dream experience and the possible centrality and formative powers of such experience, I came away dissatisfied that, in spite of his scholarship, Irwin did not deliver all that he had promised. Irwin is to be praised for his choice of descriptive phenomenology as his method. He certainly recognizes that phenomenology can offer a greater understanding of the fundamental nature of Plains Indians' dream experience than traditional psychoanalysis and other "scientific" methods. But, because he fails to apply his phenomenological method consistently and he does not robustly justify his access to the subject matter, he offers no such primordial understanding. While Irwin takes the discussion of the dreams of the Plains Indians beyond that of other scholars, he never reveals the Plains Indian as being-as-dreamer. And, if he is to prove his thesis, all of his ethnographic scholarship must rest on this revelation.

Angelo A. Calvello
Chicago Mercantile Exchange

Howling Wolf and the History of Ledger Art. By Joyce M. Szabo. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1994. 270 pages. $50.00 cloth.

Howling Wolf and the History of Ledger Art is a thorough analysis of the work of the late nineteenth-century Southern Cheyenne artist, Howling Wolf, in the context of the history of ledger art as an artistic style. Although it primarily addresses Howling Wolf, the book includes an introduction to Plains Indian painting, the development of ledger art, and the history of the Fort Marion period. It presents a useful summary of the artistic changes that occurred in Plains Indian painting as the artists responded to the drastic cultural upheavals caused by non-Indian contact. However, the most intriguing aspect of *Howling Wolf and the History of Ledger Art* is the meticulous study of Howling Wolf's style and the author's attempt to place the artist's work in a correct chronological sequence. Joyce M. Szabo discusses the stylistic attributions of the complete known works of Howling Wolf in relation to the artist's biography. The result is a greater sense of the individual artist behind the work and the overall development of his unique style.

Howling Wolf was a prolific artist whose work spans three stylistic phases of ledger art: the prereservation period, the im-

prisonment at Fort Marion, and the reservation period. It serves as an individual case study of the changes that took place in subject matter and style as a result of the diverse roles of the artist and of ledger art, as well as of new forms of patronage. During the pre-reservation period, Howling Wolf participated as a warrior within Southern Cheyenne society. It seems as if he created a ledger, the Oberlin drawings, in the collection of the Allen Memorial Art Museum, Oberlin College, at this time (the ledger is dated by Szabo through stylistic and subject analysis). The ledger shows Howling Wolf's understanding of traditional aspects of hide painting, such as the use of a system of pictographic shorthand and the importance of depicting personal exploits in battle. However, Szabo also notes the young artist's openness to experimentation.

Between 1875 and 1878, Howling Wolf was among seventy-two Southern Plains Indians held as prisoners at Fort Marion, Saint Augustine, Florida. Ledger art produced at this time reveals much experimentation in subject matter and composition, as well as a de-emphasis on pictorial conventions formerly used on hide painting and in early ledger art. At Fort Marion, Lieutenant Richard Pratt encouraged the production of ledger art and its sale to non-Indian tourists. Szabo decribes this change in patronage and its effects on the creation of Fort Marion ledger art. Particular developments in Howling Wolf's style are discussed in depth, with emphasis placed on two Fort Marion ledgers, one in the New York State Library, Albany, the other in the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University. The artist's biography reveals factors that may have contributed to his stylistic development. For example, Howling Wolf traveled to Boston for eye surgery during the Fort Marion exile and perhaps was exposed to additional influences in New England.

It seems that only a few examples of ledger art were made by Fort Marion artists after their return to reservation life in 1878. Howling Wolf created twelve drawings—the Bourke Ledger—in the Joslyn Art Museum, during the reservation period. Szabo discusses how the Bourke Ledger shows both artistic innovation and continuity with Howling Wolf's previous works. For example, changes in subject matter, such as depictions of historic tribal events or victories, may suggest Howling Wolf's reestablishment of pride in his culture after the exile at Fort Marion, where the artists were encouraged to draw scenes of life in Florida. Szabo's descriptions of the artist's stylistic development are reinforced visually through the illustrations. Drawings can be

compared among the ledgers created during different phases of Howling Wolf's life, allowing the reader to absorb a sense of Howling Wolf's personal style. Thirty-two color plates and seventy-seven black-and-white illustrations result in a thoroughly illustrated text.

