Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory

LBL Publications

Title

Experimental Evolution of Extreme Resistance to Ionizing Radiation in Escherichia coli after 50 Cycles of Selection

Permalink https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0mt359p5

Journal Journal of Bacteriology, 201(8)

ISSN

0021-9193

Authors

Bruckbauer, Steven T Trimarco, Joseph D Martin, Joel <u>et al.</u>

Publication Date

2019-04-15

DOI

10.1128/jb.00784-18

Peer reviewed

1	Experimental evolution of extreme resistance to
2	ionizing radiation in Escherichia coli after 50 cycles of
3	selection
4	Running title: Directed Evolution of Resistance to Ionizing Radiation
5	Steven T. Bruckbauer ¹ , Joseph D. Trimarco ^{1,2} , Joel Martin ³ , Brian Bushnell ³ , Katherine A.
6	Senn ⁴ , Wendy Schackwitz ³ , Anna Lipzen ³ , Matthew Blow ³ , Elizabeth A. Wood ¹ , Wesley S.
7	Culberson ^{5,6} , Christa Pennacchio ³ , and Michael M. Cox ^{1#}
8	
9	¹ Department of Biochemistry, University of Wisconsin – Madison. Madison, WI 53706-1544,
10	² Present address: Duke Microbiology and Molecular Genetics, Duke University School of
11	Medicine. Durham, NC 27710,
12	³ DOE Joint Genome Institute - 2800 Mitchell Drive Walnut Creek, CA 94598,
13	⁴ Department of Biomolecular Chemistry, University of Wisconsin – Madison. Madison, WI
14	53706-1544,
15	⁵ Department of Medical Physics, School of Medicine and Public Health, University of Wisconsin
16	– Madison. Madison, WI 53705-2275,
17	⁶ Department of Medical Physics, University of Wisconsin – Madison. Madison, WI 53705-2275.
18	
19	
20	
21	#Corresponding author: E-mail: cox@biochem.wisc.edu

22 Abstract

In previous work (1, 2), we demonstrated that *Escherichia coli* could acquire substantial levels of 23 24 resistance to ionizing radiation (IR) via directed evolution. Major phenotypic contributions involved adaptation of organic systems for DNA repair. We have now undertaken an extended 25 effort to generate *Escherichia coli* populations that are as resistant to IR as *Deinococcus* 26 radiodurans. After an initial 50 cycles of selection using high-energy electron beam IR, four 27 replicate populations exhibit major increases in IR resistance, but have not yet reached IR 28 29 resistance equivalent to D. radiodurans. Regular deep sequencing reveals complex evolutionary patterns with abundant clonal interference. Prominent IR resistance mechanisms involve novel 30 adaptations to DNA repair systems, and alterations in RNA polymerase. Adaptation is highly 31 32 specialized to resist IR exposure, as isolates from the evolved populations exhibit highly variable patterns of resistance to other forms of DNA damage. Sequenced isolates from the populations 33 34 possess between 184 and 280 mutations. IR resistance in one isolate, IR9-50-1, is derived largely 35 from four novel mutations affecting DNA and RNA metabolism: RecD A90E, RecN K429Q, and RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I. Additional mechanisms of IR resistance are evident. 36

37

38 **Importance**

Some bacterial species exhibit astonishing resistance to ionizing radiation, with *Deinococcus radiodurans* being the archetype. As natural IR sources rarely exceed mGy levels, the capacity of *Deinococcus* to survive 5,000 Gy has been attributed to desiccation resistance. To understand the molecular basis of true extreme IR resistance, we are using experimental evolution to generate strains of *Escherichia coli* with IR resistance levels comparable to *Deinococcus*. Experimental evolution has previously generated moderate radioresistance for multiple bacterial species. However, these efforts could not take advantage of modern genomic sequencing technologies. In this report, we examine four replicate bacterial populations after 50 selection cycles. Genomic sequencing allows us to follow the genesis of mutations in populations throughout selection. Novel mutations affecting genes encoding DNA repair proteins and RNA polymerase enhance radioresistance. However, more contributors are apparent.

50

51 Introduction

52 Ionizing radiation (IR) can damage any cellular component, either through direct ionization by high energy photons and electrons, or indirect ionization from reactive oxygen species (ROS) 53 produced by radiolysis of water molecules. Fortunately, levels of IR sufficient to cause 54 55 widespread oxidation of proteins or extensive DNA damage (including double strand breaks) are rarely encountered in the environment. Surprisingly, a number of microbial species and a few 56 57 multicellular organisms have evolved extreme resistance to IR (3, 4). The bacterium Deinococcus radiodurans is the first-discovered and remains the best-studied example of this 58 extremophile phenotype. D. radiodurans survives exposure to 5,000 Gray (Gy) of IR with no 59 lethality, 1000-times the lethal dose for a human. In the case of this bacterium, extreme IR 60 resistance appears to be a byproduct of natural selection for desiccation tolerance (5-7). D. 61 62 radiodurans is not alone. Organisms with high levels of IR resistance can be found readily, 63 particularly in arid environments (8, 9).

IR resistance in *D. radiodurans* has been attributed in large measure to an enhanced
capacity to ameliorate ROS produced by IR using a variety small molecules and metabolites (10-*D. radiodurans* possesses a fairly standard complement of DNA repair systems. However,
specialized adaptations of those systems and the evolution of a few novel DNA metabolic

functions may contribute substantially to the extraordinary capacity of *D. radiodurans* to repairan extensively damaged genome (13-15).

70 Substantial increases to bacterial IR resistance can be generated in the laboratory by directed evolution (16-19). The advent of advanced DNA sequencing technologies that reveal 71 genomic changes in populations has revolutionized studies of molecular evolution. Mutational 72 73 trajectories associated with adaptation have been defined in bacteria (20-26), viruses (27-31), yeast (32, 33), and mammalian tumors (34-45). These studies have greatly enhanced the 74 experimental foundation of many phenomena predicted by evolutionary biology, including 75 76 clonal interference (22, 24, 33), diminishing returns epistasis (20, 46), and genetic parallelism (21-24, 26, 29). 77

We have utilized directed evolution as a tool providing a facile path to a better 78 understanding of mechanisms underlying the extreme IR resistance phenotype in bacteria. We 79 previously exposed four replicate populations of Escherichia coli to 20 iterative rounds of 80 gamma-ray IR and observed significant increases in IR resistance (1). Focusing on isolates from 81 each population, we determined that IR resistance arose from enhanced DNA repair (reflected in 82 mutant alleles of the recombinase RecA, replicative helicase DnaB, putative helicase YfjK, and 83 84 replication restart machinery), and changes in the regulation of central metabolism and cellular responses to oxidative damage (through an allele of the anaerobic metabolism transcription 85 factor, FNR) (1, 2, 47). 86

The overall IR resistance of these populations, while increased substantially, did not reach a level comparable to *D. radiodurans*. Efforts to further enhance the IR resistance phenotype have been constrained both by source decay (altering irradiation dose rate parameters and increasing times required to impose a particular dose on a sample) and by new governmental

91 policies mandating a general decommissioning of radioactive sources used for research. To generate D. radiodurans-like levels of IR resistance in evolved E. coli, we have embarked on a 92 new and more ambitious effort with four new populations. This new effort employs a clinical 93 linear accelerator (Linac) of a type utilized for radiation treatment of cancer patients. Using this 94 device to produce a high energy electron beam, we can achieve a dose rate of 72 Gy/min, nearly 95 96 4-fold higher than that used in the previous directed evolution study (1, 2). Use of this instrument eliminates the problem of radioactive source decay and greatly reduces the amount of time 97 required for exposure to kGy levels of IR. The higher dose rate also allows us to explore 98 99 adaptation to a potentially much more challenging IR environment than that utilized in earlier trials. We can also begin to assess the effect of dose rate on an evolution trial. 100

In this report, we characterize the four new *E. coli* lineages (IR9, IR10, IR11, and IR12) 101 after the first 50 rounds of selection (IR9-50, IR10-50, IR11-50, and IR12-50). The dose required 102 to kill 99% of the cells in each population has increased from approximately 750 Gy to over 103 2000 Gy. These populations are highly resistant compared to the previously evolved isolates 104 CB2000 and CB3000 (1, 2), which appear to be poorly adapted to the higher dose rates applied 105 with the electron beam IR. Deep genomic sequencing of populations after every other selection 106 107 cycle allow us to explore the full breadth of mutations and provides a revealing window on the evolution of IR resistance. To unveil IR resistance mechanisms, we focus on the genetic 108 parallelism between the four lineages, as reflected in a representative isolate from population 109 110 IR9-50, IR9-50-1. The results both reinforce some earlier conclusions and offer new insights. The phenotype in IR9-50-1 is largely explained by four mutations, none of which appeared in 111 112 our previously evolved E. coli populations. Although adaptations in DNA repair machinery are 113 again prominent, but now feature novel mutations in recD and recN which enhance IR

resistance. Furthermore, alterations in RNA polymerase (primarily variants in genes *rpoB* and *rpoC*) also contribute substantially to an IR resistant phenotype. The other three evolved populations exhibit patterns that both reinforce those seen in IR9-50 but also suggest direct competition of two distinct pathways of evolved IR resistance (through either paired mutations of the *recA* and *recD* genes, or a grouping of *rpoB/C*, *recD*, and *recN*). Further adaptation to IR (beyond the mutations described herein) has occurred in each of the four populations, and remains to be explored.

121

122 **Results**

123 High-energy electron beam IR kills E. coli at a similar rate to high-energy photon IR

In this new set of evolution trials, we utilized a Linac to deliver doses with a high energy electron beam. Our previous evolution trials to generate IR resistant *E. coli* utilized a 60 Co source with a dose rate of approximately 19 Gy/min (1). Using the Linac in electron mode, we were able to deliver the same doses at 72 Gy/min. As there is no source decay with this device, the dose rate will remain constant over the years required for an extended evolution trial. The dose delivered by the Linac was verified using thermoluminescent dosimeters (TLDs). The delivered dose varied by less than 5% of the calculated dose (Table S1).

Although the Linac electron beam and photon sources are different, the dose delivery mechanisms are very similar. In order to rule out any differences between electron and photon modes, we sought to determine if high-energy electron beam ionizing radiation (IR) kills *E. coli* similarly to high-energy photon IR. We note that the ⁶⁰Co and ¹³⁷Cs sources used in our previous directed evolution studies (1, 2, 47) produced high-energy photons. The Linac used in this study has both an electron and photon mode. By changing the distance of the *E. coli* cultures to the source of the IR beam, the Gray per minute (Gy/min) dose rate can be made equivalent between these modes. At a dose rate of 17 Gy/min, high energy electrons and photons killed nearly an identical percentage of *E. coli* MG1655 culture at 1000 Gy, with the electron beam being slightly more potent (Fig. 1). Therefore, the two IR modes appear to have comparable effects at the level of bacterial survival.

142

143 Directed evolution of extreme IR resistance over 50 rounds of selection

Beginning with a single culture of the *E. coli* strain MG1655 split into four, we generated four IR resistant populations using a modified version of a previously established directed evolution protocol (1) as described in the Materials and Methods and depicted in Fig. 2A.

Using this protocol, we carried out 50 iterative cycles (with selection cycles occurring 147 approximately once per week). The resulting populations were designated IR9-50, IR10-50, 148 IR11-50, and IR12-50 (Fig. 2B). Over these rounds of evolution, the dose required to kill 99% of 149 each culture increased from approximately 750 to 2300 – 2500 Gy (Fig. 3A). At round 50, these 150 populations were highly radioresistant compared to the parent MG1655 strain (Fig. 3B). 151 Previously described IR resistant E. coli isolates (1, 2, 47), which were evolved to withstand 152 ⁶⁰Co IR at about 4-fold lower dose rates, were only moderately more resistant to the beam 153 generated by the Linac compared to the parent strain and were greatly surpassed by the 154 populations generated in this study (Fig. 3B). Populations IR9-50, IR10-50, IR11-50, and IR12-155 156 50 have not yet reached the level of IR resistance of the bacterium Deinococcus radiodurans but have made significant progress towards this goal. We note that D. radiodurans was significantly 157 more sensitive to the higher dose rate in the Linac electron source than it was to the lower dose 158 rates in the ⁶⁰Co photon source (Fig. 3B) (4, 11, 13). 159

161 Growth phenotypes of evolved population isolates

The IR resistance phenotype of these experimentally-evolved populations was not 162 accompanied by an apparent growth defect in LB rich medium. An isolate from each population 163 at round 50 of selection (IR9-50-1, IR10-50-1, IR11-50-1, and IR12-50-1) produced growth 164 165 curves comparable to the parent MG1655 strain in LB (Fig. 4A). However, growth defects of these isolates became apparent when inoculated in other growth media. In a defined rich medium 166 supplemented with glucose, EZ medium, isolate IR12-50-1 failed to grow and isolates IR9-50-1 167 168 and IR11-50-1 exhibited growth defects easily observed in a standard growth curve (Fig. 4B). The isolate IR10-50-1 grew similarly to MG1655 in EZ medium and was the only of the four 169 isolates to grow in M9 minimal medium supplemented with glucose (Fig. 4C). Although IR9-50-170 1, IR11-50-1, and IR12-50-1 have potentially inactivating mutations in key amino acid 171 biosynthetic pathways that could prevent growth in minimal medium (IR10-50-1 does not have a 172 mutation which would clearly affect amino acid biosynthesis), supplementing minimal medium 173 with these amino acids did not rescue the ability of these isolates to grow (Fig. S1). 174

Highly sensitive growth competition assays (48) in LB medium can reveal subtle growth phenotypes of these isolates that are not readily apparent when comparing standard growth curves (Fig. 5). When paired with the parent wild type *E. coli* strain in a mixed culture of LB, all four evolved isolates were rapidly outcompeted, even with significant dilutions to bias the starting culture ratios towards the evolved strains. These results indicated that 50 rounds of selection in this directed evolution protocol came with an underlying fitness cost, even when selection is not being applied.

