguistic form in the originals and the role of performance in constructing these narratives, and they attempt to capture some of these details of discourse in their translations. Among the many remarkable translations in this section are Robert Bringhurst's translation of Ghandl's Haida narrative "The Sea Lion Hunter" and Catherine Callaghan's translation of James Knight's Lake Miwok myth "How Coyote Made the World." Bringhurst describes and exemplifies the productive role of such pattern numbers as three and five in structuring lines and verses as well as acts and movements in the Haida oral tradition. Callaghan argues for the need to translate Knight's original myth in a manner that captures the original's "high" declamatory style. She opts for a lofty prose rather than a more poetically nuanced representation of this culturally important narrative. In another remarkable work, albeit not a translation in the usual sense, Virginia Hymes discusses and shows how a recorded English-language performance, "Celilo," produced by Larry George (Sahaptin), represents the traditional ethnopoetic organization of that verbal art tradition and uses this knowledge to effectively reveal this organization in her textual representation of the oral performance of a story that both celebrates a former site of salmon runs and documents its destruction.

In part 3 ("South"), which contains nine works from eight different languages (Western Apache, Navajo, San Juan Tewa, O'odham, Kiowa, Yuchi, Cherokee, Catawba), we find two contributors translating works that are usually regarded as songs, or "song-poems," and two others whose "source" narratives are encoded in English. Hao Huang translates a Turtle Dance Song composed by Peter Garcia Sr. in Rio Grande Tewa, as spoken at San Juan Pueblo. Huang also includes extensive commentary by Garcia on the performance, structure, and cultural significance of these songs, which demonstrates how insightful and articulate Native composers and performers can be, not just as providers of text but as authoritative interpreters as well. David Kozak's treatment of "Whirlwind Songs," translated from O'odham performances by Ha-ata and Vicente Jose, provides valuable cultural and discourse analysis of this example of a ritual song used to cure "whirlwind sickness." In "The Red Wolf Story" Luke Eric Lassiter supplies an important narrative, told in English by Ralph Kotay (Kiowa), that reveals the history of the Kiowa Gourd Dance. In Rex Lee Jim's (Navajo) two Coyote stories, "Coyote and Skunk" and "Coyote and Bobcat," the author, who teaches at Diné College, provides stories in English preceded by a lively and imaginative introduction in which he dialogues with Coyote on the value of children videotaping their elders and other topics. Far more conventional are Blair Rudes's translations of several short Catawba fables and Willard Walker's presentation of the Cherokee story "Thunder and the Ukten," which was performed by Willie Jumper and first transcribed by Wesley Proctor (both Oklahoma Cherokees), who rendered it in the Cherokee syllabic script. In these works both authors introduce their translations with more attention to cultural and historical background than to the indigenous

discourse structures that most of the other contributors seek to preserve in their translations.

Finally, part 4 (“East”) provides translations of narratives from ten languages (Lakota, Ioway-Otoe-Missouria, Meskwaki, Menominee, Ojibwe, Seneca, Oneida, Maliseet, Migmaq, and Naskapi). Two contributions that are especially noteworthy because of the balance in their treatment of both linguistic and cultural aspects of translation are Rand Valentine’s translation of “The Birth of Nenabozho”—a sequence of four stories on the life of the central trickster/culture hero figure in Ojibwe thought told a century ago by Waasaagoneshkang to William Jones—and Wallace Chafe’s Seneca “Creation Story” as told by John Armstrong.

I hope I have conveyed some of the richness and diversity of Swann’s collection as a sampler of the current research producing English translations of Native American verbal art, past and present. If this volume can succeed in reaching and even creating new audiences for Native American verbal art in translation, then its omission of Native American linguistic texts in the original may serve a valuable purpose after all. Swann, in his introduction, reports that some linguists refused to participate in his volume, asking, “What does it say to the Native communities when we tell them ‘Your literature is only valuable when it is in English?’” But such a question ignores the important observation that this collection is not directed at either professional linguists (“Americanists”) who know the languages (or at least some aspects of them) or Native American communities in the throes of language renewal but rather to the nonspecialist reader seeking to acquire a sense of Native American oral traditions in a more user-friendly form. *Voices* may thus serve a valuable educational function by introducing the artistry of Native American linguistic traditions to a broader audience that can be moved to abandon often covert ideologies of contempt for “small,” “tribal” languages because of their presumed inferiority and mobilized to lend support to language revitalization efforts on behalf of these and other threatened languages. But while this attempt both to find and enlighten new readers can be readily rationalized, it is important to honor the committed readers—perhaps in future volumes—for whom inclusion of the Native language not only restores the proper balance to the translation process but also recenters the study of verbal art in the Native-language originals.

Paul V. Kroskrity

University of California, Los Angeles