

## **UC Merced**

### **Journal of California and Great Basin Anthropology**

#### **Title**

Crum: *Po'i Pentum Tammen Kimmappéh: The Road on Which We Came: A History of the Western Shoshone*

#### **Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/13r409g1>

#### **Journal**

Journal of California and Great Basin Anthropology, 16(1)

#### **ISSN**

0191-3557

#### **Author**

Clemmer-Smith, Richard O

#### **Publication Date**

1994-07-01

Peer reviewed

*Po'i Pentum Tammen Kimmappéh: The Road on Which We Came: A History of the Western Shoshone.* Steven J. Crum, University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City, 1994, vii + 240 pages, index, bibliography, \$29.95 (cloth).

Reviewed by:

**RICHARD O. CLEMMER-SMITH**

University of Denver, Denver, CO 80208.

Steven J. Crum (Ph.D., 1983, University of Utah) is a historian and member of the Duck Valley Shoshone Tribe. This fact gives the book a special kind of authority; Crum speaks not only with the weight of historical documents behind him, but also with the insight and ability to cross-check facts and interpretations with individuals who are personally known to him. He is not, then, merely indulging in the rhetoric of the "new" Western historians when he says that the Western Shoshone of Nevada have been active participants in the making of their own history.

Before you say, "Ho-hum. Just another grandstander insisting on the post-modernist jargon of 'human agency' and 'natives-as-not-the-victims-of-historical-victimology'," consider who the Western Shoshone are supposed to be in the anthropological literature: prototypical hunter-gatherers; the only exemplar of the "family level of socio-cultural integration"; the fundamental case study for ecological adaptation to a desert environment; and, according to Julian Steward, nearly fully acculturated to Anglo-American life by the 1930s. It should therefore be surprising to discover that today the Western Shoshone have a supra-tribal-level political organization; an ongoing lawsuit against the U.S. Government for hunting, fishing, and land ownership rights; are one of the few tribes that have chosen to fight for Treaty-guaranteed land rather than accepting a substantial payment offer from the U. S. Indian Claims Commission; and are one of the few North American indigenous nations that successfully evaded wholesale re-

location to reservations while still preserving much of their culture and tradition. Crum documents all this and more in accurate detail in his book, utilizing material from the National Archives, state historical archives, tribal council minutes, claims proceedings and expert witness testimony, newspaper articles, and many other sources. Also included are interviews with Western Shoshones, which were often recorded by local historians or by Shoshones themselves decades earlier and were lost in Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) files or sometimes are accessible only through the descendants of the interviewees themselves.

Crum begins his history with a brief look at "The Native Way of Life," and a selected summary of events between 1848 and 1880. It is the subsequent chapters, dealing with the century-plus between 1880 and 1989, that are the heart of the book and the most valuable contribution to an understanding of how a modern native nation has come to be. Perhaps the most revealing chapter (No. 5) is the one dealing with the period between 1941 and 1960, "From the New Deal to Termination." This period is among the least well documented in American Indian tribal histories; yet it is clear that much of what Western Shoshones struggled to accomplish in this period set the agenda for what was to come in the following three decades. Especially valuable is Crum's effort to document events among the Shoshone who were not at Duck Valley; these "off-reservation" Shoshone were nearly denied tribal status during the Indian New Deal, when, ironically, the BIA was trying to find, revive, and create tribes nearly everywhere else, and at one time, some BIA officials even questioned whether they fit the definition of "Indian"!

Crum's history is largely a political and demographic one rather than an economic or cultural one. While some economic and cultural data are to be found, the major focus is on the maneuverings that Shoshones made to safeguard

their tribal and personal existence against a frontier that was indifferent and sometimes downright hostile to the situations of indigenous peoples. Struggles over land in Ruby Valley, efforts to obtain economic assistance for families living in grinding poverty, controversies over claims strategies, and the complexities of tribal political leadership emerge as close and personal encounters, as well as general historical events. We not only learn what, where, and why; we also learn who was involved and how particular intra-tribal and inter-ethnic interactions took place. Crum does not have to press his point too finely; it is clear from the events themselves that Western Shoshones shaped the course of their history in a way that has few parallels.

Julian Steward, whose classic work on Basin-Plateau sociopolitical organization has shaped the anthropological image of the Western Shoshone, left them in 1937 with his final session of fieldwork completed. But what he completed was a partial, and as he put it himself, a gastronomically-oriented ethnographic reconstruction of Western Shoshone life and culture as it might have been around 1860 or 1870. At that time, Western Shoshones were already largely in full engagement with the demographic, economic, and political forces brought into their country by immigration, homesteading, mining, and railroads; some groups were entering their third decade of such engagements. Thus, Steward's reconstruction, although a fair approximation of aboriginal life, really left the Shoshone frozen in a sociopolitical time warp. He said little about what happened between the "aboriginal" period and his period of field work, the 1930s.

*The Road on Which We Came* tells us not only what was happening during the period that we all thought was "aboriginal," but also what happened following the "aboriginal" period and what was happening right under Steward's nose in the 1930s, but which he did not cover in the least in his monograph. Thus, this volume is a

welcome correction to the "ethnographic present" with which the Western Shoshone have been unfairly saddled for these many decades. It is highly readable and will provide an easily-digestible cornucopia of information for historians, anthropologists, and Western Shoshones themselves who are looking for a comprehensive history of a tribe that, despite being well-known in the anthropological literature, otherwise might have been in danger of being burdened with an ill-deserved historical obscurity.



*Early Hunter-Gatherers of the California Coast.* Jon M. Erlandson. New York and London: Plenum Press, 1994, 336 pp., 73 tables, 47 figs., bibliography, index (hard cover), \$45.00.

*Reviewed by:*

**WILLIAM R. HILDEBRANDT**

Far Western Anthropological Research Group, Inc.,  
P.O. Box 413, Davis, CA 95617.

This book is an expanded and updated version of Erlandson's 1988 Ph.D. dissertation. As outlined in the introductory chapter, the primary goals of the study are to: (1) reconstruct the paleogeography of the Santa Barbara coast during the early Holocene and determine how environmental changes may have affected early occupants of the region; (2) reconstruct subsistence economies through the analysis of archaeofaunal data; (3) compare these results to data from elsewhere to assess early Holocene adaptive variability along the California coast; and (4) evaluate the validity of various models that have been used to explain the evolution of coastal adaptations, particularly those dealing with the importance of marine versus terrestrial foods. To the extent possible, given the less-