183 Evolved isolates exhibit variable resistance to non-IR DNA damaging agents

Isolates from the four evolved populations after 50 cycles of selection revealed that 184 resistance to IR does not correlate in any predictable way with resistance to other DNA 185 damaging agents, even within a single population (Fig. 6 and 7). Multiple isolates from each 186 population exhibited highly variable levels of resistance to UV radiation (Fig. 6), mitomycin C 187 188 (which causes DNA intrastrand crosslinks), ciprofloxacin (which causes DNA double-strand breaks through inhibition of DNA gyrase), bleomycin (which causes DNA double-strand breaks 189 190 and apurinic/apyrimidinic sites through a ROS mediated mechanism (49, 50)), and hydroxyurea 191 (which has a complex mechanism of action that both reduces dNTP production and causes ROSmediated DNA damage) (51-54)(Fig. 7). While some isolates exhibited increased resistance to 192 these DNA-damaging agents, others showed no change or increased sensitivity. The results 193 indicate that the directed evolution trials are generating specialists that are uniquely adapted to 194 IR resistance. 195

196

197 Deep-sequencing reveals unique evolutionary histories of the evolved populations

We utilized deep-sequencing technology to monitor genomic changes as IR resistance increased 198 199 with continued selection cycles. At every other round of selection, genomic DNA was prepared from each population and submitted to the Joint Genome Institute (Walnut Creek, CA) for 200 sequencing to determine all mutations present in each population. Stitching together these 201 202 snapshots revealed the underlying complexity of these evolving populations (Fig. 8A-D). Depicted in Fig. 8 are the allele frequencies of all mutations detected above 2% frequency at 203 204 each even round of selection for each lineage. Each line represents a single mutation; groups of 205 mutations that rise and fall in frequency together are inferred to be linked within a subpopulation. The number of sub-populations and total number of mutations increased rapidly (Fig.
8E). The steady accumulation of mutations over time suggests that mutator strains have not yet
appeared in these populations. The complete dataset upon which Fig. 8 is based is provided in
Supplementary Data 1 through 4.

Despite starting from the same parent strain, the evolutionary path of each population was 210 211 unique. The only event in common to each population was the excision of the e14 prophage, as indicated by four mutations in the *icd* gene in which the prophage is inserted (as depicted by the 212 213 initial single black line appearing in each population in Fig. 8A-D). When e14 is excised, the *icd* 214 gene is restored to the wild-type sequence. Despite excision of e14 occurring quickly in each population, that excision became fixed in only three of them. In the IR10 lineage, the sub-215 population that lost the e14 prophage was driven extinct by another sub-population and e14 is 216 retained in population IR10-50. 217

Each lineage experienced significant clonal interference, as depicted by the numerous 218 competing sub-populations in Fig. 8A-D. Competition of sub-populations within lineages IR11 219 and IR12 significantly reduced the rate of fixation events in each lineage. In IR11 (Fig. 8C), no 220 mutations were able to fix from approximately round 16 to round 50 of selection due to severe 221 222 clonal interference. In IR12 (Fig. 8D), no subpopulation was able to sweep to fixation until 30 cycles of selection were completed. Although clonal interference is apparent in lineages IR9 and 223 224 IR10, its effects are far less severe than in IR11 and IR12. In IR9 (Fig. 8A), no subpopulation 225 was able to fix post-e14 phage excision until approximately round 20. After this event, another subpopulation swept to fixation unimpeded (defined as a continuous, linear rate of increasing 226 227 allele frequency). A final subpopulation was able to eventually reach 100% frequency, but was in 228 competition with a separate subpopulation for approximately 12 rounds of selection.

Surprisingly, lineage IR10 (Fig. 8B) has approximately 6 distinct subpopulations which swept to
fixation, and each was not noticeably affected by intra-population competition. The differing
trajectories of evolution in each population may reflect the relative fitness of the mechanisms of
IR resistance employed by each eventual successful subpopulation.

At round 50 of selection, there were distinct differences in the amounts and types of 233 234 mutations between populations. Populations IR9-50 and IR10-50 are the most homogenous, with approximately 16 and 17%, respectively, of the total high confidence (> 2% allele frequency) 235 mutations being fixed (detected at > 99% frequency). In contrast, only 4% and 11% of high 236 237 confidence mutations in IR11-50 and IR12-50 are fixed, respectively (Table 1). Although IR9-50 and IR10-50 shared a similar percentage of fixed mutations, IR9-50 and IR12-50 had the highest 238 total number of mutations. Each population had a ratio of non-synonymous to synonymous 239 mutations greater than two. 240

GC to AT and AT to GC transitions were detected in high numbers, agreeing with 241 mutational patterns detected in previously evolved IR-resistant E. coli populations (1, 2). Base 242 substitutions are approximately 50% transitions and 50% transversions, whereas E. coli exposed 243 to ⁶⁰Co gamma-ray irradiation exhibit transversions at about four times the frequency of 244 245 transitions (1, 55). In particular, GC to TA transitions appeared at very high levels in each population, indicative of significant template-strand 8-oxodG-mediated mutagenesis (56). These 246 results indicated that the selection utilized in the current study produces a substantially different 247 248 mutational, and perhaps DNA damage, spectrum relative to the populations evolved to resist ⁶⁰Co-produced IR. 249

250

251 Mutations which enhance IR resistance in isolate IR9-50-1

252 We have begun characterization of evolved IR resistance after 50 cycles of selection. To define mutations that made significant contributions to the phenotype, we counted on a 253 substantial degree of genetic parallelism (21, 22, 26) between the four populations. We focused 254 on mutations meeting the following criteria: i) the mutations were non-synonymous; ii) 255 mutations occurred in a gene that was mutated in at least two additional populations; iii) 256 257 mutations in the gene achieved at least 10% abundance at some point during selection in each 258 population in which they appeared; and iv) the mutation remained in the population at round 50 259 of selection. These criteria narrowed the search to mutations appearing in six genes, including 260 those involved in recombinational DNA repair (dinI, recD, and recN), transcription (rpoB), regulation of anaerobic metabolism (arcB), and copper ion transport (copA). Two additional gene 261 alterations were analyzed: Nth C203Y and RecA A290S. These did not meet the criteria we set 262 in the current study but were the only two variants, aside from the loss of the e14 prophage, 263 where the exact same mutation appeared in two populations. The RecA A290S variant, which is 264 265 fixed in population IR10-50 and also appears in the IR11 lineage, is the only variant detected in this current study that was also detected in an earlier study (1). The relevant variants are listed in 266 Table 2. 267

To determine the molecular basis of IR resistance in one of the populations, we more carefully characterized one isolate from population IR9-50: IR9-50-1. IR9-50-1 contained over 300 mutations (Table 3). A complete dataset for mutations found within the sequenced isolates is presented in Supplementary Data 1 through 5, with isolate data in the appropriate lineage data file.

273 IR9-50-1 is representative of several mutational patterns seen in most of the populations,
274 as it has mutations in *dinI*, *recD*, *recN*, *rpoB*, *rpoC*, and *copA* (which contain the majority of

275 mutations listed in Table 2). This isolate does not have mutations in arcB, nth, and recA. However, a mutation in arcB, leading to the variant gene product ArcB N405D, did appear 276 earlier in the IR9 lineage but was driven to extinction via clonal interference. As such, five 277 protein variants present in IR9-50-1 were investigated for contributions to IR resistance: RecD 278 A90E, RecN K429Q, DinI R28H, RpoB S72N, and CopA V270F. The ArcB N405D mutation 279 280 was also examined as it represented a mutational pattern in other populations. A mutation in rpoC (which codes for the K1172I variant) was also included in the strains with RpoB S72N, as 281 the genomic proximity of *rpoC* to *rpoB* did not allow for ready separation of these two mutations 282 283 with the methods used here.

To assess the potential contribution of mutations identified in this way to IR resistance, 284 we first isolated each mutation in an otherwise wild-type genetic background. We then took the 285 evolved isolate and converted the mutation being studied to wild-type in the otherwise mutant 286 background to determine if it caused phenotypic loss. We moved these mutations singly and in 287 combination into a derivative of the parent E. coli strain (MG1655) lacking the e14 prophage (as 288 this prophage appears to excise from the chromosome after IR exposure and each subsequent 289 mutation occurred in this genetic background (1, 2)). This strain, Founder Δe_{14} (1, 2), thus 290 291 provided the otherwise wild-type genetic background to determine the contribution of each mutation to IR resistance. We determined that the RecD A90E and RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I 292 variants each provided a significant increase in IR resistance (Fig. 9A) when isolated in this 293 294 otherwise wild type background. A combination of these two alleles did not significantly increase IR resistance of the parent strain beyond either individual mutation, indicating that they 295 296 do not contribute additively. The effects of these two alleles were confirmed by converting each 297 of them singly and in combinations to the wild-type allele in the IR9-50-1 genetic background (Fig. 9B). Interestingly, the RecN K429Q mutation did not significantly alter IR resistance of
Founder △e14. However, when this variant was converted to the wild-type RecN in the IR9-50-1
genetic background, IR resistance was dramatically lowered. When these four mutations were
eliminated from a derivative of IR9-50-1 that retained the other 308 mutations, IR resistance was
not reduced lower than the wild-type RecN single mutant, suggesting a key role for the RecN
K429Q variant.

The RecD A90E mutation appeared to be at least a partial loss of function, as deleting the *recD* gene from Founder Δ e14 increased IR resistance just as much as the RecD A90E variant (Fig. 9A). These data agree with the fact that a truncated, and likely inactive, RecD variant appeared earlier in the IR9 lineage and in the IR10 lineage (Table 2). The DinI, CopA, and ArcB variants did not contribute significantly to IR resistance when isolated in the wild type background; additionally, converting the *dinI* or *copA* genes to the wild-type sequence in IR9-50-1 did not increase IR sensitivity of this strain.

Following the allele frequency of mutations in genes that demonstrably contributed to IR 311 resistance (recA, recD, recN, and rpoB), a new pattern emerged (Fig. 10). In the lineages IR9, 312 IR11, and IR12 there was a conserved temporal order in the appearance of mutations. First, the 313 314 e14 prophage was lost, followed by an *rpoB* mutation and then a *recD* mutation along with a *recN* mutation. In the IR12 lineage, the primary *rpoB* mutation was a synonymous coding 315 mutation. However, this did not negate a possible effect of this mutation, potentially at the level 316 317 of codon usage (RpoB D1203, GAC (WT) to GAT (mutant): 0.37 to 0.63 frequency). The trend was clear in lineages IR9 and IR11, where all the mutations were non-synonymous. IR10 was the 318 319 only lineage that did not conform to this trend. Although the e14 prophage did excise in lineage 320 IR10, the sub-population that lost the prophage was outcompeted by another that maintained the 321 prophage and contained a variant of both RecD (N124D) and RecA (A290S). This RecA variant, A290S, was previously observed in E. coli populations evolved to resist IR (1, 2) and also 322 significantly contributes to electron beam IR resistance (Fig. S2). This is the only mutation 323 observed in these four populations that appeared in the previously evolved E. coli populations, 324 aside from loss of the e14 prophage (1, 2). After the appearance of the RecA A290S and RecD 325 326 N124D variants, no RpoB variants appeared in the IR10 lineage until nearly round 40 of 327 selection, and those variants (F15L and K1200E) had not yet reached even 50% frequency in 328 IR10 at round 50. It appears that the evolutionary path observed in IR10 nearly occurred in 329 population IR12 as well, where the sub-population that lost the e14 prophage was almost outcompeted by a different lineage (the competing sub-population again featuring RecD 330 (T568A) and RecA variants (E19K)), before being carried to fixation with the apparent help of a 331 different RecD variant (S92I). A sub-population with a RecD (W534R) and RecA variant 332 (E286G) also reached high frequency in IR11 but was slowly outcompeted by a subpopulation 333 with a different RecD variant (A550E) after it gained a second RpoB variant (P535L). In all of 334 these populations, after either RpoB/RecD/RecN or RecA/RecD variants fixed, the opposing 335 grouping of mutations did not appear within the given population. These results imply that these 336 337 two evolutionary pathways confer competing yet overlapping mechanisms of IR resistance.

