

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Working the Navajo Way: Labor and Culture in the Twentieth Century.
By Colleen O'Neill.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0vr355rb>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Knack, Martha C.

Publication Date

2006-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Sun Dance, brought to Fort Hall in 1901, became a unifying cultural force precisely because it offered a redemptive, communally oriented ideology that replaced the failed, transformative Ghost Dance that had spread to Fort Hall in 1870 and persisted until it was renewed in 1890.

No doubt cultural continuity played an important role in defining the social and political profile of Fort Hall. However, as Katherine M. B. Osburn has shown in *Southern Ute Women* (1998), turning the spotlight as much on the non-Indian players as on segments of the Native population reveals much about the power that agents and directors of acculturative agendas actually did exercise. Heaton's careful reconstruction of Fort Hall's society and economy in the early reservation period adds to work that has preceded and followed it but also lends weight to the argument made by scholars such as Ann Stoler ("Making Empire Respectable: The Politics of Race and Sexual Morality in Twentieth-Century Colonial Cultures," in *American Ethnologist*, 1989) that attention to the premises on which colonial authority was constructed and to the consequences of its implementation are as important as focusing on the standard, colonized subjects of ethnographic and ethnohistorical investigation.

Richard O. Clemmer
University of Denver

Working the Navajo Way: Labor and Culture in the Twentieth Century. By Colleen O'Neill. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2005. 235 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

Colleen O'Neill has created a fascinating case study that also engages significant theoretical issues. She has managed to reverse the ordinary historical question of how twentieth-century economics and wage labor have impacted Native society, politics, and gender, to asking how Navajos effected change from *within* their cultural and social existence. This requires that the author control the historical literature and gain a far from superficial grasp of the ethnography. She conceives of her subject in an appropriately large scope, placing it within regional development, capitalist growth, and race and class structure, without losing contact with the essential human reality. She argues that Navajos have "selectively engag[ed] in the capitalist market as wage earners, producers, and consumers," while doing so only "on their own terms" (82, 105).

Although Navajos entered into wage employment as early as the 1870s, O'Neill focuses on the period from 1930–70. She discusses the little-known hand-dug coal production by Navajo men for the local market, which she balances with the more familiar women's weaving, in order to establish the gender-specific nature of wage work. The former was attached to a technology and marketing system external to Navajo culture, while the latter was channeled through on-reservation traders. The first was a commodity defined as valuable by the larger capitalist industrial system but produced seasonally in order to accommodate the demands on male labor for subsistence horticulture, pastoralism, and household maintenance. In contrast, the latter

produced an art form embedded in the values and symbols of Navajo culture but peripheral to the market economy. Its year-round production supplied an economic safety net for reservation families. Similarly, O'Neill shows that migrant agricultural harvesting, off-reservation work in defense industries during World War II, and railroad maintenance labor also subsidized the Navajo on-reservation society.

In all cases, she says, it was the Navajos' choice to engage in part-time or seasonal labor. Unlike other authors who have interpreted this pattern as an exploitation of cheap labor by non-Indian employers, O'Neill declares that Navajos purposefully avoided permanent obligations that would separate them from culturally required commitments to kin, community, and religion (85, 105, 107, 154). Similar to other authors, she observes that Navajos placed various household members in diverse modes of economic production and pooled the resultant income, but again she interprets this strategy as a voluntary choice, rather than as one driven by the need to balance risks of economic instability and marginalization (82, 134).

O'Neill places economic issues within a complex political context of struggling nascent tribal councils, industrial corporations, government policy makers, and administrators. She perceives some federal pressure toward Navajo wage labor in the forced sheep reduction program but balances this with a discussion of the Navajos' subversion of the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) urban relocation program. She describes a wealthy traditional elite serving as early labor bosses who provided workers to off-reservation employers, but then O'Neill traces their displacement by young educated culture brokers. She notes how the nascent tribal council struggled to separate itself from its federal resource management origins and distance itself from non-Indian labor unions and shows how it then essentially adopted those same unions' child labor and safety standards into tribal law. In a fascinating chapter she narrates the role Navajos played as strike breakers in the wartime Gallup uranium industry that alienated them from the labor union movement until Navajo-specific unions were formed in 1973. In short, O'Neill admirably avoids simplistic dichotomous, moralized stereotypes and steers toward a more sensible and realistic presentation of a complicated political economy.

This presentation is based on a wide array of primary and secondary sources. O'Neill has tapped the BIA files at the National Archives and utilized an imaginative assortment of relevant regional and corporate archives. This volume needs a bit more quantitative data extracted from this plethora of sources to support the numerous generalizations and individual anecdotes contained inside, however.

O'Neill describes her work as "a book about Navajo workers, how they adjusted their lives to the market economy, and how they shaped that economy in the process" (1). She does not actually provide evidence that Navajos held enough economic power to force accommodation by the national economic system. This makes her even more general declaration that "Native Americans are indeed relevant, *if not central*, to the history of economic development in the United States" an issue for further research (4, italics added).

On the whole, Colleen O'Neill has presented a well-informed and nuanced discussion of twentieth-century Navajo wage labor that places it squarely within a cultural framework, situates Navajos as decision makers, considers multiple layers of political authorities, and engages issues of gender, class, race, and power. The issues are significant, and the evidence substantial. This volume is an excellent addition to the scholarly research on Native American wage labor and Navajo twentieth-century history.

Martha C. Knack

University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Writing the Cross Culture: Native Fiction on the White Man's Religion. Edited by James Treat. Golden, CO: Fulcrum Publishing, 2006. 208 pages. \$15.95 paper.

If it was the editor's objective to allow his reader to seek a thematic position for his anthology of fiction dealing with the Native encounter with Christianity he succeeds admirably. If it was, likewise, a goal of restricting his own voice in this work, say, beyond a short story, he has succeeded as well. If one counts the absence of editorial comment and guidance as literary success then this book is a triumph. Except for the dust jacket we are left with few hints as to the editor's *raison* in choosing the stories he has gathered together.

The structure of this anthology is twenty-six stories that are arranged around the theme of the Native encounter with Western Christianity. These stories are diverse, and their variety is the book's strength. In reviewing the individual stories that James Treat has gathered together, we are presented with a series of roughly chronological briefs on the Native place (or lack thereof) in postreform Catholic and Protestant traditions. The usual suspects, in the modern Native literary canon, appear—Deloria, Momaday, Harjo, Alexie, Posey—together with less well-known or quoted works by both old and new Native writers. It is refreshing to hear the voices again of Oskison, Johnson, and Zitkala-Ša/Simmons in this modern assembly. Newer writings from the hands of Barnes, Brandt, Weahkee, and Yazzie along with Sandoval's "end of time vision" lift the reader's eyes from the page for the reflection their stories deserve.

The various authors frame their stories within the question of the Native place within a colonizing Christianity. Told through characters such as Fus Fixico, Kitug-Anunquot, Margaret Hill, the Priest of the Sun, Grandma Josephine, Bertha, Walter, James, and Saint Coincidence, the hope, strength, humor, loss, and acceptance/denial of the Native in a Christian America are shown in the breadth and depth that they have long deserved.

The restriction of "voice" is either a postmodern literary device or indulgence, depending on one's personal perspective. Treat is virtually silent as an editor. In his story, "Inscribing the Wound World: Human Fiction on the Spaceman's Religion," he provides a clever afterword for the anthology in the form of a fictional prospectus to a publisher. Unfortunately, Treat may be a better editor, silent or otherwise, than an included author. His role as the