

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Potawatomi of the West: Origins of the Citizen Band. By Joseph Murphy.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/02c7g9mw>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 14(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hacker, Peter R.

Publication Date

1990

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

formal comparative methods. This would have helped broaden the scope of Hurt's work beyond his emphasis on the trans-Mississippi West and the Southwest. The use of charts or maps to summarize some of the comparative information that he presents in narrative form would have aided the reader. While Hurt's intent was to be suggestive rather than definitive, some topics should have been treated in a less cursory manner, particularly Indian irrigation and water rights, since these were the key to agricultural success in the semi-arid and arid regions on which he focuses.

Joanna L. Endter

University of California, Los Angeles

Potawatomi of the West: Origins of the Citizen Band. By Joseph Murphy. Shawnee, OK: Citizen Band Potawatomi Tribe, 1988. 347 pages.

On 19 October 1989, Father Joseph Murphy, O.S.B., died while on vacation in California. He was seventy-eight. Fortunately, before his death he was able to view with satisfaction the long-overdue publication of his Ph.D. dissertation, "Potawatomi Indians of the West: Origins of the Citizen Band," by the Citizen Band Potawatomi tribe. This dissertation had been accepted by the University of Oklahoma in 1961, and Father Murphy, an honorary member of the Citizen Band, donated the publication rights to the tribe among whom he had labored for so long. When considering the close relationship Father Murphy enjoyed with the Citizen Band, one might understandably be prone to dismiss his work as partial and subjective. Such fears are unjustified. The publication of *Potawatomi of the West* was not motivated by mere sentimentality. The book reflects an enormous amount of research, insight, and evaluation, and is essential to an adequate understanding of Citizen Band history.

The history of the Potawatomi Indians is characterized by the divisive impact of various Euro-American forces on the tribe. French fur traders, Jesuit missionaries, British army officers, and American governmental officials all contributed in one way or another to Potawatomi factionalism. From the seventeenth century to the present, Potawatomi tribesmen have expressed a

variety of conflicting responses to the processes of acculturation and assimilation; these reactions often led to severe internal conflict. Struggles between full-bloods and métis, hunters and agriculturalists, and assimilationists and traditionalists created such discord that the Potawatomis scattered, finding that they could not, or would not, live together.

By 1840, the majority of Potawatomis found themselves bereft of their homelands in the upper Old Northwest and living on reservations in Council Bluffs, Iowa, and at the Osage River Subagency in Kansas. Each group did quite well on its own, and tribesmen showed no great desire to reunite with their distant kinsmen. The ever-present threat of again losing their lands to rapacious Americans, however, did much to persuade them to consider reunification in 1846. After considerable treaty negotiations with the federal government, the generally "traditional" Potawatomis living in Council Bluffs and known as the Prairie Band rejoined their relatively "progressive" brethren from the Osage River Subagency on a newly created reservation at the Kaw or Kansas River in Kansas. Unfortunately, it soon became quite obvious that this marriage of necessity needed a quick annulment.

In the next few years, several Potawatomis not only contemplated taking individual allotments of land, but even entertained the idea of becoming American citizens. This faction, made up of the progressive elements from both bands, became known as the Citizen Band, and their endeavors met bitter opposition from the anti-allotment Prairie Band.

Encouraged by railroad agents and the federal government, representatives from both bands compromised in 1861 by signing a landmark treaty allowing those who wished to take allotments to do so, and providing a diminished reservation elsewhere for those who did not. Indians who were deemed competent to manage their own affairs were even provided with the means to become American citizens. Within six years, the new citizens, having lost most of their land to unscrupulous speculators, tax collectors, and frontier "opportunists," realized that the citizenship provision of their 1861 treaty had been premature. In desperation they allowed the government to help them sell the rest of their lands so that they could purchase a new reservation in the Indian Territory, far from the grasp of American settlers. Although they failed to escape completely the grasp of the set-

tlers, the reservation they selected in the late 1860s, near Shawnee, Oklahoma, has continually served as the Citizen Band's tribal headquarters since then.