338

Prominent mutations can contribute to enhanced growth phenotypes

If variants of proteins such as ArcB, CopA, and DinI do not contribute to IR resistance, do they make some other contribution to fitness that explains their prominence? We have previously observed that high frequency mutations in experimentally evolved populations may contribute to enhanced growth rates, rather than IR resistance (47). Part of the selection protocol

involves an outgrowth step, after irradiation, in which mutants that grow slowly could be lost. 344 Consistently, the ArcB N405D mutation significantly enhanced the growth phenotype of 345 Founder Δe_{14} in a growth competition assay relative to the same strain with a wild-type ArcB 346 (Fig. 11). The DinI R28H and the CopA V270F mutations had no measurable effect on growth 347 (Fig. S3). Mutations that enhance the growth phenotype of these populations are likely 348 349 important, as evidenced by their inability to grow well in media aside from LB (Fig. 6) and their inability to compete with Founder $\Delta e14$ in mixed culture without IR selection (Fig. 5). In effect, 350 351 certain mutations may arise that compensate for growth defects conferred by mutations that 352 contribute to IR resistance or deleterious, hitchhiking mutations. Founder $\Delta e14$ with the RpoB S72N and RpoC K1172I variants is outcompeted quickly by Founder ∆e14 with wild-type RNA 353 354 polymerase (Fig. 11). These results indicate that in order to develop high levels of IR resistance, mutations which buffer against deleterious effects on viability must also rise to prominence in 355 these populations. Although not arising in the same genetic background, the growth phenotype of 356 the ArcB N405D variant indicates that these populations have developed variants which can 357 enhance growth to the degree which mutations such as the RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I variants 358 impede growth. 359

360

361 **Discussion**

It is clear that latent within the *E. coli* genome is a capacity for resistance to extreme doses of ionizing radiation. After 50 rounds of selection with high-energy electron beam IR, the dose required to kill 99% of each of these four replicate populations increased by over three-fold to approximately 2500 Gy (Fig. 3A). After a dose of 1500 Gy, this translates into an increase in survival of 4-5 orders of magnitude (Fig. 3B). The dose of electron beam IR that these strains 367 can withstand far exceeds that of previously evolved IR-resistant isolates (1, 2), at least when
368 the new and higher dose rate is applied. These populations vary in their growth phenotypes (Fig.
369 3B and 4) and resistance to other forms of DNA damage (Fig. 6 and 7), indicating that they are
370 specialized to withstand high doses of IR.

Most laboratory exercises in experimental evolution have been characterized by a rapid 371 372 decline in the rate of fitness increase, as fitness approaches some biologically determined optimum for a given agent of selection (22, 57, 58). One key difference between the current 373 374 experiment and many other long-term directed evolution experiments is that the selection agent 375 here is not a constant. The dose of IR inflicted on the populations increases as resistance levels increase. Increased selection pressure to meet a defined, desired phenotype throughout selection 376 is not a novel protocol (58), yet in our evolution experiment there is no evident deceleration in 377 the rate of fitness gains. Genetic patterns (parallelism) have allowed us to identify some key 378 contributors to the growing IR resistance phenotype. However, the continuing advance of IR 379 resistance and allele diversity in all populations also suggests that the pool of potential adaptive 380 mutations is much greater than that now present in any one population. As selection continues, 381 substantial additional gains in unique pathways may be expected. Ionizing radiation is not only a 382 383 selection agent, but also a potent mutagen. Although this study was not initiated with the goal of exploring mechanisms of molecular evolution, we anticipate that the datasets provided in 384 Supplemental Data 1 through 4 will be of use to investigators in that field. 385

386

387 Modified DNA repair proteins and RNA polymerase enhance IR resistance

388 Each population has traversed unique evolutionary paths to reach the same goal (Fig. 8A-389 D). Despite varied levels of clonal interference in each population, significant genetic parallelism

in these populations allow us to identify at least some of the contributors to extreme IR resistance. In one isolate from population IR9-50, IR9-50-1, mutations in *recD*, *recN*, and *rpoB/rpoC* increase IR resistance of the Founder Δ e14 parent-derivative. However, these variants – singly or together – do not account entirely for the IR resistance phenotype of IR9-50-1 at a dose of 1000 Gy (Fig. 9A and B). None of these genes have been previously implicated as mutational targets contributing to IR resistance (1, 2, 47).

The effects of mutations in these genes reveal complex interactions. When present in an 396 otherwise wild-type background, the mutations in *recD* and *rpoB* exhibit a clear contribution to 397 398 IR resistance, although results with the recN mutation were variable. The recD and rpoB effects were not additive, and combining them demonstrated diminishing returns epistasis. When the 399 400 rpoB mutation was reverted to wild-type in the IR9-50-1 mutant background, the IR resistance phenotype was reduced little or not at all. However, reverting the *recD* and *recN* mutation to 401 wild-type resulted in a considerable loss of IR resistance. It appears likely that a complete 402 genetic deciphering of the IR resistance of IR9-50-1 and other isolates will require a more 403 systematic consideration of relationships between mutations and genetic backgrounds. 404

Although additional contributions are clearly present, the alterations in RecD, RecN, and RpoB/RpoC (Fig. 9) provide the clearest evidence for phenotypic contributions in the current work. RecD is part of the RecBCD heterotrimer responsible for preparing ssDNA required for RecA loading, initiating homologous recombination. The RecD A90E variant is likely a loss of function mutation, as a RecD deletion in the Founder Δ e14 background increases IR resistance as much as the A90E variant in this background. RecD inactivation produces a hyperrecombination phenotype (59-62). Increased homologous recombination could be of significant use to repair highly fragmented DNA post-IR, with approximately 15 DSBs generated at 1000Gy (3).

RecN is a cohesin-like protein which is involved in RecA-mediated double-strand break repair (63-66). There is little known about the precise function of RecN, though it has been implicated in maintaining proximity of broken dsDNA ends to an active RecA filament. The function of the K429Q variant is unknown, but the K429 residue is positioned in a RecN domain highly conserved among bacteria. The K429Q variant is unlikely to be a loss of function, as *recN* deletion greatly enhances IR sensitivity (2, 67). Further work on these RecN variants may shed new light on the function of the RecN protein.

RpoB and RpoC are the beta and beta-prime subunits of RNA polymerase, respectively. 421 Stringent mutations of RNAP, which mimic the effects of ppGpp binding and therefore the 422 stringent response, are located primarily in RpoB and RpoC (68). Some of these stringent 423 mutants are capable of rescuing UV-sensitivity of *ruvABC* mutants of *E. coli*, potentially due to 424 decreased stability of contacts of RNAP with DNA (69, 70). Similar to these previous 425 observations, the mutations in RpoB that are prevalent in our evolved populations do not locate 426 to a single region of RpoB and therefore may affect DNA interaction throughout the DNA 427 428 channel formed by RpoB/RpoC. Previously described stringent mutations L571Q and H1244Q mutants (69, 70) affect residues near those affected in the current study. These mutations likely 429 decrease stability of RNAP on DNA and may allow for easier removal of RNAP that has stalled 430 431 at a DNA lesion. Removal of stalled RNAP may be crucial for efficient DNA repair due to RNAP occluding the lesion from repair machinery or providing a major obstacle to DNA 432 433 replication (71). Additionally, many stringent mutants of RNAP also confer resistance to the 434 antibiotic Rifampicin. Mutated variants of RNAP at P535 (72) and S574 (73-75) (which have 435 also been isolated in this study) have previously been isolated using selection for rifampicin resistance. Although these are the first RNA polymerase mutations detected in E. coli evolved 436 for IR resistance, similar mutants have been generated during experimental evolution of E. coli 437 for trimethoprim and doxycycline resistance (58), heat tolerance (76, 77), growth in nutrient-438 limited conditions (78, 79), and acid resistance (80, 81). Modifications in RNA polymerase may 439 440 confer enhanced fitness throughout serial passaging, a common feature of experimental evolution studies. This advantage, combined with a potential ability to enhance DNA repair, may explain 441 the rapid appearance of *rpoB* or *rpoC* alleles in each evolving lineage (except IR10). 442

443

444 Excision of the e14 prophage is induced by selection for IR resistance

The only event common to each of the four populations is the excision of the e14 445 prophage, which was evident by round two of selection. However, in lineage IR10 the 446 subpopulation that lost e14 was outcompeted and driven extinct by cycle ten. Despite no 447 448 apparent mutations within e14 that may prevent its excision, the e14 prophage remains within lineage IR10. It is unclear why e14 excision is the first clear event to happen in each population 449 (an event that also occurred early in evolution of our previously evolved gamma-ray IR-resistant 450 451 E. coli populations (1, 2). Excision of the e14 prophage is predicted to be under regulation of the SOS response, this event may simply be an artifact of the *E. coli* DNA damage response (82). 452 453 However, the e14 genome does encode two potentially lethal cell division inhibitor proteins: a 454 homologue of the lambda phage protein Kil and SfiC. Loss of these proteins may itself be selective pressure. Indeed, loss of the e14 has been previously noted during experimental 455 evolution (83) Interestingly, deletion of the e14 prophage has also been observed to cause 456

457 variable resistance to many antimicrobial agents, including increased resistance to hydrogen458 peroxide (84).

459

460 Direct competition between two pathways to IR resistance dictates adaptation

Population sequencing also reveals the underlying competition of lineages within each population. Clonal interference is a hallmark of these populations. While much of this study focuses on the current end-point (each population after 50 cycles of selection), observing evolution over the remaining 49 cycles allows us to understand the genetic context in which new mutations arise and how the successful lineages were able to outcompete other fit, but ultimately unsuccessful, lineages. This competition within populations was almost immediately apparent.

There is an apparent competition between lineages which contain alleles of *rpoB* and 467 those with recA alleles. In the current protocol, with its much higher IR dose rate, recA alleles 468 are less common than observed in our earlier study, and novel rpoB, recD, and recN alleles 469 470 predominate. In IR9, a single recA variant appeared (Y294C) but only reached approximately 12% frequency in the population before being driven extinct by round 20 of selection. This 471 population successfully lost the e14 prophage and then gained an *rpoB* allele followed by *recD* 472 473 and *recN* alleles. The appearance of *recD* and *recN* alleles in tandem occurred in three of the four populations, and each contributes similarly to IR-resistance in a wild-type background (Fig. S4). 474 In IR10, the RecA/RecD variant pair appears very early, and rapidly outcompetes the lineage that 475 476 lost the e14 prophage. After this event, the only mutation that became fixed within the population (of those common to all four populations which we are focusing on) is another RecD 477 478 variant. RpoB variants do not appear until at least round 40 of selection in IR10, and by round 479 50, these variants do not yet appear to be on a path to fixation. No high-frequency recN allele has

480 appeared in IR10. The IR11 and IR12 lineages followed a path similar to that taken by IR9. In the IR11 lineage, loss of the e14 prophage and subsequent gain of an *rpoB* allele became fixed. 481 In this genetic background, two separate sub-populations containing RecN/RecD and 482 RecA/RecD variants, respectively, later reached prominence. The RecN/RecD subpopulation 483 gained a variant of RpoB which assisted in driving this sub-population to fixation and the 484 485 RecA/RecD to extinction. Finally, IR12 almost began on a similar evolutionary trajectory as IR10. A sub-population that lost the e14 prophage and gained an rpoB allele (which leads to a 486 487 synonymous coding mutation) was nearly outcompeted by a RecA/RecD variant sub-population, 488 before a RecN/RecD variant-pair rescued the sub-population that had lost e14. By round 40 of selection, the winning subpopulation reached fixation. 489

Despite our focus on the genetic parallelism between these four populations, it is evident 490 that each population has begun to develop unique adaptations. Of the total number of fixation 491 events in each lineage (excluding excision of the e14 prophage, IR9: 2; IR10: 5; IR11: 2; IR12: 492 2) tracking mutations in rpoB/recA/recD/recN only fully accounts for such events in IR9 and 493 IR11. In all four lineages, major subpopulations that have arisen after fixation of 494 rpoB/recA/recD/recN combinations are completely unaccounted for by the criteria used to 495 496 identify the mutations tested in this study. While it is clear that e14 excision and competition between RecA/RecD and RpoB/RecD/RecN provides a path to enhanced IR resistance, this 497 appears to be only the first step on a complicated fitness landscape. New methods must be 498 499 applied to determine the unique paths taken by each of the four lineages.

500

501 Source of IR and dose rate alter the molecular basis for experimentally-evolved IR 502 resistance

Populations IR9-50, IR10-50, IR11-50, and IR12-50 provide us with a platform for understanding the molecular fundamentals of extreme IR resistance. These populations have been evolved using a source of IR with a much higher dose rate than that used previously to evolve IR resistance in *E. coli* (72 Gy/min versus 19 Gy/min) (1). Isolates from the prior evolved populations, CB2000 and CB3000 (1, 2) are only moderately more resistant to this form of IR compared to the parent strain. The higher dose rate in the current protocol may account for the relative sensitivity of the strains derived from the earlier evolution trial.

510 There are distinct differences in the mutations which appear in these populations and 511 those that were previously evolved (1, 2). Only a single mutation previously noted to enhance IR resistance, RecA A290S (1), appears in the four new populations. While enhanced DNA repair is 512 a hallmark of the previously evolved populations and the populations presented here, it appears 513 as though the enhancements are indeed different. In addition, the frequency of transversion 514 mutations detected in the new populations (~50% of all mutations) is far higher than that 515 observed in the earlier studies ($\sim 20\%$ of all mutations) (1, 55). This appears to be due to the 516 extreme amount of detected GC to TA transitions, specifically. This transition is a hallmark of A 517 mispairing with template-strand 8-oxodG (56), indicating that DNA damage may be more 518 519 extreme in cells exposed to electron beam IR. However, the high energy electrons and gamma rays produce similar levels of killing (Fig. 1). A more likely explanation lies with the differences 520 in the dose rate applied. In any case, these new E. coli lineages are replete with novel 521 522 mechanisms of experimentally evolved IR resistance.

