

# **UCLA**

## **American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

### **Title**

Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State. Edited by Duane Champagne, Karen Jo Torjesen, and Susan Steiner.

### **Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1420w0gm>

### **Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(3)

### **ISSN**

0161-6463

### **Author**

Poelzer, Greg

### **Publication Date**

2006-06-01

### **DOI**

10.17953

### **Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

mandated by that expectation. In like manner, collection of tolls for crossing a stream by bridge was apparently seen by the Indians managing the bridge as a “reciprocity” payment for permitting the emigrants to cross Indian land. Of course, such an idea would never have occurred to wagon train travelers who were, in their judgment, on land acquired by their government through the Louisiana Purchase. Policy makers from the first days of the Republic had rejected the idea that Indians had an unrestricted claim to particular territory. One problem, however, is quite apparent. Professor Tate distinguishes between “reciprocal gift-giving” and individual acts of simple kindness not so motivated. The problem? On the basis of what standards could emigrants have been expected to differentiate between the two?

Tate’s scholarly efforts have resulted in a book that should be read by anyone with more than a passing interest in the westward migration. It is, of course, obvious that it would be excellent “adjunct reading” for college Western history classes. In fact, the volume is so well written it could also well be used for advanced high school classes.

*Robert L. Munkres*  
Muskingum College

**Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State.** Edited by Duane Champagne, Karen Jo Torjesen, and Susan Steiner. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 2005. 208 pages. \$72.00 cloth; \$26.95 paper.

*Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* is a collection of chapters originating from a conference held at Claremont Graduate University in 2002. This is important to note for two reasons. First, the book is organized around the broad themes of that conference; second, the collection includes panel discussions from the conference, as chapters serving as bookends for each of three sections of the book. As a whole, *Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* holds together very well. Scholars in the field of indigenous studies and cognate disciplines will find several of the nine essay chapters extremely useful. At the same time, the editors clearly have taken a great deal of care to ensure that all of the chapters are also accessible to an undergraduate student audience.

The collection is organized around three sections: “Indigenous Identity and the State,” “Culture and Economics,” and “Trilateral Discussion: Canada, the United States, and Mexico.” As the latter theme suggests, the collection offers a comparative perspective on indigenous issues in Canada, the United States, and Mexico. The collection does not attempt to undertake a systematic comparative analysis between individual country contexts, nor do the authors significantly draw on the lessons and experiences of indigenous peoples in the other countries. Nevertheless, *Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* does show the harsh contrast of the situation of indigenous peoples in Canada compared with that of their neighbors to the south.

The overall quality of the individual contributions is very good. Too often it is the case that edited books contain a handful of excellent contributions,

a few good contributions, and the rest is filler material. This book is solid from front to back. The first section of the book deals with the question of indigenous identity. Duane Champagne provides an overview of indigenous relations with modern states, particularly notions tied up with identity and political community. This is followed by two short essays: the first, by Steven Crum, discusses border-crossing issues for indigenous communities focusing on two US-Mexico cases: the Kumeyaay and Tohono O'odham and two US-Canada cases: the Iroquois and Blackfoot. The second, by James Dempsey, focuses on the issue of Bill C-31 in Canada, which restored status to many Indians in Canada who had lost their status due to the enfranchisement policies of the Canadian government. Although these latter two chapters are quite short and cover familiar territory for many scholars, they do provide solid entry points for undergraduate students studying indigenous issues.

The second section of the book addresses fundamental questions about indigenous peoples and the economy. The chapter by Brian Calliou ties in questions of leadership and culture identified by scholars such as Menno Boldt and Taiaiake Alfred with the pioneering work of Cornell and Kalt's nation-building model. The chapter by Cora Voyageur, however, is one of the strongest in the collection and should be read by scholars working on Aboriginal issues in Canada and elsewhere. Voyageur tackles the myths and the realities of Aboriginal participation in the Canadian economy, as well as Aboriginal entrepreneurship and self-employment. The comparatively higher levels of unemployment in the wage economy would not surprise many. However, most will find the comparatively similar levels of participation in the labour market very revealing, debunking the myth that Aboriginal people, as a whole, are not productive members of the general economy.

The last section of *Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* is more of a mixed bag of very informative chapters. Few scholars of indigenous issues in Canada and the United States have a good grasp of indigenous issues in Mexico and the rest of Latin America. The chapter by Sylvia Marcos provides an overview of recent politics surrounding indigenous rights movements in Mexico, including the role of indigenous women. June Nash provides a compelling comparative analysis of movement for political autonomy in Mexico and Guatemala—it is a very good read. The chapter by Patricia McCormack, although highly critical of dominant narratives of the place of Aboriginal people in the history of the Canadian state and society, nevertheless points out the misunderstanding on both sides of the Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal divide. This is something that is usually neglected by academics. Moreover, she underscores both the need and the hope for dialogue between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal peoples if real collaboration is to be possible. The last chapter of this section, by Barbara Tedlock, introduces central questions around plant drugs, indigenous knowledge, and intellectual property rights.

There are two points about the book that deserve note and commendation. First, the individual chapters are largely accessible to intelligent lay readers. With a few exceptions, the writing is clear and not heavily laden with unnecessary jargon. Second, the book includes discussions from the conference on each of the broad themes covered in the book; these are arranged

at the end of each section. Although not unique, the inclusion of conference discussion is not that common. These discussions are a refreshing addition and, because the discussion is more free flowing and a bit more informal, provide readers a better sense of many of the contributors as individuals. In short, *Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* makes a very useful contribution to contemporary indigenous issues within a comparative spirit.

*Greg Poelzer*

University of Saskatchewan

**Justice as Healing: Indigenous Ways.** Edited by Wanda D. McCaslin. St. Paul, MN: Living Justice Press, 2005. 459 pages. \$25.00 paper.

The Native Law Centre at the University of Saskatchewan has published a compilation of short articles, excerpts, declarations, quotes, and a poem on indigenous ways of restorative justice and healing. It contains a number of excerpts from the Native Law Centre's *Justice as Healing* newsletter—some as short as one page—as well as excerpts of research reports and conference presentations. This compilation offers accessibility to a broad readership.

The book's objectives are to provide hope and dialogue about indigenous justice traditions, inspire indigenous people to journey toward "justice as healing," and celebrate indigenous peoples finding their voices and telling their stories about peacemaking and reconciliation. There is a call for different paradigms for justice, "paradigms that are founded on indigenous teachings and traditions and that nurture us as peoples and communities." It reflects much of the work and thinking on "decolonizing the justice system and charting a return to ways that are healing and natural for us" (xix).

*Justice as Healing: Indigenous Ways* explores alternative approaches using indigenous worldviews, values, and ways of restoring harmony, reconciliation, and resolving conflict in response to western justice systems that have essentially failed indigenous peoples. This exploration is contextualized with the idea of healing indigenous peoples from the harms and negative effects of colonization and the imposition of western imperial legal institutions.

There is a juxtaposition between indigenous ways of conflict resolution and the "passion of Eurocentric society for labelling people as criminals and then making them suffer" along with the way western criminal justice systems justify "a theory of social control by violence" (3). Western justice systems have failed indigenous peoples. This has led to questions about why these systems and laws focus on punishing people rather than attempting to heal them. We need to rethink justice from our traditional ways, which involve holistic approaches to justice.

The authors are "attempting to grasp the wisdom of our Elders, to define ourselves, to articulate a certain way of healing, and to apply it to our traumatic experiences" (5). The goal of healing allows us to live in a world as indigenous peoples connected to our own cultures, traditions, and values. While willing to dialogue with western theorists about justice in modern society, the editor