

UCLA

Comitatus: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies

Title

Medieval Academy Reprints for Teaching, 5-7 (review)

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0gd8v1q6>

Journal

Comitatus: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 11(1)

ISSN

0069-6412

Author

Halasey, Steven Douglas

Publication Date

1980-10-01

Peer reviewed

BOOK REVIEWS

W. A. Pantin, *The English Church in the Fourteenth Century*, Mediaeval Academy Reprints for Teaching 5 (Cambridge: University Press, 1955; rpt. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), pp. xii + 292, appendices, index, \$5.00. ISBN: 0-8020-6411-6.

Marsilius of Padua, *Defensor Pacis*, translated by Alan Gewirth, Mediaeval Academy Reprints for Teaching 6 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1956; rpt. New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1967; rpt. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), pp. xciv + 450, introduction, appendices, index, \$6.00. ISBN: 0-8020-6412-4.

John B. Morrall, *Political Thought in Medieval Times*, Mediaeval Academy Reprints for Teaching 7 (London: Hutchinson and Co., 1958; rpt. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), pp. 152, bibliography, index of names, index of subjects, \$3.00. ISBN: 0-8020-6413-2.

No scholar who has attempted during recent years to locate texts for classroom use can be unaware of the difficulties: many of the finest works have long been out of print, and the cost of those which are available is often prohibitive for classroom assignment. The Mediaeval Academy of America, however, through its Committee on Centers and Regional Associations, now offers an excellent solution to these problems. The series Mediaeval Academy Reprints for Teaching (MART), now in its second year, promises to bring many useful texts back into print at prices low enough to justify their use in undergraduate classes. The texts to be reprinted are selected from nominations made by the academy's members, and (judging from the form of the questionnaire circulated to members) some attempt is being made to ensure that they will actually be used in the classroom.

In order to make these texts available at reasonable prices, of course, some sacrifices have been necessary. The reprints are, for instance, photolithographic reproductions of the originals—with all the variations in format and repeated errors (including the typographical error in the *Defensor Pacis*,

p. 297, last line, 'veneratio' for 'veneration') which such a process makes possible. And the quires of the reprints are merely glued into their covers (themselves slightly less sturdy than one might wish), without stitching for reinforcement. These sacrifices, however, are minuscule when compared with the advantages of having Heinrich Fichtenau's *Carolingian Empire* or A. H. M. Jones' *Constantine and the Conversion of Europe* (MART 1 and 4, respectively, from the first year of the series) in print at less than five dollars apiece.

In terms of its possibilities for classroom use, W. A. Pantin's *English Church in the Fourteenth Century* is the most nicely balanced of this year's MART offerings. Not only do its three parts ("Church and State," "Intellectual Life and Controversy," and "Religious Literature") function independently—a major advantage for courses whose organization is topical—but the work is sufficiently short for assignment *in toto* in many lecture courses and nearly all seminars. Equally important, Pantin manages to maintain a balance between narrowly English and international views of certain problems (for instance, *eigenkirche* patronage and papal provisions, the relations of the papacy and English crown, and fourteenth-century controversies), which simplifies the task of finding texts with which to supplement his work. Pantin's treatment of religious literature gives this reprint a particularly broad appeal, since it provides a clear demonstration of the relations between 'historical phenomena' (specifically, thirteenth-century efforts to implement the reforms of the Fourth Lateran Council) and literary history, which should commend the work to students in both disciplines.

Students using this work should be made aware, however, that there are several curiosities—not in themselves disadvantageous—in Pantin's approach to his topic. The most important of these, because of its effect throughout the work, is surely Pantin's contention that

the study of the fourteenth century, as of the later Middle Ages generally, has suffered much in the past from a habit of reading history backwards, of trying to trace signs and causes of the great changes to come, and of thinking of the period as the 'eve of the Renaissance' or the 'eve of the Reformation.' I think that the proper and really fruitful method is to tackle the problem from the other end, and to ask ourselves, how does the fourteenth century grow out of the thirteenth century? (p. 2).