The book includes two appendices of handwritten captions and named protagonists from the Oberlin Ledger. These are presented without adequate descriptive titles and are somewhat confusing. An appendix comparing the basic descriptive information about each ledger discussed in the book would be helpful. Copious notes provide much additional information. Most references to other ledger artists appear in the notes. Unfortunately, Szabo makes few comparisons of Howling Wolf's work with other Plains Indian ledger artists, in particular the other prisoners at Fort Marion. Detailed stylistic comparisons of Howling Wolf's drawings and the work of other Fort Marion artists would be interesting. Szabo claims that Howling Wolf was already an accomplished ledger artist prior to arriving at Saint Augustine; thus, his possible influence on the other prisoners could be explored further. However, other studies do address more specifically the Fort Marion period, such as Karen Daniels Petersen's *Plains Indian Art from Fort Marion* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1971). Szabo does not elaborate on the impact of acculturation on the artists and their choice of subjects or style of Fort Marion art. This topic has been explored by other authors, such as Janet C. Berlo, "Portraits of Dispossession in Plains Indian and Inuit Graphic Arts" (*Art Journal* 49:2 [Summer 1990]).

Rather than comparing Howling Wolf 's work with other Plains Indian artists of the period, Szabo focuses on his drawings in relation to his personal biography. Historians of Native American art have become more and more concerned in recent scholarship with the importance of documenting individual biographies of nineteenth-century Indian artists. Recent publications, such as the exhibition catalog *Visions of the People: A Pictorial History of Plains Indian Life*, edited by Evan M. Maurer (Minneapolis: Minneapolis Institute of Arts, 1992), integrate biographic information into catalog entries. However, few monographs exist that address individual ledger artists. (See Helen H. Blish, *Amos Bad Heart Bull: A Pictorial History of the Oglala Sioux* [Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1967].)

As a comprehensive approach to the work of a major nineteenth-century Plains Indian artist, *Howling Wolf and the History of*

Ledger Art serves as an important contribution to the historiography of Native American art. Szabo's detailed analysis of Howling Wolf's ledger drawing style also acts as a methodological example of how stylistic analysis can help in the attribution and chronological placement of an individual artist's work. As a major Southern Cheyenne artist of the nineteenth century, Howling Wolf contributed greatly to the history of Plains Indian ledger art. *Howling Wolf and the History of Ledger Art* documents the life and work of this important artist, helping to acknowledge his role within the history of Plains Indian art.

Catie Anne Cadge
University of Victoria

Kachinas: Spirit Beings of the Hopi. Art by Neil David, Sr., foreword by Frederick Dockstader, descriptions by J. Brent Ricks and Alexander E. Anthony, Jr. Albuquerque: Avanyu Publishing Inc., 1993. 194 pages. $50.00 cloth.

Kachinas: Spirit Beings of the Hopi follows a practice, now at least ninety years old, in which Hopi artists illustrate Hopi katsinas (kachinas). The book is indebted, in particular, to two of its predecessors—*Hopi Katcinas Drawn by Native Artists* by Jesse Walter Fewkes (1903), the Annual Report of the Bureau of American Ethnology, (1921; reprinted in 1982 by the Rio Grande Press) and *Kachinas, A Hopi Artist's Documentary* by Barton Wright, illustrated by Cliff Bahnimptewa (1973). White-bear (Kutcahonauu), who did many of the illustrations for Fewkes, is Neil David's grandfather.

The book has a short foreword by Frederick Dockstader, author of *The Kachina and the White Man,* and an introduction by J. Brent Ricks, a lawyer, and Alexander E. Anthony, Jr., a gallery director, who are the publishers. Ricks and Anthony provide a brief overview of Hopi and of katsinas and a list of the insights that the two men gained through this project.

Featured are seventy-nine rarely depicted and unusual Hopi katsinas painted by Hopi-Tewa artist Neil David, Sr. of Polacca, First Mesa. David, a painter of katsinas and a carver of katsina figurines since 1969, was approached by trader Erik Bromberg in the 1970s to record what was seen as vanishing information. Bromberg realized that most katsina carvers were using the