523 We do not yet have experimentally evolved *E. coli* that can match the natural IR 524 resistance of the bacterium *D. radiodurans*. However, selection is continuing.

526 Materials and methods

527 Growth conditions and bacterial strains used in this study

Unless otherwise stated, *E. coli* cultures were grown in Luria-Bertani (LB) broth (85) at 37°C with aeration. *E. coli* were plated on 1.5% LB agar medium (85) and incubated at 37°C. Overnight cultures were grown in a volume of 3 mL for 16 to 18 hr. Exponential phase cultures were routinely diluted 1:100 in 10 mL of LB medium in a 50 mL Erlenmeyer flask and were grown at 37°C with shaking at 200 rpm and were harvested at an OD_{600} of 0.2, unless otherwise noted. After growth to an *OD600* of 0.2, cultures were placed on ice for 10 min to stop growth before being used for assays.

535 Cultures were plated on tetrazolium agar (TA) for growth competition assays when noted 536 (48, 86). The defined rich medium EZ was mixed per manufacturer's specifications and was 537 supplemented with 0.2% glucose or 0.2% glycerol as indicated (Teknova; Hollister, CA). M9 538 minimal medium (supplemented with 0.2% glucose) was used when indicated (85).

All strains used for *in vivo* assays in this study are mutants of *E. coli* K-12 derivative MG1655. Genetic manipulations to transfer mutations or delete genes were performed as previously described (87, 88). Strains used in this study are listed in Table 4.

542 Serial dilutions and CFU/mL determination

All serial dilutions were performed in 1X phosphate-buffered saline (PBS) (for 1 L: 8 g NaCl, 0.2 g KCl, 1.44 g Na₂HPO₄, KH₂PO₄ 0.24 g with 800 mL dH₂O, adjust pH with HCl to 7.4, then add remaining 200 mL dH₂O). Unless otherwise stated, serial dilutions were performed with serial 1:10 dilutions of 100 μ L of culture or previous dilution into 900 μ L 1X PBS. Before transfer to the next dilution tube, samples were vortexed for 2 seconds and mixed by pipetting to ensure mixing. One-hundred μ L of appropriate dilutions were aliquoted onto agar plates of the appropriate medium and were spread-plated utilizing an ethanol-sterilized, bent glass rod. For spot plating, 10 μ L of each dilution was aliquoted onto agar plates of the appropriate medium and spots were allowed to dry before plates were incubated as in *Growth conditions*.

552 CFU/mL was calculated using the highest CFU count for each strain assayed that 553 remained between 30 and 300 CFU (ex: 250 CFU on a 10^{-4} dilution plate would be used for 554 calculation over 40 CFU on a 10^{-5} dilution plate).

555

556 **TLD dose validation**

557 An independent dose verification was performed with thermoluminescent dosimeters (TLDs). TLDs are passive dosimeters that are small, accurate and well-suited for dose 558 verification in the routinely used 1.5 mL sample vials. For this project, three TLDs were sealed 559 560 in a small plastic bag, placed into 1.5 mL tubes containing 900 µL dH₂O, were placed horizontally and submerged under 1.3 cm dH₂O, and irradiated as described in 'Generalized 561 Linac irradiation protocol'. After the vials were irradiated, the TLDs were read out in the 562 University of Wisconsin Medical Radiation Research center (UWMRRC) TLD lab and 563 compared to the calculated dose. Non-irradiated control TLDs were read out simultaneously to 564 account for any background radiation. The TLDs were calibrated with a separate ⁶⁰Co beam in 565 the University of Wisconsin Accredited Dosimetry Calibration Laboratory (UWADCL), which 566 provides independent National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) traceability for the 567 568 measurements. This serves as an independent check of the ion-chamber based dose calculation method used to determine the beam-on time for this project. The estimated overall uncertainty on 569 the TLD measured values is $\pm -5\%$ with a coverage factor of k=1. 570

571

572 Generalized Linac irradiation protocol

Samples were maintained at 4 °C and transported to the University of Wisconsin Medical 573 Radiation Research Center (UWMRRC) Varian 21EX clinical linear accelerator (Linac) facility 574 for irradiation. The total transport time was approximately 15 min to and from the Linac facility. 575 For each irradiation, the Linac was set to deliver a beam of electrons with 6 MeV of energy to 576 577 uniformly irradiate all samples (a total of 14) at once. To accomplish this, a special high-dose mode called HDTSe⁻ was utilized, which resulted in a dose rate to the samples of approximately 578 72 Gy/min. The sample tubes were placed horizontally and submerged at a depth of 1.3 cm 579 580 (measured to the center of the tube's volume) in an ice-water filled plastic tank and set to a source-to-surface distance (SSD) of 61.7 cm. A 30 x 30 cm² square field size was set at the Linac 581 console, which gave an effective field size at this SSD of 18.5 x 18.5 cm^2 . This is ample 582 coverage to provide a uniform dose to all of the sample vials. The monitor unit calculations 583 (determination of the amount of time to leave the Linac on) were based on the American 584 Association of Physicists in Medicine (AAPM) Task Group 51 protocol for reference dosimetry 585 (89). This is the standard method for determining dose per monitor unit in water for radiation 586 therapy calculations. Once the dose was determined in the AAPM Task Group 51 reference 587 588 protocol conditions (SSD = 100 cm and depth = 10 cm), an ion chamber and water-equivalent plastic slabs were used to translate this dose to the specific conditions used in this project 589

590

591 Linac photon mode

The Linac is designed to deliver dose with either electron or photon beams. In photon mode, the electron beam first strikes a flattening filter (not present in electron mode) to produce bremsstrahlung photons and also flatten the beam intensity profile. In order to rule out any effective differences between electron and photon modes during irradiations, the sample vials
were irradiated with the same dose rates for both modes by altering the source-to-surfacedistance (SSD) for each mode.

- 598
- 599

Ionizing radiation resistance assay using the Linac

600 Strains were grown in biological triplicate overnight and to an OD_{600} of approximately 0.2 in LB as routinely performed. A 1 mL sample for each dose tested (including 0 Gy) was 601 removed and aliquoted into a sterile 1.5 mL microfuge tube. Samples were pelleted by 602 603 centrifugation at 13 xg for 1 min, and the supernatant was poured off. Samples were resuspended in 1 mL ice-cold 1X phosphate-buffered saline (PBS), and pelleting was repeated. This process 604 605 was repeated three more times to wash cells. A 100µL aliquot of each culture was removed, 606 serial diluted 1:10 in 900µL of PBS to a final 10,000-fold dilution and 100µL was plated on LB agar to determine the colony forming units (CFU)/mL before irradiation. Samples were 607 maintained at 4 °C and irradiated with the appropriate doses as described. A 100µL aliquot of 608 each culture was removed and plated to determine CFU/mL and percent survival as described. 609

610

611 Directed evolution protocol using Linac

For each round of directed evolution, separate aliquots of 2 mL of LB medium was inoculated with frozen stock of each population from the previous round of selection. These were incubated overnight with aeration at 37 °C and were grown with usual practices in LB medium to an OD_{600} of 0.2 the next day. Each culture was incubated on ice for 10 minutes to stop growth. Three 1 mL samples were removed and aliquoted into sterile 1.5 mL microfuge tubes. Samples were washed three times with 1 mL ice-cold 1X phosphate-buffered saline (PBS) and resuspended in a final volume of 1 mL of 1X PBS. A 100μ L aliquot of each culture was removed, serial diluted 1:10 in 900 μ L of PBS to a final 10,000-fold dilution and 100 μ L was plated on LB agar to determine the colony forming units (CFU)/mL before irradiation. Samples were maintained at 4 °C and taken to a Varian 21EX clinical linear accelerator (Linac) for irradiation.

623 After irradiation, an aliquot of each culture was removed, serial diluted 1:10 in 900 μ L of PBS to a final 1,000-fold dilution, and 100 µL of each serial dilution was plated on LB agar for 624 625 each dose to determine the CFU/mL after irradiation. LB agar plates were incubated overnight at 626 37 °C. Remaining irradiated cultures pelleted by centrifugation at 13 xg and supernatant was discarded. These pellets were resuspended in 1 mL of fresh LB medium, and this was added to 1 627 mL LB medium in a 5 mL glass culture tube. These resuspensions were incubated overnight with 628 aeration at 37 °C. The following day, the percent survival for each dose was calculated using 629 CFU/mL calculations before and after irradiation at each dose. The overnight culture of each 630 population replicate showing closest to 1% survival was stored at -80 °C and used for the next 631 cycle of selection. One cycle of selection was performed weekly due to limited access to the 632 Linac. 633

The initiating round of selection was done as described above, except the original culture used was an overnight culture of MG1655 prepared from an isolated colony. This protocol was adapted from a previously used protocol (1).

637

638 UV Resistance Assay

639 Cells from a single colony of each strain were cultured overnight and then grown to an 640 OD_{600} of ~ 0.2 as in *Growth conditions*. Samples were diluted and spotted onto 25 mL 1.5% LB agar described in the *Serial dilutions*. Spots were dried before the plate lid was removed and
spots were exposed to the appropriate dose of UV irradiation using a Spectrolinker XL-1000 UV
Crosslinker (Spectronics Corporation, Westbury,NY). Plates were imaged after incubation for 24
hr.

645

646 **Resistance to DNA-damaging agents**

647 Cells were grown overnight and to an OD_{600} of approximately 0.2 in LB as routinely 648 performed. Samples were mixed by vortexing for 5 s and were serial diluted 1:10 in 900 µl 649 phosphate-buffered saline (PBS) to a final 100,0000-fold dilution. Ten µl was removed from 650 each dilution and spotted onto 30mL 1.5% LB agar medium supplemented with 10 or 7.5 ng/ml 651 ciprofloxacin hydrochloride as specified, 0.5 µM bleomycin, 4 µg/mL mitomycin C, or 5 mM 652 hydroxyurea. Spots were dried before being incubated overnight at 37 °C. Plates were imaged 653 after 48 hr for ciprofloxacin and bleomycin plates.

654

655 Growth Competition Assay

This assay was adapted from a previously published protocol (2, 48). To differentiate 656 657 strains within the competition, a fitness-neutral deletion of the *araBAD* operon was introduced into one of the two strains. This deletion results in red colonies on tetrazolium arabinose (TA) 658 agar plates (48). Briefly, overnight culture of each strain to be competed were mixed 1:1, or 1:9 659 660 (for growth competitions using isolates from the evolved populations after round 50 of selection or RpoB or ArcB mutations, in favor of the losing competitor) in a 1.5 mL tube. Samples were 661 662 mixed by vortexing for 5 s and were serial diluted 1:10 in 900 µl phosphate-buffered saline 663 (PBS) to a final dilution of 1:100,000. One hundred uL of the final dilution was spread plated onto TA agar plates to assay for CFU. Seventy μ l of the remaining cell mixture was used to inoculate 5 mL of fresh LB media for growth overnight. This overnight culture was used to inoculate fresh media the following day, and 100 μ l was serially diluted and plated as noted above. This procedure was repeated twice more over a period of two days. The number of white versus red CFU was noted after each day of the competition and the total percentage of the culture for each competitor was determined.

670

671 Deep Sequencing

672 Genomic DNA was prepped from overnight cultures prepared from frozen stocks of populations from every even round of selection using the Wizard Genomic DNA Purification Kit 673 (Promega, Madison, WI). DNA samples were submitted to the Department of Energy Joint 674 Genome Institute (Walnut Creek, CA) for sequencing and analysis. DNA was randomly sheared 675 into ~500bp fragments and the resulting fragments were used to create an Illumina library. This 676 library was sequenced on Illumina HiSeq generating 100bp paired end reads. Reads were aligned 677 to the reference genome using BWA (90), downsampled to an average depth of 250 fold 678 coverage with picard (http://broadinstitute.github.io/picard) and putative mutations and small 679 680 indels were called using callvariants.sh from BBMap (sourceforge.net/projects/bbmap).

Sequencing results are reported in their entirety in Supplemental Data 1 through 4. However, for analysis of numbers and types of mutations in each population (and consequently for generating Fig. 8, and Table 1 through 3), mutations in genes with high homology throughout the genome (as in *rrs*, *rrl*, *rrn*, *rhs*, and *ins* genes) were not considered due to increased likelihood of a false-positive mutation call. In addition, mutations with inconsistent frequency

calls (ex: jumping from 0, to 100, to 0% allele frequency) were also not used. All mutationsremoved from consideration are also listed in Supplemental Data 1 through 4.

688

689 **Growth Curves**

Strains were cultured described as in *Growth conditions* overnight and to an OD_{600} of 0.2 in LB medium, EZ medium supplemented with 0.2% glucose (Teknova; Hollister, CA) and M9 minimal medium (85) supplemented with 0.2% glucose. Cultures were then diluted 1:100 in the appropriate medium in a clear, flat bottom 96-well plate (Fisher product #: 07-200-656) and incubated overnight in a Biotek Synergy 2 plate reader (Biotek; Winooski, VT) at 37 °C with shaking, with OD_{600} readings taken by the plate reader every 10 minutes.

