

UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

The Myth of the Male Breadwinner: Women and Industrialization in the Caribbean by Helen I. Safa

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0pf7f30h>

Journal

NWIG: New West Indian Guide / Nieuwe West-Indische Gids, 70(3/4)

Author

Maurer, WM

Publication Date

1996-09-01

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

The conclusion by editor Watson is redundant. It is another plea for a technological restructuring of Caribbean economies to enable them to compete in a global economy. Again there is no explanation of how this is to be done or what economic sectors should be targeted – only a laundry list of false and real obstacles.

A changing world economy absorbing technological changes, most incremental, does require the Caribbean to respond. However, this book does not consider the response of tourism, the leading industry in the region, or the promising export of services. It is focused, to the extent that it is focused, on the assembly plant export of components. The need to build with limited resources an indigenous technological capability for exports scarcely rates a mention and there is no discussion of how it can be achieved.

These books are especially disappointing because they are by proven, competent academics deeply concerned with the future of the Caribbean. Perhaps the exigencies of commercial publishing have led them to write too fast in a rhetorical mode without doing the needed empirical homework.

The Myth of the Male Breadwinner: Women and Industrialization in the Caribbean. HELEN I. SAFA. Boulder CO: Westview, 1995. xvi + 208 pp. (Cloth US\$ 55.00, Paper US\$ 18.95)

BILL MAURER
Department of Anthropology
University of California
Irvine CA 92697, U.S.A.

What are the implications of women's entry into the industrial workforce for their empowerment at the level of the household, workplace, and political arena? Helen Safa's book compares the experiences of women in Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic, and Cuba to provide an insightful commentary on the gendered dimensions of the international division of labor. She documents changes in women's status as Puerto Rico and the Dominican Republic moved from import-substitution to export-led industrialization, and as Cuba adopted "material incentives" and market reforms. The book is based on survey data supplemented by interviews with women garment and textile workers. In all three countries, Safa finds that the primary locus of women's subordination has shifted from the "private

patriarchy” of husbands and fathers, to the “public patriarchy” of the workplace and political arena where the “myth of the male breadwinner” continues to dictate factory and state policy. The experience of wage work has given women new authority in their homes. While this new-found voice has not translated itself into successful political action, it has provided women with a sense of self-worth in increasingly trying economic times. As one woman remarked, “a person who works has rights” (pp. 84-85).

The book is divided into six chapters. The first outlines state policies and industrialization patterns. The second addresses changing forms of patriarchy in the Caribbean, from the *casa/calle* distinction that relegated women to the domestic sphere, to occupational segregation in the workplace and unresponsive unions and political parties. The third, fourth, and fifth chapters deal with Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic, and Cuba, respectively. The sixth summarizes the book’s findings and relates them to other research on women and industrialization.

Among the more important variables for understanding women’s empowerment and subordination within and across the three cases are international trade relationships, state policies, women’s marital status, women’s age cohort, and men’s economic marginalization. State policy in all three countries helped determine the levels and character of women’s labor force participation. The failure of Puerto Rico’s Operation Bootstrap after fuel price increases in the 1970s led the state to retool industry toward export and service provision. The end of U.S. sugar import quotas in the 1980s led to the Dominican currency devaluation, which in turn encouraged export manufacturing by reducing the cost of labor. In Cuba, state efforts to mitigate women’s “double day” and guarantee shared responsibility for housework failed along with the sugar crop in the 1970s. “Material incentives” replaced “moral” ones, and, together with market reforms and the collapse of the Soviet Union, further hindered women’s full participation in the public arena.

Where women’s earnings essentially replace those previously garnered by men, as in Puerto Rico and the Dominican Republic, conjugal instability often results and women find themselves bearing the burden of providing for their household. Where women and men together provide for the household, women find themselves in a better position in relation to men (p. 183). Yet across the board, women still subscribe to an ideology that places their contributions as mothers and housewives above their contributions as breadwinners and workers. In Puerto Rico, Safa finds younger women more concerned with their own personal advancement than worker solidarity while older women who tend to be heads of households

resist remarriage but are also cynical and isolated (pp. 81-82). In the Dominican Republic, women maintained that unions were men's business, and married women who contributed to the household economy and gained authority because of it still viewed men as the household heads (p. 114). Meanwhile, "the erosion of the man's role as economic provider has led some men to tighten their control over women" (p. 118) and some women to subscribe to a patriarchal view of women's place even as they themselves do not rest easily within it. In Cuba, the Revolution led to greater sexual freedom and a greater awareness of women's issues. But sexual freedom meant more children at an earlier age, while housing shortages produced three-generation households. Three-generation households tend to increase the authority of elders and, with it, a more traditional sexual division of household labor (pp. 135, 143). With more women in each household, men feel little pressure to share in domestic tasks, despite a Family Code requiring their contribution to household labor (p. 136). Although women in Cuba enjoy a greater public presence than women in Puerto Rico or the Dominican Republic through the Communist Party, unions, and mass organizations, they nevertheless tend to place their domestic responsibilities above their paid labor.

The argument that wage work increases women's liberation and sense of individual rights is a familiar one. It has been criticized by feminists who argued that women lost the power they had had in kin-based societies when they were drawn into an industrial work force which may have paid them wages, but at a level insufficient to maintain a household without a husband. Safa makes a significant contribution to this debate in three ways. First, by illuminating women's experience of industrialization in the periphery, she rectifies its European and American focus. Second, by emphasizing the international economic system in which women find jobs and make life decisions, she shows that the debate cannot simply be addressed from a local or a national perspective. Third, and most important, by focusing on changing models of industrialization, she highlights international patterns of inequality and the state policies and practices responsible for them. The theoretical debate between those who see wage work as emancipatory and those who see it as robbing women of their traditional authority is shifted to new terrain and considerably enriched. Safa, documenting the effects of the new global feminization of labor, shows that the impact of paid labor is contradictory for women, increasing their economic autonomy while leaving intact the myth of the male breadwinner and women's responsibilities in the home.