

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Choice, Persuasion, and Coercion: Social Control on Spain's North American Frontiers. Edited by Jesus F. de la Teja and Ross Frank.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/13c9q5mj>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Gulliford, Andrew

**Publication Date**

2006

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

fire. Several Nez Perce people were killed by friendly fire at the Bear Paws battle, but not Chief Looking Glass. In all narrative accounts such as those of Josephy, McWhorter, or a half dozen others, all agree he was killed by enemy fire. Fort Keogh is mentioned as the location where surrendering Nez Perce people were sent after the Bear Paws and that it is in “present-day Wyoming,” but it is in Montana, near Miles City.

Every year brings forth more historical publications regarding some aspect of Nez Perce tribal history, and considering the ever-increasing mass of materials it may be surprising that McCoy had as few errors as he did. The vast majority of his facts, the analysis of authors and motives, and where they fit in the panorama of tribal history will stand, and McCoy should be applauded for the leap he has made in the effective incorporation of the creation myth of the Nez Perce people as insight into the history-making process. His contribution, to put forth point-blank what has been suggestive and slow brewing in the past, is to show the power of a people not only to survive but to take a firm grasp on their own story and regenerate themselves. Even with some great photographs, maps, and truly insightful footnotes, this book is not for everyone. It is a book for researchers of Native America and it will be one that scholars of Nez Perce history will want.

The Coyote and Monster story is but one of dozens of Nez Perce myths. McCoy’s work challenges the Anglo establishment and tribal members alike to reread and rethink every myth as a metaphor and a potential historical framework. Nez Perce people are currently active in interpreting their own story through the Nez Perce National Historical Park and through their participation in the Lewis and Clark Bicentennial commemoration. As this review is being written, Nez Perce warriors under the colors of the United States are serving in Afghanistan and Iraq, and tribal politicians are players in discussions of the future of northwest salmon and nuclear cleanup. As McCoy’s study suggests, much more will be coming forth from the Nez Perce people and from other plateau tribes.

*Steven Ross Evans*

Lewis-Clark State College

**Choice, Persuasion, and Coercion: Social Control on Spain’s North American Frontiers.** Edited by Jesus F. de la Teja and Ross Frank. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005. 384 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Published in cooperation with the Clements Center for Southwest Studies at Southern Methodist University (SMU), *Choice, Persuasion, and Coercion* features cutting-edge scholarship on the Spanish presence in the United States and northern Mexico from the 1760s to the 1820s. The eleven original essays in the book evolved out of a unique collaborative process in which invited scholars traveled to SMU’s Fort Burgwin campus at Taos, New Mexico to discuss drafts of the essays that they had read in advance. Later the authors came to the SMU campus in Dallas to talk about their revised essays in a conference

setting open to students, faculty, and the public. The result of this process is a major contribution to the field of borderland studies with seminal essays that probe deeply into the eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century world of power relationships and diplomacy on the northern Spanish frontier.

From Afro-Spanish Florida to shifting Native American alliances on the north Texas frontier, to understanding hierarchies and the *Sistema de Castas* in Saltillo, this comprehensive volume opens a vital window into the Spanish world of stifling mercantile regulations, Native political economies, paternalism of the Spanish monarchy, and wife stealing. The authors use personal narratives effectively and they have delved deeply into Spanish archives. What emerges is a complex world of shifting alliances, military intimidation, elite loyalty to the crown, and intense obsession with race and skin color in a vital, fluid conquest society. Thanks to the process of writing and rewriting, the chapters work well together and the authors successfully reference one another's work.

Alfredo Jimenez begins with an excellent overview of formal Spanish power relationships with his chapter "Who Controls the King?" If this chapter is intended to demonstrate reciprocal relations among Spanish colonials and their ability to petition the king, it neglects to include a corresponding chapter from a Native perspective. Native oral traditions are not utilized. Several chapters clearly demonstrate "top-down" history, while social history "from the bottom up" is not as well delineated. We know what Spanish administrators thought of *indios barbaros*, but we know little about what Native peoples thought of the armed invasion of their homelands. That said, *Choice, Persuasion, and Coercion* is a marvelous synthesis of social control theory with critical analysis of the Spanish racial paradigm, "the purity of blood," and the importance of rituals, gifts, male honor and valor, and ceremonial meetings.

Readers will come to understand jurisdictional issues related to crown and church conflicts, the social mobility of *castas* or persons of mixed ancestry, and the significance of *clientela* or patronage networks. From Jane Landers we learn about geopolitics and Spain's contested Florida frontier. Gilbert C. Din writes about Louisiana, 1763–1803, Spanish control in a multiethnic society, and a Creole revolt. In the aptly titled "They Conceal a Malice Most Refined," Ross Frank describes the limits to social and ethnic mobility with fascinating data on underpaid Spanish soldiers and the unruly *vecino* population. Frank explains the complicated world of racial hierarchies and the census terms *color quebrado*, *lobo*, *coyote*, *mulatto*, *genizaro*, and *casta*. He discusses Native revolutionaries and punishment of three years of labor in chains at an *obraje* or textile workshop.

