

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Gender and Sexuality in Indigenous North America, 1400–1850. Edited by Sandra Slater and Fay A. Yarbrough.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0409h2pt>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 37(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Tatonetti, Lisa

Publication Date

2013

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

programs of the United States, which laid the foundation for modern welfare systems. Overall, Cahill's groundbreaking work of social history provides a unique investigation into the local and interpersonal workings of the United States Indian Service during the height of the assimilation period. This work will surely become a classic in the social history of the United States Indian Service as well as government-Indian relations.

Jonathan Byrn

Murray State University

Gender and Sexuality in Indigenous North America, 1400–1850. Edited by Sandra Slater and Fay A. Yarbrough. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2011. 200 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

Sandra Slater and Fay A. Yarbrough have brought together eight essays on indigeneity, gender, and sexuality and arranged them chronologically, forming a collection that spans a broad time period, a variety of topics, and a wide range of academic fields, including history, cultural studies, and literary studies. Yarbrough's brief introduction names the book's four overarching themes: first, "how Europeans manipulated native ideas about gender for their own purposes and how indigenous people responded to European attempts to impose gendered cultural practices that clashed with native thinking"; second, "how indigenous people made meaning of gender and how these meanings changed over time within their own communities"; third, how "sexual practice [can serve] as a site for cultural articulation, as well as a vehicle for the expression of gender roles"; and, lastly, how race functions in Native history (1–2).

The two opening essays primarily analyze how understandings of gender and sexuality circulate within colonial discourses. M. Carmen Gomez-Galisteo's "Subverting Gender Roles in the Sixteenth Century: Cabeza de Vaca, the Conquistador Who Became a Native American Woman" reads Álgar Núñez Cabeza de Vaca's position as trader within the context of his encounters with indigenous peoples, suggesting this position destabilized his performance of masculinity. Sandra Slater's "'Naught but women': Constructions of Masculinities and Modes of Emasculation in the New World" analyzes what she views as the contest of masculinities that marks the imperialist encounter, in which "Native and European men both sought to bolster their own masculinity through the emasculation of their enemies" (30). Each of these essays puts forward an interesting premise; however, Gomez-Galisteo fails to differentiate between and among the indigenous nations to which she refers, which weakens her claims. The essay's often-broad comparisons between

“European” and “Native American” understandings of gender implicitly suggest that European masculinities and indigenous femininities can be singularly quantified and juxtaposed. For example, Cabeza de Vaca is afforded a history and nationality while the “Native American societies [he] lived among” remain nameless and largely undocumented in both main text and footnotes, even though the essay pivots on the argument that Cabeza de Vaca is “feminized” by taking on an indigenous gender occupation reserved for women in the communities he encounters (18). Granted, the extant documents that detail economic and cultural practices of the indigenous inhabitants of the Gulf Coast at this period are limited; however, indigenous studies scholars have long questioned such generalizations when specific contentions are being made about indigenous cultural practices.

Slater begins with a broad claim that seems similarly troubling—“For the natives, chiefs and particularly warriors embodied shining examples of manhood” (32). However, she goes on to offer specific examples of indigenous masculinities, examining Iroquoian, Aztec, and Pequot records of encounters with colonizers, among others. These broad-ranging comparisons of disparate cultures likewise risk forwarding a singular understanding of indigenous masculinity, but from the outset Slater recognizes the specific nature of gender performance, stating “masculine identities emerge from a variety of socioeconomic influences” that are marked by “personal history, national influence, environment, expectation, religion, and economics” (30–31). Overall, both Gomez-Galisteo and Slater examine how European and indigenous masculinities were perceived primarily from a settler-colonial perspective.

Two of the essays attend to the narratives of little-known indigenous women. Dorothy Tanck de Estrada’s “Who Was Salvadora de los Santos Ramirez, Otomi Indian?” examines Father Antonio de Paredes’s 1762 biography of Salvadora de los Santos Ramirez, an Otomi Indian living in Querétaro in the late eighteenth century. Santos Ramirez joined “a group of lay women, known as *beatas*, who were following the religious life without being nuns or living in a convent,” keeping house and raising funds for the group (77). Tanck de Estrada maps the perception of Santos Ramirez within the Native and non-Native communities of Querétaro and beyond, ultimately situating her narrative as part of a hagiographic tradition such as that tied to the recently canonized Kateri Tekakwitha, a Kanienkehaka (Mohawk) Catholic.