696

697 Acknowledgements

This work was supported by grant GM112757 from the National Institute of General Medical
Sciences (NIGMS), and by grants 2817 and 502930 from the Joint Genome Institute, United
States Department of Energy. Steven Bruckbauer was supported by a Morgridge Biotechnology
Scholarship from the Vice Chancellor's Office for Research and Graduate Education, University
of Wisconsin-Madison. Joseph Trimarco was supported by the Hilldale Undergraduate
Fellowship (UW – Madison).

704

References

Harris DR, Pollock SV, Wood EA, Goiffon RJ, Klingele AJ, Cabot EL, Schackwitz W,
 Martin J, Eggington J, Durfee TJ, Middle CM, Norton JE, Popelars M, Li H, Klugman
 SA, Hamilton LL, Bane LB, Pennacchio L, Albert TJ, Perna NT, Cox MM, Battista JR.

- 2009. Directed evolution of radiation resistance in *Escherichia coli*. J Bacteriol
 191:5240-5252.
- Prince 2. Byrne RT, Klingele AJ, Cabot EL, Schackwitz WS, Martin JA, Martin J, Wang Z, Wood
 EA, Pennacchio C, Pennacchio LA, Perna NT, Battista JR, Cox MM. 2014. Evolution of
 extreme resistance to ionizing radiation via genetic adaptation of DNA repair. eLife
 3:e01322.
- 3. Daly MJ. 2012. Death by protein damage in irradiated cells. DNA Repair 11:12-21.
- 716 4. Cox MM, Battista JR. 2005. *Deinococcus radiodurans* The consummate survivor. Nat
 717 Rev Microbiol 3:882-892.
- Tanaka M, Earl AM, Howell HA, Park MJ, Eisen JA, Peterson SN, Battista JR. 2004.
 Analysis of *Deinococcus radiodurans*'s transcriptional response to ionizing radiation and
 desiccation reveals novel proteins that contribute to extreme radioresistance. Genetics
 168:21-33.
- Fredrickson JK, Li SM, Gaidamakova EK, Matrosova VY, Zhai M, Sulloway HM,
 Scholten JC, Brown MG, Balkwill DL, Daly MJ. 2008. Protein oxidation: key to bacterial
 desiccation resistance? Isme J 2:393-403.
- 725 7. Battista JR, Earl AM, Park MJ. 1999. Why is *Deinococcus radiodurans* so resistant to
 726 ionizing radiation? Trends Microbiol 7:362-5.
- 8. Rainey FA, Ray K, Ferreira M, Gatz BZ, Nobre MF, Bagaley D, Rash BA, Park MJ, Earl
- AM, Shank NC, Small AM, Henk MC, Battista JR, Kampfer P, da Costa MS. 2005.
- 729 Extensive diversity of ionizing-radiation-resistant bacteria recovered from Sonoran desert
- soil and description of nine new species of the genus *Deinococcus* obtained from a single
- soil sample. Appl Environ Microbiology 71:5225-5235.

732	9.	Rainey FA, Nobre MF, Schumann P, Stackebrandt E, Dacosta MS. 1997. Phylogenetic
733		diversity of the Deinococci as determined by 16s ribosomal DNA sequence comparison.
734		Int J Syst Bacteriol 47:510-514.

- 10. Daly MJ, Gaidamakova EK, Matrosova VY, Kiang JG, Fukumoto R, Lee DY, Wehr NB,
- Viteri GA, Berlett BS, Levine RL. 2010. Small-molecule antioxidant proteome-shields in
 Deinococcus radiodurans. PLoS One 5:e12570.
- 11. Daly MJ, Gaidamakova EK, Matrosova VY, Vasilenko A, Zhai M, Venkateswaran A,
- 739 Hess M, Omelchenko MV, Kostandarithes HM, Makarova KS, Wackett LP, Fredrickson
- JK, Ghosal D. 2004. Accumulation of Mn(II) in, *Deinococcus radiodurans* facilitates
 gamma-radiation resistance. Science 306:1025-1028.
- 12. Slade D, Radman M. 2011. Oxidative Stress Resistance in *Deinococcus radiodurans*.
 Microbiol Mol Biol Rev 75:133-191.
- Selvam K, Duncan JR, Tanaka M, Battista JR. 2013. DdrA, DdrD, and PprA:
 components of UV and mitomycin C resistance in *Deinococcus radiodurans* R1. PLoS
 One 8:e69007.
- 14. Earl AM, Mohundro MM, Mian IS, Battista JR. 2002. The IrrE protein of *Deinococcus radiodurans* R1 is a novel regulator of *recA* expression. J Bacteriol 184:6216-24.
- Harris DR, Tanaka M, Saveliev SV, Jolivet E, Earl AM, Cox MM, Battista JR. 2004.
 Preserving genome integrity: The DdrA protein of *Deinococcus radiodurans* R1. PLoS
 Biol 2:e304.
- 752 16. Witkin EM. 1946. Inherited differences in sensitivity to radiation in *Escherichia coli*.
 753 Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 32:59-68.

- Parisi A, Antoine AD. 1974. Increased radiation resistance of vegetative *Bacillus pumilus*. Appl Microbiol 28:41-6.
- 18. Davies R, Sinskey AJ. 1973. Radiation-resistant mutants of *Salmonella typhimurium*LT2: development and characterization. J Bacteriol 113:133-44.
- Frdman IE, Thatcher FS, Macqueen KF. 1961. Studies on the irradiation of
 microorganisms in relation to food preservation. II. Irradiation resistant mutants. Can J
 Microbiol 7:207-15.
- Chou HH, Chiu HC, Delaney NF, Segre D, Marx CJ. 2011. Diminishing returns epistasis
 among beneficial mutations decelerates adaptation. Science 332:1190-1192.
- Cooper TF, Rozen DE, Lenski RE. 2003. Parallel changes in qene expression after
 20,000 generations of evolution in *Escherichia coli*. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 100:10721077.
- Good BH, McDonald MJ, Barrick JE, Lenski RE, Desai MM. 2017. The dynamics of
 molecular evolution over 60,000 generations. Nature 551:45-50.
- 23. Lieberman TD, Michel JB, Aingaran M, Potter-Bynoe G, Roux D, Davis MR, Skurnik D,
- 769 Leiby N, LiPuma JJ, Goldberg JB, McAdam AJ, Priebe GP, Kishony R. 2011. Parallel
- bacterial evolution within multiple patients identifies candidate pathogenicity genes. NatGenet 43:1275-1280.
- 772 24. Tenaillon O, Barrick JE, Ribeck N, Deatherage DE, Blanchard JL, Dasgupta A, Wu GC,
- 773 Wielgoss S, Cruveiller S, Medigue C, Schneider D, Lenski RE. 2016. Tempo and mode
- of genome evolution in a 50,000-generation experiment. Nature 536:165-170.

775	25.	Wannier TM, Kunjapur AM, Rice DP, McDonald MJ, Desai MM, Church GM. 2018.
776		Adaptive evolution of genomically recoded Escherichia coli. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA
777		115:3090-3095.

- Woods R, Schneider D, Winkworth CL, Riley MA, Lenski RE. 2006. Tests of parallel
 molecular evolution in a long-term experiment with *Escherichia coli*. Proc Natl Acad Sci
 USA 103:9107-9112.
- 27. Luksza M, Lassig M. 2014. A predictive fitness model for influenza. Nature 507:57-61.
- 782 28. Miller CR, Joyce P, Wichman HA. 2011. Mutational effects and population dynamics
 783 during viral adaptation challenge current models. Genetics 187:185-202.
- Miller CR, Nagel AC, Scott L, Settles M, Joyce P, Wichman HA. 2016. Love the one
 you're with: replicate viral adaptations converge on the same phenotypic change. PeerJ
 4:e2227.
- 30. Morris DH, Gostic KM, Pompei S, Bedford T, Luksza M, Neher RA, Grenfell BT, Lassig
- 788 M, McCauley JW. 2018. Predictive modeling of influenza shows the promise of applied
 789 evolutionary biology. Trends Microbiol 26:102-118.
- Zanini F, Brodin J, Thebo L, Lanz C, Bratt G, Albert J, Neher RA. 2015. Population
 genomics of intrapatient HIV-1 evolution. eLife 4:e11282.
- Kvitek DJ, Sherlock G. 2013. Whole genome, whole population sequencing reveals that
 loss of signaling networks is the major adaptive strategy in a constant environment. PLoS
 Genet 9:e1003972.
- 795 33. Lang GI, Rice DP, Hickman MJ, Sodergren E, Weinstock GM, Botstein D, Desai MM.
- 2013. Pervasive genetic hitchhiking and clonal interference in forty evolving yeastpopulations. Nature 500:571-574.

798	34.	Alexandrov LB, Nik-Zainal S, Wedge DC, Aparicio S, Behjati S, Biankin AV, Bignell
799		GR, Bolli N, Borg A, Borresen-Dale AL, Boyault S, Burkhardt B, Butler AP, Caldas C,
800		Davies HR, Desmedt C, Eils R, Eyfjord JE, Foekens JA, Greaves M, Hosoda F, Hutter B,
801		Ilicic T, Imbeaud S, Imielinsk M, Jager N, Jones DTW, Jones D, Knappskog S, Kool M,
802		Lakhani SR, Lopez-Otin C, Martin S, Munshi NC, Nakamura H, Northcott PA, Pajic M,
803		Papaemmanuil E, Paradiso A, Pearson JV, Puente XS, Raine K, Ramakrishna M,
804		Richardson AL, Richter J, Rosenstiel P, Schlesner M, Schumacher TN, Span PN, Teague
805		JW, Totoki, Y., Tutt, A. N. J., Valdes-Mas, R., van Buuren, M. M., van 't Veer, L.,
806		Vincent-Salomon, A., Waddell, N., Yates, L. R., Zucman-Rossi, J., Futreal, P. A.,
807		McDermott, U., Lichter, P., Meyerson, M., Grimmond, S. M., Siebert, R., Campo, E.,
808		Shibata, T., Pfister, S. M., Campbell, P. J., Stratton, M. R., Australian Pancreatic Canc,
809		Genome, Icgc Breast Canc Consortium, Icgc Mmml- Seq Consortium, Icgc PedBrain.
810		2013. Signatures of mutational processes in human cancer. Nature 500:415-421.
811	35.	Alexandrov LB, Jones PH, Wedge DC, Sale JE, Campbell PJ, Nik-Zainal S, Stratton MR.
812		2015. Clock-like mutational processes in human somatic cells. Nat Genet 47:1402-1407.
813	36.	Alexandrov LB, Ju YS, Haase K, Van Loo P, Martincorena I, Nik-Zainal S, Totoki Y,
814		Fujimoto A, Nakagawa H, Shibata T, Campbell PJ, Vineis P, Phillips DH, Stratton MR.
815		2016. Mutational signatures associated with tobacco smoking in human cancer. Science
816		354:618-622.
817	37.	Bolli N, Avet-Loiseau H, Wedge DC, Van Loo P, Alexandrov LB, Martincorena I,
818		Dawson KJ, Iorio F, Nik-Zainal S, Bignell GR, Hinton JW, Li YL, Tubio JMC, McLaren
819		S, Meara SO, Butler AP, Teague JW, Mudie L, Anderson E, Rashid N, Tai YT, Shammas
820		MA, Sperling AS, Fulciniti M, Richardson PG, Parmigiani G, Magrangeas F, Minvielle

822		2014. Heterogeneity of genomic evolution and mutational profiles in multiple myeloma.
823		Nat Commun 5:2997.
824	38.	Gundem G, Van Loo P, Kremeyer B, Alexandrov LB, Tubio JMC, Papaemmanuil E,
825		Brewer DS, Kallio HML, Hoegnas G, Annala M, Kivinummi K, Goody V, Latimer C,
826		O'Meara S, Dawson KJ, Isaacs W, Emmert-Buck MR, Nykter M, Foster C, Kote-Jarai Z,
827		Easton D, Whitaker HC, Neal DE, Cooper CS, Eeles RA, Visakorpi T, Campbell PJ,
828		McDermott U, Wedge DC, Bova GS, Grp IPU. 2015. The evolutionary history of lethal
829		metastatic prostate cancer. Nature 520:353-357.
830	39.	Hunter KW, Amin R, Deasy S, Ha NH, Wakefield L. 2018. Genetic insights into the
831		morass of metastatic heterogeneity. Nat Rev Cancer 18:211-223.
832	40.	Kandoth C, McLellan MD, Vandin F, Ye K, Niu BF, Lu C, Xie MC, Zhang QY,
833		McMichael JF, Wyczalkowski MA, Leiserson MDM, Miller CA, Welch JS, Walter MJ,
834		Wendl MC, Ley TJ, Wilson RK, Raphael BJ, Ding L. 2013. Mutational landscape and
835		significance across 12 major cancer types. Nature 502:333-339.
836	41.	Martincorena I, Campbell PJ. 2015. Somatic mutation in cancer and normal cells. Science
837		349:1483-1489.
838	42.	Morganella S, Alexandrov LB, Glodzik D, Zou XQ, Davies H, Staaf J, Sieuwerts AM,
839		Brinkman AB, Martin S, Ramakrishna M, Butler A, Kim HY, Borg A, Sotiriou C, Futreal
840		PA, Campbell PJ, Span PN, Van Laere S, Lakhani SR, Eyfjord JE, Thompson AM,
841		Stunnenberg HG, de Vijver MJV, Martens JWM, Borresen-Dale AL, Richardson AL,
842		Kong G, Thomas G, Sale J, Rada C, Stratton MR, Birney E, Nik-Zainal S. 2016. The
843		topography of mutational processes in breast cancer genomes. Nature Commun 7:11383.