Pantin does an excellent job of carrying through with this approach, by providing the thirteenth-century background to his topics, which should

enable students to view the fourteenth century by the same light in which contemporaries probably saw themselves. Thus, papal provisions are shown to be "simply part of the growing centralization of the Church which had been going on during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries" (p. 47), and fourteenth-century religious literature is treated as "the logical outcome of forces at work in the thirteenth century and earlier" (p. 189). But, without discussing Pantin's view of previous scholarship (which, I think, is both valid and significant), it is important to note that his corrective approach is similarly limited, and that this, in turn, limits the usefulness of the text. Scholars wishing to use Pantin's approach for later periods (to ask, in effect, how did the fifteenth or sixteenth centuries grow out of the fourteenth?), for instance, are likely to find that this work lacks discussion of the elements which would allow such a reconstruction.

These limitations are further aggravated by Pantin's decision, with regard to fourteenth-century intellectual life, "to present some of the less familiar sides of the subject" (p. 5), and in particular, to exclude both Ockham and Wyclif while devoting fifteen pages (pp. 151-65) to Richard FitzRalph. The effect of this decision is to imply that neither Ockham nor Wyclif were typical of the fourteenth-century English Church, despite the dozen mentions of the former and thirty-odd mentions of the latter which Pantin is compelled to make. But, even if it is admitted that the controversies which surrounded Wyclif were atypically intense (as Pantin argues on pp. 134-35), it is as difficult to justify dismissing them as it is to accept Pantin's conclusion that works of religious instruction were "the most constructive achievement of the fourteenth-century English Church" (p. 261), when no account has been taken of the Wycliffite translations of the Bible. In short, Pantin's search for elements of continuity in the fourteenth-century English Church leads him to eliminate many important topics which, while no less outgrowths of the preceding decades, point toward new directions in religious thought and activity. We may well question whether such a characterization is any more accurate than those which it is meant to correct. Although there is much to recommend Pantin's approach, then, instructors who plan to use this text should give careful thought to selecting supplementary readings which will cover the areas neglected there, and provide an alternative view of the period.

Marsilius of Padua's *Defensor Pacis*, translated by Alan Gewirth, stands in even greater need of supplementation than Pantin's work, if it is to be used effectively in the classroom. In this instance, however, the failures are less the result of authorial design than of academic publishing, which has now (for the second time) reprinted Gewirth's translation without also

reprinting its intended companion, *Marsilius of Padua and Medieval Political Philosophy*.¹ However this separation occurred, it is unfortunate, for as Gewirth himself admits, the introductory remarks in this volume are sufficient only "to help the reader cope with the structure, basic ideas, and vocabulary of Marsilius' treatise" (p. xviii). Instructors wishing to use Gewirth's translation are thus left with the difficult problem of locating a classroom set of some text which will adequately discuss the many philosophical, political, ecclesiastical, and scriptural issues raised by the *Defensor Pacis*.

Because their scope is deliberately limited, it is the two central sections on "Basic Themes" and "Religion and Politics" (pp. xxx-lxv) which require the greatest supplementation. Within these, Gewirth's remarks on popular sovereignty (pp. xxxviii-xlv) and the relations of Church and State (pp. lii-lxv) as viewed by Marsilius are particularly notable, but in such limited space little consideration can be given the historical background of the former or elaboration of the latter by later thinkers. Nor is Gewirth able to take up all the issues one might wish: there is, for instance, almost no attempt made to put the *Defensor Pacis* into its historical (as opposed to intellectual) context; and minimal preparation is provided for Marsilius' immensely complex discussion of clerical poverty, ownership, and use (Discourse II, caps. xii-xiv), which is itself a response to developments in canonical legislation.

Gewirth's introduction nevertheless provides the basic essentials for any student trying for the first time to cope with this complex treatise, in which both structure and terminology are based upon the difficult traditions of scholastic and (to a lesser extent, in Discourse II) canonical argumentation. Thus, in his section on "Structure and General Argument" (pp. xix-xxix), Gewirth examines the "doctrinal and terminological disparities" (p. xx) between the first two discourses, and demonstrates that Marsilius moves from a general consideration of civil tranquility (in Discourse I, using Aristotelian concepts of the State) to the specific cause of civil discord embodied in papal pretensions to temporal power (in Discourse II, where the bases of argumentation shift to scriptural and patristic authorities). This explanation is helpful, since at first reading much of the *Defensor Pacis* appears disjointed, and students whose assignments do not include the entire text are likely to lose track without Gewirth's guidance. Gewirth's section on "Language and Translation" (pp. lxvi-xci) is similarly helpful, since Marsilius' use of certain terms (as in the case of his four definitions

¹ Alan Gewirth, *Marsilius of Padua, Defender of the Peace*, volume I: *Marsilius of Padua and Medieval Political Philosophy* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1951).

of *ius*, or his separation of the action of judgment into discernment and coercive sentencing) is an important element in his argument.

