

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Museums and Māori: Heritage Professionals, Indigenous Collections, Current Practice. By Conal McCarthy.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0jn12770>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 37(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Belgrave, Michael

**Publication Date**

2013-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

her award-winning study, *White Mother to a Dark Race* (2009), both authors share a commitment to exploring the deadly consequences of maternalism in a colonial context.

I join Haskins in encouraging further work presenting perspectives of the other groups of actors in the complex drama she approached here from the outings matrons' point of view. Haskins goes as far as she can to extrapolate from her sources, and notes the importance of the absence of outings matrons from the remembrances of Tohono O'odham people who were their contemporaries. I sincerely hope that soon someone will find a way to tell the Native side of this story.

*Helen M. Bannan*

Emerita, University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh

**Museums and Māori: Heritage Professionals, Indigenous Collections, Current Practice.** By Conal McCarthy. Walnut Creek: Left Coast Press, Inc., 2011. 334 pages. \$99.95 cloth; \$36.95 paper.

*Museums and Māori* is a superb case study of the transformation of New Zealand public institutions as a result of Māori political challenges in the 1980s and 1990s. Conal McCarthy explores museums and museum professionals with a story that could be told in similar terms for a wide variety of other institutions and professional groups. New Zealand's health sector, schools, and welfare system experienced similar demands and accommodations. As McCarthy shows, it was not just that the institutions changed, but also that the professional practice of those involved was substantially redirected. In the 1980s New Zealand faced a time of dramatic social and economic reform, as several decades of a protected economy and a welfare state were dismantled and replaced with an open, market-based economy. Māori raised long-standing criticisms of the public sector, finding allies among those keen to reduce the size of the state and shift responsibility to individuals, families, and, in this case, tribes.

Māori demands combined decolonization with market responsiveness, and indigenous sovereignty became strongly linked to consumer sovereignty, an alliance that greatly strengthened Māori political aspirations for self-determination. Paralleling these growing market emphases was the rediscovery of the Treaty of Waitangi as a defining event in reforming relationships between Māori as an indigenous minority and the non-Māori settler majority. The Waitangi Tribunal began a process of revitalizing the 1840 treaty, which formed the basis of British sovereignty and the long-standing focus of Māori grievances.

The tribunal set about recognizing tribes and settling historic grievances, a process which continues today. Biculturalism emerged as the recognition that New Zealand was based on two communities through colonization, but still within a single sovereign state. McCarthy explores these issues for museums and museum professionals, but biculturalism also affected hospitals and nurses, child protection and social workers, local authorities and urban planners, and schools and teachers. The idea of indigenous sovereignty was tabled for a later time and an accommodation was achieved between Māori and state institutions and between Māori and professional practitioners. He explores, as no one else has done, the strengths and weaknesses of that accommodation.

He describes the increasing anger of Māori by the 1970s at their exclusion from museums, seeing their taonga (treasures) refashioned as artifacts, alienated from their creators and their descendants, and treated with cultural ignorance. Initially, Māori campaigned to have taonga returned. In a minority of cases (not considered by McCarthy), taonga were seen as so sacred that Māori wished simply to bury them, but for the most part they were to be cared for in tribally owned and managed museums. Over time, and as tribes worked through their treaty claims, they sought an accommodation with museums and with their professionals, realizing that the costs and professional skills required for autonomous institutions were well beyond the capacity of tribes at the time. Similar accommodations were made elsewhere, such as in the care of children, so that Māori social work expertise was recognized, social work practice revised, and Māori care providers developed to take a significant role, but the care of children remained a central government responsibility under state direction and funding.

Few Māori museums have emerged, although marae (tribal meeting places) are also depositories of taonga. As with all of these relationships the transformation has not been without tensions. McCarthy explores this process as it affects museums in great depth, demonstrating the extent to which the landmark Te Māori exhibition, from 1980 to 1986, had precedents in evolving practice that legitimized the change in direction in the treatment of taonga. He also shows that Māori participation in museum reform took place on a high level. Those people leading the demand for reforming museum practice were national leaders with significant mana who regarded the preservation of taonga to be as significant as the dramatic changes which the Māori world was experiencing in these decades. McCarthy explores the experience of large-scale museums such as the National Museum, *Te Papa*, and the Auckland War Memorial Museum, and that of smaller city museums, which developed strong relationships to tangata whenua (local tribes) in places like Gisborne and Hamilton. The author ignores the cases of private and commercial museums. He shows that individual curators could work effectively with Māori only to

have their work neglected through a change of local government or museum personnel. This is an insider's story well told, by a non-Māori with a huge commitment to the accommodations achieved in that 1980s and 1990s period. McCarthy has a huge affection not only for museums, but also for the way that they have been enriched by Māori inclusion.