S, Moreau P, Attal M, Facon T, Futreal PA, Anderson KC, Campbell PJ, Munshi NC.

821

844	43.	Nik-Zainal S, Van Loo P, Wedge DC, Alexandrov LB, Greenman CD, Lau KW, Raine
845		K, Jones D, Marshall J, Ramakrishna M, Shlien A, Cooke SL, Hinton J, Menzies A,
846		Stebbings LA, Leroy C, Jia MM, Rance R, Mudie LJ, Gamble SJ, Stephens PJ, McLaren
847		S, Tarpey PS, Papaemmanuil E, Davies HR, Varela I, McBride DJ, Bignell GR, Leung K,
848		Butler AP, Teague JW, Martin S, Jonsson G, Mariani O, Boyault S, Miron P, Fatima A,
849		Langerod A, Aparicio S, Tutt A, Sieuwerts AM, Borg A, Thomas G, Salomon AV,
850		Richardson AL, Borresen-Dale AL, Futreal PA, Stratton MR, Campbell PJ, Int Canc
851		Genome C. 2012. The life history of 21 breast cancers. Cell 149:994-1007.
852	44.	Vogelstein B, Papadopoulos N, Velculescu VE, Zhou SB, Diaz LA, Kinzler KW. 2013.
853		Cancer genome landscapes. Science 339:1546-1558.
854	45.	Wedge DC, Gundem G, Mitchell T, Woodcock DJ, Martincorena I, Ghori M, Zamora J,
855		Butler A, Whitaker H, Kote-Jarai Z, Alexandrov LB, Van Loo P, Massie CE, Dentro S,
856		Warren AY, Verrill C, Berney DM, Dennis N, Merson S, Hawkins S, Howat W, Lu YJ,
857		Lambert A, Kay J, Kremeyer B, Karaszi K, Luxton H, Camacho N, Marsden L, Edwards
858		S, Matthews L, Bo V, Leongamornlert D, McLaren S, Ng A, Yu YW, Zhang HW,
859		Dadaev T, Thomas S, Easton DF, Ahmed M, Bancroft E, Fisher C, Livni N, Nicol D,
860		Tavare S, Gill P, Greenman C, Khoo V, Van As N, Kumar, P., Ogden, C., Cahill, D.,
861		Thompson, A., Mayer, E., Rowe, E., Dudderidge, T., Gnanapragasam, V., Shah, N. C.,
862		Raine, K., Jones, D., Menzies, A., Stebbings, L., Teague, J., Hazell, S., Corbishley, C., de
863		Bono, J., Attard, G., Isaacs, W., Visakorpi, T., Fraser, M., Boutros, P. C., Bristow, R. G.,
864		Workman, P., Sander, C., Hamdy, F. C., Futreal, A., McDermott, U., Al-Lazikani, B.,
865		Lynch, A. G., Bova, G. S., Foster, C. S., Brewer, D. S., Neal, D. E., Cooper, C. S., Eeles,
866		R. A., Camcap Study Grp, Tcga Consortium. 2018. Sequencing of prostate cancers

- 867 identifies new cancer genes, routes of progression and drug targets. Nat Genet 50:682-868 692.
- 869 46. Rokyta DR, Joyce P, Caudle SB, Miller C, Beisel CJ, Wichman HA. 2011. Epistasis
 870 between beneficial mutations and the phenotype-to-fitness map for a ssDNA virus. PLoS
 871 Genet 7:e1002075.
- 872 47. Bruckbauer ST, Trimarco JD, Henry C, Wood EA, Battista JR, Cox MM. 2019. A variant
 873 of the *Escherichia coli* anaerobic transcription factor FNR exhibiting diminished
- promoter activation function enhances ionizing radiation resistance. PLoS One in press.
- 48. Lenski RE, Rose MR, Simpson SC, Tadler SC. 1991. Long-term experimental evolution
 in *Escherichia-coli*.1. Adaptation and divergence during 2,000 generations. American
 Naturalist 138:1315-1341.
- 878 49. Povirk LF. 1987. Mutational specificity of bleomycin. Proc Amer Assoc Cancer Res
 879 28:117-117.
- 880 50. Povirk LF. 1987. Bleomycin-induced base substitutions in the lambda-cI gene. Environ
 881 Mutagen 9:86-86.
- 882 51. Hendricks SP, Mathews CK. 1998. Differential effects of hydroxyurea upon
 883 deoxyribonucleoside triphosphate pools, analyzed with vaccinia virus ribonucleotide
 884 reductase. J Biol Chem 273:29519-29523.
- Sakano K, Oikawa S, Hasegawa K, Kawanishi S. 2001. Hydroxyurea induces sitespecific DNA damage via formation of hydrogen peroxide and nitric oxide. Jap J Cancer
 Res 92:1166-1174.
- 53. Singh A, Xu YJ. 2016. The cell killing mechanisms of hydroxyurea. Genes 7:99.

- Weinberger M, Trabold PA, Lu M, Sharma K, Huberman JA, Burhans WC. 1999.
 Induction by adozelesin and hydroxyurea of origin recognition complex-dependent DNA
 damage and DNA replication checkpoints in *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*. J Biol Chem
 274:35975-35984.
- Sie C-X, Xu A, Wu L-J, Yao J-M, Yang J-B, Yu Z-L. 2004. Comparison of base
 substitutions in response to nitrogen ion implantation and 60Co-gamma ray irradiation in *Escherichia coli*. Genet Mol Biol 27:284-290.
- Wang D, Kreutzer DA, Essigmann JM. 1998. Mutagenicity and repair of oxidative DNA
 damage: insights from studies using defined lesions. Mut Res-Fund Mol Mech Mutagen
 400:99-115.
- Elena SF, Lenski RE. 2003. Evolution experiments with microorganisms: The dynamics
 and genetic bases of adaptation. Nature Rev Genet 4:457-469.
- 58. Toprak E, Veres A, Michel JB, Chait R, Hartl DL, Kishony R. 2012. Evolutionary paths
 to antibiotic resistance under dynamically sustained drug selection. Nature Genet 44:101U140.
- 904 59. Amundsen SK, Taylor AF, Chaudhury AM, Smith GR. 1986. recD: the gene for an
 905 essential third subunit of exonuclease V. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 83:5558-62.
- 906 60. Biek DP, Cohen SN. 1986. Identification and characterization of *recD*, a gene affecting
 907 plasmid maintenance and recombination in *Escherichia coli*. J Bacteriol 167:594-603.
- 908 61. Chaudhury AM, Smith GR. 1984. A new class of *Escherichia coli recBC* mutants 909 implications for the role of RecBC enzyme in homologous recombination. Proc Natl
- 910 Acad Sci USA 81:7850-7854.

911	62.	Thaler DS, Sampson E, Siddiqi I, Rosenberg SM, Thomason LC, Stahl FW, Stahl MM.
912		1989. Recombination of bacteriophage lambda in recD mutants of Escherichia coli.
913		Genome 31:53-67.

- 914 63. Uranga LA, Reyes ED, Patidar PL, Redman LN, Lusetti SL. 2017. The cohesin-like
 915 RecN protein stimulates RecA-mediated recombinational repair of DNA double-strand
 916 breaks. Nature Commun 8:15282.
- 917 64. Wang G, Maier RJ. 2008. Critical role of RecN in recombinational DNA repair and
 918 survival of Helicobacter pylori. Infect Immun 76:153-160.
- 919 65. Picksley SM, Morton SJ, Lloyd RG. 1985. The *recN* locus of *Escherichia coli* K12:
 920 molecular analysis and identification of the gene product. Mol Gen Genet 201:301-7.
- 921 66. Meddows TR, Savory AP, Grove JI, Moore T, Lloyd RG. 2005. RecN protein and
 922 transcription factor DksA combine to promote faithful recombinational repair of DNA
 923 double-strand breaks. Mol Microbiol 57:97-110.
- Brena-Valle M, Serment-Guerrero J. 1998. SOS induction by gamma-radiation in *Escherichia coli* strains defective in repair and/or recombination mechanisms. Mutagen
 13:637-641.
- 927 68. Cashel M, Gentry DR, Hernandez VJ, Vinella D. 1996. The Stringent Response, p 1458928 1495. *In* Neidhardt FC, Curtiss RI (ed), *Escherichia coli* and *Salmonella*: Cell Mol Biol,
- vol 1. ASM Press, Washington, D. C.
- 930 69. Trautinger BW, Lloyd RG. 2002. Modulation of DNA repair by mutations flanking the
 931 DNA channel through RNA polymerase. EMBO J 21:6944-6953.
- 932 70. McGlynn P, Lloyd RG. 2000. Modulation of RNA polymerase by (p)ppGpp reveals a
- 933 RecG-dependent mechanism for replication fork progression. Cell 101:35-45.

934	71.	Epshtein V, Kamarthapu V, McGary K, Svetlov V, Ueberheide B, Proshkin S, Mironov
935		A, Nudler E. 2014. UvrD facilitates DNA repair by pulling RNA polymerase backwards.
936		Nature 505:372-377.

- 937 72. Landick R, Stewart J, Lee DN. 1990. Amino acid changes in conserved regions of the
 938 beta subunit of *Escherichia coli* RNA polymerase alter transcription pausing and
 939 termination. Genes Develop4:1623-1636.
- 940 73. Barrick JE, Kauth MR, Strelioff CC, Lenski RE. 2010. *Escherichia coli* rpoB Mutants
 941 Have Increased Evolvability in Proportion to Their Fitness Defects. Mol Biol Evol
 942 27:1338-1347.
- 943 74. Severinov K, Soushko M, Goldfarb A, Nikiforov V. 1993. Rifampicin region revisited 944 new rifampicin-resistant and streptolydigin-resistant mutants in the beta subunit of
 945 *Escherichia coli* RNA polymerase. J Biol Chem 268:14820-14825.
- 75. Zhou YN, Lubkowska L, Hui M, Court C, Chen S, Court DL, Strathern J, Jin DJ,
 Kashlev M. 2013. Isolation and characterization of RNA Polymerase *rpoB* mutations that
 alter transcription slippage during elongation in *Escherichia coli*. J Biol Chem 288:27002710.
- 950 76. Deatherage DE, Kepner JL, Bennett AF, Lenski RE, Barrick JE. 2017. Specificity of
 951 genome evolution in experimental populations of *Escherichia coli* evolved at different
 952 temperatures. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 114:E1904-E1912.
- 953 77. Tenaillon O, Rodriguez-Verdugo A, Gaut RL, McDonald P, Bennett AF, Long AD, Gaut
- BS. 2012. The molecular diversity of adaptive convergence. Science 335:457-461.
- 955 78. Avrani S, Bolotin E, Katz S, Hershberg R. 2017. Rapid genetic adaptation during the first
 956 four months of survival under resource exhaustion. Mol Biol Evol 34:1758-1769.

- 957 79. Conrad TM, Frazier M, Joyce AR, Cho BK, Knight EM, Lewis NE, Landick R, Palsson
 958 BO. 2010. RNA polymerase mutants found through adaptive evolution reprogram
 959 *Escherichia coli* for optimal growth in minimal media. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA
 960 107:20500-20505.
- 80. Harden MM, He A, Creamer K, Clark MW, Hamdallah I, Martinez KA, Kresslein RL,
 Bush SP, Slonczewski JL. 2015. Acid-adapted strains of *Escherichia coli* K-12 obtained
 by experimental evolution. Appl Environ Microbiol 81:1932-1941.
- 964 81. He A, Penix SR, Basting PJ, Griffith JM, Creamer KE, Camperchioli D, Clark MW,
 965 Gonzales AS, Erazo JSC, George NS, Bhagwat AA, Slonczewski JL. 2017. Acid
 966 evolution of *Escherichia coli* K-12 eliminates amino acid decarboxylases and reregulates
 967 catabolism. Appl Environ Microbiol 83:UNSP e00442-17.
- 968 82. Mehta P, Casjens S, Krishnaswamy S. 2004. Analysis of the lambdoid prophage element
 969 e14 in the *E. coli* K-12 genome. BMC Microbiol 4:4.
- 970 83. Charusanti P, Conrad TM, Knight EM, Venkataraman K, Fong NL, Xie B, Gao YA,
- Palsson BO. 2010. Genetic basis of growth adaptation of *Escherichia coli* after deletion
 of *pgi*, a major metabolic gene. PLoS Genet 6:e1001186.
- 973 84. Wang X, Kim Y, Ma Q, Hong SH, Pokusaeva K, Sturino JM, Wood TK. 2010. Cryptic
 974 prophages help bacteria cope with adverse environments. Nat Commun 1:147.
- 975 85. Miller JH. 1992. A Short Course in Bacterial Genetics: A Laboratory Manual and
 976 Handbook for *Escherichia coli* and Related Bacteria. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory,
 977 Cold Spring Harbor, NY.
- 86. Lenski RE. 1991. Quantifying fitness and gene stability in microorganisms. Biotech
 15:173-92.

