

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Native America Collected: The Culture of an Art World. By Margaret Dubin.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0z91p43p>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 26(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bunn-Marcuse, Kathryn

Publication Date

2002-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

recognize that Americans in different parts of the country held different attitudes toward Indians and that elevating southwestern Native crafts did little except reinforce a growing perception that Indians in the Southwest were the only “true” Indians left. The public’s ability to see Native cultural diversity was also hampered by the fact that the IACB exhibition at the 1939 San Francisco Golden Gate International Exposition included no photographs of contemporary Native life but instead exhibited crafts and craft demonstrators in ways more typical of ethnographic rather than art exhibits.

Overall, Meyn draws upon examples that originate in the Southwest but, as part of the research for the dissertation this book is based on, she conducted oral history interviews with Native artists and others “to comprehend the Indian viewpoint” (p. xii). Summaries of interviews with these eleven individuals are presented as an appendix and include individuals associated in some way with the IACB as well as a larger set of Chitimacha basket-makers who were not. The substance of these interviews or what IACB might have meant to the Native people involved is not integrated with the author’s discourse on the IACB, nor could this small attempt have even begun to address Native peoples’ thoughts on the subject or the tremendous diversity of their individual and collective experiences.

Altogether, the author has made an effort to confine her subject to what she has called the grassroots history of the IACB but, as suggested above, this cannot begin to address the social and political complexities inherent in early twentieth-century politics and federal programs directed at Indian people. Similarly, our understanding of the IACB will not be complete until we begin to examine how Native people themselves saw and were affected by these policies from their implementation to the present.

Ann McMullen

National Museum of the American Indian, Smithsonian Institution

Native America Collected: The Culture of an Art World. By Margaret Dubin. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2001. 184 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

As Margaret Dubin points out, very few available treatises deal with both historic and contemporary Native American art collecting. *Native America Collected* is one. It provides a good overview of the relevant themes and issues. It covers museum and anthropological collections; private collections; tourism; and the legislating of the art market, as well as the written history of Native American art as related by critics and art historians. Obviously, Dubin casts a wide net for a relatively short volume and as such no one section provides an in-depth examination. The chapter titles suggest separate treatment of discrete categories, but certain issues reappear throughout the book, so that a new layer is added to the inquiry each time. As a result, the reader becomes aware that these issues are thoroughly enmeshed, and that the usual academic distinctions between them do not reflect the realities of the art world.

Identity politics is the underlying theme to this book and one of the most powerful lessons that Dubin conveys is that identity is a serious matter and cannot be shrugged on and off like a cloak when convenient (p. 78). This is true not only for the artists and their cultural identity but for Dubin in her self-described role as ethnographer. The epilogue is one of the most interesting sections of the book; in it Dubin explains how she set about undertaking the research for her dissertation, which is the source of this book. She recounts some difficult yet humorous moments when her identity as an anthropologist was most problematic, not with the Native people she wanted to interview but with the “non-Native Americans who had assumed the role of gatekeepers to the Native American world” (p. 150). Access was certainly one of the many difficulties of working in the “field,” a term that now denotes a fragmented and disperse set of locations rather than a single geographically bounded area.

Another challenge of the “new ethnography” is how to organize and present data from such a dizzying area of people, places, histories, and objects. Anthropologists working with “experimental” writing styles have presented a variety of models: James Clifford’s *Routes* (1997) or James Clifford and George Marcus’ *Writing Culture* (1986), for instance. While Dubin does not utilize a radical new style, neither does she fall into any formal academic genre. In fact, to this reader it seemed that her work as a journalist may have been the driving force behind her style, which combines anecdote, factual reporting, and interviews together with a thorough understanding of the current theories and analytical frameworks employed in art history, anthropology, sociology, and cultural studies. In a refreshing step away from the often jargon-laden writing style prevalent in some of these fields, Dubin refers to and engages other scholars’ arguments without being drawn into terminological showmanship.

I set out to review this work according to typical (and perhaps outdated) academic standards. In each chapter I looked for a thesis, a body of evidence proving that theory, followed by a conclusion to complete the package. However, in any given chapter Dubin’s stated object of investigation proved slippery as themes from other chapters reappeared and obscured the topic at hand. However, as this conversational ebb and flow of topics and ideas occurred throughout the book, I realized the strength in this presentation: it reflected the realities and connectedness of all the players in the art field by refusing to work within academically circumscribed roles. For instance, the initial chapters—the first on the history of collecting and the second on legislation of the art market purport to deal with different topics, but overlap to such a degree as to obliterate a formal distinction. Dubin’s history of collecting starts from the premise that the imagined or historic Indian is still the most prevalent image in the American mind and that art objects often perpetuate this image while replacing the real Indians (the artists). Her discussion encompasses early collections and salvage anthropology, tourism and tourist art, and the development of the art market. It also includes a foray into relevant legislation to elucidate changes in federal policy toward tribal objects and tribal sovereignty, including the Archaeological Resources Protection Act (1979) and the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, or

NAGPRA (1990). In addition to the positive aspects of NAGPRA—namely increased tribal control over sacred objects or objects of cultural patrimony—Dubin astutely observes some of NAGPRA's lesser known implications: "By restricting commerce, repatriation legislation forcibly decommunitizes tribal objects, reinforcing the perceptions of tribal peoples as premodern, and, thus, incapable of preserving or appreciating their own history" (p. 25).

The NAGPRA discussion leads nicely into the second chapter on legislation, which focuses primarily on the 1935 and 1990 Indian Arts and Crafts Act before it ventures off into "the larger context of the overlapping discourses of cultural primitivism, authenticity, and tradition" (p. 41). Again, both the positive and negative effects of the law are examined: the act allows tribes to control and regulate identity—a valuable commodity in the art market—and yet that control itself results in divisiveness within communities, pitting the enrolled against the unenrolled and leading some galleries and collectors to "support antiquated notions of racial purity" based on the act's preference for authenticity (p. 36). Dubin's research exposes the arts community's ambivalence to such federal regulation. She reveals the difficulty of the situation through a description of Gerald Vizenor's play, "Ishi and the Wood Ducks." Dubin skillfully employs this bit of political writing to illustrate the ironies of legislating identity. Other artists' attempts to support or defy the legislation are examined as well: Chippewa painter David Bradley's campaign to unmask "fake" Indians enraged some within the arts community, while Jimmie Durham's carefully composed self-descriptions defy the easy ethnic categories that predominate in minority art shows.

In comparison, other sections of the book seemed overly simple, though still interesting. Her chapter on artists—"Selling Paintings, Dispelling Stereotypes"—relied on long quotations and transcribed interviews with artists. This proved her hypothesis that despite monolithic stereotypes of Indian artists, contemporary artists actually employ a multitude of art forms as well as a variety of personal ideologies; however, it seemed less an integrated part of the overall text than an indulgent opportunity to share her encounters with these artists. And while Dubin begins this chapter with a promise to leave the text "unfettered by academic commentary," the absence of an organizing framework leaves one feeling that this collection of assorted quotes simply skims the surface of issues that deserve deeper consideration (p. 66).

While *Native America Collected* does not actually break new ground in the history of collecting, it is still a worthwhile read. It provides a complex yet accessible picture of the Native American art world. Its treatment of the shifting relationships of power and unresolved conflicts surrounding identity and status is particularly strong. Interviews with artists, examples of and references to individual artworks and engagements with various theories provide much intellectual fodder. I would recommend this book to either a newcomer wanting an overview of the field or to those who are already familiar with the long bibliography of the history of collecting.

Kathryn Bunn-Marcuse
University of Washington