These changes brought the marae into the museum, recognizing that museum professionals were kaitiaki (caretakers) for taonga on behalf of iwi (Māori tribes). Māori became partners in the collections, involved in governance and management and in the protocols of opening and closing exhibitions and in the planning of exhibitions. Te reo Māori (Māori language) was used in interpretation and signage. Some parts of collections have been returned, most notably *Mataatua*, Ngāti Awa's carved whareniui (meeting house) from its exile in the Otago Museum. Taonga have become, if not part of new Māori museums, part of new tribal cultural centers. While this has dramatically transformed the museums and the work of museum professionals, Māori remain subordinate, particularly at the level of Māori participation in staffing, where most Māori hold junior roles.

It is now twenty years since these professional accommodations took place. McCarthy attempts to look forward to see what the new direction might be, arguing that Māori concerns about the limitations of biculturalism will lead to the development of tribal museums funded by treaty settlement payouts. However, the amount of capital transferred to tribes as a result of settlements is limited and the demands upon it wide-ranging. The questions McCarthy raises about a post-bicultural age are significant and in the end he is uncertain as to where this might lead. This is not surprising. The emphasis on the Treaty of Waitangi, the shared focus of biculturalism, has shifted markedly. Mixed member proportional representation in Parliament has given the Māori a greater role in the executive, limiting some of the political usefulness of the Treaty of Waitangi. The term *bicultural* now seems remarkably dated. And yet, the accommodations which were made between non-Māori-dominated professions and Māori in the 1980s and 1990s remain. For these professions, biculturalism remains at the heart of their claims of legitimacy in dealing with Māori. Because of the link between consumer-focused reforms and biculturalism, these changes are now part of the professions' ethical relationships with their clients generally. Māori are also for the most part reluctant to step back from these agreements, while still wanting to expand Māori control of institutions.

Yet McCarthy's own approach also demonstrates one of the weaknesses of biculturalism. The Treaty of Waitangi was between Māori and the British Crown, and so biculturalism turned professions into proxies of the Crown, thus reinforcing the dichotomy of non-Māori/Māori while ignoring relationships between Māori. McCarthy's book deals with almost none of the tensions

between Māori as they affect museums. How do museums deal with the claims of those on whose land the museum is located, and the different claims of the owners of the taonga in that museum's collections who are from other lands? *Te Papa* gives its marae over to different iwi on a rotating basis. How does this fit with the claims of locals for recognition of their land? These are questions McCathy ignores. Biculturalism has disguised the rich contextual landscape of Māori customary relationships, something a post-bicultural approach must address. At the same time the treatment of other cultures remains problematic. New Zealand museums have extensive Pacific collections and McCathy's inclusion of Sean Mellon's "Afterword" does little more than acknowledge the problem. However, no other book comes close to as finely and extensively covering such an important transformation in New Zealand's recent graspings at postcolonialism.

*Michael Belgrave*  
Massey University

**Native Acts: Law, Recognition, and Cultural Authenticity.** By Joanne Barker. Durham: Duke University Press, 2011. 296 pages. \$84.95 cloth; \$23.95 paper.

Joanne Barker's *Native Acts* moves among seemingly disparate topics such as the California Indian mission disenrollments, the federal government's termination of the Delaware of Oklahoma, the legal complaints of gender discrimination in *Martinez v. Santa Clara*, and the same-sex marriage bans by the Navajo and Cherokee nations to explore the limits of recognition with which tribal nations grapple as a result of being rendered "domestic dependents" of the United States. Barker's analysis troubles tribal nation-building and its intersections with identity and cultural authenticity through which Native legal status and rights are articulated. She argues that culturally based philosophies and teachings have the possibilities of radically reformulating Native social and interpersonal relations in that healthy tribal nations and communities must be based upon ethics and responsibilities towards all citizens.

*Native Acts* invokes the familiar categories of recognition, membership, and tradition that shape Native studies to explore how United States narrations of national progress—civilization, democracy, freedom, liberty, and equality—actually uphold relations of domination between the United States and tribal nations. As Barker shows, our tribal nations, leaders, and citizens have been forced to make impossible decisions about the future of their lands and people, and although we must appreciate the predicaments of leadership, we must also recognize that their decisions are bounded by the legal discourse