980	87.	Warming S, Costantino N, Court DL, Jenkins NA, Copeland NG. 2005. Simple and
981		highly efficient BAC recombineering using galK selection. Nuc Acids Res 33:e36.
982	88.	Datsenko KA, Wanner BL. 2000. One-step inactivation of chromosomal genes in
983		Escherichia coli K-12 using PCR products. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 97:6640-6645.
984	89.	Almond PR, Biggs PJ, Coursey BM, Hanson WF, Huq MS, Nath R, Rogers DWO. 1999.
985		AAPM's TG-51 protocol for clinical reference dosimetry of high-energy photon and
986		electron beams. Med Phys 26:1847-1870.
987	90.	Li H, Durbin R. 2009. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler
988		transform. Bioinform 25:1754-1760.
989		

991 Figure Legends

992 Fig. 1. Cell killing with electron beam versus photon beam ionizing radiation. Early 993 exponential phase cultures of MG1655 were exposed to electron beam or photon beam IR as 994 described in the Materials and Methods. Percent survival was determined via CFU/mL counts 995 pre- and post-irradiation. Results are representative of a single experiment performed in 996 biological triplicate.

997

Fig. 2. Directed evolution scheme and lineage nomenclature. (A) Scheme. Briefly, overnight 998 cultures were grown from a freezer stock of the parent strain/the evolved population from the 999 previous round of selection. This overnight culture was used to inoculate fresh LB rich medium 1000 1001 and cultures were grown to early exponential phase. These cultures were then separated into multiple aliquots and washed 3X in 1X PBS to remove LB medium. One aliquot of each 1002 population was irradiated with the same dose that killed 99% of the population in the previous 1003 1004 round of selection, and the remaining aliquots were irradiated with higher doses. A portion of the irradiated aliquots were plated to determine percent survival, while the remaining culture was 1005 1006 resuspended in fresh LB medium. These were then grown overnight, and the culture that was 1007 nearest to 1% survival (as determined by CFU counts from pre- and post-irradiation cultures) was stored at -80° C. One round of selection was conducted weekly due to limited access to the 1008 Linac. (B) Nomenclature. We have generated four lineages of highly IR-resistant E. coli, 1009 designated IR9, IR10, IR11, and IR12. A designated round of selection indicates a population at 1010 that round (Ex: IR9-50 is lineage IR9 after 50 rounds of selection). Each population has been 1011 stored at -80 °C as a 'fossil record' of evolution. Clonal isolates generated by streak plating a 1012

population then streak plating ten separate isolated colonies are designated by a numeral value
added to the parent population nomenclature (Ex: The first isolate from IR9-50 is IR9-50-1).

1015

1016 Fig. 3. Documentation of increased IR resistance. (A) Increase in dose required to kill 99% of *cells.* Each data point indicates the dose of IR that each population was given prior to being 1017 outgrown overnight (Step 6 in Fig. 2) and stored at -80° C. (Step 7 in Fig. 2). The percent 1018 survival was estimated from a single replicate at each round of selection. (B) Survival curves of 1019 1020 evolved populations compared to previously evolved Escherichia coli isolates and Deinococcus 1021 radiodurans. Early exponential phase cultures of the indicated strains were exposed to electron beam IR as described in the Materials and Methods. CB2000 and CB3000 are isolates from E. 1022 *coli* populations evolved to withstand γ -ray IR (1, 2). Error bars represent the standard deviation 1023 1024 of CFU/mL calculations from a single experiment performed in biological triplicate.

1025

Fig. 4. Growth curves of evolved isolates in rich and minimal medium. (A) Growth curves of 1026 1027 isolates in LB rich medium. (B) Growth curves of isolates in EZ defined rich medium supplemented with 0.2% glucose. (C) Growth curves of isolates in M9 defined minimal medium 1028 1029 supplemented with 0.2% glucose. Cultures of indicated strains were grown in the appropriate 1030 medium overnight and then to early exponential phase as described in the Materials and Methods. All cultures were incubated at 37 °C during growth. Early exponential phase cultures 1031 1032 were diluted 1:100 in the appropriate medium, and then incubated overnight in a Biotek Synergy 2 plate reader, with OD_{600} measurements taken automatically every 5 minutes. Each growth 1033 1034 curve is a representative replicate from an experiment performed in biological triplicate.

Fig. 5. Growth competitions of evolved isolates. (A) Growth competition of IR9-50-1 against 1036 Founder $\Delta e14$. (B) Growth competition of IR10-50-1 against Founder $\Delta e14$. (C) Growth 1037 competition of IR11-50-1 against Founder $\Delta e14$. (**D**) Growth competition of IR12-50-1 against 1038 Founder $\Delta e14$. Growth competitions were performed as described in the Materials and Methods. 1039 Briefly, competitions were started with an excess of the evolved isolate so that competitions 1040 1041 could be carried out to 72 hr (at approximately a 9:1 ratio of evolved isolate to Founder Δe_{14}). Even with an excess of IR9-50-1, this isolate was outcompeted by 48 hr. Deleting the araBAD 1042 operon causes a red colony phenotype with no fitness cost that allows for differentiation of the 1043 1044 two strains in competition on TA medium. IR11-50-1 is red on TA medium without alteration of the *araBAD* operon, so this competition was performed against Founder $\Delta e 14 araBAD^+$. Error 1045 bars represent the standard deviation of CFU/mL calculations of an experiment performed in 1046 1047 biological triplicate. Results shown are representative of two independent experiments.

1048

Fig. 6. Evolved isolates exhibit variable survival of UV irradiation. Five isolates from each population were grown in LB medium overnight and then to early exponential phase as described in the Materials and Methods. Cultures were serial diluted in 1X PBS, and then 10 μ L of each dilution was spot plated onto LB agar. Once spots dried, plates were exposed to UV irradiation and were then incubated overnight before imaging. Results shown are representative of two independent experiments performed.

1055

Fig. 7. Evolved isolates exhibit variable survival of various DNA damaging agents. Five
isolates from each population were grown in LB medium overnight and then to early exponential
phase as described in the Materials and Methods. Cultures were serial diluted in 1X PBS, and

1059 then 10 μ L of each dilution was spot plated onto LB agar with the indicated DNA-damaging 1060 agent. Once spots dried the plates were then incubated overnight before imaging. Results shown 1061 are representative of two independent experiments performed.

1062

Fig. 8. Mutations in evolving populations. (A-D) Allele frequencies as a function of selection 1063 1064 round. Panels A-D reflect the indicated population, IR9, IR10, IR11, and IR12, respectively. Whole populations at each even round of selection were deep-sequenced by the Joint Genome 1065 1066 Institute (JGI) as described in the *Materials and Methods*. Every mutation that reached at least 1067 2% frequency at some point in a single population are depicted as single lines. The sole black 1068 line in each graph represents the loss of the e14 prophage. Mutations that reach a frequency of 1069 "1.00" are fixed, and subsequent mutations occur within that genetic background. The y-axis 1070 represents the allele frequency of each single mutation within the population (i.e. a mutation at 1071 0.5 is in 50% of the isolates in the population). The x-axis represents the round of selection. Allele frequency data was generated from every even cycle of selection. Graphs were generated 1072 1073 using the R library "ggplot2". Line colors are utilized primarily to allow ready distinctions 1074 between subpopulations, but otherwise have no significance. Data used to generate these plots 1075 are contained within Supplemental Data 1 through 4. (E) Number of mutations over rounds of 1076 selection in evolving populations. Each data point represents the total number of detected 1077 mutations at or above 2% frequency in each sequenced whole population. The number of 1078 mutations generally increases, but experience dips as major sub-populations are driven to 1079 extinction. Data used to generate this plot are contained within Supplemental Data 1 through 4.

1080

Fig. 9. Mutations which contribute to IR resistance in the evolved isolate IR9-50-1. (A) IR 1081 resistance of Founder $\Delta e14$ derivatives containing mutations from lineage IR9. Mutations were 1082 moved singly or in combination from IR9-50-1 (in the case of ArcB N405D, from IR9-20-1; the 1083 *recD* deletion was made in the Founder Δe_14 parent strain) into the Founder Δe_14 strain 1084 background as described in the Materials and Methods. A '+' symbol indicates that the variant is 1085 present in that strain. (B) IR resistance of IR9-50-1 derivatives containing reversions of 1086 mutations to the wild-type sequence. Wild-type sequences of the gene encoding the indicated 1087 1088 protein variants was moved from Founder $\Delta e14$ into IR9-50-1 as described in the Materials and 1089 Methods (IR9-50-1 does not have a ArcB variant, therefore no reversion was tested in this strain). A '-' symbol indicates that the variant was reverted to the wild-type allele in that strain. 1090 1091 Each strain was assayed for IR resistance alongside biological triplicate of the parent strain (a 1092 Founder $\Delta e14$ or IR9-50-1 control) and the average percent survival of the experimental strains was compared to that of the parent strain. All strains were exposed to 1000 Gy of electron beam 1093 IR and percent survival was determined via calculating CFU/mL before and after irradiation. 1094 Error bars represent the standard deviation of CFU/mL calculations of at least two independent 1095 experiments performed in biological triplicate. Statistical significance of percent survival relative 1096 to the parent strain was determined using a two-tailed Student's T-test. The '*' and '***' 1097 represent p-values of < 0.05 and < 0.001, respectively. 1098

1099

Fig. 10. Frequencies of mutations implicated in IR resistance over rounds of selection.
Frequencies of mutations in genes implicated in evolved IR resistance (*rpoB*, *recA*, *recD*, *recN*)
and the loss of the e14 prophage are depicted. Both synonymous and non-synonymous mutations
are included. These data seemingly indicate two separate paths to acquiring IR resistance: loss of

the e14 prophage, gain of an *rpoB*, then *recD*, then *recN* mutation, in that order (IR9, IR11, IR12), or gain of a *recA* and *recD* mutation in concert (IR10). In lineages IR11 and IR12, these two pathways to IR resistance appear in direct competition, with the *rpoB*, *recD*, and *recN* path being the apparent 'winner'. Data used to generate these plots are contained within Supplemental Data 1 through 4.

1109

Fig. 11. Effects of prevalent mutations on growth. Two mutations from lineage IR9 have 1110 opposite effects on growth; ArcB N405D greatly enhances growth of Founder ∆e14 whereas the 1111 1112 RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I mutations greatly hinder growth. These results suggest that mutation not seen to affect IR resistance (ArcB N405D) may be selected for in these populations to 1113 counteract the deleterious growth effects of mutations which enhance IR resistance. Growth 1114 1115 competition assays were performed as described in the Materials and Methods. Initial ratios of each strain were purposefully mixed at 9 (loser):1 (winner) so that growth competition assays 1116 could be carried out for longer than 24 hr. Results shown are representative of two independent 1117 experiments performed. 1118

- 1119
- 1120
- 1121
- 1122
- 1123
- 1124

1125

1127 Tables

1128

Table 1. Number and types of mutations in evolved populations after 50 cycles of selection. Mutations in coding regions that likely cause loss of function of the protein product (single and double base insertions/deletions, gain or loss of stop codons, and loss of start codons) appeared in each population. However, IR9-50 had the most predicted loss of function mutations (72) compared to the other three populations (IR10-50: 48, IR11-50: 40, IR12-50: 49). Of these mutations in all populations, -1 frameshift mutations were the most common, followed by introduced stop codons.

1136

1137 Table 2. Mutations that are likely candidates for enhancing IR resistance. Proteins listed are encoded by genes that have i) mutations that were non-synonymous; ii) mutations that occurred 1138 1139 in a gene that was mutated in at least two additional populations; iii) mutations that achieved at 1140 least 10% abundance at some point during selection in each population in which they appeared; and iv) the mutation remained in the population at round 50 of selection. The mutations in RecA 1141 and Nth were included as these are the only proteins with the same variant present in two 1142 1143 populations. The bolded variants are fixed in the indicated population, the variants listed in black are present above 2% frequency at round 50 of selection, and variants listed in gray were present 1144 1145 in the indicated lineage but have been driven extinct by round 50 of selection.

1146

1147 Table 3. Number of mutations in isolates from evolved populations after 50 cycles of 1148 selection. Nomenclature of the isolates indicates the lineage (ex: IR9) and round of selection 1149 (ex:50) from which the isolate was derived. The remaining numeral distinguishes the individual 1150 isolates.

