

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Faith and Boundaries: Colonists, Christianity, and Community among the Wampanoags of Martha's Vineyard, 1600-1871. By David J. Silverman.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0cf7w8fd>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 29(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Nicholas, Mark A.

Publication Date

2005-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

here through the storytelling of living generations and made accessible to future generations. Equally important is that traditional ecological knowledge from a region of the Americas, long unknown to or often ignored by Western science, is now available for those who might integrate the two approaches. If that melding occurs, the likelihood of a sustainable future for humankind ought to be increased.

Michael H. Horn

California State University, Fullerton

Faith and Boundaries: Colonists, Christianity, and Community among the Wampanoags of Martha's Vineyard, 1600–1871. By David J. Silverman. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005. 328 pages. \$60.00 cloth.

The Wampanoags are one of the better studied Native groups of Southern New England. Readers of this journal are no doubt familiar with their famous colonial emissary, Squanto (Tisquantum), or how Wampanoags were fierce opponents of the Puritans under the leadership of their sachem Metacom, otherwise known as King Philip. On the eve of English settlement, they possessed “sachem rights” to lands that ranged over Cape Cod, Martha's Vineyard, eastern Rhode Island, and portions of Nantucket, while their numbers exceeded twenty thousand. Like the Five Iroquois Nations of New York or Powhatan's chiefdom in Virginia, Wampanoags were a presence to be reckoned with in the seventeenth century. And as with other Native groups who have survived to the present day, Wampanoags still pass on their oral traditions and customs among communities of people with Mashpee on Cape Cod and Gay Head on the Vineyard. Because the Wampanoags occupied homelands that have attracted the interest of several generations of scholars of Native North America, it would at first appear there would be little room for David J. Silverman to chart new ground. But most scholars have focused on the mainland or Nantucket while the Vineyard has not received as much attention. With this tiny island as his focus, the gifted Silverman makes plenty of room for himself. He restores the importance of the Vineyard to the field of Native American history, as well as to the annals of colonial New England.

Faith and Boundaries is another wonderful addition to the Cambridge University Press series called Studies of North American Indian History. Armed with the tools of ethnohistory, Silverman has chosen an immense scope. By tightly analyzing significant findings, he manages to cover the years from the seventeenth-century Puritan settlement of the Vineyard through the 1870 enactment of the Fifteenth Amendment by the Massachusetts government. Silverman also keeps sight of the intricate connections between the mainland, Nantucket, and the Vineyard—this makes *Faith and Boundaries* more than just a study of the special set of intercultural relations between Natives and newcomers that arose in one peculiar offshore setting. The “peaceful coexistence” unique to the Vineyard and found in Wampanoag Christian worship and Indian-run civic institutions never “trumped” a Euro-American racism,

which King Philip's War sparked first on the mainland and which persisted in different forms after the American Revolution. As Vineyard Indians in the eighteenth century were pushed to the margins as "racial others" under Euro-American economic markets, practices of justice, and concepts of land rights, several communities disappeared and others throughout the nineteenth century struggled to uphold their sense of community with specific lands. Silverman does challenge the conventional understanding of seventeenth-century Puritan-Wampanoag relations in the course of presenting his argument—most historians have looked to the mainland and discovered an intercultural peace between and among several "praying towns" and Puritans in Plymouth and Massachusetts Bay that was tenuous at best and dissolved abruptly with the cataclysmic downward spiral of King Philip's War. His other insights should command the attention of historians of Native American religion and eighteenth-century New England, as well as scholars concerned with the place of race in the early republic of the Northeast. This study is exhaustively researched, based on published accounts and sources from archives on the mainland and both Nantucket and the Vineyard, and elegantly written in seven thematic chapters followed by two population appendixes. Readers will find it most remarkable how Silverman brings together a vast evidentiary record to capture Wampanoag resiliency in the face of the seemingly insurmountable obstacles of racial difference.

In the first two chapters Silverman establishes the distinctive relations on the Vineyard between Wampanoags and Puritans. Unique not only because it was one of two islands off New England's coastline colonized by Englishmen, the Vineyard also differed from Nantucket in the way that its settlement proceeded. Silverman first traces the networks of patronage and power behind the colonization of the island under Thomas Mayhew Sr. He then shifts effortlessly into discussions of early relations with the Indians, where he argues that Christianity broke through what appeared to both parties as an impenetrable cultural divide. Silverman casts fresh light on seventeenth-century mission history with a close examination of specific Indians whose roles were prominent in island-based Puritan proselytizing. In his estimation, a grasp of Christianity became the source of their influence.

Wampanoag and Puritan cultural brokers put Christian teachings and beliefs through a process Silverman describes as "religious translation." This is one of many of his important contributions. Silverman's rigorous analysis of the creation of a "Wampanoag Christianity" in chapters 1 and 2 has no equal in the literature on Southern New England Indians. Contrary to what most historians have argued, Silverman does not see Indian conversion to Christianity on the Vineyard as a weapon wielded by Puritans to initiate a complete loss of Algonquian cultural practices and social structures. He applies a sensitive and imaginative eye to familiar seventeenth-century texts published by "praying town" missionaries and finds a melding of Algonquian religious practices with Protestant ones. Christianity, in other words, brought stability to two foreign cultures that shared a small island, a place so small that one might have predicted a swift and violent separation that followed patterns on the mainland.