Perhaps the most interesting chapter in the book, and certainly the most innovative, is Susan M. Deed's essay "Subverting the Social Order: Gender, Power, and Magic in Nueva Vizcaya." Native witchcraft and Spanish colonial concepts of the devil meet in a fascinating case study of the 1691 confession of a mulatta slave who successfully masqueraded as a man and came to a priest seeking penance. Deed contrasts the slave's religious epiphany with the 1721 story of Father Felipe de Calderon who claimed that Christina de Villanueva, the wife of a petty Spanish trader, had employed witchcraft and the "diabolical arts" to make Calderon ill. The Jesuit suffered from intestinal

ailments and sexual impotence from a cup of chocolate she had given him after one of their sexual liaisons. As he tried to withdraw from her seductive influence he found himself *ligado* or tied. In this fascinating analysis of love magic, folk cultures, and female power Deeds explains, “Mulattos, mestizos, Apache captives, and other Indian workers lived in close contact, sharing their cures and antidotes for getting by on a daily basis” (108).

Julianna Barr describes systems of barter and slavery in Texas and male diplomatic rituals revolving around the acquisition and return of captive women. Ironically, to insure that Indian women could be returned they could not be baptized because Spanish administrators would run afoul of the church for repatriating new converts. Caddos, Wichitas, and Comanches stole and traded women commercially, but in Barr’s words, “Spaniards introduced a scale of captive-taking unimaginable to most Indian nations. Spanish forces aimed large-scale attacks on Apache and Comanche rancherias and took women and children captive in numbers of fifty to one hundred people at a time” (166). Cecilia Sheridan chronicles Native territoriality in northeastern New Spain and Cynthia Radding discusses local governance and defiance in colonial Sonora. Patricia Osante writes of colonization in Nuevo Santander while James A. Sandos provides vivid details of the missionary frontier in Alta California, 1769–1821.

Sandos explains that “California Indians’ predilection toward sinfulness was, in part, resistance to Spanish rule and Spanish ways,” yet resistance did not mean survival (269). Priests realized that Natives died too early in the California missions. Father President Mariano Payeras wrote his superiors in Mexico City in 1820 that “the sad experience of fifty one years has showed us all too well that we too have erred in our calculation. Having already seen two generations in the missions, we sadly observe that the mission native dies equally, and perhaps more so, than the Indians of the sierra.” He urged a different course that “would free us for all time from undeserved reproach,” but reforms did not occur (271). Sandos also explains the dangers of bringing a beautiful young Mexican wife to a dreary frontier outpost in the affair of Governor Pedro Fages, whose wife accused him of having sex with a Yuma Indian girl and publicly humiliated him. Father Matias Noriega came to Monterey to persuade Doña Eulalia Callis de Fages to reconcile with her spouse, but “she replied that she would rather be in hell with the devil than in Alta California with her husband” (255). Perhaps the chapter that best defines racial issues in New Spain is Jose Cuellos’s chapter “Racialized Hierarchies of Power in Colonial Mexican Society” using Saltillo as a case study but explaining that “each ‘race’ was a complicated social construct centered in the indelible, but often blurred, badge of skin color” (202). Yet he adds, “Nonelite groups negotiated their identities and roles in the social order—or their exclusion from it—through different combinations of political, economic, and cultural strengths and weaknesses at all levels of colonial life” (205). Utilizing three centuries of explicit census data, Cuellos proves “the fluidity of racial identities on the rim of the empire” (213).

*Choice, Persuasion, and Coercion* is a masterful study of a vanished world and a quantum leap forward in understanding race, class, and gender in a

Spanish colonial context. The book has a fine glossary and bibliography, but it sorely needs relevant regional maps as well as maps showing community racial segregation and who lived where in colonial settlements. Also missing is a comprehensive conclusion to put the essays into perspective. Nevertheless, this is a major contribution to the field of borderland studies that provides new insights into Spanish and Indian identities and patterns of accommodation. Previous scholarly notions of racial barriers disintegrating at the end of the colonial period must now be understood in the context of adaptability and multiethnic alliances.

*Andrew Gulliford*  
Fort Lewis College

**Conquest by Law: How the Discovery of America Dispossessed Indigenous People of Their Land.** By Lindsay G. Robertson. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005. 272 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

Lindsay Robertson has written a strange book. It purports to be a study of “discovery”—the doctrine by which Christian colonizers explained their domination of American Indians; but it reads more like an apology for John Marshall, the Supreme Court chief justice responsible for establishing the doctrine as the foundation of federal Indian law.

*Conquest by Law* provides much useful detail about the people and places involved in the trilogy of cases that announced the discovery doctrine: *Johnson v. McIntosh* (1823), *Cherokee Nation v. Georgia* (1831), and *Worcester v. Georgia* (1832). The book describes complex political and economic circumstances that put the Cherokee Nation in the middle of increasingly bellicose state-federal conflicts that led up to the American Civil War. The reader is shown a staggering array of insider deals, bribes, self-dealing, and other corrupt practices by politicians, lawyers, judges, and other major figures whose interests converged on dispossession of indigenous peoples. In the face of this history, it is unbelievable that these cases continue to be considered valid precedent for twenty-first-century decisions, not only in the United States, but also in Canada and Australia.

The book fails in two crucial respects: first, in attempting to exempt Chief Justice Marshall from the networks of personal interests that swirled around the cases, and second, in misconstruing the key holdings of the cases so as to make it appear that Marshall did not intend and was not aware of their long-term anti-Indian consequences. What might have been a great book is marred by these failures. Any reader concerned with a critique of the foundation of federal Indian law—the discovery doctrine—will have to go beyond this book.

Robertson asserts that “the chief justice came to realize [the discovery doctrine] was a tragic mistake” (xi) and subsequently “repudiated” it (xii). It is not unusual to find John Marshall lauded as an advocate of Indian sovereignty. This notion, however, is problematic. In light of the historical evidence and a close reading of the cases, Robertson should not have embraced it.