One of the outstanding essays in the collection looks at this same time period in a different part of the Americas. Dawn G. Marsh’s “Hannah Freeman: Gendered Sovereignty in Penn’s Peacable Kingdom” reads the account of Hannah Freeman’s life as told to Moses Marshall, a newly appointed representative of the first poorhouse in Chester County, Pennsylvania. Marsh shows how Freeman structures her story and, importantly, her life, around

a specifically Lenape cosmology, arguing that Freeman's narrative demonstrates an understanding of "shared sovereignty" that functions as personal history, tribal history, and land claim. Ultimately, Marsh contends that the details Freeman presents about her life explicitly challenge William Penn's romanticized narrative of the Quakers' "peaceable kingdom" (103), an ideology Freeman's Quaker neighbors would have held dear. Both Tanck de Estrada and Marsh reclaim indigenous women's words and histories, convincingly arguing for their importance in Native American and indigenous studies. Marsh in particular carefully situates her essay in grounded cultural history, as does Jan V. Noel in another of the collection's essays, "Revisiting Gender in Iroquoia." Noel offers a tribally specific reading of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Haudenosaunee women's significant rights and responsibilities.

A number of essays reference two-spirit histories within larger arguments about gender performances. Roger M. Carpenter's "Womanish Men and Manlike Women: the Native American Two-Spirit as Warrior" argues there is a "sparse historical record" about multiply gendered people (148). Although Carpenter recognizes the problematic history of the term *berdache*, he then goes on to employ it. Presenting a brief overview of two-spirit history and roles in a section entitled "Womanish Men," Carpenter then offers "a glimpse of the differing prisms of European observers," reading colonial accounts of encounter by Spanish and French traders and missionaries such as Cabeza de Vaca, Jean Ribault, Louise Hennepin, Pierre Liette, and Pierre Marquette (152). Carpenter shows how non-Native US frontier narratives similarly offer more insight into the culture of the observer than into specific iterations of two-spirit identities. Yet Carpenter's narrative at times falls into the same trap. For example, the section "Manlike Women" suggests "female berdaches" were uncommon, an anthropological claim that Sue-Ellen Jacobs, Wesley Thomas, and Sabine Lang attribute to the attitudes toward women taken by non-Native missionaries and traders and the ensuing lack of documentation of Native women. A subsequent contention similarly relies on the historical record and non-Native interpretations of indigenous traditions, that "northern Plains and Plateau women may have felt drawn to the prospect of being a two-spirit person—and hence a warrior" because they were "raised in societies where women had little power" (158). Such claims for gender binaries are largely refuted by feminist scholars in contemporary indigenous studies who argue for more nuanced understandings of gender and power in indigenous contexts. Indeed, editor Yarbrough does so in her own essay.

Gabriel S. Estrada's excellent concluding essay centers on the controversies surrounding two-spirit histories. "Two Spirit Histories in Southwestern and Mesoamerican Literatures" looks at texts from both sides of the US/Mexico border to argue that contemporary two-spirit studies must broaden not only

its geographical focus, but also its range of sources. Like Carpenter's reading of the historical record, Estrada demonstrates the elasticity of evidence by showing that historical and contemporary writers read and represent queer indigenous people through the lens of their culture and subject position. Examining Ramón A. Gutiérrez's critique of Will Roscoe's scholarship, in which Gutiérrez contends that Roscoe idealizes two-spirit history by imposing a white "gay liberationist" agenda "onto Native American pasts," Estrada shows the danger of relying on a single set of data (171). Tracing the sources of this scholarly debate, Estrada suggests that Gutiérrez's interpretation of two-spirit histories comes from "privileging . . . texts written by Spanish conquistadors and priests" (171). Estrada finds that readings of Mesoamerican sexual histories commonly "rely on the earliest Spanish Empire documents of the 1500s, 1600s, and 1700s [that] represent two-spirit sexuality as either rampant or heavily suppressed sin" (174). Suggesting that contemporary scholars must pay attention to the narratives "contemporary indigenous peoples [have about] their own two-spirit histories and cultures" (175), Estrada ultimately calls for two-spirit studies to forward a pan-American understanding of indigenous genders and sexualities.

Though *Gender and Sexuality in Indigenous North America 1400–1850* has some methodological weaknesses, as a whole it is a valuable resource for libraries and for scholars in the field. The collection is a fine addition to current conversations in the field about gender and sexuality, in particular because of the text's intervention into ongoing scholarly conversations about gender and sexuality and its attention to several lesser-known indigenous narratives.

Lisa Tatonetti

Kansas State University

In the Belly of a Laughing God: Humour and Irony in Native Women's Poetry. By Jennifer Andrews. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2011. 320 pages. \$55.00 cloth.

In her introduction Jennifer Andrews states clearly that "despite its popularity . . . Native poetry has not garnered the same sustained critical and popular attention as novels" and goes on to underscore the crucial importance poetry plays not only in the field of literary criticism but, more importantly, in the lives of North American indigenous peoples (32). Indeed, nearly a decade ago in their 2003 essay collection *Speak to Me Words*, editors Dean Rader and Janice Gould emphasized the lack of critical attention to Native American poetry despite the growing field of Native American literary criticism. Since