Silverman next explores a series of “challenges” that sorely tested Christian coexistence on the Vineyard. He first shows how Christian faith and trust in missionaries helped the island survive King Philip’s War, although mainland Christian Wampanoags were cast as “savages” who deserved nothing more than death, imprisonment, and even enslavement. Land deeds and court records provide Silverman with a window into the gradual dispossession of Wampanoag homelands at the hands of greedy English settlers who understood land as capital and cared little for the island Indian’s usufruct rights. In the process, Silverman finds that Indians faced tough choices about keeping their sachems or abandoning such forms of community leadership to protect the small portions of the island they shared. In similar sources Silverman turns up various disputes over livestock, land tenure, and justice in which Wampanoags came before the bench to fight for their rights and territorial protection, although Euro-Americans continually tried to relegate Natives to the bottom rungs of New England society. In chapter 6, Silverman makes good use of merchant accounts and contracts to trace the role island Wampanoags played in a coercive labor market of indentured servitude, one that forced Indians into English homes, ship hulls, and debt. Even with all this radical change, Silverman argues, Vineyard Wampanoags continued to find solace and ties of kinship and friendship in their churches. As civic institutions, however, churches were not free of conflict. Using mission accounts and correspondence, Silverman ably reconstructs the tensions that developed as many Indians stepped forward to lead Wampanoag churches and fill other positions as community leaders.

In Silverman’s words, “This rising bar of civilization shifted the focus of difference between Indians and Europeans from culture, which could change, to race, which in many people’s minds could not” (14). For the Wampanoags this would prove to be a terrible turning point in their history. The final chapters of *Faith and Boundaries* are rich explorations into the conflicts that centered on race. Here Silverman adds significantly to a body of literature produced by Daniel R. Mandell, Jean O’Brien-Kehoe, John Wood Sweet, and Joanne Pope Melish. Silverman manages to unravel how African in-migration and shifting Euro-American views of people of color combined to almost erase a Wampanoag ethnic identity on the Vineyard. He also follows a tide of evangelicalism and slave emancipation in the early American republic that eventually reached the Vineyard to disrupt Christian life and leadership. At the same time, Silverman draws significant comparisons with large mainland reserves like Mashpee of Cape Cod that faced similar sets of issues. Continuing with his story of racial segregation through one final tragic episode, Silverman ends the book with the understudied and complicated topic of citizenship in antebellum New England. As Silverman finds, Wampanoags continued to protect their homelands, Christian faith, and sense of community, even as walls of brick that once separated white farms from Indian communal lands were fortified by racial laws that clearly denounced Vineyard Indians in the 1870s as a mixed and nonexistent “tribal” people unworthy of citizenship.

Faith and Boundaries is important on multiple levels, not just for the questions it raises but also for its significance to Southern New England Indians

today, who still confront postcolonialism in the politics of tribal recognition. Many present-day groups like the Mashpees of Cape Cod are viewed as mixed and “non-Indian.” Such groups have been denied tribal status despite repeated appeals. Forced to answer to a government that defines *tribe* from an antiquated perspective, Southern New England Indians such as Mashpees can profit from books like *Faith and Boundaries*. As Silverman makes clear, Wampanoags ceased to define their sense of “peoplehood” in terms of distinct, autonomous, and indigenous political entities. In contrast, they abandoned their sachems to preserve their lands, adopted outsiders to fend off demographic disaster, and borrowed from what was new to preserve some of the old. At the core of many Native identities in Southern New England has always been a sense of community tied to specific lands; such a relationship is imbued with mythical and spiritual substance and generational value. Perhaps if governing authorities started to understand “tribal recognition” in this way, many Indian peoples of Southern New England who still face the legacies of colonialism as well as current racism might get at least the recognition they so justly deserve, if not a portion of their territory. Silverman’s study also had this reader thinking about the power of Christianity when confronted by race. Have people of different skin color who have come to worship together ever managed to fully break down the boundaries of racial consciousness in other periods and regions throughout American history?

Faith and Boundaries is one of the finest books to appear in some time about Southern New England Indians. One can only hope that Cambridge University Press will publish a paperback edition soon, for it will stimulate interesting discussions in upper-division undergraduate classes and graduate seminars.

Mark A. Nicholas
Lehigh University

The Island Chumash: Behavioral Ecology of a Maritime Society. By Douglas J. Kennett. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005. 298 pages. \$60.00 cloth.

There is a long and rich history of archaeological research on the northern Channel Islands of the California coast. The reasons for this sustained interest are varied. Prior to the first encounter with Europeans—Spaniard Juan Rodríguez Cabrillo reached the islands from Mexico in 1542—the islands were the home of a culturally rich, maritime-oriented people. The Island Chumash lived in highly populated permanent villages that were ruled by chiefs who wielded considerable social power as they negotiated trade networks between the islands—San Miguel, Santa Rosa, Santa Cruz, and Anacapa—as well as across the Santa Barbara Channel to the mainland and beyond. The unspoiled setting of these islands contrasts with the nearby urban sprawl of the Los Angeles–Santa Barbara region, and archaeologists working on the islands, thanks to the relative lack of destructive modern development and their