

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Education for Extinction: American Indians and the Boarding School Experience, 1875-1928. By David Wallace Adams.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/10k6r332>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 20(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Ellis, Clyde

Publication Date

1996-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

competition may arise. It would prove interesting to examine the impact of contemporary conflicts between urban groups and indigenous peoples about water and hydroelectricity on health policies and conditions. Also, as described here, it appears as if those in the economic periphery have little or no political potency. I do not think Kunitz wishes to imply that indigenous community members usually remain politically inactive. As he notes, those natives who have treaties are most able to affirm their health care rights. Readers might do well to assume that these affirmations involve indigenous political actions; these behaviors might be linked to those of liberal urbanites.

Anyone fascinated by the influence of colonial European and federal policies on indigenous health circumstances will find this book rewarding. *Disease and Diversity* might be especially helpful to Indian Health Service and tribal health providers, as well as to academic researchers new to this field of study. Because Kunitz offers a comparative overview that includes detailed case study descriptions, this book will also be useful for advanced undergraduate and graduate students in public health, epidemiology, medicine, medical anthropology, and government relations/policy.

I certainly recommend this book. The research could be replicated among other populations. Perhaps such a book would also examine the ways in which health professionals could help to ease some of the deleterious economic and social conditions that impact their patients.

Diane Weiner

University of California, Los Angeles

Education for Extinction: American Indians and the Boarding School Experience, 1875–1928. By David Wallace Adams. Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1995. 396 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

In this important book, David Wallace Adams does what no one else has yet managed: He eloquently and comprehensively charts the ambitious but troubled history of Indian education during its heyday between the 1880s and the 1920s. Focusing on the boarding schools that lay at the heart of the school system, Adams discusses the role played by such schools in the ambitious forced assimilation campaign of the era. It was a grand plan, built on

high-minded ideals that promised to remold Indian youth culturally and psychologically. But as Adams demonstrates, in its details the campaign often fell short of the goals. This is not a revelation. Robert Trennert, Michael Coleman, and Margaret Szasz, among others, have addressed the troubled history and limited effectiveness of the Indian schools. What's new here are methodological and organizational models that are not only comprehensive but astonishingly revealing. The failure of the Indian schools has never been more completely analyzed; but happily, and most importantly, this is no mere recitation of policy; it is a discussion of ideological paradigms and experiences that peers through multiple lenses and contexts.

Dividing the book into four sections, Adams integrates ideology, policy and structure, student experience, and consequences. In part 1, "Civilization," he discusses Indian schools as part of the larger agenda that placed great hopes on Lockean ideals and Jeffersonian optimism. As the nineteenth century came to a close, reformers and government policymakers alike comforted themselves with the knowledge that they had discovered the most promising solution to the so-called Indian problem. The answer, of course, was schools. In the campaign to transform the country's Indians into manageable wards, nothing promised greater or more lasting rewards than education. Revered as nearly mythical in their power to elevate and improve, schools enforced the era's civilizing agenda with special fervor. Determined to "conquer the Indians by a standing army of school-teachers, armed with ideas, winning victories by industrial training, and by the gospel of love and the gospel of work" (p. 27), the Indian Office envisioned a school system from which would emerge graduates who had thrown off the barbarism of the past, ready to assume new lives and new futures. Thus, schools dovetailed perfectly with the larger assimilation agenda that had long dominated official thinking.

Adams describes in detail the models and organization of the Indian schools, carefully examining the multitiered system that reformers created by the close of the nineteenth century. The closest scrutiny is reserved for reservation and off-reservation boarding schools, the institution to which policymakers devoted the lion's share of attention and hope. Using Richard Pratt's pioneering work at Carlisle as a model, Adams skillfully recounts the rapid development of a nationwide network of off-reservation schools that could inspire Indian children to "take to heart the inspiring lessons of white civilization" (p. 59).

His work on the administrative bureaucracy of the schools is especially insightful, and his description of those who typically became teachers is masterful. Importantly, even at this early stage in his discussion, Adams is careful to point out that deep flaws in organization, limited energies, and political and social constraints conspired to hobble even the most carefully laid plans. From the beginning, it seems, reformers laid a foundation already weakened by serious faults.

In part 2, "Education," Adams explains how boarding schools operated. Beginning with the assault on identity and culture that defined every student's experience, this is a wonderfully drawn portrait of boarding school life that includes discussions of everything from haircuts to battles against disease. Joined to this is a brilliant delineation of the classroom as the bridge between knowledge and transformation. Adams builds his chapter around the topics used by educators themselves—self-reliance, citizenship, literacy, individualism—taking care to address how deeply value laden such ideals proved to be.

Schooling was not a neutral enterprise; on the contrary, reformers considered it a kind of peaceful war of assimilation with high stakes and dangerous consequences. This is clearly revealed in the chapter on school rituals. Although literacy and academic training were crucial to the success of students, educators knew that other experiences could contribute to the schools' legitimizing and transformative agenda. These included such obvious things as religion, gender relations, and holidays, each of which conveyed cultural and psychological meanings. Thanksgiving and Washington's Birthday, for example, were emotion-laden experiences that exposed students to deeply felt and culturally emotive belief systems.

But there was more to this than prayer, Arbor Day, and recognizing one's proper place. Sports also played a central role, and Adams's discussion of athletics at schools like Carlisle is fascinating. In addition to the usual emphasis on health, cooperation, hard work, and discipline, sports introduced Indian youth to intangible ideals. Football, Adams asserts, was charged with cultural and political meanings that went far beyond touchdowns. "Indian-white football was more than just a game," Adams concludes. "Football was about boundaries. It was about another time and space. It was about the frontier and about Crazy Horse and Custer. It was about history and myth" (p. 190).

The book concludes with assessments of student response and of the boarding school legacy. Not surprisingly, Adams argues

that students and parents alike proved to be diverse, even profoundly ambivalent in their responses. On the one hand, he cites numerous examples of resistance movements that have come to be the stock-in-trade of school critics and bashers; on the other hand, he also addresses the accommodation that typified the experience of many—if not most—students. Noting that levels of response and ranges of options and experiences were remarkably varied, Adams writes that students often acted in ways that confounded their masters. Just as Tsianina Lomawaima observes in her work on Chilocco, Adams finds that “policymakers and school authorities never anticipated that Indian students would be active participants in the acculturation drama” (p. 266).

In the end Adams finds that boarding schools created complex, contradictory results for Indians and whites alike. As “yet another deplorable episode in the long and tragic history of Indian-white relations” (p. 336), schools clearly were often insidious institutions of coercive assimilation. Yet there was more to it. Like Frederick Hoxie, Tsianina Lomawaima, and Michael Coleman, Adams insists that students often survived the rigors and terrors of a war waged against children. Despite the concerted efforts of the schools, Indian children demonstrated a “conscious and strategic adaptation to the hard rock of historical circumstance, a pragmatic recognition that one’s Indianness would increasingly have to be defended and negotiated in the face of relentless hegemonic forces” (p. 336). This book is an important and eloquent discussion of that process.

Education for Extinction is everything that its title promises. Comprehensive, diligently researched (is there anything that Adams has not read?), and elegantly written, it is the definitive study of Indian education during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Clyde Ellis
Elon College

Grateful Prey: Rock Cree Human-Animal Relationships. By Robert Brightman. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993. \$40.00 cloth.

Robert Brightman’s *Grateful Prey* has a bold thesis: “I suggest that Cree hunting strategies are not now and have never been