

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Cultural Heritage Management: A Global Perspective. Edited by Phyllis Mauch Messenger and George S. Smith.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0jz3d91x>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(2)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Campbell, Gregory R.

**Publication Date**

2012-03-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

**Cultural Heritage Management: A Global Perspective.** Edited by Phyllis Mauch Messenger and George S. Smith. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2010. 512 pages. \$85.00 cloth.

Cultural heritage has become a widespread concern in many countries. The world's political economy has transformed throughout the past century, endangering many communities and threatening their tangible and intangible heritage resources. Under these rapidly changing conditions, local, national, and global communities are increasingly preserving aspects of heritage. Within this context, numerous issues arise, including not only the protection and management of heritage resources, interpretation, and ownership, but also the selection and regulation of heritage, providing fertile ground for contestation and debate.

Composed by an impressive cross-section of archaeologists, anthropologists, and other heritage professionals who are actively engaged in heritage issues, *Cultural Heritage Management: A Global Perspective* addresses a wide array of issues. The impetus for the volume arose from several working conferences on the world's heritage resources and the original presentations provide the basis for the book, with additional articles solicited to address heritage management in a global context. The result is an interdisciplinary collection of twenty-one articles, representing seventeen nations from every continent, including perspectives about heritage from countries rarely appearing in the US literature.

Heritage, at its roots, is about the preservation, recovery, commemoration, interpretation, and perpetuation of tangible (and sometimes intangible) resources in order to create and sustain a sense of identity and place. In many instances, heritage issues are often dictated and manipulated by a myriad of factors, as several authors point out. Despite diverse scholarly perspectives, approaches, and topics, the articles elucidate a number of overlapping themes that reflect the complexities of the management, protection, and valuation of cultural heritage.

The majority of authors discuss the history and the current status of cultural heritage research and preservation in a broad context. Cultural heritage is intimately embedded in prevailing political structures, nationalistic agendas, legal frameworks, and colonial agendas. Many authors focus on heritage issues at the national level, discussing how distinct governmental structures have shaped the development of heritage management practices. As Nelly M. Robles Garcia and Jack Corbett point out in "Heritage Resource Management in Mexico," the archaeology program was created by fervent nationalism that continues to hinder heritage development. Heritage practices and policies also are affected by political regime changes, such as in South Africa (chapter 12),

Russia (chapter 11), Poland (chapter 10), or the formation of the European Union (chapter 16), offering new opportunities and challenges.

Economics is another central factor in the development and vitality of heritage preservation and management. As noted by several case studies, infrastructural development and growth can threaten or destroy tangible and intangible aspects of heritage resources. Chen Shen and Hong Chen describe how the Three Gorges Dam and South-North Water projects in China have rapidly destroyed heritage sites; Katsuyuki Okamura and Akira Matsuda (chapter 7) detail how Japanese heritage was directly impacted by the severe downturn in the economy. Development projects, environmental projects, and economic recessions directly affect whether a resource is acknowledged as a cultural resource, but the economic climate also affects local, national, and international allocation of resources dedicated to the cultural heritage sector.

Conversely, economics can also support and sustain heritage projects. Several authors note that heritage preservation can generate income, and so tourism, museums, archaeological sites, natural landscapes, and unique living cultural traditions provide impetus for the promotion and preservation of tangible and intangible cultural resources.

Several articles address policy issues that guide the management of cultural heritage and the valuation of past and present heritage resources. Legal and financial frameworks in particular affect how local, national, and international cultural heritage preservation activities and management are conducted. William H. Jansen, for example, details how the World Bank and USAID contribute to cultural heritage preservation through poverty-reduction and economic-development initiatives. Arlene K. Fleming and Ian L. Campbell argue that the extant policies of the World Bank and the International Finance Corporation could offer an avenue to integrate cultural heritage fully into economic development and environmental initiatives (chapter 18). Patrick J. O'Keefe details the various international conventions and resolutions associated with cultural property, urging that their content be instituted as national and international public policies. These articles, in addition to those by Neil Brodie and Brijesh Thapa, offer strategies for effective heritage resource management by enlisting the fiscal and human resources of developers, national and local governments, communities, nongovernmental agencies, professional organizations, funding agencies, researchers, and others. The authors address the impact of policies and strategies for developing and sustaining heritage resources, while arguing that heritage preservation is critical for social and economic community health.

Indigenous peoples fully realize that there is an intimate relationship between cultural and political sovereignty; heritage preservation is also about power and control of a community's collective memory. The struggle

to acknowledge, if not incorporate, the practices and beliefs of indigenous societies in heritage management and policies is ever-present. Several authors address evolving roles in accountability to various publics. Maria Luz Endere, in “The Challenge of Protecting Archaeological Heritage in Argentina,” describes the impact of state formation on indigenous access to and control over sacred sites; David W. Morgan summarizes difficulties faced by policy makers and practitioners in honoring indigenous concepts of culture and heritage within the US national framework (chapter 15). His arguments complement several major points raised by Hester A. Davis, who notes that because under US law private ownership and individual rights reign supreme, this substantially affects cultural and heritage resource issues.

By contrast, authors Heather Burke and Claire Smith argue that in Australia, Aboriginal concerns have significantly contributed to a paradigm shift away from cultural resource management and toward cultural heritage management, a move which dismantles Western constructs of use and exploitation of property, and integrates concepts of conservation and acknowledgment rooted in indigenous means of knowing.

As with any wide-ranging, diverse collection, the articles vary in quality, but overall *Cultural Resources Management* testifies to the growing international importance of a broad concept of cultural heritage. Local, regional, and national identities are created, defined, and transformed by our relationships—past and present—to the past. Heritage, tangible or intangible, provides a sense of belonging, continuity, and collectivity. However, in baring the commonalities and disagreements among the various approaches to heritage practice and management, the contributions to this volume aptly illustrate that this is a complex arena. This book provides a framework for reflection and debate and offers valuable avenues for further discussion as the concept of cultural heritage rapidly evolves.

Gregory R. Campbell  
The University of Montana

**Defying the Odds: The Tule River Tribe’s Struggle for Sovereignty in Three Centuries.** By Gelya Frank and Carole Goldberg. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2010. 428 pages. \$65.00 cloth; \$40.00 paper.

This comprehensive, scholarly text commences with an introductory foray into theories of sovereignty espoused in political philosophy and international law, and compares them to the culture-based sovereignty claims of indigenous peoples. The authors show how the sovereignty claims of indigenous peoples