In *Potawatomi of the West*, Father Murphy capably traces the history of the Potawatomi from the 1830s through the Citizen Band's first few years in the Indian Territory. By focusing on the impact of missionary work, both Catholic and Baptist, on tribal policymaking, and on the Indian Department's efforts to implement federal policy concerning the tribe, Murphy conveys a well-balanced thesis on Citizen Band origins. Potawatomi viewpoints and reactions are certainly not ignored, and the several biographical sketches of prominent Potawatomi do much to further enhance this work. Particularly strong is Father Murphy's comparative treatment of the two major Potawatomi bands and their interaction with one another when reunited on the Kansas River reservation. The emerging theme convincingly demonstrates that the geographical divisions within the tribe were not nearly as important as the cultural schisms. Not all Council Bluffs Potawatomi fit the Prairie Band stereotype of "traditional" Indians, and not all Osage River Potawatomi fit the Citizen Band mold. Despite the seemingly incompatible nature of the two bands when they were first reunited, mixed-bloods from the separate reservations often acted together and shared the same goals. It was these progressive, and predominantly Catholic, mixed-bloods who tended to dominate the census rolls of the Citizen Band that emerged after 1861. By the same token, Prairie Band membership seemed to incorporate the more traditional elements from both the Iowa and Osage River bands.

Based primarily upon government documents from the National Archives, *Potawatomi of the West* fits into that often-maligned tradition of narrative history. Father Murphy imposes a chronological order, avoids quantitative analysis, and bases his conclusions directly upon the content of the records that he uncovered. His history makes use of the many reports from Indian agents, commissioners of Indian Affairs, missionaries, and the Potawatomi themselves, and his conclusions reflect a great deal of old-fashioned common sense. They are also expressed quite well. Although numerous secondary sources are indicated in the bibliography, most of the footnotes refer to primary documents. There were no published books specifically about the Citizen Band for him to refer to in 1961, and very few on the Potawa-

tomis in general. Today, interested readers can refer to R. David Edmunds's *The Potawatomis: Keepers of the Fire*; James Clifton's *The Prairie People: Continuity and Change in Potawatomi Indian Culture, 1665-1965*; and H. Craig Miner and William E. Unrau's *The End of Indian Kansas: A Study of Cultural Revolution, 1854-1871*.

As with all works of this scope, certain weaknesses do appear, but in this case most of them can be dismissed as typical of Indian dissertations written in the early 1960s. The term *half-breed*, for example, is used unhesitatingly. Also, since the book was written as a dissertation, it tends to read like a dissertation. There are plenty of "I"s and "you"s, and block quotes are far too numerous and far too lengthy by today's standards. In terms of analysis, one wishes that Father Murphy had explored more thoroughly the effect of railroad interests upon Potawatomi factionalism and treaty negotiations. Instead he simply refers the reader to Paul Wallace Gates's *Fifty Million Acres: Conflicts over Kansas Land Policy, 1854-1860*. The peculiar qualities of the Citizen Band's legal status would also benefit from greater elucidation, and the effectiveness of the business committee needs additional treatment.

The Citizen Band tribe should be commended for the excellent publication values in this work. Most of the photographs are superb, the style of italicizing and double-spacing block quotes is a success, and typographical errors are limited to one (on page 172 the date should read 1858, not 1958). The only serious complaint is that newer maps should have been drawn. The publishers opted instead to photograph old maps, which came out too small and too hard to read to be of much use. Still, *Potawatomis of the West* deserves a space in any Indian scholar's library, and its current availability is much welcomed.

Peter R. Hacker
Texas Christian University

Art of the Red Earth People: The Mesquakie of Iowa. By Gaylord Torrence and Robert Hobbs. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1989. 144 pages. \$50.00 Cloth. \$24.95 Paper.

Surrounded by the vast Iowa farmlands, about one thousand Mesquakie or Fox Indians inhabit a small native enclave near the