1152	Table 4. List of strains used in this study. Strains generated in this study were constructed as
1153	described in the Materials and Methods. A 'wt' designation indicates that the protein is variant at
1154	the indicated allele in the evolved isolate but has been swapped to the wild-type (MG1655)
1155	allele. The '*' symbol indicates that this nucleotide position is in reference to the NCBI
1156	GenBank U00096.3 reference genome.
1157	
1158	

1160	Table 1

	Parent bp	Mutant bp	IR9-50	IR10-50	IR11-50	IR12-50
	AT	GC	93	106	94	110
Transitions	GC	AT	180	158	130	223
su	AT	CG	26	17	11	25
ersio	GC	ТА	154	116	84	143
USV6	AT	TA	81	58	59	85
Tra	GC	CG	41	25	31	51
	Trans	sitions	273	264	224	333
	Transv	rersions	302	216	185	304
	Тс	otal	575	480	409	637
	Synon	ymous	127	124	98	171
	Non-syn	onymous	340	275	237	363
	dN/dS		2.68	2.22	2.42	2.12
	Stop (gained	29	15	12	16
	Stop	o lost	1	2	0	1
bu	Start lost		0	0	1	2
odi		+1	1	2	2	3
Ō	Insertions	+2	0	0	0	0
		+3	0	0	1	0
		+12	0	0	1	0
	Deletions	-1	40	26	21	26
		-2	0	1	1	2
		-3	1	0	0	0
	SN	IPs	81	70	65	92
b		+1	0	0	0	0
dir	Insertions	+2	0	0	0	1
00-6		+3	0	0	0	0
Vor		-1	3	6	4	6
~	Deletions	-2	0	0	0	1
		-3	0	0	0	0
es	Fixed (>99%)		107	84	20	76
lele enc	>50%		242	109	130	150
equ	>10 %		309	199	205	320
fr	÷ >2%		620	515	439	676

Pathway	Protein	IR9	IR10	IR11	IR12			
Anaerobic respiration	ArcB	N405D	D166Y S280R L90 fs Y71C	R100H S74W	S24P K547 fs			
Copper metabolism	СорА	V270F		T525A	A812V			
DNA metabolism	Dinl	R28H P14A	166N	S26Y				
	Nth		C203Y E160K		C203Y K85N			
	RecA	Y294C	A290S	A290S E286G	E19K			
	RecD	A90E L188* L223* P99*	N124D Q463* L301M	A550E A39G C71 fs G307W W534R	S92I A271E C103* T568A			
	RecN	K429Q E271G R118L	F144L	R102P S382R	A361T R285C R368H S310L			
RNA polymerase	RpoB	S72N S391P	F15L K1200E	P535L S574F	T600I			

Table3

1167

1107	Isolate	Number of Mutations								
1168	IR9-50-1	312								
	IR9-50-2	298								
	IR9-50-3	299								
	IR9-50-4	314								
	IR9-50-5	322								
	IR10-50-1	184								
	IR10-50-2	188								
	IR10-50-3	197								
	IR10-50-4	210								
	IR10-50-5	191								
	IR11-50-1	200								
	IR11-50-2	192								
	IR11-50-3	194								
	IR11-50-4	182								
	IR11-50-5	197								
	IR12-50-1	280								
	IR12-50-2	241								
	IR12-50-3	245								
	IR12-50-4	232								
	IR12-50-5	237								

1169 Table 4

1170

Strain	Relevant Genotype	Source				
MG1655	YbhJ L54I + MntP G25D + RIP321 A 4296380* ACG + GIpR C 3560455*	Blattner, 1997				
E A) A/2704	CG + GatC ACC 21/3360* A					
EAW//04	$MG1655 \Delta e14 + RDSR L92R + CytR Q110 stop + Tabl/ycjD Int (G$	Harris, 2009				
(Founder De14)	1351174° A) + yinv/ppiC int (1 3959934° C)	This study				
IR9-50	MG1655 exposed to 50 iterative rounds of IR; mixed population	This study				
IR10-50	MG1655 exposed to 50 iterative rounds of IR; mixed population					
IR11-50	MG1655 exposed to 50 iterative rounds of IR; mixed population	This study				
IR12-50	MG1655 exposed to 50 iterative rounds of IK; mixed population					
IR9-50-1	Isolate from IR9-50	This study				
IR9-50-2	Isolate from IR9-50	This study				
IR9-50-3	Isolate from IR9-50	I his study				
IR9-50-4	Isolate from IR9-50	This study				
IR9-50-5	Isolate from IR9-50	This study				
IR10-50-1	Isolate from IR10-50	This study				
IR10-50-2	Isolate from IR10-50	This study				
IR10-50-3	Isolate from IR10-50	This study				
IR10-50-4	Isolate from IR10-50	This study				
IR10-50-5	Isolate from IR10-50	This study				
IR11-50-1	Isolate from IR11-50	This study				
IR11-50-2	Isolate from IR11-50	This study				
IR11-50-3	Isolate from IR11-50	This study				
IR11-50-4	Isolate from IR11-50	This study				
IR11-50-5	Isolate from IR11-50	This study				
IR12-50-1	Isolate from IR12-50	This study				
IR12-50-2	Isolate from IR12-50	This study				
IR12-50-3	Isolate from IR12-50	This study				
IR12-50-4	Isolate from IR12-50	This study				
IR12-50-5	Isolate from IR12-50	This study				
CB2000	Isolate from IR-resistant evolved population IR-2-20	Harris, 2009				
CB3000	Isolate from IR-resistant evolved population IR-3-20	Harris, 2009				
EAW792	Founder Δe14 + ArcB N405D	This study				
EAW971	Founder Δe14 + CopA V270F	This study				
EAW766	Founder Δe14 + Dinl R28H	This study				
JDT56	Founder Δe14 + RecA A290S	This study				
EAW726	Founder Δe14 + RecD A90E	This study				
EAW725	Founder Δe14 + RecN K429Q	This study				
EAW756	Founder Δe14 + RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I	This study				
EAW748	Founder Δe14 + RecD A90E + RecN K428H	This study				
EAW904	Founder Δe14 + RecD A90E + RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I	This study				
EAW781	Founder Δe14 + RecD A90E + RecN K428H + RpoB S72N/RpoC K1172I	This study				
EAW972	IR9-50-1 + CopA V270 wt	This study				
EAW1047	IR9-50-1 + Dinl R28 wt	This study				
EAW973	IR9-50-1 + RecD A90 wt	This study				
EA1024	IR9-50-1 + RecN K429 wt	This study				
EAW981	IR9-50-1 + RpoB S72/RpoC K1172 wt	This study				
EAW1021	IR9-50-1 + RecD A90 wt + RpoB S72/RpoC K1172 wt	This study				
EAW1046	IR9-50-1 + RecD A90 wt + RpoB S72/RpoC K1172 wt + RecN K429 wt	This study				
STB75	Founder Δe14 ΔaraBAD	Bruckbauer, 2018				

* nucleotide position compared to NCBI GenBank U00096.3 reference sequence











	10 ⁰ 10 ⁻¹	10 ⁻²	10 ⁻³	10 ⁻⁴	10 ⁻⁵	10 ⁰	10 ⁻¹	10 ⁻²	² 10 ⁻	³ 10⁻	⁴ 10 ⁻⁵
Founder ∆e14				0	• ²	۲	۲	de.	Ŷ		
IR9-50-1	\bullet			(i)					0	63	5.5
IR9-50-2			۲						0	54	÷
IR9-50-3	\bullet \bullet			())	:			0	۲	13	
IR9-50-4	\bullet		0	9			۲	۲	0		:.
IR9-50-5				2					P	\$	•
Founder ∆e14		۲	۲	-			0				
IR10-50-1			۲	9	-		۲	2	3		
IR10-50-2					30		•	1	e.,	.,	•
IR10-50-3			\bigcirc	43			۲	1	:		·
IR10-50-4	\bullet		۲	¢9	÷.	\odot	۲	4		•	
				Be	×.,			22	12	~	
IR10-50-5			W	2.12	1.		-	-	212	•	
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14						0		•2*	•		
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1							· · · ·	•224	•	•	
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2					1) 1) 2)			•	•		
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3							*	•	•		
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4											
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4 IR11-50-5								•	•		
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4 IR11-50-5 Founder ∆e14								•	•		
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4 IR11-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR12-50-1									•	•	
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4 IR11-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR12-50-1 IR12-50-2									·	•	
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4 IR11-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR12-50-1 IR12-50-2 IR12-50-3									·		. 3
IR10-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR11-50-1 IR11-50-2 IR11-50-3 IR11-50-4 IR11-50-5 Founder ∆e14 IR12-50-1 IR12-50-2 IR12-50-3 IR12-50-3 IR12-50-4									·		

0 J/m²

120 J/m²

| 10 ⁻² 10 ⁻³ 10 ⁻⁴ | ⁴ 10 ⁻⁵ | 10 [°] 10 ⁻¹ | 10 ⁻² 10 | ⁻³ 10 ⁻⁴
 | 10 ⁻⁵ | 10 [°] | 10 ⁻¹ | 10 ⁻² 1
 | 0 ⁻³ 10 | ⁴ 10 ⁻⁵ | 10 [°]
 | 10 ⁻¹ | 10 ⁻²
 | 10-3 | 10 ⁻⁴
 | 10 ⁻⁵ | 10 [°]
 | 10 ⁻¹
 | 10 ⁻² | 10 ⁻³ | 10-4 | 10 |
|--|--|--|---
--|--
--	---	---

---|---|---|---|
| | • | 00 | 0 3 | 1
 | | \odot | |
 | | | ۲
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | | | |
| • • * | •• | • | ۲ ک | 1.00
 | 2. | ۲ | | <u>ان</u> 🕄
 | 3 1 | |
 | |
 | 9 | e
 | |
 |
 | | | 0 | • |
| ● ● ≮ | ••• | 0 | 00 | 3
 | • | ٢ | |) (
 | | |
 | |
 | | 3
 | |
 | ullet
 | | • | | •3 |
| ● ● ② | 38 | | |
 | | | |
 | | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 | \bullet
 | | | | • |
| • • * | • | ି 🚱 | <i>्</i> " |
 | | | |
 | | |
 | |
 | | 3
 | |
 |
 | | | 5 | • |
| | •• | 00 | 0 | 1
 | • | | 9 |
 | | |
 | |
 | | ÷
 | |
 |
 | | | | •• |
| | • | | |
 | | \bigcirc | \odot |
 | | |
 | | 0
 | | 12
 | |
 |
 | • | | | |
| | | | |
 | | $\overline{\bigcirc}$ | 0 |
 | 3 .: | . : |
 | 0 | 0
 | |
 | ** |
 |
 | | s . | • | |
| | • | | | 12
 | | \odot | 0 |
 | | |
 | 0 |
 | | 10
 | • |
 |
 | | 6 | | |
| | | | | 12
 | | 0 | 0 | 3
 | | | 0
 | 0 |
 | | 3
 | |
 |
 | | | | |
| | | | 00 |
 | | 0. | |
 | · · · | | \odot
 | ۲ | <u>ن</u>
 | 0 | 2
 | |
 |
 | | | 1 | |
| | | | 4 |
 | • | \odot | 0 |
 | 3 (3 | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | | | |
| | | a a | a .A |
 | | \bigcirc | | 1. A.
 | | | 0
 | | a
 | alles . | .15
 | |
 |
 | | | 1 | |
| | ** | | • | ÷.
 | - | | |
 | | |
 | 9 | 9
 | |
 | 14 |
 |
 | | | | |
| | | | |
 | | | |
 | | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | | 24. | • |
| | • | | |
 | | | |
 | | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | | 3 | |
| | | | |
 | | • | |
 | | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | | 86
11 | |
| | * | | |
 | | | |
 | | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | | | : |
| | | | |
 | | | |
 | | |
 | |
 | |
 | |
 |
 | | ₩ (| | |
| | * | | |
 | - | \bigcirc | \odot |
 | | - | 0
 | 0 | 0
 | |
 | |
 | e la la
 | | | | |
| • • * | •• | 0 | ۵ 🖓 | 36
 | | \odot | 0 | \$\$ ·.
 | 14 | •.* | 0
 | |
 | |
 | •• |
 |
 | - | e: | | |
| | - | | i 1 |
 | | \circ | 0 | 9 t
 | | |
 | 0 |
 | |
 | 1.0 | ۲
 | <u>e</u>
 | | | | |
| • • * | ••• | | (2) | •
 | | | \bigcirc | 9
 | | |
 | • |
 | 9 | 13
 | 8 | ۲
 | •
 | | | | |
| | ••• | 0 | @ 3 | 3
 | | \odot | \bigcirc | 9
 | | 24 |
 | |
 | | 3
 | | \bullet
 |
 | | | | |
| | | | (2) |
 | | O | 0 | D ?
 | 1 | • |
 | |
 | 9 | 1
 | | \bullet
 | 1.
 | | | | |
| B only | 7. | 5 ng/m | nL Cipi | oflox
 | acin | 0.5 | 5 µN | l Ble
 | omy | cin | 4 µ
 | g/ml | _ Mi
 | tom | iycir
 | пC | 5 m
 | nM ł
 | Hydi | roxy | ure | а |
| | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 0 0 0 < | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵
10 ² 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵
10 ² 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵
10 ² 10 ⁵ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ¹ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁴ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ² 10 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 10 ² 10 ⁴ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁰ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 | 10° 10° 10° 10° 10° 10° 10° 10° 10° 10° | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁹ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁹ 10 ¹ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁹ 10 ¹ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁹ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ⁴ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 0 < | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ¹ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ¹ 1 | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ³ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁶ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ | 10 ² 10 ³ 10 ⁴ 10 ⁵ 10 ⁴ | 10 10 <t< td=""><td>10¹ 10¹ 10¹</td><td>10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹</td><td>10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹</td><td>10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹10¹</td></t<> | 10 ¹ | 10 ¹ | 10 ¹ | 10 ¹ |