Throughout his translation of the *Defensor Pacis* Gewirth shows his concern for clarity and accuracy, and there are very few instances where the English idiom creates difficulties. The treatise is long, however, and instructors may have some problems in isolating the more cogent passages for classroom assignment. In the instances (particularly numerous in Discourse II) where Marsilius refers for proof to a previous section—with the 'minor term' changed—the problem of classroom readings becomes even more complex. Here, Gewirth's footnotes and cross-references are helpful, and should enable instructors to use Marsilius' work piecemeal to illustrate specific ideas. Even so, this is a work which operates best when it is read in its entirety, and instructors should resist the temptation to separate Marsilius' ideas from their proper context—even if this means exposing their students to more tedious and complicated reading than they might wish.

The last of this year's MART offerings, John B. Morrall's *Political Thought in Medieval Times*, focuses on "the rise, development and collapse of the ideal of a Christian Commonwealth and its replacement by a return to a more purely political conception of the State," during the period from the "fall of Graeco-Roman civilization in the west" to the Reformation (p. 11). Without being overly disparaging, the best indication of the depth of his work is the fact that Morrall covers this extremely difficult topic in a mere 127 pages. It is apparent, then, that this work is designed for the most basic of classes (or for review), and that its major advantage is its brevity. But it should not be thought that Morrall's simplicity of approach also implies simple-mindedness; indeed, his sections on the twelfth through fourteenth centuries (pp. 41-118) are especially good for the ease with which he treats the many complex influences, including Civil and Canon Law, papal *plenitudo potestatis*, representative assemblies within the feudal and Church hierarchies, and the decline of the unified imperial ideal in the face of national particularism.

Morrall's description of the "two hundred years between Marsiglio of Padua and Martin Luther" as "The Age of Ambiguity" (p. 119) is less satisfactory. Such an appellation, like the 'Dark Ages,' or C. S. Lewis' 'Drab Age' (used to describe the literature of England in the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries), does little to stimulate students' interest, and describes the current status of scholarship more than the age itself. Instructors would be well advised to assign readings which will help to

clarify this difficult period for their students, and will avoid allowing Morrall's characterization to stand.

The content of this year's MART reprints has been scrutinized previously, and none of the works has been found lacking. The success or failure of the series, however, will depend largely on the ability of instructors to use the reprints in the classroom. This year's works are not severely limited, but they do require supplementation and careful treatment. As the MART series progresses, the options for supplementary readings will increase, giving instructors even greater choice in planning their courses. As a first step toward better courses and greater interest among students, the MART series deserves close inspection.

Steven Douglas Halasey
University of California
Los Angeles

Andrew Hughes, ed., *Medieval Music: The Sixth Liberal Art*, rev. ed., Toronto Medieval Bibliographies 4 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980), pp. xiii + 360, \$25.00. ISBN: 0-8020-2358-4.

Incorporating references to many of the major works published during the 1970s, the revised edition of Andrew Hughes's bibliography features a supplement which serves to update the nearly two thousand entries of the original edition. The logistical problem of presenting references to the approximately 250 selected studies of the supplement within the confines of the bibliography has been easily surmounted by assigning to each of them a number which includes one decimal place; the new numbers—with a lighter type face—are inserted between the existing ones in the original bibliography, and direct the user to the supplement. Although the format necessitates shuffling back and forth between the main section and the supplement, this design avoids the high cost of resetting the entire volume. For achieving such satisfactory results, and for preserving the high quality of the original edition, the publisher is to be commended.

Hughes maintains the twenty-nine subject divisions established in the earlier edition, and continues the practice of supplying succinct annotations to most of the new listings. A general index and an author/editor index for the new supplement are also included. Furthermore, Hughes has been