

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Sharing the Desert: The Tohono O'Odham in History. By Winston P. Erickson.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0gk3g093>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 19(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Dobyns, Henry F.

Publication Date

1995-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Sharing the Desert: The Tohono O'Odham in History. By Winston P. Erickson. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1994. 182 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

This book is intended to serve as a textbook on Tohono O'Odham history in nine reservation schools. Unfortunately, even students in the two high schools will have difficulty comprehending the scholarly presentation. Tenth graders currently read only at the twenty-third percentile. Pupils in the seven primary or middle schools predictably will learn even less from this text, inasmuch as fourth and seventh graders read at the thirtieth percentile or less. No color illustrations grab the attention of beginning or poor readers. Only twenty-three black-and-white photographs, along with eleven maps, break up the 166 text pages. Most photographs show objects or are group portraits; only eleven show human activities that will interest poor readers. This book will become a reference work for teachers and a few very capable and exceptional students.

Given the predictable fate of this book, it seems fair to ask how good it is as a reference work. The answer is, "Not very good." O'Odham students who can read this text are likely to become disenchanted with its pervasive Eurocentric perspective. The author has a single company of California Volunteers take "control" of Arizona in 1862, whereas the column from California actually achieved far less than control with infantry and cavalry brigades. Additional California Volunteers later reoccupied outlying posts such as Camp Mohave, and New Mexico Volunteers escorted officials of the territory created in 1863 to Prescott.

Discussing Franciscan missions peripheral to the desert, Erickson goes into Francisco Garcés's explorations north from Mission St. Francis Xavier at Bac. Yet he does not mention the two O'Odham committees that sponsor two major calendrical festivals at the still-mission at Bac. Nor does Erickson date the regional cult pilgrimage to the church at Magdalena de Kino, Sonora, although O'Odham pilgrims spread "Sonora Catholicism." Erickson writes that O'Odham "received land from the mission for their own use," but, in reality, missionaries usurped O'Odham riverine oasis fields and seized O'Odham irrigation water and then required neophytes and converts to work their crops. Erickson does mention that malnutrition contributed to the high death rate among missionized O'Odham, although he misinterprets the

ratio of twenty burials to one baptism as evidence of O'Odham temporary residence instead of disease mortality.

Erickson denigrates the pre-mission O'Odham as nearly full-time gatherers of uncultivated foods, ignoring evidence collected by the foremost ethnographer of the Tohono O'Odham that theirs was an economy of relative abundance. Of course, that abundance came significantly from seasonal exploitation of riverine oases, and Erickson reiterates the erroneous theme that "the desert could provide enough food for survival."

Erickson credits Eusebio F. Kino, S.J., with establishing Christian missions on the San Pedro River in 1697, when, in fact, Kino and Juan M. Manje simply traveled the length of the stream, meeting native villagers. A curious Apache-centrism creeps into Erickson's discussion of the San Pedro River valley. He has the Apaches "take" the area by 1735, but, in fact, Spanish troops forcibly removed the upstream natives to the Santa Cruz River valley in 1762. Erickson has Apaches occupying native village sites in the San Pedro River valley, which they never did, even long after the forcible Spanish relocation of the native populace.

Approximately one-half of this textbook's prospective readership is female, yet the author ignores that reality. He disregards historic female contributions to survival on the desert—functional and artistic baskets sold for centuries, and watercooling *ollas* made near riverine oasis customers from Tucson to Tubac to Bisbee. Erickson does mention the O'Odham selling *ollas* in Bisbee; he just fails to make the point that women made them.

There is no mention in this textbook of Hilda Manuel, a woman judge who emerged as one of the foremost tribal court judges in the nation. Nor does this text discuss other women who have played important roles in reservation governance in recent decades. This silence concerning female leaders highlights the book's utter failure to prepare student readers to participate in reservation governance. The entire post-World War II period is sketched in one of the book's eleven chapters.

Perhaps Erickson sought to avoid loading the text with personal names and dates, but this reference work-to-be fails to identify all of the chief executives of reservation government. Thomas A. Segundo, arguably the greatest Tohono O'Odham chief executive, rates a portrait and a summation of the plan for developing desert human and natural resources that hundreds of Desert People worked out under his leadership. The "new programs" he led after returning to the reservation in 1967 remain

unidentified. The text records that Segundo died in an airplane crash en route to speak to Native American students attending eastern colleges, It errs, as it often does, on a detail. The commuter aircraft crashed outside Coolidge, not Phoenix. That sixty-mile or so misplacement is the sort of mistake that destroys the confidence of readers reared in the desert.

Henry Throssell rates a group (thirteen members of the Rodeo and Fair Association) portrait and a discussion of the council's wartime approval of air force planes flying over the reservations. José Ignacio, first chairman of the reservation government formed as authorized by the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934, is mentioned as such. His successor, Peter Blaine, is mentioned because he wrote a book of memoirs. The text mentions anything but a representative sample of chief executives and governance issues. There is not a word about gaming in a national facility on San Xavier Reservation, the large cash income it generates, and the political disagreements among district and national authorities over distribution of that income. Erickson's Tohono O'Odham collaborators may well have thought that this fundamental economic and political issue with which readers will have to deal as reservation citizens is too controversial to be treated in a textbook.

Successive reservation administrations have built up a police force that must deal with drug smugglers and illegal immigrants as well as ethnic malefactors. Since President Richard M. Nixon ordered the federal government to contract many functions to reservation governments, the Tohono O'Odham Nation has taken over numerous programs once run by Euro-American bureaucrats. Readers of Erickson's textbook will not learn about them. Indeed, for all the detail this volume contains concerning the last score of years, it might as well have been published twenty years ago.

Not very skillful readers are likely to be put off by the overly academic tone of this text. They will also be misinformed by many passages. Now that mechanical cotton pickers harvest nearly all of Arizona's fiber, few students will have picked cotton. They need to know, therefore, that only an author who never picked cotton could call it "an attractive kind of work." When the thirst-enduring People picked cotton, they did so in their own ethnic manner. They paced themselves to pick about two hundred pounds day after day, unlike members of other ethnic groups, who might pick five hundred pounds one day and crash the next.